AN EXAMINATION OF EDWARD LHWYD'S JOURNEY TO SCOTLAND IN 1699 WITH PARTICULAR REFERENCE TO FOLK CULTURE AND LANGUAGE

Jane C Shillaker

1604160

January 2021

Master's Degrees by Examination and Dissertation

Declaration Form

1. This work has not previously been accepted in substance for any degree and is not being concurrently submitted in candidature for any degree.

Name...…………………………Jane C Shillaker……………………………………………………...

Date …………………………13 January 2021……………………………………………………...

2. This dissertation is being submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of ………………M A (Celtic Studies) ……………………………….............................

Name… ……………Jane C Shillaker………………………………………………………….

Date ………………………13 January 2021…………………………………….……………...

3. This dissertation is the result of my own independent work/investigation, except where otherwise stated.

Other sources are acknowledged by footnotes giving explicit references.

A bibliography is appended.

Name……………: Jane C Shillaker……………………………………………….……………….

Date: ……………………13 January 2021……………………………………..………………………

4. I hereby give consent for my dissertation, if accepted, to be available for photocopying, inter- library loan, and for deposit in the University's digital repository

Name………Jane C Shillaker………………………………………………………………………

Date…………………13 January 2021…………………………….…………………………….

Supervisor's Declaration.

I am satisfied that this work is the result of the student's own efforts.

Signed: …………………………………………………………………………..

Date: …………………………………………………………………………..

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the work of Edward Lhwyd, pioneer in the field of Celtic Studies, from the perspective of his journey to Scotland in 1699/1700. Lhwyd was at this time Keeper of the Ashmolean Museum in Oxford and his wide-ranging interests included natural history, botany, fossils, linguistics, antiquarianism and folklore. He visited Scotland as part of a tour of the Celtic nations to gain first-hand experience for his proposed publication *Archaeologia Britannica*. What he learned from his encounters there was supplemented by his development of a wide-ranging network of correspondents, whose knowledge and skills he used extensively alongside his own fieldwork in *Glossography*, the first and only volume of *Archaeologia Britannica* he was to publish.

Drawing both on his published work and remaining source material (notebooks, drawings and above all correspondence) this dissertation assesses his methodology, output and contribution to Celtic studies, using his Scottish work as an exemplar. His own letters and those of his contacts are appraised in detail. This appraisal shows both how collaborative knowledge networks were established and used in this period and how Lhwyd stood out in having a distinctively empirical and unprejudiced perspective. Lhwyd's travels are contextualized with reference to the political and cultural situation at this time and the experiences of Martin and Thomas Pennant, respectively a contemporary and a later traveller in Scotland. Finally, his contribution to Scottish Gaelic linguistics and his Scottish findings in the areas of antiquarianism, natural history and ethnography are reviewed and I suggest some areas where further work may be merited.

INTRODUCTION

In late 1699/early 1700, Edward Lhwyd, Keeper of the Ashmolean Museum in Oxford and naturalist, linguist and antiquarian, made a two-month journey to Scotland. It was part of a wider research tour of the Celtic nations for his intended great work *Archaeologia Britannica*. Lhwyd had been inspired by his contribution to a revised edition of Camden's *Britannia* to propose a similarly ambitious work focusing on his own particular areas of interest. This dissertation considers his Scottish trip in detail, from 1695 when he first conceived of visiting the Highlands, through his preparations, itinerary, travels and use of contacts up until publication of volume 1 of *Archaeologia Britannica* in 1707. It looks briefly at the situation in Scotland in 1699/1700 and the experiences of other travellers to provide context. The detailed review of his correspondence to and from the network of contacts he built up from his journey, showing how knowledge was shared in this period, is used alongside surviving notebooks and *Glossography* (his one published volume of *Archaeologia Britannica*) to summarise and assess his observations in the fields of Gaelic linguistics, archaeology, natural history, folklore and ethnography. I intend to demonstrate how his work on Scotland exemplifies his multi-faceted and multi-disciplinary approach, making him a pioneer of Celtic studies.

Some points of terminology need to be explained at the outset. Lhwyd's research covered Wales, Ireland, Scotland, Brittany and Cornwall. For convenience, I refer to these countries and their languages, when alluding to all of them, as Celtic. Celtic is a contested term, even in the context of Edward Lhwyd, where opinions range through those who (wrongly) say he never used it, a narrowly defined meaning reflecting the view of the French Abbé Pezron that Celtic

equalled Breton, and something approaching modern usage. [1] Lhwyd does use the word Celtic in the Preface to *Archaeologia Britannica* but also refers to Irish and British (in which he includes Welsh, Cornish and Armorican/ Breton). [2]

In referring to the language spoken in Scotland which is today called Gaelic, Lhwyd and others tended (but not exclusively) to use the term "Irish". There was no agreed contemporary term for the Scottish language; "Gaelic" was not commonly employed until at least eighty years later. [3] I use Gaelic to refer to this language, other than when citing Lhwyd or his contemporaries.

In reading about Lhwyd's life and work, his surname is variously spelled Lhwyd or Lhuyd. As far as possible, I follow the practice of R. T. Gunther who assembled Lhwyd's correspondence for publication in 1945. Gunther considered Lhwyd to be the man's own preference. [4] He found only one example of him signing himself Lhuyd rather than Lhwyd. [5]

---

[1] See for example discussion in J. Collis, *The Celts Origins Myths Inventions*, (Brimscombe Port Stroud: The History Press, 2010) at 11 and A. Roberts, *The Celts Search for a Civilization*, (London: Heron Books, 2015) at 24.

[2] The Preface is reproduced in D.W. Evans & B.F. Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* (Aberystwyth: Celtic Studies Publications, 2009) at 55.

[3] W. Ferguson, 'Samuel Johnson's Views on Scottish Gaelic Culture', *The Scottish Historical Review* LXXVII 2 204 (1998), 183-198 at 187, FN 17.

[4] R. T. Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* (Oxford: OUP, 1945) at vii. See also comments by Brynley Roberts for preferring Lhwyd at page [VIII] of D.W. Evans & B.F. Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations*.

[5] Edward Lhwyd to Dr Thomas Smith, 26 June 1707, in Gunther, *Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 527.

SOURCES

Since the only work published in Lhwyd's lifetime regarding Scotland is *Glossography,* volume one of *Archaeologia Britannica* (1707), this thesis depends heavily on other source material. These include notebooks, sketches and correspondence between Lhwyd and his network of contacts. [6] I therefore start by setting out what this material comprises and how it survived.

Lhwyd died in debt in 1709. His manuscripts and papers were sold to pay these debts in 1715. The entire collection was bought by Sir Thomas Sebright, a graduate of Jesus College. [7] Jesus College and the Bodleian Library both missed their chance to acquire them.

Sebright engaged Thomas Carte to catalogue the collection. Carte's records survive in the Bodleian Library, but lack detail. His activities were not entirely scrupulous; MS Carte 108 contains five manuscripts owned by Lhwyd which he apparently took from Sebright, and MS Carte 269 is one of Lhwyd's Scottish notebooks. [8]

After Sebright's death, his collection passed in three directions. The Irish manuscripts Lhwyd had collected and his miscellaneous personal papers were donated to Trinity College Dublin in

---

[6] A summary of the contents, location and catalogue references of the notebooks is set out in the Appendix.
[7] E. Rees and G. Walters, 'The Dispersion of the Manuscripts of Edward Lhuyd', *Welsh History Review*, 7 (2): (1974), 148-178 at p.152.
[8] ibid at 161. Also see Appendix.

1782. [9] Welsh manuscripts went to Thomas Johnes of Hafod. The mansion at Hafod and its library were later destroyed in a fire, taking with it the greater part of these. The remainder of the Sebright collection was auctioned in 1807. The auction catalogue refers to thirty-six memorandum books, notes and drawings. A notable purchaser was Sir William Watkins Wynn. Sadly, his purchases were also lost to fires, some at a bookbinder and the rest in a house fire in 1858. The manuscripts and other papers bought by other purchasers are now largely held in the National Library of Wales. [10] However, no material relevant to Lhwyd's Scottish travels appears to have survived from the residue of the Sebright collection auctioned in 1807. Apart from the notebook (MS Carte 269) mentioned above, the only remaining original source material gathered by Lhwyd and associated with Scotland is in Trinity College Dublin. [11] There are just five items in their catalogue which specifically relate to Scotland, being three notebooks, an annotated Oxford Almanack and some miscellaneous papers. [12]

There is a general assumption that much material was lost in the fires. John Lorne Campbell for example asserts that eleven volumes of notes from Lhwyd's tours were lost in the Wynn fires. He reconstructed Lhwyd's itinerary from letters, notebooks in Trinity College Dublin and scraps of other information found on manuscripts and in *Archaeologia Britannica.* [13] The notebook in MS Carte 269 was not originally available to him. [14]

---

[9] J.L. Campbell & D. Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963) at xiv.

[10] Rees and Walters, 'The Dispersion of the Manuscripts of Edward Lhuyd'.

[11] See Trinity College Library, Dublin M&ARL online catalogue entry for IE TCD MS 1369 (formerly H.4.28) under 'custodial history'; available at https://manuscripts.catalogue.tcd.ie/CalmView/Record.aspx?src=CalmView.Catalog&id=IE+TCD+MS+1369&pos=2 accessed 22 June 2020.

[12] See Appendix.

[13] J.L. Campbell, 'The Tour of Edward Lhuyd in Ireland in 1699 and 1700', *Celtica,* 5: (1960), 218-228 at 218.

[14] Rees and Walters, 'The Dispersion of the Manuscripts of Edward Lhuyd' FN 41. The existence of a Lhwyd notebook and his handwritten copy of *'A collection of Highland rites & customes'* in MS Carte 269 was therefore not known to J.L. Campbell and D. Thomson at the time they produced their extensive survey *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands 1699-1700* in 1963.

However, the quantity of lost Scottish material is moot. Lhwyd travelled on foot to Scotland with a couple of helpers. Luggage must have been limited. R. H. Morris finds a reference to Lhwyd and his three companions (two remained in Ireland) travelling with "knapsacks on their shoulders". [15] The extent to which Lhwyd made, and then used, actual notes during the journey which have since been lost in fires may be overestimated. The thirty-six notebooks catalogued in 1807 were described as covering natural history and antiquities of England and Wales and drawings from Wales. They probably represented a lifetime of field visits in both countries. They might have included some notes from Scotland. For example, Lhwyd later sent his correspondents detailed descriptions of plants observed on Mull. The level of detail suggests he must have had recourse to notes that do not survive. At the same time, Lhwyd was to make extensive use of contacts from Scotland for data gathering once he was back in Oxford, suggesting, as I will discuss, that his travels did not yield as much first-hand material as he hoped.

Turning to correspondence, of letters to and from Lhwyd, many were collected together in Oxford (from various sources) in the nineteenth century, initially in the Ashmolean; then transferred to the Bodleian in 1860. [16] This collection and surviving letters from other locations have now been collated and transcribed onto the Early Modern Letters Online resource. [17] Few letters appear to have been written actually during the course of his visit to Scotland. Richard Ellis noted that "[r]eferences to his travels in Scotland are not numerous". [18]

---

[15] R. H. Morris, ed., 'Parochialia being a summary of answers to 'Parochial Queries', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, Supplements, April 1909, April 1910, April 1911. See April 1909 at vi.

[16] R. Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709 (*Dublin: RIA, 2013) at 205.

[17] http://emlo-portal.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/collections/?page_id=907#context

[18] R. Ellis, 'Some Incidents in the Life of Edward Lhuyd', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1906-7), 1-51 at 39.

Another resource is drawings. An ability to make sketches was an important prerequisite for the young men Lhwyd employed to assist him during and after his travels. Fortunately, one of his correspondents, the Garter King of Arms, John Anstis, collected Lhwyd's drawings into two volumes now held in the British Library. [19] Frank Emery and Campbell disagree as to whether these are Anstis' copies of the originals by Lhwyd and his assistants or the drawings themselves. [20] Campbell uses the sketches as part of his evidence for Lhwyd's Scottish itinerary, whilst considering them all to be copies. Emery attributes many, if not all, of the sketches to William Jones, one of the assistants who travelled with Lhwyd, by virtue of the handwriting on them. Peter Pool, reviewing drawings from the Cornish leg of the tour, concludes "they do not seem to be in his [Lhwyd's] hand", suggesting Lhwyd himself was not the draughtsman. [21] Glyn Daniel by contrast attributes many directly to Lhwyd, whilst considering the Anstis collection all to be copies. [22] That the Scottish work is by Lhwyd himself seems difficult to challenge, since William Jones did not accompany him to Scotland. [23]

EARLY CAREER

Much of the biographical information about Lhwyd originates from a 1777 work *"British Remains"*. Lhwyd became Keeper of the Ashmolean Museum in 1690; a later holder of that

---

[19] Stowe MSS 1023 and 1024. See British Library Catalogue available at https://www.bl.uk/collection-guides/stowe-manuscripts accessed 17 September 2020.

[20] F. Emery, *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709*, (Caerdydd: Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1971) at 67; Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 304.

[21] P.A.S. Pool, 'Cornish Drawings by Edward Lhuyd in the British Museum', *Cornish Archaeology*, 16: (1977), 139-142 at 139.

[22] G. Daniel, 'Edward Lhwyd: Antiquary and Archaeologist', *Welsh History Review*, 3 (4): (1967), pp. 345- 359 at 357.

[23] F. Emery, *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709* at 69.

office, William Huddesford (in post 1755-1772), drafted, but died before publishing, a memoir of Lhwyd's life. Nicholas Owen appended this to his work *British Remains*. This apparently well researched and referenced, but also adulatory, memoir is evidence of the esteem in which Lhwyd continued to be held. Its concluding sentence, which must be Huddesford's words, reads:

"My only view was to preserve some remembrance of a man, whose character, having the proofs of his abilities always before me, I so much admire." [24]

Lhwyd was a man of the Welsh Marches, mixed English and Welsh by birth and background, born in or around 1660. [25] His parents did not marry. He grew up at his father Edward Lloyd's home, Llanforda Hall, west of Oswestry and east of Offa's Dyke. [26] Here his father employed the gardener Edward Morgan, who may have sparked Lhwyd's early interest in botany. By the time Lhwyd went to Jesus College, Oxford in October 1682 to read law, he was already a knowledgeable botanist and had made a trip that summer to mountainous areas of mid and north Wales to collect plant specimens. [27] Botany broadened into a wider interest in natural history. Although he remained at Jesus until 1687, from 1685 onwards he began to work with Dr Robert Plot, first Keeper of Oxford's new Ashmolean Museum and Professor of Chemistry there. Lhwyd was appointed assistant keeper at the Museum in 1687; in 1690 he succeeded Plot.

---

[24] Rev. N. Owen, *British Remains or a Collection of Antiquities relating to the Britons & c*, (London, 1777); copy available at https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=pZsuAAAAMAAJ&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false accessed 1 August 2020.

[25] Dictionary of Welsh Biography https://biography.wales/article/s-LHUY-EDW-1660#?c=0&m=0&s=0&cv=0&manifest=https%3A%2F%2Fdamsssl.llgc.org.uk%2Fiiif%2F2.0%2F4674186%2Fmanifest.json&xywh=-381%2C1026%2C2050%2C1669 accessed 15 November 2019; the Early Modern Letters Online resource gives his date of birth as 1659 by inference http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/profile/person/822ba92b-3ccf-4f1e-b776-e87aca45c866 accessed 1 August 2020.

[26] These biographical details are largely from B.F. Roberts, *Edward Lhuyd The Making of a Scientist*, (Llandysul: University of Wales Press, 1980) where a fuller account of his early years may be found.

[27] F. Emery, *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709* at 29.

Plot had set up the Oxford Philosophical Society which brought the young Lhwyd into contact with men such as John Ray, botanist and publisher, in 1675, of *Dictionariolum Trilingue*, Martin Lister, naturalist and John Aubrey, antiquarian. [28] All three were to remain lifelong correspondents and Lhwyd was to bring together their respective interests in his own work.

During these early years at the Ashmolean, Lhwyd catalogued the Museum's shells and fossils, augmented by specimens he personally collected. His experience with Morgan may have familiarised him with scientific cataloguing, a skill he used to produce the first illustrated catalogue of British fossils *Lithophylacii Britannici ichnographia*. [29] This work was printed at the expense of Sir Isaac Newton and Sir Hans Sloane (amongst others) showing how rapidly the young Lhwyd had acquired a serious reputation.

Morris suggests Lhwyd found his duties at the Ashmolean "irksome and hampering" and relished the greater freedom to pursue his own interests that his appointment as Keeper in 1690 brought. [30] Possibly he felt the same about law, since he never completed his degree.

PREPARATIONS FOR A GRAND TOUR

The catalyst for Lhwyd's research tour was his involvement with Edmund Gibson's new edition of what is commonly referred to as Camden's *Britannia.* [31] William Camden had

---

[28] D.W. Evans and B.F. Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd 1660-1709 A Bibliography and Readers' Guide*, (Aberystwyth: University of Wales Centre for Advanced Welsh and Celtic Studies, 2009) at 4.
[29] Roberts, *Edward Lhuyd The Making of a Scientist* at 19.
[30] Morris, 'Parochialia' at iii.
[31] G. Walters and F. Emery, 'Edward Lhuyd, Edmund Gibson, and the printing of Camden's *Britannia*, 1695', *The Library*, Vol. XXXII June: (1977), 109-135.

produced a historical and topographical survey of the British Isles in 1586 which ran into a number of editions in Latin and English. [32] Lhwyd had become acquainted with William Nicolson (Queen's College Oxford, later Bishop of Carlisle). [33] Thanks to Nicolson, in April 1693 Gibson (Queen's College Oxford and later Bishop of Lincoln and subsequently London) invited Lhwyd to contribute sections on North Wales to this new edition. [34]

The *Britannia* commission represented a significant development in Lhwyd's career. It furnished him with exposure and experience critical in empowering him to plan and carry out his own major project, *Archaeologia Britannica*. Having seen how Plot used questionnaires to good effect in producing Natural Histories of Staffordshire and Oxfordshire, he sent lists of questions to friends in each Welsh county and fleshed these out with his own travels. [35] Lhwyd's involvement expanded to take on the work of all the Welsh counties, to Gibson's immense satisfaction. [36] The work was published in 1695.

Camden's *Britannia*, and Plot's Natural Histories led Lhwyd to contemplate a Natural History of Wales. His experience on *Britannia* meant he recognised the value of field work in addition to questionnaires and correspondence. It gave him a tried and tested methodology and an understanding of the laborious process of bringing a work accurately into print. In May 1695

---

[32] G.C. Boon, 'Camden and the Britannia', *Archaeologia Cambrensis Journal of the Cambrian Archaeological Association*, Vol. CXXXVI: (1987), 1-19.

[33] The spelling of this surname varies, for example Nicholsone is also used. I use Nicolson throughout the text for consistency.

[34] Gunther, *Early Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 187-189; William Nicolson to Edward Lhwyd, 16 February 1693/4, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/2bee1928-3f40-4853-897c-7dee99144937 accessed 23 July 2020.

[35] *The Natural History of Oxfordshire being an Essay towards the Natural History of England* by R.P. LL. D was published in Oxford and London in 1677 and *The Natural History of Staffordshire* by Robert Plot LLD was published in Oxford in 1686. On the use of questionnaires see A. Fox, 'Printed Questionnaires, Research Networks, and the Discovery of the British Isles, 1650-1800', *The Historical Journal*, 53 3: (2010), 593-621 at 599.

[36] Morris 'Parochialia' April 1909 p. iv.

he wrote to his friend John Lloyd that "[S]ome gentlemen in Glamorganshire" had offered him a seven year pension to facilitate its completion. [37] But his plans were expanding. In the same letter he set out a much bolder project and the reasoning behind it:

> "…. such as are acquainted with Natural History, know there's no good to be done in't without repeated observations; and that a Countrey of so large Extent can not be well survey'd, and the Natural Productions of it duely examin'd, und\er/ the space of four or five summers; after which the time remaining will be short enough for methodizing the Observations and publishing the History. Besides, during that time I propose to take one journey into Cornwall, and an other into the Scotch Highlands, in order to collect parallel observations; that so I […] need not rely much on the credit of forreign Writers, nor overcharge the work with numerous quotations, and spinning out the matter to multiply sheets as my old Friend Dr Plot seems to have done; in both his Histories." [38]

This was the first intimation that he planned to visit the Scottish Highlands. The extract shows he had already settled on his preferred approach – a comparative methodology and personal field research. John Cramsie refers to the "social and intellectual reaction against casual observation, oral sources" of which Lhwyd's comments about his mentor Plot are an example. [39] This insistence on first hand evidence reflected trends in scientific research during the seventeenth century. Lhwyd followed the Baconian method, taking observations, classifying and arranging the data and only then attempting to formulate axioms. [40] Cramsie's assessment

[37] Edward Lhwyd to John Lloyd, May 1695, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/da90f2d2-379a-414f-b462-df286f6eb108 accessed 25 July 2020.
[38] ibid.
[39] J. Cramsie, *British Travellers and the Encounter with Britain* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2015) at 381.
[40] Roberts, *Edward Lhuyd The Making of a Scientist* at 4.

of knowledge gained through experience is a recent and important contribution to understanding the value of Lhwyd's journeys to his work.

By September, his plans had evolved further and he wrote to Lloyd to explain how the work would now cover antiquities as well as, and in preference to, natural history. [41] The project was becoming seriously ambitious. In November 1695, he circulated "*A DESIGN of a British Dictionary, Historical and Geographical; With an Essay entitl'd 'Archaeologia Britannica'; And a Natural History of Wales*:"

> "…twill be necessary to travail Wales at least four or five summers: and likewise to make one journey into Cornwall and an other into Irland or the Highlands of Scotland, for parallel observations, as to their Language, their names of Towns, Rivers, Mountains…." [42]

The "*DESIGN*" allowed five years for the Dictionary and a further two for *Archaeologia Britannica*; for the Natural History he set no time frame. There were to be two volumes. Ireland and the Scottish Highlands at this stage were alternatives and, according to Gunther, Lhwyd did not decide to visit Brittany until he reached Cornwall. [43]

Lhwyd put out feelers about the Highlands to Lister in two letters in early 1696. He was keen to find "any gentleman or clergy-man" knowledgeable in the language and antiquities, who

---

[41] Edward Lhwyd to John Lloyd, 22 September 1695, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/3f256b86-d160-4ea8-80c8-18953d82f26a accessed 25 July 2020.
[42] As reproduced in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 13.
[43] Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 20; in a letter to Martin Lister of 12 November 1696 at Gunther at 314, Lhwyd suggests he will go there if there is peace.

might also reassure him as to the safety of travelling there. [44] He planned to travel about three years hence, being around 1699, which proved to be the case. [45] Lister's intervening reply shows he found him some contacts, including Brædalbin (sic), presumably the Earl, John Campbell, who maybe was the source of Lhwyd's contacts among the Campbells of Inveraray. [46] Lister suggested Lhwyd amend his *Queries* to show Scotland rather than Wales, but he declined to do so.

The purpose of the "*DESIGN*" was bluntly a request for money. Lhwyd sought support by way of subscription in a manner akin to twenty-first century crowdfunding. The document explained how an annual pension for five years would enable him not only to travel and undertake exhaustive research but to cover the costs of assistants, correspondence, books etc. In total, £360 and five shillings was collected. [47] There were 240 subscribers, double his expectations. [48] Assured financially and with leave of absence from the Visitors of the Ashmolean, Lhwyd made an initial journey into Wales for six months in 1696.

Shortly before this, Nicolson, resident in Cumbria, wrote to him:

"I wish Scotland may be shortly in that peaceable Condition as that you may think it safe to travel into. […] In Edenburgh you may have Highlanders enough to converse with: and of the better sort; such as can write their mother tongue. Their Countrey will

---

[44] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 30 January 1696/7, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 322.

[45] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, February 1696/7, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 323.

[46] Martin Lister to Edward Lhwyd, 3 February 1696/7, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/e181fe73-fd41-442c-b5ef-ec620576dbee accessed 18 November 2020.

[47] Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 264.

[48] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 10 March 1695/6, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 301.

scarce be worth travelling in any farther, upon the account of any lower Species; after you had a thorough Tryal of the Humane." [49]

These observations were hardly designed to inspire Lhwyd to travel to Scotland, particularly with its suggestion not to venture beyond Edinburgh. Perhaps Lhwyd remembered this advice when after his journey he wrote that the Highlanders were "nothing so barbarous as the Lowlanders and English commonly represent them; but are for what I could find a very hospitable and civil people." [50]

Nicolson may have been the source of Lhwyd's introductions to Sir Robert Sibbald (although both Lhwyd and Sibbald contributed to Camden's *Britannia*) and to a Mr Sutherland who was presumably James Sutherland, Professor of Botany at the University of Edinburgh. [51] Lhwyd met both men in Edinburgh. In his letter of 18 February 1698/9, Nicolson mentioned a proposed trip to Scotland to see both men and invited Lhwyd to submit questions for him to ask them. [52] In the event, he did not depart till May, not long before Lhwyd. [53] Replies from Lhwyd to these letters do not survive.

[49] William Nicolson to Edward Lhwyd, 24 February 1696, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/6edff023-881b-456e-84f3-51b3daf6fbf4 accessed 23 July 2020.

[50] Edward Lhwyd to Henry Rowlands, 12 March 1699/1700, in Gunther, *Early Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 427/8.

[51] See his entry in Oxford Dictionary of National Biography available at https://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-47083 accessed 13 November 2020.

[52] William Nicolson to Edward Lhwyd, 18 February 1698/9, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/f711e384-f66e-450a-a389-90f1aee05d40 accessed 25 July 2020.

[53] William Nicolson to Edward Lhwyd, 11 May 1699, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/4b7b9cf6-e13a-467e-ba89-525b9fa351aa accessed 25 July 2020.

Nicolson's areas of interest were Cumbria and Anglo-Saxon and he was aware of possible links between Wales and Cumbria in the past. His scholarship may have been the catalyst to Lhwyd's Celtic studies; both men would have acknowledged the value in recording what remained of Celtic languages and culture. Lhwyd also became aware of work of Pezron around this time. Pezron had concluded there were an ancient people (Celts) speaking a language called Celtic, of which Breton was the last vestige. [54] In June 1698, Lhwyd wrote to Lister that Pezron's "notion of the Greek, Roman and Celtic Languages being of one common origin, agrees exactly with my observations". [55] Lhwyd took Irish to be derived from Latin and British from Greek.

In autumn 1696, and in preparation for his tour and work, Lhwyd issued his "*Parochial Queries in order to a Geographical Dictionary and Natural History etc, of Wales*". [56] Four thousand copies were printed for intended distribution in Wales and the Marches. [57] The preamble makes it clear that replies were intended to supplement his and his assistants' work. That Lhwyd had already acquired the skills of a perceptive and insightful researcher is shown by the final lines in the preamble where he urges those completing the queries to be comprehensive: "what we sometimes judge insignificant, may afterwards upon some Application unthought of, appear very useful". [58]

---

[54] J. Collis, *The Celts: Origins Myths Inventions* at 12.

[55] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 5 June 1698, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.], 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/0dd34a21-bf0c-46c3-8214-9899021058bc accessed 21 April 2020. This letter also appears in Gunther *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 399-400 but is wrongly dated to August 1698.

[56] Reproduced in Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 41-7.

[57] Edward Lhwyd to John Lloyd, St Steven's Day 1696, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 316.

[58] Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 41.

The Queries were in two parts, geography and antiquities, and natural history. Lhwyd sent Lister a bundle for distribution to suitable contacts in the Highlands in January 1695/6. [59] Shortly after this, Lister made his observation about amending Wales for Scotland. It is uncertain to what extent any of these pre-printed questionnaires were circulated and returned. Perhaps Lister did not attempt to circulate in Scotland, given the reference to Wales, or maybe this did, as he foresaw, cause confusion. As will be discussed, Lhwyd later distributed lists of similar questions to contacts made whilst in Scotland.

The use of these kinds of questionnaires came into its own in the seventeenth century and arguably Lhwyd of all exponents used them to the fullest effect. [60] He incorporated a simple but useful modification of leaving space for answers. Adam Fox, discussing their use, notes how they forged links between antiquarians, natural historians and the "learned and ingenious" across Britain. [61] They were a medium for building contacts with men of similar interests. This was undoubtedly the case for Lhwyd. In Wales, his itinerary broadly followed locations of those submitting replies. [62] But they had their limitations. What evidence there is suggests users, including Lhwyd, got few replies back. [63] Lhwyd's summary of Welsh replies (recorded in surviving notebooks) suggests a 15% response rate for Welsh parishes. [64] As already stated, he apparently received no responses from Scotland. Lhwyd may have had low expectations for response rates, which could explain why he had so many copies printed.

---

[59] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 6 January 1696/7, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 321.

[60] F.V. Emery, 'A Map of Edward Lhuyd's Parochial Queries in Order to a Geographical Dictionary, &C., of Wales (1696)', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1958) at 41-53.

[61] Fox, 'Printed Questionnaires, Research Networks, and the Discovery of the British Isles, 1650-1800' at 603.

[62] Emery, 'A Map of Edward Lhuyd's Parochial Queries in Order to a Geographical Dictionary, &C., of Wales (1696)' at 45.

[63] Fox, 'Printed Questionnaires, Research Networks, and the Discovery of the British Isles, 1650-1800' at 614.

[64] Emery, 'A Map of Edward Lhuyd's Parochial Queries in Order to a Geographical Dictionary, &C., of Wales (1696)' at 46.

It is also hard to judge how far responses were assessed critically or taken at face value. One advantage of fieldwork was to give responses context. Lhwyd undertook his own first-hand research in his travels. He may well have appreciated that respondents could be inaccurate, looking to please by elaboration in their replies or relying in turn on third parties whose accuracy they did not question.

SCOTLAND IN 1699/1700

Scotland outside of the major lowland towns was an extremely poor country when Lhwyd visited. The poverty of the Highlands in particular made it of little interest to central government, perpetuating a clan based social structure where access to land was controlled by the clan chief. [65] In the 1690s, bad weather and repeated harvest failure brought famine. About a fifth of the population were reduced to begging. [66] The population is estimated to have reduced by between 5% and 15% by 1700. [67]

Scotland was legally a separate country from England, albeit under one monarch, with its own Parliament in Edinburgh. The two kingdoms were not united into a common nation until 1707. Religious differences played a significant part in Scottish life and politics. The ousting of the Stuart Catholic James VII in 1688 created support for a Jacobite faction whose rebellions were to rend Scotland for many years to come. [68] The new King William required oaths of allegiance

---

[65] T.M. Devine, *The Scottish Clearances A History of the Dispossessed* (London: Penguin, 2018) at 25-27.
[66] R. Goring, ed., *Scotland The Autobiography* (London: Penguin, 2008) at 104.
[67] K. Cullen, *Famine in Scotland The Ill Years of the 1690s* (Edinburgh: EUP, 2010) at 2.
[68] J.D. Mackie, *A History of Scotland* (London: Pelican, 1982) at 269.

which many (including clergymen whom Lhwyd was to meet) felt unable to give. [69] In 1692, not so far from the areas Lhwyd visited, the clan Campbell was heavily implicated in a massacre of members of the clan Macdonald for the failure of their chief to take the oath in time. Lhwyd was visiting a country not yet united to England in Parliamentary terms and where loyalties to the Monarchy were conflicted.

Gaelic remained the spoken language of the majority of inhabitants in the Highlands and Islands but the language of education, commerce and politics was English. Gaelic was starting to be perceived, at least outside of the *Gàidhealtachd*, as the language of the less educated. [70] The 1616 School Establishment Act had as a goal its obliteration, referring to it as "a source of barbarity and incivility". [71]

Kintyre, Lhwyd's point of entry and exit to Scotland, was one of the first areas in the Highlands to see a significant switch away from the traditional clan land tenure to direct rental to tenants, a change which resulted in significant emigration away from Scotland. [72] Lhwyd's visit would have seen Kintyre on the cusp of these changes which were ultimately to overtake all of the Highlands.

---

[69] ibid at 250.
[70] K. Mackinnon, 'Scottish Gaelic Today', in M.J. Ball and N. Müller, eds., *The Celtic Languages* (London: Routledge, 2009) at 587.
[71] Extract from the 1616 Act as cited in a report by the *Society for Bettering the Condition and Increasing the Comforts of the Poor* 'Of the Education of the Poor', London Bulmer & Co 1809 at 261.
[72] Devine, *The Scottish Clearances A History of the Dispossessed* at 45.

"LEARNING IRISH"

As early as April 1692, Lhwyd wrote to Lister "I am now at some spare hours learning Irish".[73] In the preface to his Irish dictionary in *Archaeologia Britannica* Lhwyd refers to learning from the Bible and other books, rather than from any native speaker. [74]

Lhwyd's first introduction to Irish, or Gaelic, as a spoken language had been when he visited Dublin in 1688. His guide was a native speaker. Lhwyd compiled a comparative word list when visiting Tipperary to look at plants. [75] Plant and place names gave him the impetus to start comparing words in different languages; he moved from terms associated with natural history and antiquarian enquiries to looking more widely at languages themselves. Lhwyd corresponded with Aubrey on philological issues around toponyms and thence to the relationships of the various languages found in Britain. [76] Aubrey may well have been pivotal in arousing Lhwyd's interest in comparative linguistics.

In learning Gaelic, Lhwyd was challenged by the absence of any grammar book or dictionary or indeed having anyone to hand who could read the language. [77] This does rather beg the question of how he approached the task; presumably from manuscripts alone. The Bodleian

---

[73] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 17 April 1692, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/95ee9b44-8c1c-43f0-8fbc-19442d66a157 accessed 3 September 2020. Gunther dates this letter to October 1694. *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 248.
[74] E. Lhwyd, *Archaeologia Britannica A Translation of the Irish Preface*, as reproduced in Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 175-7.
[75] B.F. Roberts, 'An Early Edward Lhwyd Glossary', *Studia Celtica*, L (2016), 151-162.
[76] K.J. Williams, 'A New Philology Toponyms and Comparative Linguistics in Aubrey's Late Works', in K. J. Williams, *The Antiquary: John Aubrey's Historical Scholarship* (Oxford: OUP, 2016).
[77] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 17 April 1692.

Library held an early monolingual Irish dictionary but John Considine concludes Lhwyd was unaware of this. [78]

He would certainly have had no access to material specific to Scottish Gaelic. There were virtually no printed books in Scottish Gaelic for Lhwyd to consult even if he had been aware of them. What there were appear to have been entirely religious. John Lorne Campbell & Derrick Thomson suggest there would have been nothing available in print before he set out for Scotland. [79] In Ronald Black's chronological list of Scottish Gaelic books printed from 1567 to 1800 *Archaeologia Britannica* is the seventeenth entry. [80] The absence of materials must have been a prime factor in Lhwyd's decision to include such in his *Glossography*.

THE SCOTTISH TOUR

Lhwyd was away from Oxford from May 1697 to April 1701 on his research trips to Wales, Ireland, Scotland, Cornwall and Brittany. The Scottish part of his tour was confined to a few weeks in late 1699 and early 1700. After Ireland, Scotland and Wales he went to Cornwall and Brittany. His travels were curtailed after his arrest in France as a spy.

---

[78] J. Considine, *Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* (Oxford: OUP, 2017) at 133.
[79] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 95.
[80] R. Black, 'A Handlist of Gaelic Printed Books 1567-1800', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 25: (2009), 35-93 at 47.

His Scottish itinerary, relying substantially on Campbell & Thomson's reconstruction, appears to have been as follows. [81]

He left Ireland around the end of August 1699, using the regular ferry service between Ballycastle, Antrim and Southend, Kintyre. Thus his first taste of Scotland was of its more remote and rural aspects, having sailed from Ballycastle to the Highlands, rather than travelling through the north of England to the Lowlands and Edinburgh as Nicholson took it for granted he would. Ireland was part of his project and, as he had framed his design specifically in terms of the Highlands, an approach via Northern Ireland to Kintyre made sense. William Sacheverell, (Governor of the Isle of Man 1693-4), wrote of his own journey in 1688 to Iona (which Campbell & Thomson considered Lhwyd's goal) travelling from Liverpool to Antrim and thence to Kintyre and on through the Sound of Mull. [82] It is unclear whether Lhwyd read this work before his own journey.

From the southern tip of the Kintyre peninsula, Lhwyd travelled north along its west coast through Knapdale and visited various islands including Mull and Iona. Campbell & Thomson surmise he took the then usual route of a ferry from near Oban to the island of Kerrara and then went across Mull to Iona (as Sacheverell had done). Then Lhwyd travelled to Inveraray and Dumbarton and on to the lowland towns of Glasgow, Stirling, Falkirk and Bathgate. Edinburgh (in contrast to Nicholson's expectations) was the furthest point to which he travelled from Kintyre and he reached there in mid December 1699. He then rapidly retraced his steps back

---

[81] Campbell reconstructed the journey from correspondence, sketches and journey planning notes in the notebooks. See Campbell, 'The Tour of Edward Lhuyd' and Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xvi- xvii and also map prefacing the Introduction.

[82] W. Sacheverell, '*A Voyage to I-Columb-Kill*' (Douglas: The Manx Society, 1859) at 95 - copy available at Google books   https://www.google.co.uk/books/edition/_/dIYNAAAAYAAJ?hl=en&gbpv=0 accessed 9 December 2020.

to Glasgow. Beyond this Campbell & Thomson could not reconstruct his journey to his entry point on Kintyre. It is possible he crossed via the Isle of Bute, since he mentions in correspondence a plant he found there. [83]

Lhwyd reached Southend, Kintyre around Christmas but bad weather meant it was late January 1700 before he arrived back in Ireland. Writing in March to Lister from Sligo he says "we were detain'd about 5 weeks at the Mull of Cantire; a place where we could find but little to doe". [84]

Lhwyd was not the most forward-thinking of travellers. It might have occurred to him that autumn/winter was not the best time to travel north. Thomas Pennant, travelling seventy years later and after a network of military roads had been constructed, turned back in late August due to bad weather. [85] Lhwyd's naivety as a traveller is exemplified by his experiences in France where his arrest as a suspected spy cut short the Grand Tour. Once released he returned to England rather than going on to Paris as intended.

Looking at Lhwyd's itinerary on a map, what stands out is how little he saw of the Highlands, visiting only the south western tip, and of the Islands, only Mull, Iona and some smaller ones. This was in marked contrast to his extensive travels throughout Wales and Ireland. Campbell & Thomson suggest his goal in Scotland was simply to visit Iona. [86] Yet he travelled on to Glasgow and Edinburgh; perhaps spending half of his intended time in Scotland in the

---

[83] Edward Lhwyd to John Morton, 15 May 1700, in in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/108c4c8e-f918-4932-955f-96ec8a6d69b8 accessed 24 April 2020.
[84] Edward Lhwyd to Dr Martin Lister, 12 March 1699/1700, in Gunther, *Early Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 426.
[85] N. Leask, *Stepping Westward: Writing the Highland Tour c1720-1830* (Oxford: OUP, 2020) at 108.
[86] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xix.

Lowlands. He may have set himself a tight schedule aimed purely to cover the bare minimum needed to make contacts, identify the whereabouts of manuscripts and acquire enough first-hand knowledge of antiquities, customs and Scottish Gaelic to make the "parallel observations" referred to in his "Design". His discomfort at the length of time he was confined to Kintyre by bad weather and the fact that he left two of his assistants in Ireland suggest he had never intended to be in Scotland for long. It begs a question to read in a letter to Henry Rowlands that he has been:

> "….in places quite remote from all correspondence, among the Hebrides, and other highlands of Scotland with whom their neighbours seem to have less commerce than they have with either of the Indies". [87]

Certainly he had been in remote places but it is hard to judge now whether Lhwyd knew in truth he had visited only a small part of the Highlands and Islands or whether he genuinely failed to appreciate the size of Scotland. He may have intended to venture further. For example, his list of potential manuscript owners included "A number of Ancient Irish Manuscripts in MacLeoid's House in ye Isle of Skye". Lhwyd did not travel as far as Skye.

His travels in Scotland were made with an assistant, David Parry. Two others, Will Jones and Robin Wyn/Robert Wynne, remained in Ireland. [88] All three were Welsh and Parry was still a teenager. He must also have employed guides but there is no surviving detail about these, nor of any maps he may have used.

---

[87] Edward Lhwyd to Henry Rowlands, 12 March 1699/1700. FN 52 above.
[88] B.F. Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd's Protégés', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, 14: (2008), 21–57 at 39.

Lhwyd recruited a further assistant during his Scottish journey, Gilliecholumb, a Scottish Gaelic speaker. As early as November 1696, Aubrey wrote that he had asked Mr Garden of Aberdeen to look out for a Scottish Gaelic speaking youth to help Lhwyd with his study of the language. [89] Maybe this gave Lhwyd the notion of the potential usefulness of such an assistant. Little is known about Gilliecholumb. Correspondence with Robert Wodrow implies he was present when Wodrow and Lhwyd met in Glasgow in December 1699. [90] Will Jones, writing some years later from London, sent good wishes to Gilliecholumb and referred to him as "Ruddy Cheeks"; evidently he was very much part of the team. [91] *British Remains* says Lhwyd brought a deserted infant back from Scotland and kept him as a servant. [92] His name was Mac Mullein but he was called Gilia Cholum. This use of the word "infant" is puzzling, since references in letters are indicative of a young man capable of helping with researches. He was literate since Hugh Griffiths refers to a letter from him. [93] Elsewhere he is referred to as a "raw Scottish lad". [94] Campbell identifies him as a parishioner of Rev Duncan Campbell of Kilmichael-Lussa. Lhwyd visited there towards the outset of his journey, making it feasible this was the youth with him when he met Wodrow in Glasgow. Brynley Roberts describes the fines Gilliecholumb incurred for various infractions in Oxford, where he worked as a servant

---

[89] John Aubrey to Edward Lhwyd, 12 November 1696, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/4cbcd8e3-f95d-4ad2-84b0-e12067168757 accessed 12 October 2020.

[90] Edward Lhwyd to Robert Wodrow, 2 April 1700, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/9b8b0317-f88a-471d-856a-3059e2e9405b accessed 17 June 2020.

[91] William Jones to Edward Lhwyd, 18 April 1702, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/8f1babd1-b1fd-4412-8b64-ca5d820bcd4a accessed 27 June 2020.

[92] Rev. N. Owen, *British Remains or a Collection of Antiquities relating to the Britons* at 137.

[93] Hugh Griffiths to Edward Lhwyd, 20 May 1702, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/b0b79f34-f797-4551-85d1-706636eb346f accessed 27 June 2020.

[94] Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 330; Campbell & Thomson (who seem not to have identified his name) *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xviii.

as well as an amanuensis. [95] These shortcomings and the reference to infant suggest that, like Parry, he was still in his teens. He must have found it hard to adjust to an intellectual milieu so very distant in every sense from the place he grew up. That Lhwyd bore with him, and Jones clearly held him in affection, suggests Gilliecholumb had more in his favour than the list of fines implies. How far he assisted Lhwyd with his language studies however cannot be established.

Lhwyd reflected in detail on his Scottish trip in a letter to an unknown recipient, dated 29 January 1700. A copy was made for Samuel Molyneux and versions survive in Trinity College Dublin and Cardiff Central Library. [96] Lhwyd explains they travelled about a hundred miles in the Highlands then went on to Glasgow, Stirling and Edinburgh. Here again he emphasised the contrast between the behaviour of the Highlanders and their reputation:

> "We found a great deal of civility and kindness as well in the Highlands as in the Lowlands And tho the highlanders be Represented both in England & Ireland Barbarous and inhospitable we found 'em quite otherwise". [97]

He suggests, not unrealistically, that the combination of a barren landscape and the retention of their old customs and language might account for this prejudice, just as some Englishmen saw the Welsh and Irish in the same way and for the same reasons.

---

[95] Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd's Protégés', at 49.
[96] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 6-8.
[97] Edward Lhwyd to [Thomas Molyneux], 29 January 1699/1700, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/7ba77bb4-7dc2-4538-bbeb-c4345915168c accessed 24 April 2020.

Lhwyd's experience was not unique. Another contemporary traveller, Martin Martin, was to write the same. [98] Later in the eighteenth century Pennant also described their civility and hospitality. [99]

MAKING CONTACTS

A significant outcome of the journey to Scotland was the development of a knowledge network through contacts made there. Lhwyd seems to have made a deep impression on those who met him, even with the briefest of encounters. This perhaps accounts for how the men he met in Scotland became valuable correspondents on matters associated with its language and customs. Indeed, without these contacts, Lhwyd might not have been able to bring the Scottish aspects of *Archaeologia Britannica* to fruition.

Early in his journey Lhwyd visited Inveraray, home of the Earls of Argyll and the Clan Campbell. Both were heavily involved in Scottish politics; Clan Campbell carried out the massacre at Glencoe. John Prebble says of Inveraray "Here was Campbell wealth and Campbell power." [100] Lhwyd met Rev. Colin Campbell here. [101] We know nothing of where Lhwyd stayed but another contact, Lachlan Campbell, had been a tutor in the Earl's family. Noted above (p. 16) is the link with the Breadalbane branch of Clan Campbell.

---

[98] Cramsie, *British Travellers and the Encounter with Britain* at 390.
[99] T. Pennant, *A Tour in Scotland 1769*, as reproduced at
https://www.visionofbritain.org.uk/travellers/Pennant_Scot/10 accessed 20 October 2020.
[100] J. Prebble, *Glencoe*, (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1969) at 169.
[101] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xix; Edward Lhwyd to Rev. Colin Campbell, 20 December 1699, reproduced in same at 4-5.

Colin was minister at Ardchattan. This parish covered the area north of Lhwyd's likely departure point for Mull and Iona. Colin was a renowned mathematician but for Lhwyd it was his knowledge of Gaelic and access to other scholars and, possibly, manuscripts, that counted. Colin's surviving papers include Gaelic verse and sermons. [102] Lhwyd wrote to him from Glasgow after their meeting in Inveraray, setting out a detailed list of topics where he hoped Colin or his contacts could provide more information. Lhwyd circulated several similar lists of queries; as noted before, he did not apparently use his printed Parochial Queries whilst actually in Scotland. Lhwyd was presuming on a slight acquaintance with Colin but Colin had offered to help and this heartened Lhwyd to make the request. [103]

Lachlan Campbell, later a Minister in Campbeltown, was to prove a lifelong contact. They met either in Inveraray or Edinburgh. Richard Sharpe suggests the contact came through Wodrow and that Lachlan and Lhwyd were in correspondence before any extant letters.

> "In Lachlan Campbell Lhwyd had an educated collaborator for whom Gaelic was his mother- tongue but not part of his education." [104]

---

[102] Colin Campbell Collection in the Archives of Library of the University of Edinburgh, as recorded at https://archiveshub.jisc.ac.uk/search/archives/8f1f579f-f3b1-3fa6-9687-e72d5e843872 accessed 31 August 2020.

[103] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 4-5; Edward Lhuyd to Colin Campbell, 20 December 1699, transcribed by Dr Dòmhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart, in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/profile/work/9640399e-4afc-43c4-b594-d7860bf42609 accessed 12 June 2020.

[104] R. Sharpe, 'Lachlan Campbell's Letters to Edward Lhuyd 1704-7', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, XXIX: (2013), 244-281 at 244 & 246.

Lachlan became a useful collaborator for the Scottish Gaelic parts of the *Glossography*. He also put the Kintyre schoolmaster Eóghan Mac Gilleóin in touch with Lhwyd as a possible source of assistance with old alphabets. [105] Mac Gilleóin wrote to Lhwyd from Campbeltown on 3 January 1700, that is, during Lhwyd's enforced stay there waiting to get back to Ireland. [106] Lhwyd's manuscript list notes Mac Gilleóin as a good writer and speaker of "ye language". Campbell & Thomson suggest he was Hugh or Ewan Maclean whose own manuscripts are in the National Library of Scotland and Trinity College Dublin. [107] These include a metrical glossary used by Lachlan; they hypothesize this was the manuscript Lachlan is known to have sent Lhwyd. The Trinity College Dublin catalogue lists a work by "Eoghan McGillein (Hugh McLén) of Cantire, Argyll in 1692 from whom Edward Lhuyd acquired it in 1700". [108] The physical proximity in time and place of Mac Gilleóin with Lhwyd suggests he helped with the Scottish Gaelic translation of *Dictionariolum Trilingue* which survives in Lhwyd's papers. No other evidence of contact between the two men survives.

Similar lists of queries were circulated to Robert Wodrow, whom Lhwyd met in Glasgow, and Rev James Fraser. The published volume of Wodrow's collected letters includes one dated 21 December 1699 to Nicolson. It is immediately followed by a transcription headed "Queries and things to be done in the Western Highlands". [109] The topics are the same as sent to Colin

---

[105] A. O'Sullivan and W. O'Sullivan, 'Edward Lhuyd's Collection of Irish Manuscripts', *The Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1962), 57- 76 at 70 & FN47.

[106] Eóghan Mac Gilleóin to Edward Lhwyd, 3 January 1700, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/84478252-7ffe-4b42-8132-2525db1bfafb accessed 1 September 2020.

[107] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 10.

[108] See catalogue record for IE TCD MS 1362 (formerly H.4.21) available at https://manuscripts.catalogue.tcd.ie/CalmView/Record.aspx?src=CalmView.Catalog&id=IE+TCD+MS+1362 accessed 21 November 2020.

[109] L.W. Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow* (Edinburgh: National Library of Scotland Scottish History Publications vol.24, 1937) at 32. This volume is available at https://digital.nls.uk/scottish-history-society-publications/browse/archive/125885880#?c=0&m=0&s=0&cv=0&xywh=-1377%2C-226%2C3727%2C4515 accessed 15 June 2020.

Campbell and follow the same numbering. [110] Lhwyd wrote to Fraser on 18 December 1699 from Falkirk with an almost identical list; there are a few tweaks to phrasing such as "Northern" rather than "Western" Ersh. [111] Perhaps Lhwyd carried a proforma to copy into his letters. As in Wales, clergy were the mainstay of the questionnaire approach. Wodrow was later ordained and Fraser, like Campbell, was a minister, in his case in Kirkhill near Inverness.

The questions fell into eight broad areas. The first was assistance with translating Ray's *Dictionariolum Trilingue* into "Western Ersh", that is, Gaelic. [112] *Dictionariolum Trilingue* was to prove the lynchpin of Lhwyd's comparative Celtic linguistic studies. It comprised a comparative Latin/Greek/English vocabulary prepared painstakingly by Ray who was meticulous in recording the proper terms in all three languages for fauna and flora. [113] Terms were classified under various headings, not alphabetically, and the format proved a useful base point for word lists in other languages.

The remaining seven questions covered names of local towns, rivers and other geographical features, descriptions of any old monuments or stones (especially if inscribed), amulets and charms, coins, old games and customs, particulars of writers in Ersh/Irish and their works and finally any purely Ersh Christian names. Lhwyd's preoccupation with naming, toponymy and stones of all kinds stands out.

---

[110] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 3.
[111] Edward Lhwyd to James Fraser, 18 December 1699, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/f2cdb85e-4b0e-4958-908e-c33d32a264c3 accessed 24 April 2020. This letter is to be found copied into MS Carte 269 in David Parry's writing.
[112] Edward Lhwyd to Rev. Colin Campbell, 20 December 1699. See FN 103 above.
[113] J.L. Campbell & D. Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 91.

Wodrow, later a Presbyterian minister and renowned historian, was then Librarian of Glasgow University. [114] He and Lhwyd were introduced by James Paterson, keeper of the university museum in Edinburgh, contact of Sibbald and acquaintance of Lachlan Campbell. [115] Lhwyd met Paterson whilst in Edinburgh. Wodrow and Lhwyd had a mutual correspondent in William Nicolson. Wodrow wrote to Nicolson on 21 December 1699 that the "curiouse" Lhwyd had been there that day and "is gone to Ireland by way of Kintyre." [116] The same day he wrote to Paterson "Mr Lhuyd is gone [….] this morning for Campbltoun. He came by Bathgate Hills". [117] Lhwyd's brief visit had a lasting impact on Wodrow. He refers to him in correspondence with others for some years. He mentions Lhwyd four times in another letter to Paterson. [118] Wodrow writes that Lhwyd spent one night with Castlecary and another with Mr Charles Maitland but no further evidence appears to exist about these stays or any subsequent contact between these men and Lhwyd. [119]

Wodrow expected to hear from Lhwyd in Campbeltown but in the event Lhwyd only wrote to him once he got to Ireland and this letter of 2 April 1700 took many months to reach Wodrow. [120] Wodrow refers to recent receipt of Lhwyd's April letter and packet of fossils writing to Nicolson that October. [121] Wodrow did not hear from Lhwyd again until June 1701. Meanwhile he tried to find out Lhwyd's whereabouts from various men, James Wallace, Sutherland and

[114] A.M. Starkey, 'Robert Wodrow and the History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland', *Church History,* Vol. 43, No. 4: (1974), 488-498 at 492.

[115] Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 123, FN 385.

[116] Robert Wodrow to William Nicolson, 21 December 1699, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow.*

[117] Robert Wodrow to James Paterson, 21 December 1699, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow.* Campbltoun is Wodrow's spelling.

[118] Robert Wodrow to James Paterson, 26 January 1700, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow.*

[119] ibid. Alexander Bailey of Castlecary; Maitland was brother of the Earl of Lauderdale. See Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow* at 37 FNs 1 and 2.

[120] Edward Lhwyd to Robert Wodrow, 2 April 1700. See FN 90 above.

[121] Robert Wodrow to William Nicolson, 18 October 1700, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow.*

Paterson. To Wallace he wrote that Lhwyd "is a very civil gentleman". [122] On the basis of one meeting and a subsequent handful of letters, Wodrow formed a very positive opinion of Lhwyd. He undertook to do all he could to encourage his contacts to take copies of *Archaeologia Britannica.* [123] Lhwyd's impact on him might be seen as part of Lhwyd's legacy from his Scottish tour. The overall tone of Wodrow's letters to or concerning Lhwyd are of a man in awe of Lhwyd's intellectual capabilities, wanting to share his own discoveries and offering to help in any way with queries for the Highlands and Western Isles. [124] It is an example of how Lhwyd could inspire younger men and draw on that emotional link to obtain their assistance. However, Wodrow's common interest with Lhwyd was primarily fossils; he longed for his own copy of *Lithophylacii Britannici Ichnographia.* [125] When Lhwyd resumed correspondence in 1701 he was looking for help with his Irish/English dictionary. [126] Either this was outwith Wodrow's knowledge or his adulation had waned. There is a long gap in correspondence until Wodrow's final letter to Lhwyd in 1709 replying to one from Lhwyd dated 22 May. Wodrow had been licenced in April 1703 and explains he has not the time for fossil studies he used to have. [127] Wodrow's surviving letters contain much about fossils and stone collecting but no suggestion of an interest in linguistics, the purpose for which Lhwyd had followed up their contact. Lhwyd's personality beguiled other men when they met face to face but he did not

---

[122] Robert Wodrow to James Wallace, 16 July 1700, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow*.

[123] Robert Wodrow to Edward Lhwyd, 10 September 1703, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/d063b080-c6da-4a33-b0d7-417a6f7a2f03 accessed 31 August 2020.

[124] ibid.

[125] This desire is mentioned repeatedly to different correspondents; writing to Lhwyd he enquires about a second edition in letters of 12 January 1702 and 10 September 1703, Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow*.

[126] Edward Lhwyd to Robert Wodrow, 24 June 1701 and 10 & 22 December 1703, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/40500a78-82a2-4227-a8b9-2c0d95862467
http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/84b0f277-c98f-481d-bec6-2ab7efc4d9a2
http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/2e4d6222-3ff7-4428-90bd-03ddbda70a07
accessed 17 June 2020.

[127] Robert Wodrow to Edward Lhwyd, 26 August 1709, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/9b8b0317-f88a-471d-856a-3059e2e9405b accessed 15 June 2020.

always make best use of these contacts subsequently, possibly because he failed to appreciate others may not be so enthralled by his current intellectual inquiry as he was.

In Edinburgh, as mentioned already, Lhwyd met James Sutherland, Professor of Botany and numismatist, whose collection of coins found in Scotland greatly impressed him and Sir Robert Sibbald, antiquarian, King's physician, natural historian and Geographer Royal. [128] Sibbald's systematic approach to antiquarianism and natural history had much in common with Lhwyd's. One of Lhwyd's notebooks contains the directions Sibbald gave Lhwyd to locate the Roman Antonine wall between the Forth and the Clyde. [129] Lhwyd's correspondence refers to inscriptions found on the Wall and in the Museum Balfourianum in Edinburgh. This latter must have been of some professional interest to him. The Museum was founded by Sir Andrew Balfour and was located in the College of Physicians. [130]

Once back in Ireland, Lhwyd finally met Rev. John Beaton, an Episcopalian minister at Kilninian on Mull who had been away when Lhwyd visited there. Beaton's ancestors were eminent Scottish physicians. He led a precarious existence and he may have been in Ireland in search of another parish. Lhwyd referred to him as a "poor sojourning Clergyman". [131] Beaton was described on Lhwyd's list of potential ancient manuscript owners as having a chestful, nearly all parchment, that chest being on Tiree.

---

[128] C.W.J. Withers, 'Geography, Science and National Identity in Early Modern Britain: The Case of Scotland and the Work of Sir Robert Sibbald (1641-1722)', *Annals of Science*, 53: (1996), 29-73 at 30.
[129] MS Carte 269 – see Appendix.
[130] The Museum is described in Guy Miège, *The Present State of Great Britain and Ireland: The Present State of Scotland* (London, 7th ed. 1731) at 56 available at https://books.google.co.uk/books accessed 17 June 2020.
[131] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963) at 12 & 22.

Campbell & Thomson posit the existence of a lost letter to Wodrow describing the meeting between Lhwyd and Beaton at Coleraine. [132] A close perusal of Wodrow's letters suggests its existence is debatable. In April 1701, Wodrow sent John McLean Lhwyd's standard list of queries on the premise that, as McLean was returning home to Mull, he might encounter Beaton there. Wodrow wrote "I had in summer last ane account of a very ancient MSS. by a line from Mr Ed. Lhuyd in Ireland that was then in the hands of Mr Beaton." [133]

Campbell infers from this the existence of a letter written in summer 1700 by Lhwyd to Wodrow describing the meeting with Beaton. However, as mentioned earlier, Wodrow's first letter from Lhwyd after the two met in Glasgow was from Ireland in April 1700 and did not reach him for several months. There is no mention of Beaton or a manuscript. Meanwhile Wodrow explicitly states elsewhere he has not heard from Lhwyd. [134] A lost letter seems unlikely. Perhaps Wodrow, at that time apt to make much of his connection with Lhwyd, recalled discussion from their own meeting in Glasgow of Beaton as a potential keeper of manuscripts.

Instead, information about the encounter between Lhwyd and Beaton comes from two sources. There is Sibbald's copy of a letter Lhwyd sent on 20 April 1700 to the botanist Richard Richardson. [135] There is Nicolson's description of Lhwyd's account to him of the meeting in

---

[132] ibid at 13.

[133] Robert Wodrow to John McLean, 13 April 1701, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow*.

[134] Robert Wodrow to Archdeacon Nicolson, 18 October 1700, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow* at 118.

[135] Edward Lhwyd to Richard Richardson, 20 April 1700, copy by Sir Robert Sibbald, as reproduced in J.L. Campbell, 'Unpublished Letters by Edward Lhuyd in the National Library of Scotland', *Celtica* vol 11 (1976) 34-42 at 37. The letter is also available at H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/587d1892-2b19-49eb-b4d0-322d9ebe1d6e accessed 25 June 2020.

his *Scottish Historical Library*. [136] The meeting with Beaton was fruitful both as to Scottish Gaelic and as to folklore and place names on Mull and surrounding areas. What Lhwyd gathered from this meeting will be considered in detail later in this dissertation. The amount of information the encounter yielded suggests the two men met over several days.

In Galway, Lhwyd met Roderic O'Flaherty the renowned Irish scholar; O'Flaherty was by then over seventy. Lhwyd was aware of O'Flaherty's work "*Ogygia*" (broadly a history of ancient Ireland published in 1685) although there is no evidence he read it closely nor indeed how long the two men spent together. He had first sought an introduction to O'Flaherty in 1698. [137] They remained in touch until at least April 1708, the date of their last surviving letter.

Lhwyd's hopes of O'Flaherty's ability to translate old Irish manuscripts were apparently not fulfilled. He wrote to Richardson from Cornwall the following October:

> "I brought over about 30 Irish manuscripts all upon parchment, and so ancient that their Chiefest Antiquary Mr Flaherty (Author of the *Ogygia*) could hardly interpret one Sentence of them: […] They contein litle of Authentic History excepting what is insignificant, their Genealogies." [138]

---

[136] As cited in Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 12.

[137] Edward Lhwyd to Thomas Molyneux, 18 October 1698, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/9c0b8d56-d8f9-4cce-b10e-cfb6ed0760c8 accessed 6 October 2020.

[138] Edward Lhwyd to Richard Richardson, 21 October 1700, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/62bbde20-ef96-48c9-b4eb-a0022285798f accessed 25 June 2020.

One might wonder how Lhwyd knew they contained little of authentic history, if he could not read them. He wrote to Humphrey Wanley in January 1702/3 that "the want of a dictionary has made almost all the Irish parchment MSS. unintelligible". He reckoned he could read printed books but not manuscripts. [139] This may have been because of the old script used. Genealogies require less detailed knowledge to follow. Sharpe suggests the age and tenor of the old language were also an issue.[140] These experiences may have made Lhwyd determined to include enough material in his *Glossography* for others to acquire some knowledge of Irish/Gaelic more readily than he had been able to.

One man whom Lhwyd failed to meet on his journey was the Gaelic speaker Martin, a native of the Isle of Skye. Rev. John Macqueen of Edinburgh suggested Martin as a useful contact for Lhwyd in a letter of 21 February 1697/8. [141] Sibbald also knew Martin. [142] Lhwyd appears to have tried to make contact during his journey; in November 1702, Martin wrote that he never got Lhwyd's letter from Kintyre. [143]

Martin had embarked on a project not dissimilar to Lhwyd's and visited the Scottish Islands around the same time. He aimed to cover every island, including far distant St Kilda. In 1703 *A Description of the Western Highlands of Scotland* was published. [144] Martin asserted the

---

[139] Edward Lhwyd to Humphrey Wanley, 6 January 1702/3, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd*.

[140] R. Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 106.

[141] John MacQueen to Edward Lhwyd, 21 February 1697/8, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/b92eb577-13ce-477d-986c-4cd8dbdf42ff accessed 6 October 2020.

[142] M. Robson, ed., *Curiosities of Art and Nature* (Ness: The Islands Book Trust, 2003) at xiii.

[143] Martin Martin to Edward Lhwyd, 17 November 1702, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/7dca84f8-d214-49e8-a308-00d5279bdceb accessed 1 September 2020.

[144] M. Martin, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* (London: Andrew Bell, 1703). Edition reproduced in M. Robson, ed., *Curiosities of Art and Nature* (Ness: The Islands Book Trust, 2003).

authority of his work by saying in the preface that this is the first such work by a native or one who had travelled there. Martin's interest in the people and their customs was combined with "a clear- sighted scientific outlook." [145] Like Lhwyd, he was methodical and grounded his writing in factual observations of human and natural history. [146] He too, although from a less disinterested perspective, rebutted any suggestion of the barbarity of the inhabitants. [147] He was to influence one of the best-known journeys to Scotland in the eighteenth century, that of Dr Johnson and Samuel Boswell.

Martin wrote a comprehensive work of extensive detail, recording as much as he could of note for each island and living up to his title. His work is not dissimilar in that regard to Plot on Oxfordshire and Staffordshire. This was in marked contrast to Lhwyd, who was gathering information to a different end, the making of parallel observations across the Celtic territories. Both men visited Mull and Iona. This is pretty much the common ground of their endeavours.

In October 1702 Martin wrote to Guthrie he had not yet been to Oxford but still hoped to meet Lhwyd. [148] Martin spent time in London arranging his work's publication but the pressures of publishing *Glossography* tied Lhwyd to Oxford. Lhwyd's annotated copy of *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* is in the Bodleian Library. [149] Although Martin and Lhwyd corresponded, there is no evidence they ever met and only Martin's side of their correspondence has survived.

---

[145] Goring, ed. '*Scotland The Autobiography*', at 101.
[146] M. Robson, ed., *Curiosities of Art and Nature* at vii.
[147] M. Martin, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* at 345.
[148] Martin Martin to Gideon Guthrie, 17 October 1702 in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/ca991db0-a7e3-462f-a6d1-459e0db0d0ce accessed 1 September 2020.
[149] B.F. Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd (c.1660 – 1709): Folklorist', *Folklore* vol 120 April (2009) 36-56 at 49.

GLOSSOGRAPHY

From Ireland, Lhwyd went to Wales, Cornwall and Brittany, returning to Oxford in 1701. For the next seven years, Lhwyd's life was dominated by writing and getting into print *Glossography* (volume 1 of *Archaeologia Britannica*). It was published in 1707. There is evidence of work for a second volume but no substantive draft survives. [150]

The time taken to produce *Glossography* suggests Lhwyd struggled with the volume of material gathered during and after his four-year journey. The manuscript was ready to be printed by 1703 but the process of getting it turned into print proved tedious and time consuming. [151] Lhwyd travelled little after his grand tour, other than one visit to Cambridge. His assistants Will Jones and Hugh Griffiths undertook further research on his behalf in London.

In *Glossography*, Lhwyd writes in and about Welsh, Irish and Cornish, addresses Breton and Manx and does make some attempt to differentiate Scottish Gaelic from Irish. The thrust of his work is to gather and present information to facilitate understanding of the Celtic languages by scholars, to use them himself in the text and to make and reflect on comparisons between the languages to gain a better insight into their origins.

Roberts describes *Glossography* as "a remarkable achievement" with "its innovative and structured methodology for establishing the affinities of languages". It was the:

---

[150] Evans & Roberts*, Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 24/5.
[151] Morris, ed., 'Parochialia being a summary of answers to 'Parochial Queries'', at vii.

"…first truly comparative compendium of Celtic languages […] significant milestone in the history of European comparative linguistics […] not […] matched until the advent of the new philology of the nineteenth century". [152]

Within *Glossography*, Lhwyd wrote prefaces using Welsh, Cornish and Irish. O'Flaherty criticised this conceptually by observing how few would understand them. This criticism highlights a paradox in producing an academic work intended, inter alia, to preserve languages. Using those languages within the work to argue for their preservation immediately limits access to those already conversant with the languages, rather than others who might be converted to the cause of support. At the same time, putting their use into print validates the languages as worthy of academic attention. Sharpe says "[i]t is a striking testimony to Lhwyd's boldness that he composed a preface in Irish despite having very limited experience of the language." [153]

The preface contained errors, archaisms and little knowledge of idiom. In 1724, Nicolson arranged an English translation, probably because it was here that Lhwyd set out his detailed arguments for promoting access to the Celtic languages. These can be summarised as the preservation of ancient European languages to access their literature, laws and history, to explain person and place names, understand etymology (including Latin and Greek) and assist clergymen with non-English speaking congregations in Celtic areas. This argument came last. Religion does not figure widely in Lhwyd's writings and does not seem to have played an important role in what is known of his life but he appreciated that it could provide one practical

---

[152] Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at I.
[153] Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 141.

rationale for Celtic language studies, albeit one that could be turned on its head by also giving an argument for universal education in English.

Glossography has two chapters specific to Irish and thus of use to Scottish Gaelic users or learners. Chapter XI "A Brief Introduction to the Irish or Ancient Scottish Language" is a grammar heavily derived from one by F. O' Molloy. Martin had expedited a loan of Hans Sloane's copy of this work to Lhwyd in 1701. [154] Lhwyd's attempts to find other grammars apparently came to nothing. In January 1702/3 Wanley had referred to the Duke of Argyll having a manuscript Grammar & Lexicon "for the High-land Irish". [155] Lhwyd replied over a year later: "the Highland Grammar and Lexicon, […] is what I never heard of, and shall be heartily obliged if you can procure me the use of them." [156]

Nothing survives to suggest Wanley did so; it could have added a further dimension to Lhwyd's comparative work to have access to a specifically Scottish Gaelic grammar. The Earl (Duke as of 1701) of Argyll had his traditional home at Inveraray, on Lhwyd's route through the Highlands. It seems curious that, if such a work existed, Lhwyd had not been aware of it earlier. Lachlan Campbell after all had worked as a tutor in the Argyll household. No other reference to a Highland Grammar and Lexicon has been located.

---

[154] ibid at 124.

[155] Humfrey [sic]Wanley to Edward Lhwyd, 29 January 1702/3, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/7f49ba8c-7868-4b4a-91db-4d65ef2eeaf1 accessed 13 November 2020.

[156] Edward Lhwyd to Humphrey Wanley, 8 February 1703, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd*.

Chapter X is an Irish: English dictionary. This is Lhwyd's original work. Manuscript materials preparatory to this survive in Lhwyd's papers in Trinity College Dublin.[157] Lhwyd wrote in English, translated into Irish and sent this draft to an unknown Dublin professor whose notes also survive. He used his copy of Plunket's 1662 Latin and Irish dictionary. It is a copy in the true sense, having been transcribed for him from that owned by the Archbishop of Dublin. Thomas Molyneux organised this for him in 1702 with a fine of ten pounds if Lhwyd did not return it within six months.[158] Lhwyd was unaware of this dictionary before his travels.[159]

The dictionary was one of the first parts of *Glossography* to be printed. As such, Lhwyd was able to circulate pages for comment and recorded in the Preface that he sent it to three (unnamed) readers in each of Ireland and Scotland. Of these, only Lachlan Campbell and O'Flaherty are known to have responded.[160] Arthur Brownlow of Lurgan wrote to Lhwyd pleading lack of time and skill for reviewing the sheets sent to him.[161] Rowlands reviewed the lexicon with a mutual friend Mr Fitzgerald, but found it too difficult to get someone sufficiently conversant with Irish to help.[162]

Sharpe identifies Martin as one of the recipients of the early print of the Irish dictionary.[163] In a letter of 1 June 1703, Martin includes a word list with comments on pronunciation. He adds

---

[157] See Appendix.
[158] Thomas Molyneux to Edward Lhwyd, 10 November 1702, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/bf3a7d20-0160-4ad3-9e1e-3df955147585 , accessed 22 June 2020.
[159] Considine, *Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* at 133.
[160] Sharpe, 'Lachlan Campbell's Letters to Edward Lhwyd 1704-7' at 244.
[161] Arthur Brownlow to Edward Lhwyd, 10 June 1704, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/184aecb4-111b-4883-8c75-a312db552653 accessed 2 July 2020.
[162] Henry Rowlands to Edward Lhwyd, 29 June 1704 and 5 July 1704, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/30f54204-904a-482f-9014-fa8a6b32c826 accessed 2 July 2020.
[163] Sharpe, 'Lachlan Campbell's Letters to Edward Lhwyd 1704-7' at 249.

"I have no account from Scotland concerning your Queries". [164] Possibly this refers to the dictionary but it might also be Lhwyd's standard questionnaire. Martin told Lhwyd he was never taught to read his native language. [165] His letters to Lhwyd repeatedly stress his lack of ability in Irish/Gaelic. He was no doubt sensitive to the difference between a native speaker able to communicate on everyday matters and having scholarly literacy in a language. Yet the former would have been sufficient for Lhwyd's purposes, indeed precisely what he wanted. Perhaps if the two men had met Martin would have overcome his diffidence and provided exactly the help Lhwyd was looking for. The connection men formed with Lhwyd when he met them face to face suggests he in no way came over as intellectually intimidating.

Lhwyd also prevailed upon Sibbald. On 16 July 1703, Sibbald wrote "I did recommend the Questions to be proposed anent the Language of the Highlanders, to my Worthy friend Mr Archbald Campbell". [166] Whether this refers to the dictionary or a questionnaire there is no evidence of a response. [167]

Five letters survive from Lachlan Campbell to Lhwyd. [168] Campbell was, like Martin, diffident about his Gaelic but his written annotations to the dictionary sheets were systematic and informed. [169] Campbell by this time was ordained. Familiar with the Bible but with no secular

[164] Martin Martin to Edward Lhwyd, 1 June 1703, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/80e5102b-0ce5-4294-945f-b956d70192ae accessed 29 June 2020.

[165] Martin Martin to Edward Lhwyd, 22 December 1702, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/e37594b0-0e92-4d06-bef5-b4c577dbf317 accessed 28 June 2020.

[166] Sir Robert Sibbald to Edward Lhwyd, 16 July 1703, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/afcf6f22-feb7-4793-840b-ba75321fde8e accessed 29 June 2020.

[167] R. Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 122-3.

[168] It is apparent from references in the surviving letters that there were others.

[169] Sharpe, 'Lachlan Campbell's Letters to Edward Lhwyd 1704-7' at 249.

Scottish Gaelic books then available, perhaps he felt out of his depth with vocabulary beyond that required for preaching and everyday conversation with his congregation. His first surviving letter shows his appreciation of how Lhwyd's work could give Scottish Gaelic status and recognition, but also reflects on the difficulty of reading the older manuscripts. [170] Campbell died in 1707 and may never have seen *Glossography* in print.

There were substantial time lags in the circulation of proof pages between Lhwyd, Campbell and O'Flaherty. [171] In January 1705, Campbell acknowledges receipt of twenty-two pages noting that three of the five months allowed for his comments had already expired. He annotated as "Scot" what he saw as distinctively Scottish Gaelic terms. [172] Further comments followed in April 1705. O'Flaherty objected to the identification of words as specifically Scottish. [173] Whilst Campbell had experience of Gaelic in both Scotland and Ireland it is not evident that O'Flaherty had knowledge of how the language was spoken in Scotland. The slow and tortuous process of printing and correction (around one sheet a week) meant Lhwyd was unable to amend sheets to reflect their input, instead publishing an appendix, recording for the first time Scottish Gaelic dialect words. [174]

---

[170] Lachlan Campbell to Edward Lhwyd, 11 July 1704, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/df248ed0-f9ab-4604-9e0d-caa7db4905ac accessed 2 July 2020.

[171] Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 128.

[172] Lachlan Campbell to Edward Lhwyd, 17 January 1705, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/9d2bbf12-0306-4e56-9209-b65bb11871e3 accessed 2 July 2020.

[173] Roderick O'Flaherty to Edward Lhwyd, 29 August 1705, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/332cc6ab-dc1b-4084-9f4f-a5c48302677e accessed 3 July 2020. He makes the same comment later in a letter of 28 May 1706.

[174] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 229-231.

During these years, Lhwyd finally achieved tangible academic recognition. In Summer 1701, the Chancellor of University of Oxford admitted him MA on his merits and on condition of giving an annual lecture. In 1708, he was elected Fellow of the Royal Society. [175] He died on 30 June 1709, shortly after being appointed Senior Beadle in Divinity, and probably not yet fifty.

There were hopes that Lhwyd's young assistant Parry, who accompanied him throughout all his travels and succeeded him as Keeper of the Ashmolean, might complete his work. Parry became an alcoholic and proved incapable either of bringing out a second volume of *Archaeologia Britannica* (which granted would have been a substantial challenge) or managing Lhwyd's papers. [176] Years of a close working relationship with Lhwyd perhaps rendered him unable to manage alone, both emotionally and practically. Parry died in 1714 aged about thirty-two. Nancy Edwards' observation that "there was no one in Oxford or elsewhere who could bring his work to fruition" is apposite. [177]

---

[175] Owen, *British Remains or a Collection of Antiquities relating to the Britons & c.*

[176] A. Macgregor, *The Ashmolean Museum* (Oxford: Ashmolean Museum Oxford in association with Jonathan Horne Publications London, 2001) at 24.

[177] N. Edwards, 'Edward Lhuyd and the Origins of Early Medieval Celtic Archaeology', *The Antiquaries Journal* 87: (2007), 165-96 at 188.

ASSESSMENT OF LHWYD'S SCOTTISH RESEARCH

CONTRIBUTION TO SCOTTISH GAELIC

There was no settled term to differentiate the Gaelic spoken in Scotland around 1700. Lhwyd and Lachlan Campbell used the terms E[a]rsh (both Western and Northern) and Scottish Irish. [178]. "Western" Ersh cannot be western from the perspective of Ireland so perhaps by Ersh was intended the subset of Gaelic dialects spoken in Scotland. In his Cornish preface in *Glossography* Lhwyd went for totally different phrases "Caledonian, or Scotch-British". [179] Rowlands used the term "Highlandish" when suggesting Lhwyd list the principal words of all British dialects. [180] Martin was also unsure what to call his native language. He attributed to the natives of Eriskay the most perfect "Irish". [181] Elsewhere he used "Earsh". His use of two different words may have confused Dr Johnson, whose journey to the Hebrides he was to inspire. Johnson appears to have assumed there were two different languages, of which E[a]rsh referred to a solely spoken Scottish language. On this basis, Johnson dismissed Scottish Gaelic culture and such was his intellectual influence that this view resonated for many decades. [182]

Having started to learn Gaelic long before his journey, Lhwyd explained in the Preface to *Glossography* that travelling had not assisted in developing his proficiency to the extent hoped.

---

[178] Lachlan Campbell to Edward Lhwyd, 17 January 1705.

[179] Lhwyd, *Archæologia Britannica*, as reproduced in Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 151.

[180] Henry Rowlands to Edward Lhwyd, 5 February 1703, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/39c5991c-528d-41ea-92eb-a0c20e26a1ca accessed 29 June 2020.

[181] Martin, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* as reproduced in Robson, ed., Curiosities of Art and Nature at 87/8.

[182] Ferguson, 'Samuel Johnson's Views on Scottish Gaelic Culture'.

The class of men he met in Scotland spoke English. He wrote to Richardson how enquiries might have gone better "had we the language more perfect". [183] Brought up a dual Welsh/English speaker and educated as a boy in Latin, Lhwyd the adult perhaps underestimated the challenge of learning Gaelic, especially given the paucity of available materials.

Lhwyd had a nuanced understanding of dialect and appreciated there were different dialects within Scotland. From his meeting with Beaton, he wrote "every shire in Scotland has a different Dialect, but that of Mull is esteem'd the purest Irish next unto that of Connacht Irish in Ireland". [184] Beaton, unsurprisingly as a native of that island, must have spoken up for Mull.

Lhwyd had limited success acquiring Scottish Gaelic manuscripts whilst in Scotland. Lachlan Campbell later mentioned sending him one, possibly aware of this lack. [185] Through his encounter with Beaton, Lhwyd did gain access to at least one. Beaton showed Lhwyd "three very Large Leavs on parchment, of the Work of one Carbri Lefarhair in Irish". [186] Lhwyd speculated this might be the oldest writing in the British Isles, should Beaton's dating of 200 be correct. Lhwyd hoped O'Flaherty might translate it since Beaton's knowledge of old Irish was inadequate. It seems Lhwyd took some sheets away. [187] He also made detailed notes

[183] Edward Lhwyd to Richard Richardson, 17 December 1699, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/37f14481-2fcc-4ed5-a645-4889c70e4e8a accessed 24 April 2020.

[184] J.L. Campbell, ed., *A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes: copied by Edward Lhuyd from the manuscript of the Rev. James Kirkwood (1650-1709) and annotated by him with the aid of the Rev. John Beaton* (Cambridge: D.S. Brewer Ltd & Rowman & Littlefield for the Folklore Society, 1975) at 21-2.

[185] Perhaps the metrical glossary – see p.31.

[186] Edward Lhwyd to Richard Richardson, 20 April 1700.

[187] Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 105.

regarding manuscripts which Beaton had owned but which had been destroyed, possibly in feuds on Mull which blighted Beaton's life. [188]

From notes in Welsh in one of Lhwyd's notebooks, Derrick Thomson concluded what Beaton shared with Lhwyd was part of a fourteenth century manuscript now in the National Library of Scotland whose provenance was hitherto unknown. [189] Lhwyd referred to it as *Lhyvyr Lhydan*; otherwise it is known as Beaton's "Broad Book". The scribe has also been identified. [190] There is a copy by Beaton for Lhwyd in another notebook which Campbell & Thomson conclude is the same manuscript. The manuscript held in the National Library of Scotland is damaged so this other copy has filled gaps in the text. [191]

Lhwyd's surviving notebooks contain significant material on Scottish Gaelic words and dialects. He also had access to Robert Kirk's word list. This was a first attempt to assemble a Scottish Gaelic word list, based on about a sixth of Ray's *Dictionariolum Trilingue*. [192] The purpose was to supplement his Bible translation. Nicolson printed the list, with annotations from Lhwyd, as an appendix to his 1702 *Scottish Historical Library*.

Until Gunther gathered Lhwyd's letters for publication in 1945, it had not been appreciated that Lhwyd himself made a Scottish Gaelic translation of Ray's *Dictionariolum Trilingue*. It

[188] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 37-46.
[189] ibid at 13 and 47-51. Details of the manuscript's current cataloguing in the National Library of Scotland can be found at https://manuscripts.nls.uk/repositories/2/resources/20254 accessed 20 June 2020.
[190] T. Ó Concheanainn, 'The Scribe of John Beaton's 'Broad Book'', *Ériu,* 26: (1975), 99-101.

[191] Sharpe disagreed and considered that the works are not identical. See Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 104.
[192] J.L. Campbell, 'An Early Scottish Gaelic Vocabulary', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 5: (1942), 76-93 at 76.

was wrongly assumed that the Scottish Gaelic appendix in *Archaeologia Britannica* constituted the full output from his researches. [193] However, in one of Lhwyd's notebooks, *Dictionariolum Trilingue* is used as a prompt for an English: Scottish Gaelic wordlist. Lhwyd listed against one column 1,665 words in Argyllshire Gaelic. [194] The list was compiled during the enforced stay on Kintyre. [195] Alongside are written Inverness-shire words (in Lhwyd's handwriting and Parry's) provided by one R. Stewart, who visited Oxford in August 1704. [196] Lhwyd also asked Colin Campbell for help with translation into his "Western Ersh" but if this was forthcoming it has been lost. [197] Sutherland wrote to Wodrow in December 1702 that Lhwyd wanted "curious gentlemen of your acquaintance in the Highlands conversant in Irish manuscripts" and asked on Lhwyd's behalf about chief Irish dialects in Scotland, wanting examples of words from each. [198] Possibly this led to the contact with Stewart. These comparative lists represent "a uniquely valuable contribution to dialect studies […] a record in Welsh orthography of some Irish and Scottish-Gaelic dialects as they existed in 1700". [199]

In the same notebook, Lhwyd reproduced in Welsh spelling how Beaton spoke two chapters of Genesis from Kirk's Scottish Gaelic Bible. Lhwyd had a penetrating intellect; he realised that a scientific approach to the study of language required consideration of pronunciation as well as written words. Elsewhere he recorded phonetically what might loosely be described as useful

---

[193] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 93.
[194] Considine*, Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* at 132
[195] Edward Lhwyd to [Thomas Molyneux], 29 January 1699/ 1700, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/7ba77bb4-7dc2-4538-bbeb-c4345915168c accessed 24 April 2020.
[196] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 92/3.
[197] Edward Lhwyd to Rev. Colin Campbell, 20 December 1699. See FN 103 above.
[198] Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 122.
[199] A. & W. O'Sullivan, Introduction to E. Lhwyd's *Archaeologia Britannica*, (Shannon: Irish University Press, 1971) at v.

phrases for a traveller. [200] Anne and William O'Sullivan consider it unique as a record of pronunciation. [201] Campbell &Thomson see the Beaton records as evidence of a classical Gaelic still widely used and understood around 1700. [202]

Emery considers that the notebooks' contents "extend the study of Scottish Gaelic a full generation beyond its first showing in print." [203] Campbell & Thomson stress their significance as "an outstanding contribution to both Scottish Gaelic lexicography and dialectology". [204] They took "the formal study of the vocabulary of Scottish Gaelic back a full generation". [205] Lhwyd "originated not only research on spoken Gaelic dialects, but comparative Celtic philology itself, and was at least one hundred and fifty years before his time." [206] We can only speculate as to what use Lhwyd might have made of this data had he lived longer. The mere act of collation has proved of lasting value.

Lhwyd's use of comparative word lists stemmed from his study of toponyms as evidence of linguistic history and development. Aubrey had shared his investigations into English placenames with potentially Welsh, not Anglo-Saxon, roots and the notion that "[l]inguistic traces […] were indicators of previous cultural exchange" [207] In a letter to Mr Babington of 14 October 1703, Lhwyd reviewed Welsh and Scottish river names for a common root. This

---

[200] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 223-8.
[201] A. & W. O'Sullivan, Introduction to E. Lhwyd's *Archaeologia Britannica*, at v, FN1.
[202] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 77.
[203] Emery, *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709*, at 87.
[204] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 93-4.
[205] J.L. Campbell, 'The Contribution of Edward Lhuyd to the Study of Scottish Gaelic', *The Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1962), 77-80 at 79.
[206] J. L. Campbell, 'Scottish Gaelic Translations of John Ray's Dictionariolum Trilingue', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 9: (1961), 89-90 at 90.
[207] Williams, *The Antiquary: John Aubrey's Historical Scholarship* at 141.

technique from his study of toponymy led to his insights into Celtic languages. [208] Here is the first surviving reference to "his great philological discovery". [209] Lhwyd wrote "I am troubled with an Hypothesis of C Britons & P Britons". This hypothesis was ground-breaking in Celtic studies. Lhwyd had noticed that where Welsh used "p" as in *pump* (five), Gaelic used "c" as in *coig*. Hence "C" Britons start words with C where "P" Britons use P. Further examples included *cean* and *pen* (head), *cathair* and *pedwar* (four), *clann* and *plant* (children) and *cran* and *pren* (tree). He conjectures that Gaelic has no word purely its own beginning with P; instead, they are all Welsh words beginning with C. He had found a common root in both languages. The similarities between Welsh, Cornish and Breton had long been noted but Lhwyd had brought Gaelic into the mix.

Considine attempts to pinpoint the moment when Lhwyd made this connection. One notebook contains a Northern Irish wordlist which Considine dates to between August 1699 and the autumn crossing to Scotland. Equivalent words in Welsh were noted against this list, leading Lhwyd to make the connection. Considine concludes these words were added whilst in Scotland. Perhaps Lhwyd shared his insight with Colin Campbell. Campbell's praise poem alludes to the insights into Scottish Gaelic yielded by Lhwyd's comparative studies.

Lhwyd developed this further in *Glossography*. He approached his study of words in the same manner as he had earlier classified his collections of fossils and shells. He recognised the need

---

[208] Edward Lhwyd to Mr Babington, 14 October 1703, in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd*.

[209] Considine*, Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* at 131 and 168.

to look beyond artificial or accidental differences created by spelling to similarities in pronunciation or by substituting other letters to find common roots.

> "Etymology ceases to be a list of words more or less similar in sound but becomes a series of sound changes in which a pattern of conditions and contexts could be discerned." [210]

This was "the first serious attempt to apply scholarly principles of etymology to the Celtic languages". [211] Lhwyd found another correlation with S and H, for example Gaelic *samhradh* and Welsh *haf* (summer) or *salen* and *halen* (salt). When he came to make additions to Kirk's Scottish Gaelic wordlist published in the appendix to Nicolson's *The Scottish Historical Library* (1702), he included lists of words in Welsh/Latin/Irish which demonstrated his first letter theory with examples for the letter pairs P/C, H/S and also G/F. These conclusions anticipated many discoveries in nineteenth century comparative philology. [212] Instead of assembling word lists as an end in themselves, as Ray had done, Lhwyd turned them into an analytical tool from which he demonstrated "the unity of the group of languages which we now call Celtic." [213]

From studying river names, he hypothesized how Britons populated the British Isles from Continental Europe. Scottish river names such as Tay and Nid are similar to the Welsh ones Tawy and Nedd. The Gaelic for water *uisge* is unlike the Welsh *dwr* but Wales has a River Usk and England Rivers Ex and Ax. Taking the hypothesis that place names were a vestige of

---

[210] Roberts, *Edward Lhuyd The Making of a Scientist*, at 21.
[211] Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 17.
[212] Emery, *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709* at 81.
[213] Considine, *Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* at 143.

cultural change, he suggested "C" Britons colonised Britain first and were then pushed north and west by "P" Britons. [214] Lhwyd's theory is now discounted but that does not diminish his skill in making connections unnoticed before. [215] Lhwyd realised that languages, toponymy and an appreciation of ancient manuscripts were the key to Celtic history.

In the last extant letter from Lhwyd to Colin Campbell, Lhwyd explains how his next volume (never to come to fruition) will develop his theories about how language demonstrates the movement of peoples further. He collates Welsh, Cornish, Armoric & Irish under the one term "Celtique", possibly his first use of the term for that purpose. This offers some suggestion of what he had planned to include although most likely his ideas were still evolving. [216]

Lhwyd's *Glossography* continued to exert influence. Emery cites G.J. William's' comments that his work on comparative etymology was "of stunning originality" and his "brilliant analysis…was not fully appreciated until long after his death." [217] David Cram wrote that his "monumental work exerted a profound but covert influence on comparative philology in the nineteenth century". [218] The Celtic scholar Sir John Rhŷs considered him "the greatest Celtic philologist the world has ever seen". [219] His suggestion that the Irish and the Scots were the original inhabitants of the islands of the United Kingdom established the notion which was to become commonplace by the early nineteenth century that the Celts were the pre-Roman

---

[214] Edward Lhwyd to Mr Babington, 14 October 1703.
[215] K. MacKinnon 'Scottish Gaelic Today' in M.J. Ball and N. Müller, *The Celtic Languages* at 587.
[216] Edward Lhwyd to Colin Campbell, 22 August 1707, (as transcribed by Dr Dòmhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart), H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/profile/work/9640399e-4afc-43c4-b594-d7860bf42609 accessed 12 June 2020.
[217] Emery, *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709* at 75.
[218] As cited in Considine, *Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* at 145.
[219] As cited in Daniel, 'Edward Lhwyd: Antiquary and Archaeologist' at 345. Sir John Rhŷs (1840-1915) was the first professor of Celtic at the University of Oxford (1877) and was Principal of Jesus College (1895).

inhabitants of Britain. [220] The connections Lhwyd recognised were subsequently seen by some as evidence of an ancient Celtic identity. [221]

The publication of *Glossography* also brought attention to Gaelic in a different way. The work includes eleven commendatory or praise poems addressed to Lhwyd. They merit inclusion in a review of his contribution to Scottish Gaelic, not because they add to the ground breaking insights mentioned above, but because they were an opportunity for the language to be used in a published work likely to command a wide intellectual audience. They are also tangible evidence of the respect Lhwyd earned by his work. Of the eleven, four are in Scottish Gaelic and seven are by Scotsmen. It was Lachlan Campbell who suggested to Colin Campbell they might commission poems after O'Flaherty composed a praise poem in Latin for inclusion in *Glossography*. Their approaches to possible contributors appear to account for the preponderance of Scottish writers. [222] Colin Campbell himself wrote one in Latin and John Mclean from Mull, whose assistance Wodrow had sought for Lhwyd, wrote in Gaelic. [223] The various poets were not mainstream intellectuals. Little is known about Robert Campbell, a forester from Argyll, Semus mhac Mhuir, clergyman of Islay or Anndra Mac Ghill-Eóin, a tacksman from Tiree, or how they might have come into contact with Lhwyd. [224] Perhaps they are slender evidence of a further raft of contacts from the journey for which we now have no details. The poems all evince immense gratitude to Lhwyd in giving the language status. They contain phrases (translated) such as "[h]e has restored to the Gaels […] things which had ebbed

---

[220] Collis, *The Celts Origins Myths* at 73.
[221] Roberts, *The Celts Search for a Civilization* at 232.
[222] Evans & Roberts, *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* at 26.
[223] Lhwyd, *Archaeologia Britannica Commendatory Poems*, as reproduced in Evans & Roberts at 66-104.
[224] ibid at 67, 90 and 92.

away" and "[t]he hardy language which was under a cloud has been roused by you from the grave". [225]

Sharpe suggests Lhwyd "felt the need to display this evidence of approval from natives who spoke the languages". [226] At the same time, *Glossography* had created an unprecedented opportunity for poetry to be composed and published in Scottish Gaelic. It had been hitherto largely unpublished outside of religious texts. [227]

One final, slightly different take, on contemporary Gaelic is Lhwyd's comments in a letter to John Morton written about three months after leaving Scotland. Lhwyd observed that the Scottish Gaelic speaker understands Irish as well as a Southern Englishman understands Scottish. [228] By Scottish he apparently meant a man resident in Scotland speaking English. The implication is that there is some common understanding but also divergence. Either in the course of a few weeks Lhwyd achieved a very nuanced understanding of the difference between Gaelic as spoken in Scotland or as in Ireland, or else he repeats the observation of another, perhaps Beaton who would have been well placed to observe such differences. It is an interesting contemporaneous reflection on the divergence of the two Gaelic languages by 1700.

The insights and theories that Lhwyd had published in *Glossography* emerged just as Scottish Gaelic was being side-lined in favour of English for the educated classes. Whilst not

---

[225] ibid at 75 and 93.
[226] Sharpe, *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709* at 139.
[227] Black, 'A Handlist of Gaelic Printed Books 1567-1800'.
[228] Edward Lhwyd to John Morton, 15 May 1700.

approaching the devastation later wrought by the clearances, its use was increasingly seen as by and for the common people of the Highlands and Islands. Lhwyd may have been aware of the 1616 Act which sought to obliterate the language; his work may in part have aimed to address such hostility. The praise poems to Lhwyd were written by men conscious of the increasing tendency to alienate Gaelic from use by educated Scotsmen. Lhwyd's work is important in taking a snapshot of Scottish Gaelic at a moment in time. Even riddles recorded on blank pages in an Oxford almanack acquire significance. They were the first written records of Scottish Gaelic riddles. (Since the Almanack is dated 1703 perhaps Lhwyd's source was the mysterious R Stewart, his 1704 visitor.) [229]

After Lhwyd, word lists and dictionaries were created so Scottish Gaelic speakers could learn English. Schools were encouraged to use English. [230] Campbell & Thomson lament the losses to Scottish Gaelic culture by the failure (their perception) to support Lhwyd's work but it cemented the place of Scottish Gaelic as a Celtic language and thereby gave it academic standing. [231]

CONTRIBUTIONS TO SCOTTISH ARCHAEOLOGY AND BOTANY

Whilst much of Lhwyd's legacy from his visit to Scotland was linguistic, his stated purpose for the journey was also to look at matters historical and geographical. His *Parochial Queries*, as amended for use in Scotland, requested details of barrows, stone monuments of all kinds and

---

[229] Campbell & Thomson at 220-2. They appear in Manuscript IE TCD MS 1380 – see Appendix.
[230] There was some movement for Gaelic medium schools in the nineteenth century but this was superseded after 1872 by universal English education. See K. MacKinnon 'Scottish Gaelic Today' at 588.
[231] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xxiv.

inscriptions. There would have been plenty of these for Lhwyd to find on Kintyre, Mull and Iona. The Anstis drawings must give a flavour of what Lhwyd saw. [232] They focus on details; some of the drawings and inscriptions on slabs and crosses he recorded can readily be identified today. His recorded inscriptions were a source for names and spellings, drawing together his antiquarian and linguistic interests.

Edwards examines Lhwyd's approach to the recording of old monuments and their carvings and inscriptions throughout his career. She notes how his scientific methodology permeated all that he did. His meticulous copies of what he had seen first-hand would be circulated to his correspondents for their opinions. [233] His assessment of monuments was always measured; he did not follow the contemporary trend for linking them to heroic and possibly mythical figures. He stands out in this regard. Celtic studies in the eighteenth century were to be overlaid with romantic notions far from his precise scholarship. [234]

He visited the Catstane at Kirkliston near Edinburgh with Paterson. This stone circle was recorded with its dimensions in a letter to Rowlands and a drawing sent to another correspondent, Humphrey Humphreys. [235] Thanks to Lhwyd, there is a record of how the circle once stood with surface remains now gone. Its inscription with its reference to "Vetta" which, by analogy, Lhwyd reads as "Gwêd", is discussed in a letter to Morton; Wodrow quotes Lhwyd's findings writing to Nicholson. The suggestion is that "Vetta" is the son of a Pictish

---

[232] See p.10. The drawings are in Stowe MSS 1023 and 1024 in the British Library. I looked at those reproduced in Campbell & Thomson plates III – XXII.
[233] Edwards, 'Edward Lhuyd and the Origins of Early Medieval Celtic Archaeology'.
[234] J. P. Jenkins, "From Edward Lhuyd to Iolo Morganwg: The Death and Rebirth of Glamorgan Antiquarianism in the Eighteenth Century", *Transactions of the Glamorgan Local History Society*, 23: (1979), 29-47.
[235] N. Edwards, 'Edward Lhuyd and the Origins of Early Medieval Celtic Archaeology' at 184-5.

king, although Lhwyd was more interested in the Latin/Celtic name congruences. [236] He dated it by its script to the fifth/sixth centuries. This is still considered accurate. The Canmore website identifies Lhwyd's letters and drawing as the earliest reference to the Catstane. [237] (Today the inscription is read as Vetta <u>daughter</u> of Victricus. Lhwyd and his contemporaries were blind to such a possibility.)

A January 1700 letter has a drawing of one side of the cross at Campbeltown and his transcription of its inscription. [238] Today it is the other side of that cross which attracts most attention; a small mermaid at the top is currently used as the logo for the local Heritage Centre. [239] Lhwyd suggested the cross was about 400 years old; Historic Scotland now dates it to 1380 while noting that previously the preferred date was 1500. [240] Lhwyd's dating (or contemporary knowledge when he visited) has proved more accurate than that of later scholars.

A drawing of an eight stone circle appears to be that at Lochbuie on Mull. [241] Current records show a ninth stone replaced by a boulder and outlying stones; Lhwyd's record therefore reveals that excavations happened after his visit. [242]

---

[236] Robert Wodrow to Archdeacon Nicolson, 18 February 1701, in Sharp, ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow* at 149.
[237] https://canmore.org.uk/site/50719/the-cat-stane
[238] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands.* The letter is at 6-8 and the drawing at plate III.
[239] https://campbeltownheritagecentre.co.uk/objects/the-campbeltown-cross/
[240] https://canmore.org.uk/site/38797/campbeltown-old-quay-head-campbeltown-cross
[241] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* plate X11.
[242] https://www.isle-of-mull.net/attractions/history/standing-stones/lochbuie/ accessed 16 September 2020.

A comparison of his sketch of the Macmillan Cross at Kilmory with a modern photograph makes it clear the two are the same, even though the sketch is little more than a rough outline or aide memoire. [243]

Lhwyd visited the tiny island of Eilean Mor or Mac y Chormic in the Sound of Jura. [244] By tradition this was a retreat of St Carmaic/ Cormic, with a chapel dedicated to him. Lhwyd sketched the cross there with its inscription to Mariota de Ros, wife of Donald, second Lord of the Isles, who commissioned it. [245] This cross was subsequently badly damaged. A surviving sketch from 1875 is close to Lhwyd's own but lacks the inscription. [246] The original is now in the National Museum of Scotland with a replica on the island. [247] Thanks to Lhwyd, we have a record of it when it was more intact.

It is interesting in itself that Lhwyd was taken to this small island. He was evidently en route for Iona so a guide might have surmised that the remains on Eilean Mor would also appeal to him. Alternatively, as the cross itself would have been very prominent in Lhwyd's time, he might have seen it from Kilmory and asked to be taken there.

---

[243] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* plate VII.
[244] Edward Lhwyd to Dr Richard Richardson, 17 December 1699, in Gunther *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd*.
[245] Mariota died in 1440; her husband in 1423.
[246] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* plate X. A sketch from 1875 by Captain T P White can be seen at https://canmore.org.uk/collection/1322895 accessed 23 October 2020.
[247] These details come from the blog https://www.thehazeltree.co.uk/2018/11/05/the-secrets-of-st-cormac/ accessed 23 October 2020. They are confirmed by the final entry at https://www.historicenvironment.scot/visit-a-place/places/eilean-mor/history/ accessed 23 October 2020.

Notwithstanding these examples, Lhwyd did not discover as much as he anticipated in the area of antiquities, remarking to Richardson on his lack of observable finds in April 1700. [248] He wrote at length about Newgrange, a megalithic tomb in Ireland, but no monument in Scotland yielded similar interest. [249] The season for his trip and the weather must have precluded a thorough examination of what the areas he visited had to offer the antiquarian. There is no evidence that Lhwyd travelled with any prior knowledge of sites. He does not seem to have had advance replies to his questionnaires which might have directed him to particular monuments. Sibbald directed him to the Antonine wall near Edinburgh. Had he planned his journey after the publication of Martin's book, he (like Dr Johnson after him) might have been inspired to travel further afield. Martin for example draws and describes in great detail the standing stones at Callanish on the Isle of Lewis. [250] This would surely have been a monument to fire Lhwyd's research instincts as much as Newgrange did.

Lhwyd was keen to record natural as well as human history but here too he picked the worst time of year. He did record some new plant finds. He mentions to Richardson plant exchanges with Sutherland and plants found, notwithstanding the wind, on a high hill on Mull in November. [251] The highest point on Mull is over 3,000 feet; Lhwyd was well used to plant

[248] Edward Lhwyd to Richard Richardson, 20 April 1700, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/587d1892-2b19-49eb-b4d0-322d9ebe1d6e accessed 24 April 2020.

[249] McGuiness, 'Edward Lhuyd's Contribution to the Study of Irish Megalithic Tombs' *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, vol. 126 (1996), pp. 62-85.

[250] Martin Martin, *A Description of the Western Isles of Scotland*', in Robson, *Curiosities of Art and Nature* at 21.

[251] Edward Lhwyd to Richard Richardson, 17 December 1699, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/37f14481-2fcc-4ed5-a645-4889c70e4e8a accessed 24 April 2020.

hunting in the mountains of Snowdonia. Similar, but not identical, plant lists appear in two other surviving letters describing them as rare and hitherto unknown to him. [252]

CONTRIBUTIONS TO SCOTTISH FOLKLORE AND ETHNOGRAPHY

By 21st century standards, it may seem odd that folklore, customs or beliefs should be considered appropriate for inclusion in a historical and geographical work by a man as painstakingly scientific and experience-driven in his research as Lhwyd. However, by the standards of the time, it made perfect sense. Lhwyd's initial published scientific work had been on fossils. The same examination of unusual features in certain stones which led to the identification of apparently fossilised plants and animals also led him to look at those stones identified by local people as being in some way unusual and possibly possessing special powers. He was known to be interested in unusual stones and so any perceived as such would be drawn to his attention.

> "Lhwyd's study of fossils constantly brought him up against chipped stone implements, which to many were thunderbolts or elf-shot." [253]

Furthermore, in the course of gathering information about traces of the past still extant in the physical environment, antiquarians would come across oral accounts and stories. Such accounts are recorded in Camden's *Britannia* and Plot's Natural Histories of Staffordshire and Oxfordshire, works which inspired Lhwyd. His questionnaires included queries intended to

---

[252] Edward Lhwyd to [Thomas Molyneux], 29 January 1699/ 1700; Edward Lhwyd to John Morton, 15 May 1700.
[253] Daniel, 'Edward Lhwyd: Antiquary and Archaeologist' at 351.

elicit such stories, recognising their place with particular regard to toponomy and ancient history. Sibbald similarly emphasised the need to identify "remarkable curiousities" in his work on Scotland. [254]

As Cramsie identifies, in many ways Lhwyd was ahead of his time in studying what is now called ethnography – not a word he would have recognised. [255] Ethnography as the observation of social practices and interactions or the systematic recording of culture is precisely what he set out to do with his collation of data on folklore, folk beliefs and local customs.

Contemporary scholars also subsumed discussion of second sight and fairies into such investigations. Second sight can be defined as "the uncanny ability of certain individuals to foresee the future" [256] For the religiously faithful it offered a means to counter the materialist world view of Hobbes and others which was starting to sway intellectuals. If second sight could be "proved", it would buttress arguments for the existence of God. Thus Kirk, translator of the Bible into Scottish Gaelic and assembler of the associated word list, published *The Secret Commonwealth* dealing, inter alia, with second sight. It was intended as "a genuine attempt to understand the interface between the natural and the supernatural". [257] Aubrey was fascinated by the topic as an end in itself. Martin also tackled the subject, devoting an entire section of his *Description* to it. His encounters and the stories he heard are presented as incontrovertible

---

[254] Withers, 'Geography, Science and National Identity in Early Modern Britain: The Case of Scotland and the Work of Sir Robert Sibbald (1641-1722)' at 36.

[255] Cramsie, *British Travellers and the Encounter with Britain 1450-1700*, at 380.

[256] M. Hunter, 'The Discovery of Second Sight in Late 17th Century Scotland', *History Today*, vol 51 June: (2001), 48-53 at 48.

[257] ibid at 52.

evidence and he critiqued disbelievers. Local people were straightforward and had no motive for making up the sightings. [258]

Lhwyd's interest in folklore, customs and second sight was not in pursuit of any ideological viewpoint. His approach was one of structured examination of the evidence. "Lhwyd's first reaction to what appeared to be unusual occurrences was always to seek a natural explanation, however novel". [259] His work is permeated by empiricism – assemble examples, consider the evidence and then formulate theories to be tested and recorded.

Lhwyd did not publish on this topic in his lifetime. His surviving papers contain many notes, especially from the meeting with Beaton. One notebook contains Lhwyd's annotated copy of "*A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes*", clearly handwritten in haste. Campbell published this text with annotations in 1975. [260] Campbell says the location of the original manuscript and the author are unknown; Cramsie suggests Rev James Kirkwood as the author. [261] Lhwyd's copy was apparently transcribed from one held by Sibbald who in turn got it from Robert Boyle. Boyle had financed Kirk's Scottish Gaelic Bible translation in which Kirkwood was also involved. Campbell hypothesizes that Boyle commissioned one of them to write the account. When Lhwyd sent Fraser his standard list of questions in December 1699, he referred to three sheets on rites and customs procured by Boyle from a correspondent for him. [262]

---

[258] Martin, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* at 300-334.
[259] Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd (c.1660 – 1709): Folklorist' at 43.
[260] Campbell, *A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes.*
[261] Cramsie, *British Travellers and the Encounter with Britain* at 387.
[262] Edward Lhwyd to James Fraser, 16 December 1699, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/f2cdb85e-4b0e-4958-908e-c33d32a264c3 accessed 8 November 2020.

Possibly this is part of "*A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes*". Lhwyd wrote from Falkirk, having met Sibbald in Edinburgh.

Lhwyd evidently showed "*A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes*" to Beaton, since on the copy Beaton deleted some of the observations as misleading. Campbell makes the interesting observation that the letter to Fraser is Lhwyd's only reference to this copy. During and subsequent to his travels he wrote in detail about finds in Scotland (monuments, stones used as amulets etc) to Lister, Robinson, Richardson, Rowlands, Wodrow and Colin Campbell. Exchanging information and theories was very much part of his approach. Yet nowhere else does he refer to the three sheets/ his copy of "*A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes*", even though copying it must have taken time and trouble. He certainly discussed the subject in detail with Beaton. Maybe he felt there was nothing useful to be said until back in Oxford with time to reflect on the data gathered. Roberts reminds us that:

> "Lhwyd's undigested collections are the notes of men in haste, writing in difficult circumstances, and expecting to have an opportunity on their return to Oxford to expand what they had noted, to gather more material and to make comparisons". [263]

In terms of first-hand data, what Lhwyd gleaned in Scotland was sparse. There is a marked contrast with the volume of detail published by Martin. Lhwyd's lack of proficiency in Gaelic may have rendered it difficult to question local people about their customs and beliefs to the extent Martin did. The first-hand material, as described in letters to various correspondents during and after his Scottish journey, largely concerns stones used as charms and amulets,

---

[263] Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd (c.1660 – 1709): Folklorist', at 49.

unsurprising given his interest in fossils. [264] It is only with stones that Lhwyd expresses his thoughts on what the finds might represent. He wrote to various scholarly contacts describing stones as Amulets of the Druids, fitting them into theories he already held. The colloquial name of the stone and his description as listed in these letters is:

- Adderbeads (glass beads)

- Cocknee stones (*echinites pileatus minor* of Flint)

- Toadstones (river pebble with an odd mark on it)

- Eye buttons or beads (agate like the pupil of an eye)

- Combat stones (*echinites galeatus*)

- Snail stones (ring shaped glass cylinder)

- Healing stones (named by Drs Plot and Lister as *ombria pellucida*) – quartz pebbles used to counter the effects of elf shot in cattle

- Elf arrows (flint arrow head set in silver and worn round the neck)

- Hedgehog stone (small glass cylinder with knobs or prickles)

- Molestone (blown glass bead)

Lhwyd recognised these were not stones with special powers (folk beliefs centred around their curative and protective properties) but the artefacts of ancient peoples. [265] Elf arrows were believed to be shot by fairies (or men, at the behest of fairies) but Lhwyd said "…I must crave leave to suspend my faith, until I see one of them descend". [266] He was aware of contemporary

---

[264] Edward Lhwyd to Martin Lister, 15 December 1699, in Gunther, *Early Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd*; Edward Lhwyd to Dr Richard Richardson, 17 December 1699, in Gunther; Edward Lhwyd to [Thomas Molyneux], 29 January 1699/ 1700.
[265] Daniel, 'Edward Lhwyd: Antiquary and Archaeologist' at 352.
[266] Edward Lhwyd to Dr Richard Richardson, 17 December 1699, in Gunther, *Early Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* at 425.

Native American use of similar arrowheads, suggesting a more banal explanation for their origin. He observed caustically that even well-educated people believed snake stones were made by snakes. They were traditionally thought to be generated from a knot of living snakes and to have medicinal properties. A man Lhwyd met on Mull assured him that he personally had taken a "cocknee" stone out of a cock's knee. Lhwyd whilst in Scotland asked Colin Campbell for examples of such stones and possibly the data above was in some part the outcome. [267]

Writing to Robert Davies in September 1701, Lhwyd referred to his "tolerable collection" of snake stones known "in Wales by the name of *Glain Neidr*, in the Highlands by the name of *Crap an Aithreach*, in the Low Lands by that of Adder-Sten, and in Cornwal Mil-preve." [268]

As ever, Lhwyd sought insights by drawing comparisons. As early as 1694 he referred to glass beads he had found in Wales as Druid. [269] He linked them to Pliny's reference to Druids manufacturing such stones and wearing them as amulets. Lhwyd fitted his discoveries in Scotland into this thesis. Having found that such stones occurred in Scotland, Wales and the West of England, but not Ireland, he surmised there were no Druids in Ireland. Lhwyd did not accept the popular beliefs around the various stones but recognised that the belief itself might have an antiquarian value, perhaps as evidence of an early religious rite. [270] He sought

---

[267] Edward Lhuyd to Colin Campbell, 20 December 1699.

[268] Edward Lhwyd to Robert Davies, 22 September 1701, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/cd2de721-3948-419f-95ee-0899b36066e6 accessed 9 October 2020.

[269] Edward Lhwyd to Edmund Gibson, 18 October 1694; Edward Lhwyd to Dr Richard Richardson, 19 June 1698 both in Gunther, *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd*.

[270] Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd (c.1660 – 1709): Folklorist', at 45.

corroboration in historical accounts such as Pliny. Lhwyd recognised that establishing evidence for similar beliefs about these stones across the Celtic nations could indicate a common early Celtic history.

Notwithstanding his "tolerable collection", Lhwyd remained keen for more examples. When he asked James Sutherland to procure an adderstone for him, Sutherland responded that this had proved impossible as their owners valued them so highly, at a cow and a calf. [271]

The remaining information on folklore topics found in his notebooks is very much raw data gathered from Beaton, being notes on different topics and animals in Welsh and Gaelic. Possibly he was recording words or phrases as much for different dialects as for the custom described. Examples include a phrase traditionally called through a door to encourage a person on the point of death to move on, written both in Gaelic and phonetically in Welsh. [272] In a list of animals, he records "*madu/maddah uisge*" for otter but also noted the name of the king of the otters is "*dobhar chù*". Next to this is the Welsh note "*edrych yno*" although whether he wanted to look into the language difference or the king of the otters is unclear. There are notes on corpse candles, traditional omens of impending death in the form of faint flickering lights. Martin and later Pennant attest to belief in their manifestation in the Highlands and Martin notes they were witnessed in Wales. [273] Lhwyd knew of the belief in Wales; he recorded that

---

[271] James Sutherland to Edward Lhwyd, date between 1700 and 1702, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge. There are two entries, one a card index and one a transcribed letter, dated differently but the card index clearly relates to the transcribed letter. http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/b97a9d8c-b67a-43f1-b9bb-5d9f8fe0b392 accessed 28 June 2020.
[272] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 52.
[273] Martin, *A Description of the Western Islands of Scotland* at 313.

in Scotland they were seen in red, green and white. [274] Recording once again in Gaelic and phonetic Welsh, perhaps Lhwyd was as interested in the words as the belief.

There are some mentions of second sight. [275] Lhwyd recorded examples related to the manner of a person's death and to identify a future wife. He also left notes interpreting the "code" behind a vision – if the seer sees a man with fish scales, the man will die by drowning, in a shroud, will die in his own bed and so on. Martin wrote on the topic in much more detail, as did Pennant some decades later. [276] What use Lhwyd would have made of this material can only be conjectured. His firm empirical methods would have inclined him to record the fact of the belief, rather than take what he had learned as proof that second sight existed. Neither Lhwyd nor Martin make any reference to Coinneach Odhar "The Brahan Seer" who was supposedly alive and working in the seventeenth century. [277] This absence endorses suspicions that he was largely the creation of a later folklorist Alexander Mackenzie. [278] Had Lhwyd heard of Coinneach Odhar, he would surely have wanted to find out more, not least because the tradition was that his skill derived from a magic stone.

The lack of written reflections in correspondence on his folklore material may suggest Lhwyd was struggling to know quite what use to make of it. As already observed, this is in marked contrast to his reflections on language, monuments and botany. He did ask one of his amanuenses, David Lewis, to prepare a comparison of rites and customs between Wales and

[274] Campbell & Thomson, *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at 53.
[275] ibid at 54-5. Note that Elizabeth Sutherland in her history of second sight *Ravens and Black Rain* (London: Corgi, 1987) at 52 considers this to be one of the earliest written references to second sight.
[276] T. Pennant, *A Tour of Scotland 1769* at 179.
[277] A. Ross, *The Folklore of the Scottish Highlands* (New York: Barnes & Noble/B.T. Batsford, 1993) at 35.
[278] A. Mackenzie, *The Prophecies of The Brahan Seer (Coinneach Odhar Fiosaiche)* (Inverness: The Aberdeen University Press, 1888) 4th edition at 4-9, as available at Http://Www.Gutenberg.Org/Files/57840/57840-H/57840-H.Htm accessed 29 September 2020.

the Hebrides, a proposal typical of his empirical approach. What became of this is unknown. Lewis wrote to Lhwyd to follow up his work in September 1703 and January 1704. [279] There is no surviving response from Lhwyd.

Writing in 1963, Campbell & Thomson observed that Lhwyd's survey of Highland folklore "has not yet been completed". [280] Roberts has written about Lhwyd as a folklorist but across all the Celtic nations. [281] There would still appear to be scope for further research using his specifically Scottish data.

SCOTLAND AFTER LHWYD

The eighteenth century was a turbulent one for Scotland. The Act of Union with England in 1707 was followed by Jacobite uprisings, the consequence of which for the Highlands and Islands was intense repression, land clearances and emigration. By the middle of the eighteenth century travel to these parts of Scotland was again perceived as a most dangerous undertaking. Any door which might have started to open with Lhwyd's discovery that the people were hospitable rather than barbarous was firmly closed. Whilst travellers such as Pennant emulated Lhwyd's scientific and open-minded techniques, others sought confirmation of their existing prejudices.

---

[279] David Lewis to Edward Lhwyd, 16 September 1703 and 27 January 1704, in H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge, http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/6e287121-fa90-43f2-90f7-a8864e328746 accessed 29 September 2020.
[280] Campbell & Thomson *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xxii.
[281] Roberts, 'Edward Lhwyd (c.1660 – 1709): Folklorist'

Pennant made journeys to Scotland in 1769 and 1772. There was much in common between his approach and that of Lhwyd. His interests too had progressed from fossils to natural history to the wider picture. [282] He issued questionnaires in advance of travel but with a different bias, towards agrarian economy, although he also was interested in recording natural history, landscape, antiquities and customs. [283] He too was drawn to elf shots, adder stones and the like; like Lhwyd he observed how Wales and Scotland attributed special powers to the *glain naidr*. [284] On his 1772 trip he was accompanied by a botanist, a Gaelic expert and an artist. [285] His published works were intended to be readable volumes of cultural travel, rather than an academic compendium like *Archaeologia Britannica.*

Pennant was working with commercial publication in mind. A comparison of his work throws up some interesting points about Lhwyd. Pennant is known to have kept journals during his travels, although these do not survive. There is no evidence Lhwyd did the same, reflecting the different angle of his approach. Lhwyd was not interested in people per se nor in offering suggestions as to how their lives might be improved. Improvement was Pennant's "driving force. [286] Pennant, and Martin seventy years earlier, commented on the state of the people; Pennant remarked on the extreme poverty. [287]. His work includes a detailed description of the miserable interior of a cottage. [288] There are no such observations anywhere by Lhwyd; either

---

[282] R.P. Evans, 'A Round Jump from Ornithology to Antiquity: The Development of Thomas Pennant's *Tours*' in M-A. Constantine and Nigel Leask, eds., *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* (London: Anthem Press, 2019) at 16.

[283] T. Furniss, "'As If Created by Fusion of Matter after some Intense Heat": Pioneering Geological Observations in Thomas Pennant's *Tours* of Scotland', in Constantine & Leask, *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* at 165.

[284] A. Hutton and N. Leask, "'The First Antiquary of his Country": Robert Riddell's Extra-illustrated Volumes of Thomas Pennant's *Tours in Scotland*', in Constantine & Leask, *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* at 134.

[285] Constantine & Leask at 5.

[286] N. Leask, *Stepping Westward: Writing the Highland Tour c1720-1830* at 97.

[287] As cited in Evans, 'A Round Jump from Ornithology to Antiquity: The Development of Thomas Pennant's *Tours*' ibid at 23.

[288] ibid at 28.

he did not visit homes (perhaps because of lack of language skills) or did not perceive such social issues pertinent to his scientifically biased research.

The best-known account of a journey to the Western Isles of Scotland is that of Dr Johnson and Samuel Boswell in 1773. This took place very shortly after Pennant's. William Ferguson suggests that, in contrast to Pennant, Johnson travelled with a closed mind full of English prejudice against any indigenous literary tradition. [289] Their rich account of Highland life has proved enduring, but the slant of the writing rendered it less popular in Scotland. [290]

Elizabeth Edwards considers that "Pennant's and Johnson's *Tours* defined Scotland for their own time, and for the tourists who followed them". [291] Lhwyd by contrast did not set out to produce a travelogue but, had he lived to produce a second volume or further work, he might well have distilled his research into a form which defined Scotland for his era too. He did play a significant role in maintaining Scottish identity at a moment which it stood to be subsumed. Whilst this may be implicit rather than explicit in his work, by focussing on Celtic languages, natural history and antiquarianism, he gave the countries concerned an identity and standing critical to later movements for independent national identities. The mere existence of serious academic study such as Lhwyd put into *Archaeologia Britannica* was a small step towards cementing the existence of separate Celtic national identities; identities which were to revive in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Lhwyd's research on Scottish Gaelic in particular

---

[289] W. Ferguson, 'Samuel Johnson's Views on Scottish Gaelic Culture'.
[290] Constantine & Leask, *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* at 3.
[291] E. Edwards, '" A Galaxy of the Blended Lights": The Reception of Thomas Pennant', in Constantine & Leask, *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* at 147.

preserved something of the language and culture prior to the devastating impact of clearances and emigration.

CONCLUSION

Lhwyd's work sought to order the materials of the outside world, whether fossils or languages, plants or archaeological remains. [292] His published and unpublished work leaves a legacy of great value to Scottish studies at a seminal moment in its history. Campbell and Thomson call his Scottish contribution immense. [293] The extraordinary scale of his fieldwork, as Considine expresses it, was part and parcel of a scientific methodology which required the making of comparisons across countries and cultures to reach insights. [294] His detachment from political, religious and social issues made him an impartial observer. His observations are refreshingly free from prejudice.

As I have set out to demonstrate by my review of his correspondence, Lhwyd stands as an example of knowledge transfer at this time, using personal contacts and networks backed up by intensive fieldwork to reach conclusions, rather than having recourse only to material published by others to arrive at conjectural history. His drawing together of the different disciplines of natural history, linguistics and antiquarianism made him a pioneer in Celtic Studies. The great tragedy of Lhwyd's work was his premature death. In the first volume of *Archaeologia Britannica* he set out an original theory of the common roots of the Celtic

---

[292] D. McGuiness, 'Edward Lhuyd's Contribution to the Study of Irish Megalithic Tombs' at 71.
[293] Campbell & Thomson *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* at xxiii
[294] Considine*, Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* at 143.

languages and how they might explain early Celtic history, based not only on his work in Scotland but formulated whilst there. He might have broken further new ground had he lived long enough to bring out a second volume. His remaining notebooks contain data on Scottish folk customs which even now has not been fully studied and evaluated. His Scottish antiquarian notes and sketches may yet yield more insights.

APPENDIX

OUTLINE OF CONTENTS AND LOCATION OF SURVIVING NOTEBOOKS AND SIMILAR BELONGING TO EDWARD LHWYD REFERRED TO IN THE TEXT ABOVE

TRINITY COLLEGE DUBLIN [295]

NOTEBOOKS

- IE TCD MS 1349 formerly catalogued as H.4.8 contains notes by Lhwyd in Welsh concerning Scottish folklore and items deriving from his contact with Rev. John Beaton, including a part copy by Beaton of his "Broad Book".

- IE TCD MS 1368 formerly H.4.27 is a notebook recording various features of Irish and of Scottish Gaelic, including some Scottish Gaelic phrases with equivalent in Welsh phonetics. There are notes on owners of Irish manuscripts.

- IE TCD MS 1369 formerly H.4.28 is a notebook containing Scottish Gaelic phrases and Lhwyd's translation of Ray's *Dictionariolum Trilingue* into two Scottish Gaelic dialects. There are also lists of Highland placenames, notes on owners of Scottish Gaelic manuscripts (including those of Beaton) and a transcription of Beaton's reading of the first two chapters of the Bible.

MISCELLANEOUS

- IE TCD MS 1380 formerly H.5.8 is a 1703 Oxford Almanac interspersed with notes made by Lhwyd including some Scottish Gaelic sayings and riddles.

---

[295] Many works, for example Campbell & Thomson *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* use old Trinity College Dublin catalogue references so both are given. See A. O'Sullivan and W. O'Sullivan, 'Edward Lhuyd's Collection of Irish Manuscripts' at 70 and the online catalogue of Trinity College Library Dublin https://manuscripts.catalogue.tcd.ie/CalmView/Overview.aspx accessed 22 June 2020.

- IE TCD MS 1392 formerly H.5.20 is a miscellaneous collection of Lhwyd's papers, apparently working papers for *Glossography* volume 1 of *Archaeologia Britannica*. They include copies of an Irish grammar, a fragment of a comparative Celtic vocabulary and annotated workings for the Irish: English dictionary.

BODLEIAN LIBRARY OXFORD

- MS Carte 269 contains, inter alia, various items derived from Lhwyd's contact with Robert Sibbald in Edinburgh, including a copy of Sibbald's copy *'A collection of Highland rites & customes,'* and Sibbald's directions for Lhwyd to find the Roman wall between the Forth & the Clyde, as well as a work of Sibbald's on the Picts and papers relating to Cornish and Breton. [296]

---

[296] This is the Bodleian library reference. The notebook is in the Carte collection of papers. See
https://archives.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/repositories/2/archival_objects/7888
https://archives.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/repositories/2/resources/2354/collection_organization accessed 20 June 2020.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

PRIMARY SOURCES

H. Watt, B. Roberts, R. Sharpe [eds.] 'The Correspondence of Edward Lhwyd' in *Early Modern Letters Online*, Cultures of Knowledge http://emlo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/

BOOKS AND ARTICLES

Black, R., 'A Handlist of Gaelic Printed Books 1567-1800', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 25: (2009), 35-93.

Boon, G.C. 'Camden and the Britannia', *Archaeologia Cambrensis Journal of the Cambrian Archaeological Associatio*n, Vol. CXXXVI: (1987), 1-19.

Campbell, J.L. ed., *A Collection of Highland Rites and Customes: copied by Edward Lhuyd from the manuscript of the Rev. James Kirkwood (1650-1709) and annotated by him with the aid of the Rev. John Beaton* (Cambridge: D.S. Brewer Ltd & Rowman & Littlefield for the Folklore Society, 1975).

Campbell, J.L. 'The Contribution of Edward Lhuyd to the Study of Scottish Gaelic', *The Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1962), 77-80.

Campbell, J.L. 'An Early Scottish Gaelic Vocabulary', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 5: (1942), 76-93.

Campbell, J.L. 'Scottish Gaelic Translations of John Ray's Dictionariolum Trilingue', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, 9: (1961), 89-90.

Campbell, J.L. 'The Tour of Edward Lhuyd in Ireland in 1699 and 1700', *Celtica,* 5: (1960), 218-228.

Campbell, J.L. 'Unpublished Letters by Edward Lhuyd in the National Library of Scotland', *Celtica* vol 11 (1976) 34-42.

Campbell J.L. & Thomson, D., *Edward Lhuyd in the Scottish Highlands* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963).

Collis, J. *The Celts Origins Myths Inventions*, (Brimscombe Port Stroud: The History Press, 2010).

Considine, J. *Small Dictionaries and Curiosity: Lexicography and Fieldwork in Post-Medieval Europe* (Oxford: OUP, 2017).

Constantine, M-A. and Leask, N., eds., *Enlightenment Travel and British Identities Thomas Pennant's Tours in Scotland and Wales* (London: Anthem Press, 2019).

Cramsie, J. *British Travellers and the Encounter with Britain* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2015).

Cullen, K. *Famine in Scotland The Ill Years of the 1690s* (Edinburgh: EUP, 2010).

Daniel, G., 'Edward Lhwyd: Antiquary and Archaeologist', *Welsh History Review*, 3 (4): (1967), 345- 359.

Devine, T.M. *The Scottish Clearances A History of the Dispossessed* (London: Penguin, 2018).

Edwards, N. 'Edward Lhuyd and the Origins of Early Medieval Celtic Archaeology', *The Antiquaries Journal* 87: (2007), 165-96.

Ellis, R., 'Some Incidents in the Life of Edward Lhuyd', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1906-7), 1-51.

Emery, F., *Edward Lhuyd 1660-1709*, (Caerdydd: Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1971).

Emery, F.V., 'A Map of Edward Lhuyd's Parochial Queries in Order to a Geographical Dictionary, &C., of Wales (1696)', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1958).

Evans, D.W. and Roberts, B.F., *Edward Lhwyd Archaeologia Britannica Texts and Translations* (Aberystwyth: Celtic Studies Publications, 2009).

Evans, D.W. and Roberts, B.F., *Edward Lhwyd 1660-1709 A Bibliography and Readers' Guide*, (Aberystwyth: University of Wales Centre for Advanced Welsh and Celtic Studies, 2009).

Ferguson, W., 'Samuel Johnson's Views on Scottish Gaelic Culture', *The Scottish Historical Review* LXXVII 2 204 (1998), 183-198.

Fox, A., 'Printed Questionnaires, Research Networks, and the Discovery of the British Isles, 1650-1800', *The Historical Journal*, 53 3: (2010), 593-621.

Goring, R., ed., *Scotland The Autobiography* (London: Penguin, 2008).

Gunther, R. T., *Early Modern Science in Oxford Vol. XIV Life and Letters of Edward Lhwyd* (Oxford: OUP, 1945).

Hunter, M., 'The Discovery of Second Sight in Late 17th Century Scotland', *History Today*, vol 51 June: (2001), 48-53.

Jenkins, J. P., "From Edward Lhuyd to Iolo Morganwg: The Death and Rebirth of Glamorgan Antiquarianism in the Eighteenth Century", *Transactions of the Glamorgan Local History Society*, 23: (1979), 29-47.

Leask, N., *Stepping Westward: Writing the Highland Tour c1720-1830* (Oxford: OUP, 2020).

Macgregor, A., *The Ashmolean Museum A Brief History of the Institution and its Collections* (Oxford: Ashmolean Museum Oxford in association with Jonathan Horne Publications London, 2001).

McGuiness, D., 'Edward Lhuyd's Contribution to the Study of Irish Megalithic Tombs', *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, vol. 126 (1996), 62-85.

Mackenzie, A. *The Prophecies of The Brahan Seer (Coinneach Odhar Fiosaiche)* (Inverness: The Aberdeen University Press, 1888) 4th edition at 4-9, copy as available at Http://Www.Gutenberg.Org/Files/57840/57840-H/57840-H.Htm.

Mackie, J.D., *A History of Scotland* (London: Pelican, 1982).

Mackinnon, K., 'Scottish Gaelic Today', in Ball, M.J. and Müller, N. eds., *The Celtic Languages* (London: Routledge, 2009).

Martin M., *A Description of the Western Isles of Scotland*', as reproduced in Robson, ed., *Curiosities of Art and Nature* (Ness: The Islands Book Trust, 2003).

Miège, G., *The Present State of Great Britain and Ireland: The Present State of Scotland* (London, 7th ed. 1731) available at https://books.google.co.uk/books

Morris, R. H., ed., 'Parochialia being a summary of answers to 'Parochial Queries', *Archaeologia Cambrensis*, Supplements, April 1909, April 1910, April 1911.

Ó Concheanainn, T., 'The Scribe of John Beaton's 'Broad Book'', *Ériu,* 26: (1975), 99-101.

O'Sullivan, A. and O'Sullivan, W., 'Edward Lhuyd's Collection of Irish Manuscripts', *The Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, (1962), 57- 76.

O'Sullivan, A. & W., Introduction to E. Lhwyd's *Archaeologia Britannica*, (Shannon: Irish University Press, 1971).

Owen, Rev. N., *British Remains or a Collection of Antiquities relating to the Britons & c*, (London, 1777).

Pennant, T. *A Tour in Scotland 1769*, as reproduced at https://www.visionofbritain.org.uk/travellers/Pennant_Scot/10

Pool, P.A.S., 'Cornish Drawings by Edward Lhuyd in the British Museum', *Cornish Archaeology*, 16: (1977), 139-142.

Prebble, J., *Glencoe*, (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1969).

Rees, E. and Walters, G., 'The Dispersion of the Manuscripts of Edward Lhuyd', *Welsh History Review*, 7 (2): (1974), 148-178.

Roberts, A., *The Celts Search for a Civilization*, (London: Heron Books, 2015).

Roberts, B.F. 'An Early Edward Lhwyd Glossary', *Studia Celtica*, L (2016), 151-162.

Roberts, B.F. 'Edward Lhwyd (c.1660 – 1709): Folklorist', *Folklore* vol 120 April (2009), 36-56.

Roberts, B.F. *Edward Lhuyd The Making of a Scientist*, (Llandysul: University of Wales Press, 1980).

Roberts, B.F. 'Edward Lhwyd's Protégés', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, 14: (2008), 21–57.

Robson, M. ed., *Curiosities of Art and Nature* (Ness: The Islands Book Trust, 2003).

Ross, A., *The Folklore of the Scottish Highlands* (New York: Barnes & Noble/B.T. Batsford, 1993).

Sacheverell, W., *A Voyage to I-Columb-Kill* (Douglas: The Manx Society, 1859) copy available at Google books.

Sharp, L.W., ed., *Early Letters of Robert Wodrow* (Edinburgh: National Library of Scotland Scottish History Publications vol.24, 1937).

Sharpe, R., 'Lachlan Campbell's Letters to Edward Lhwyd 1704-7', *Scottish Gaelic Studies*, XXIX: (2013), 244-281.

Sharpe, R., *Roderick O'Flaherty's Letters to William Molyneux, Edward Lhwyd and Samuel Molyneux 1696-1709 (*Dublin: RIA, 2013).

Starkey, A.M., 'Robert Wodrow and the History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland', *Church History,* Vol. 43, No. 4: (1974), 488-498.

Sutherland, E. *Ravens and Black Rain* (London: Corgi, 1987).

Walters, G. and Emery, F., 'Edward Lhuyd, Edmund Gibson, and the printing of Camden's *Britannia*, 1695', *The Library*, Vol. XXXII June: (1977), 109-135.

Williams, K. J., The *Antiquary: John Aubrey's Historical Scholarship* (Oxford: OUP, 2016).

Withers, C.W.J., 'Geography, Science and National Identity in Early Modern Britain: The Case of Scotland and the Work of Sir Robert Sibbald (1641-1722)', *Annals of Science*, 53: (1996), 29-73.

REPORT

Society for Bettering the Condition and Increasing the Comforts of the Poor 'Of the Education of the Poor', London Bulmer & Co 1809 available at https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015049829065&view=1up&seq=271

WEBSITES

Bodleian Library Archives https://archives.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/

Y Bywgraffiadur Cymrieg/Dictionary of Welsh Biography https://biography.wales/

Canmore: National Record of the Historic Environment
https://canmore.org.uk/site/50719/the-cat-stane
https://canmore.org.uk/site/38797/campbeltown-old-quay-head-campbeltown-cross

Campbeltown Heritage Centre https://campbeltownheritagecentre.co.uk/objects/the-campbeltown-cross/

Explore Isle of Mull https://www.isle-of-mull.net/attractions/history/standing-stones/lochbuie/

National Library of Scotland/Leabharlann Nàiseanta na h-Alba https://www.nls.uk/

Oxford Dictionary of National Biography https://www.oxforddnb.com/

The Library of Trinity College Dublin Archives https://www.tcd.ie/library/manuscripts/