# (Re)translation and Reception of Li Qingzhao's Works in the Anglophone West

Name: Hongxiu Liu Student Number: 2000461

Supervised by: Dr. Nadia Georgiou Dr. Sarah Reynolds Dr. Katharina Zinn

Submitted in partial fulfilment for the award of the degree of Professional Doctorate English Language Education and English Literature University of Wales Trinity Saint David 2025

### DECLARATION

This work has not previously been accepted in substance for any degree and is not being concurrently submitted in candidature for any degree.

Date ......11/06/2025.....

## **STATEMENT 1**

This thesis is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. Where correction services have been used the extent and nature of the correction is clearly marked in a footnote(s). Other sources are acknowledged by footnotes giving explicit references. A bibliography is appended.

Signed ...... (candidate)

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for deposit in the University's digital repository.

Date ......11/06/2025.....

# Acknowledgments

I owe the first and greatest gratitude to Dr. Nadia Georgiou, Dr. Sarah Reynolds, and Dr. Katharina Zinn, my dissertation supervisors. They are not only my academic mentors but also role models as female scholars. The thesis could not have been done without their constant guidance and patient coaching. The meetings with my supervisors are the most intellectual and enjoyable conversations of my time in the UK. The academic sparkle between us has filled me with joy. I could not be who I am today without their support and inspiration. "They raise me up to more than I can be!" Their dedication to their work and the academic and love for their families have taught me how to be a better woman. I have been awed by their independent thinking and professionalism. Through this PhD journey, I have been empowered by their powers.

I extend my sincere gratitude to the examiners, Dr. Van Poucke and Dr. Jansen for their thorough examination of my thesis, and Dr. Ros. Coard, the chair of my examining panel, for dedicating her time to conduct the oral examination. The discussion with them was both cordial and insightful, and their constructive feedback has significantly refined and enhanced the quality of my work.

I am thankful for the devotion of my program team at the UWTSD, such as Dr. Jessica Chapman, Dr. Peter. Mitchell and Dr Paul Wright, etc. Those lectures given in Phrase One have provided me with preparatory knowledge for this thesis. In particular, Dr. Thomas Jansen has been like a father, though much younger, to all Prof. Doc students, caring about our mental health and academic progress.

I am also grateful to the staff from the Doctoral College and UWTSD library for their support, especially Nina Sharp. I also thank Lampeter Library for providing bestsellers for me to read beyond academics.

I thank my cousin Yijia for collecting data from the library of the University of California, Berkeley. The dataset could not have been completed without her and sources from that library. Similar thanks are given to my American friend Lance Winstein and my former student Zhou Zhikang for scanning books from America.

My gratitude also goes to my colleagues and employers in WHPU, for sharing my teaching duties and their consideration. Thanks for their understanding of my struggle

to do a thesis while working.

I would like to thank many friends who have helped me on this PhD journey, especially Xiaoya, Shao Jia, Guomei, Xia Ting and Pang Bo. Xiaoya has been like a brother to me and always encourages me to keep my spirit till the end even if he was in Somalia, serving for the United Nations Peacekeeping Force. Shao Jia has always been there for me since we were post-graduate students, and he took care of my daughter's studies in China without asking for payment while I was in the UK. That kindness was beyond words of gratitude. It is Guomei who spurred me to apply for PhD during the COVID-19 period and always has had faith in me. Thanks to Xia Ting, the Chinese version of Li Qingzhao's *Ci As If Dreaming* was presented in Chapter One as an illustration of handwriting from the *Song* Dynasty. Pang Bo and I are good PhD companions and we supported each other academically by discussing our projects while I was in the UK. Other friends in China and the UK who also cheered me up are still remembered in my heart and not named here for the sake of space.

Last but not the least, I would like to give my special thanks to my family. My parents have supported me all the way to where I am. I owe them an eternal debt. My brother has generously sponsored my study in the UK, which was more than what I had asked for. I owe sincere thanks to Christina and Dan, as this PhD journey has taken a long time and a lot of effort. I am very sorry that I could not fulfill some family duties and give them the love and care they deserve. I am truly sorry that they have to bear all the separation from me and depend on their own in China without me being there. I thank them for understanding and supporting me whenever I want to give up. Their generous love for me is a stream of power. I could not go on and complete this journey without their love.

Therefore, I dedicate this work to my beloved.

# Abstract

As the most renowned Chinese female poet, Li Qingzhao (1084-1156 CE) has received extensive attention from Chinese scholars, evidenced by thousands of academic publications. In contrast, the number of her English (re)translations both in mainland China and the Anglophone West, remains under a hundred, resulting in limited scholarly studies typically focusing on the limited number of existing translators and translations. This leads to a lack of comprehensive examination of the (re)translation and reception of her works, a gap this project aims to fill.

This project builds on Cadera and Walsh's (2022) theory that a reciprocal connection exists between retranslation and reception. Utilizing a mixed methods approach, the project triangulates bibliographical data of the English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's work from 1918 to 2021 with paratextual materials and textual criticism to build a comprehensive diachronic dataset. The project examines her (re)translations contextually, textually and peritextually, to provide a systematic (re)translation and reception history of Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone world.

Taking (re)translations as a primary and collective act among (re)translators, editors and publishers, the contextual investigation charts Li Qingzhao's complete (re)translation trajectory over the past 100 years. The findings suggest that (re)translations and reception might be related to diverse contextual factors, highlighting her increasing prominence in the Anglophone literary scene and wider reception of her work despite the early marginalization and underrepresentation of her literary diversity, especially in anthologies.

The peritextual examination of Li's ten English collections reveals the effects of elements such as book titles, covers, blurbs, presentations and notes on the poet's reception. The micro-investigation examines the textual features of early French to English (re)translations to uncover their possible impact of indirect translation on readers. Beyond the (re)translation dataset, creative responses to Li Qingzhao and her works by Anglophone artists are recognized as an alternative type of reception.

Key words: (Re)translation; Reception; Li Qingzhao's works; the Anglophone West

# **Table of Contents**

Acknowledgement	
Abstract	
Foreword	
Chapter One Introduction	1
1.1 The Background of this Study	1
1.1.1 The Socio-political Background	
1.1.2 The Paucity of <i>Ci</i> Research	2
1.2 The Importance of Li Qingzhao	3
1.3 The Research Niche	5
1.4 The Research Objectives	6
1.5 Research Questions and Outlines	6
1.6 Research $\widetilde{M}$ ethodologies	8
1.6.1 A Bibliographic Research Method	
1.6.2 Quantitative Methods	
1.6.3 Qualitative Methods	
1.7 Significance of this Study	10
1.8 Cultural Background	13
1.8.1 Chinese Literary Terms and Names	
1.8.2 The Introduction of <i>Ci</i>	
1.9 Introduction of Li Qingzhao and Her Works	
1.9.1 Introduction to Her Life	
1.9.1.1 Early Life in Her Parents' House	
1.9.1.2 Marriage to Zhao Mingcheng (赵明诚)	
1.9.1.3 The Fall of the Country and Widowhood	
1.9.1.4 Second Marriage and Divorce	
1.9.1.5 Later Life and Death	
1.9.2 Brief Introduction of Her Works	
Chapter Two Theoretical Framework	
2.1 Retranslation and its Motives	
2.1.1 Definition	
2.1.1 Definition 2.1.2 The Motives for Retranslations	
2.1.2 The Motives for Retrainstations 2.1.2.1 Retranslation Hypothesis (RH)	
2.1.2.1 Retrainstation Typoticsis (RT) 2.1.2.2 Arguments against RH.	
2.1.2.2 Arguments against Kri.	
2.2 Research Methodologies of Retranslation	
2.2 Research Fields and Relevant Research	
2.3 Research Fleids and Relevant Research	
2.4.1 Traditional Approaches to Poetry Retranslation	
2.4.1 Traditional Approaches to Focu y Retrainstation.	
2.4.2 Other Multiple Approaches	
2.4.4 Chinese Poetry Retranslation with Paratexts	
Chapter Three Literature Review	
3.1 The English (Re)translations of Li Qingzhao's Works in Mainland China	30
3.1.1 Before 1980	20
3.1.2 From the 1980s to 1990s	
3.1.3 From 2000 to 2009	
3.1.4 From 2010 to 2022/3	
3.2 Studies on Li Qingzhao's English (Re)translations in Mainland China	
3.2.1 The Overview of Studies	
3.2.2 Specific Research Foci and Methods	
3.3 (Re)translations of Li Qingzhao's Works and Relevant Research in the Anglophone West	
3.3.1 From the 1910s to 1950s	
3.3.2 From the 1960s to 1970s	
3.3.3 From the 1980s to 1990s	
2.2.5 I Iom me 17000 to 17700	

3.3.4 From 2000 to 2022/2023	
3.3.5 Beyond Published Print Academic Journals and Books	56
3.4 Conclusion	57
Chapter Four (Re)translations and Reception of Li Qingzhao's Works: A Macro-Contextual	
Perspective	59
4.1 Examining Overall Published Paratexts	
4.1.1 Selection of Material	59
4.1.2 Sourcing from Published Paratexts	61
4.1.3 Discussion	62
4.1.4 Further Findings from Paratexts	65
4.2 Examining Translators	67
4.2.1 Selection of Materials	67
4.2.2 Visibility /Popularity of Translators	
4.2.3 Discussion	
4.3 Examining the Origin of Source Work	72
4.3.1 Definition of "Source Texts"	
4.3.2 Selection of Materials	
4.3.3 Sourcing from Paratexts	73
4.3.4 Discussion	
4.4 Examining (Re)translated Source Texts	
4.4.1 Overall Preference for <i>Ci</i>	
4.4.2 Discussion	
4.4.3 Overall Preference for Other Types of Works	
4.4.4 Further Discussion	
4.5 Examining Monographs on Women's Literature	
4.5.1 Selection of Materials	
4.5.2 Preference of Female-centric Monographs	
4.5.3 Discussion	
4.6 Examining Anthologies	85
4.6.1 Selection of Material	
4.6.2 Preference from Anthologies	
4.6.3 Discussion	
4.7 The Dynamics in the Proportion of Li Qingzhao's (Re)translated Works	
4.7.1 Data Filtration and Collection	
4.7.2 Synchronic Examination	
4.7.3 Discussion	
4.7.4 Diachronic examination	
4.7.5 Discussion	
Chapter Five (Re)translation and Reception of Li Qingzhao's Complete Collections: A	) 2
Peritextual Analysis	95
5.1 Titles, Subtitles and Cover Design	96
5.1.1 Titles and Subtitles	
5.1.2 Cover Design	
5.2 Blurb on Dust Jackets, Flaps and Back Covers	
5.2.1 Blurb on the Back Cover of Rexroth and Chung (1979)	
5.2.2 Blurbs on Other Collections	
5.3 Contents Pages and Organisation	
5.3.1 Contents Pages	
5.3.2 Organisation and Presentation	
5.4 Notes	
5.4.1 Eroticisation	. 112
5.4.2 Cases of Ambiguity	
5.4.3 Over-annotation	
5.4.4 Possible Causes and Impacts	
5.5 Conclusion	
Chapter Six (Re)translation and Reception of Li Qingzhao's Works: Within the Dataset and	
Beyond	122
6.1 A Contextual Analysis of French-English (Re)translations through Paratexts	122
6.1.1 Whithall's (1918) Chinese Lyrics from The Book of Jade	
6.1.2 Rexroth's (1956) One Hundred Poems from the Chinese	

6.1.3 About Chinese Women (Barrows, 1977) and Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classi	cal
(Nienhauser, 2000)	124
6.2 A Textual Analysis of French-English (Re)translations by Case Studies	125
6.3 Influence of French-English (Re)translation on the Source Culture	
6.4 Reception and Influence of Li Qingzhao on the Target Culture Beyond the (Re)translation	ı Dataset
	128
6.4.1 Examining Poems Published in Print and Digital journals	130
6.4.2 Examining Poems and Prose in Book Chapters	131
6.4.3 Other Forms of Creative Responses	136
6.5 Conclusion	138
Chapter Seven Conclusions	
7.1 Revisiting the Research Questions	140
7.2 Proposals for Retranslations and Circulation of Li Qingzhao's Works	144
7.3 Major Contributions	
7.4 Limitations and Suggestions for Future Research	150
Bibliography	152
English Sources:	
Chinese Sources:	
Appendix 3-1: Publications from the 1910s to 1950s	180
Appendix 3-2: Publications from the 1960s to 1970s	180
Appendix 3-3: Publications from the 1980s to 1990s	182
Appendix 3-4: Publications from 2000 to 2022/2023	184
Appendix 4-1: Publishing information of 95 (re)translations	187
Appendix 4-2: Categories of publishers	191
Appendix 4-3: Translators and popularity	191
Appendix 4-4: Chinese source references	195
Appendix 4-5: Individual pieces (re)translated	199
Appendix 4-6: Popularity of individual pieces (re)translated	208
Appendix 4-7: Female-focused monographs and popularity list	209
Appendix 4-8: Anthologies and popularity list of individual pieces	
Appendix 4-9: Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies	215

# List of Figures:

Figure 1 Outline of the research project	7
Figure 2 "Rumengling-last night" handwritten by my dear friend Ms. Xia Ting	-16
Figure 3 The No. of entries with the Chinese theme "Chinese to English poetry translation"	-36
Figure 4 The No. of entries with the Chinese themes "Chinese to English poetry translation" and	
"paratext"	-36
Figure 5 The No. of entries with the Chinese theme "paratext"	-36
Figure 6 The No. of entries with the Chinese themes "paratext" and "Chinese to English poem	
translation"	-36
Figure 7 The No. of book entries with the Chinese title "Li Qingzhao"	-44
Figure 8 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao English translation"	
Figure 9 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "English translated Li Qingzhao"	
Figure 10 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "translating Li Qingzhao"	
Figure 11 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Yi'an" spaced with "translation"	
Figure 12 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao" spaced with	
"translating"	-46
Figure 13 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao" spaced with	
"translation"	-46
Figure 14 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao"	
Figure 15 The publications of Li Qingzhao's English-translated works till 2022	
Figure 16 The research contributors	
Figure 17 The main research subjects	
Figure 18 The keywords co-occurring net	-48
Figure 19 Publications from the 1910s to 1950s in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 8	
Figure 20 Publications from the 1960s to 1970s in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 2	• •
	· · · ·

	-
Figure 22 Publications from 2000 to 2022/3 in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 29) Figure 23 Types of book publishers	
Figure 24 The correspondence between Prof. Egan and the author	
Figure 25 The frequency of inclusion and ranking of <i>Ci</i> (re)translated in overall dataset	
Figure 26 The frequency of inclusion and ranking of <i>Shi</i> and <i>Wen</i> (re)translated	
Figure 27 The frequency of inclusion and ranking of works in female-themed monographs	
Figure 28 The No. of works included in monographs by date	
Figure 29 The proportion of retranslations included in female-centric monographs	
Figure 30 Contrast in genders	
Figure 31 The proportion of Li Qingzhao's retranslated works in anthologies by date	
Figure 32 Hu's (1966) cover	96
Figure 33 Rexroth and Chung's (1979) cover	96
Figure 34 Ho's (1968) cover	97
Figure 35 Mayhew and McNaughton's (1977) cover	97
Figure 36 Cryer's (1984) cover	
Figure 37 Wang's (1989) cover	
Figure 38 Djao's (2010) cover	
Figure 39 Lee's (2018) cover	
Figure 40 Coren's (2021) cover	
Figure 41 Egan's (2019) cover	
Figure 42 Rexroth and Chung's (1979) blurb	
Figure 43 Cryer's (1984) blurb	
Figure 44 Lee's (2018) blurb	
Figure 45 Djao's (2010) blurb	
Figure 46 Coren's (2021) blurb	
Figure 47 Ho's (1968) blurb	
Figure 48 Hu's (1966) blurb	107

# List of Tables:

Table 1 Research methodology	9
Table 2 Publications before 1980 in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 5)	38
Table 3 Publications from the 1980s to 1990s in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 18)	39
Table 4 Publications from 2000 to 2009 in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 16)	40
Table 5 Publications from 2010 to 2022/3 in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 22)	42
Table 6 The No. of (re)translations published in countries/regions every decade	61
Table 7 Major translators and their popularity	68
Table 8 Chinese source references	73
Table 9 The top included pieces in anthologies	86
Table 10 Popularity of Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies	90
Table 11 Approaches to blurbs in collections	- 108
Table 12 Eroticised images	- 112
Table 13 English renditions of "甚霎儿晴,霎儿雨,霎儿风"	- 115

# Foreword

I chose Li Qingzhao (1084-1156 CE) as my research topic for personal reasons; she is my source of inspiration. For one, Li Qingzhao's life experience touched me deeply during the Covid-19 period. During her 73 years of life, she experienced a great deal, from her light-hearted youth and well-matched marriage, to the fall of the country in her middle age, and the sudden death of her beloved husband, after which she became a recurrent runaway. Her second marriage and divorce resulted in humiliation and solitude in her later years (see her short chronology below). Despite the unimaginable pain and loss she suffered during her lifetime, she never gave up, and always maintained hope for a life of integrity with strength of character, even during her darkest periods. Just as Djao (2010, p.3) said, "throughout her life, she held up the beauty and strength of her character and her mind like the plum blossom...a blossom like no other..." That sentiment has illuminated me like a torch in my toughest moments of life, especially during the lockdown periods. Another aspect of Li Qingzhao that has inspired me is her fearlessness against social prejudice and her resolution of her divorce. In Chinese culture, divorce continues to be seen as a failure of one's life or virtue and is especially the fault of women. Even today, some Chinese people retain these traditional reservations about women's divorce. After ten years of verbal abuse and cold violence in marriage, I put forward my divorce request a few years ago and met with tremendous hostility, even from my parents. Li Qingzhao's resistance to social pressures strengthened my faith in being true to myself. Her tenacity inspired me to work as hard as I could and look for the best that life has offered, and that is what brought me to this PhD journey.

A short chronology of Li Qingzhao related to the *Song* Dynasty (Xu, 2018, p. 345-444):

1084 CE: Li Qingzhao was born in Shandong province.

1090 CE: At 7, Li Qingzhao accompanied her father to the capital city Bianjing.

1101 CE: At 18, Li Qingzhao married Zhao Mingcheng.

1103 CE: Zhao Mingcheng graduated from the Imperial University.

1107 CE: After the death of Zhao's father, Zhao and Li returned to Qingzhou.

1126 CE: The couple were at Zichuan where Zhao was posted. When Jurchen invaded, both Emperor *Song* Huizong and his successor *Song* Qinzong were captured, marking the end of the Northern *Song* Period.

1127 CE: Southern *Song* Period began when *Song* Gaozong claimed the throne in Nanjing. Zhao went to Nanjing to mourn his mother's death, whereas Li travelled south alone with their collections in 15 carts.

1128 CE: Zhao was posted in Nanjing and their collections in Qingzhou were destroyed by Jurchen.

1129 CE: First, Zhao was dismissed from his post in Nanjing. When they sailed at Chiyang, he was reposted to Huzhou and summoned to Nanjing for an audience by the emperor. Zhao left Li Qingzhao, rushing to Nanjing and died there at 49.

1132 CE: At 49, Li remarried Zhang Ruzhou, sued and divorced him three months later,

resulting in imprisonment. She was released nine days later with the help of Qi Chongli. 1156 CE: Li Qingzhao died at 73.

#### A note on translations and references:

When referencing translated poetry, I usually cite it under the translator's or anthologist's name, instead of the author of the source text. For instance, Egan (2019) refers to the Egan's rendition of Li Qingzhao's works; and Birch (1965) refers to the anthology edited by Birch. In other circumstances, like previous literature, it directly refers to authors. I believe the context in the following research will clarify this practice and I extend my sincere apologies to any translators whose visibility may have been unintentionally diminished because of my practice.

# **Chapter One Introduction**

Many readers know Li Qingzhao (李清照) (1084-1156 CE) as the most prominent female poet in Chinese literature; some readers are also familiar with her Ci (词). However, not many know how her English (re)translations shaped her image and Anglophone readers' perception of Chinese women and Chinese culture in a broad sense. Rather than taking the traditional readers' response as an approach to reception, this project approaches reception from a social perspective through (re)translations and creative responses, as agents, like translators, editors, publishers, academics and artists, are initial receivers of translated literature and help it slowly filter down to a greater audience. Taking translators and publishers as the primary points of reception, proposed by Gulyás (2022, p.222), this project first aims to chart Li Qingzhao's (re)translation history in the past 100 years through a diachronic dataset of 95 (re)translations and reveal how her works were received by those agents under complex macro-contextual influences. And then the data from the diachronic analysis is triangulated with peritextual materials of ten English collections, such as titles, covers, blurbs, etc., to reveal the potential impact of peritextual elements on their reception by potential readers. A further micro-textual criticism of early French-English (re)translations in the dataset suggests their possible influence on following translators and readers. Finally, by perceiving artists as alternative receivers, this research identifies and recognizes their creative responses, such as creative poems, musicals, novels and video games, etc., in different forms and media. As these creative responses have transcended the retranslation dataset and been exploited and integrated into the target culture, they provide evidence of the poet's depth and breadth of reception in the Anglophone world. Therefore, this chapter begins with the background to justify the necessity of this project and identify the research niche. The research objectives, questions and methodologies are stated afterwards, followed by the poet's biography and cultural background. Chapter Two deals with the theoretical framework and Chapter Three reviews the literature. Chapters Four to Six cover the macro and micro analysis of (re)translation and reception of her works in the past 100 years.

### 1.1 The Background of this Study

#### 1.1.1 The Socio-political Background

In 2017, the 13th Five-Year Plan for Cultural Development and Reform was issued under the guidelines of the 13th Five-Year Plan for Economic and Social Development of the People's Republic of China (the 13th Five-Year Plan) by the Chinese government. Its specified aims included the protection of Chinese classics, the promotion of Chinese cultural exports and making the Chinese voice heard outside China (Xinhua News Agency, 2017).<sup>1</sup> Later in 2022, the 14<sup>th</sup> Five-Year Plan for Cultural Development and Reform was issued. Its aims included the transmission and promotion of traditional Chinese culture, and advancement of cultural exchange and trade between China and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The translation was taken from *Chinadaily*, a bilingual newspaper recognized by the Chinese government to give news release about China.

other countries (Xinhua News Agency, 2022).<sup>2</sup>

Traditional Chinese culture covers a wide range of subjects, including traditional Chinese festivals, social customs and values and also classical Chinese literature, etc. With this in mind, the broad field of this research focuses on classical Chinese poetry and its relevant (re)translations in the Anglophone West. For the purposes of this research, Anglophone West mainly refers to the places where English is used as a medium of publication, such as the United Kingdom and British-controlled Hong Kong before 1997, the United States and Canada. New Zealand, Australia and other Englishspeaking countries are excluded from this research due to the inaccessibility of relevant resources published in those regions. Poetry's unrivalled position in Chinese culture has been widely accepted both in China and the West from the past to the present. For instance, Robert Payne (1949, p. xi) said that, "we can understand a people best through poetry, and the Chinese have always regarded poetry as the finest flower of their culture", and Whincup (1987, p. vii) also pointed out that, "poetry is the heart of Chinese culture." Similarly, Seaton (2006, p. xi) also mentioned "the extremely elevated place of poetry in traditional Chinese culture". Among all poetic forms in classical Chinese poetry, both Tang Shi (唐诗) and Song Ci (宋词) have held supreme standings. The research subject is narrowed down to Song Ci for the following reasons.

#### 1.1.2 The Paucity of Ci Research

Compared with *Tang Shi*, *Song Ci* have received less attention in the Anglophone world, even though some scholars have argued that *Song Ci* embodied unparallel literary beauty (Xu, 2011; Zhou, 2003). Not only were *Song Ci* translated into English almost a century later than *Tang Shi* (Tu, 2020, p. 60), but the number of (re)translations is significantly lower than that of *Tang Shi* (Gong and Wu, 2013, p. 113; Ayling and Mackintosh, 1965, p. vii).

This is exacerbated by the paucity of literary criticism, which has not studied Ci comprehensively and systematically (Gong and Wu, 2013, p.113). According to Kang's (2022, p.15) bibliometric analysis, still too little research and few PhD theses except Li (2005b) have been undertaken and exclusively dedicated to the English translations of Ci in China up to April 2022, despite the emergence of several relevant studies in the past six years. There is also not much corresponding research in the Anglophone West. Even among the existing studies, Ci and its features still suffer from frequent confusion and misunderstanding. For instance, the understanding of Ci and its translation varies from one scholar to another. In the 20<sup>th</sup> century, many scholars (Ayling and Mackintosh, 1965; Chang, 1980; Hamill, 1985) in the Anglophone West adopted the Wade-Giles spelling system, referring to the Chinese Shi and Ci as Shih and Tz'u respectively in English; some (Chu, 1937) used "lyrics" to mean Chinese Ci; Hsu (1962) alternated between "poem" and "Tz'u" to name the Chinese Ci; Payne (1949) even used the English term "poem" to cover both Chinese "Shi" and "Ci"; whereas Ci was referred to as both "lyrics" and "Tz'u" by Hinton (2008). In the 21st century, some simply used the Mandarin Shi and Ci (Djao, 2010; Egan, 2013; 2019; Lee, 2018; Coren, 2021).

This is also true in the case of translating Cipai (tune titles 词牌) in Li Qingzhao's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The translation was taken from *Chinadaily*, see footnote 1.

works. Pin-Ching Hu (Hu Pinqing in Hanyu pinyin transliteration) (1966) chose to translate some Cipai into English based on meaning and some by using transliteration. For example, when she translated the Cipai "Pinling ( $\square \Leftrightarrow$ )", she chose the transliteration as "Modelled on Pinling" (Hu, 1966, p. 64), whereas she chose to translate the meaning as "Modelled on Painted Lips" (Hu, 1966, p. 65) for "Dianjiangchun (点绛唇)". Rexroth and Chung (1979) chose to title some Ci based on the main idea first and then translate Cipai by meaning. For instance, the translation of the Cipai "Rumengling (如梦令)" was made of two parts. The first part, "Joy of Wine", came as the main title and it was a summary of the main idea and invention by translators. "To The Tune 'A Dream Song'" was followed as the subtitle and it was a translation from its Chinese meaning (Rexroth and Chung, 1979, p.3). James Cryer (1984) titled some *Ci* with the main idea and untitled some others, but all were offered the translation of Cipai by meaning at the bottom of each page. For example, the Ci "Caisangzi (采桑子)" began with no title but the first verse and its Cipai was translated by meaning into "tune: Picking Mulberries" at the bottom (Cryer, 1984, p.13). The Ci "Yujia'ao (渔家傲)" began with the title "Recalling a Dream" based on the main idea and the Cipai was also translated by meaning as "Pride of the Fisherman" at the bottom (Cryer, 1984, p.7). Djao (2010, p.35-36) chose to translate every Cipai into English by its meaning. Similarly, "Rumengling" was translated as "To the tune of 'As in a Dream"" and "Dianjiangchun" was translated as "To the tune of 'Painted Lips". Hinton (2008) left all of Li Qingzhao's Ci untitled in the text and listed her Ci with the bracketed first verse in the content part. Clearly, the above-described inadequacy and inconsistency have resulted in a patchy representation of *Ci* in English, which has led to a paucity of critical attention on Ci.

### 1.2 The Importance of Li Qingzhao

Among all *Ci* poets in the *Song* Dynasty, Li Qingzhao, has been widely acknowledged as the most talented and the best-known female poet among her contemporaries in Chinese literature. Her special brilliance in *Ci* has been compared with other literary geniuses and praised by over thirty scholars in the *Song*, *Yuan* (元), *Ming* (明) and *Qing* (清) Dynasties and pre-modern China. For instance, she was praised as the Number One female *Ci* poet in the Northern *Song* Dynasty by Hu Yiyun and Xu Shijun (Xu, 2018, p. 459 and p.465).

Many subsequent writers have been affected by Li Qingzhao's works and have imitated her style, so that it has become known as "Yi'an style (易安体)". Lu You (1125-1210. CE) and Xin Qiji<sup>3</sup> (1140-1207. CE) were two of the most famous Yi'an followers, demonstrating a clear reference to her in their *Ci* "*The Shen Garden* (沈园)" and "*Qing Yu'an* (青玉案)" respectively (Chen, 2021, p.17). As a representative of the *wanyue* (婉约) lyrical style (the school of the delicate restrained), Li Qingzhao was often coupled with Xin Qiji, a representative of the *haofang* (豪放) lyrical style (the school of the heroic abandon). They were nicknamed "*Ji'nan Two Ans* (济南二安)" because of their similar leading position in *Ci* history, their shared birthplace, and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Both Lu You and Xin Qiji are two well-known patriotic poets recognized in ancient Chinese literature.

fact that they share the same character "An" in Li's style name and Xin's courtesy name (Zhu, 2018, p.127).<sup>4</sup> Nalan Xingde from the Qing Dynasty was also influenced by her (Idema and Haft, 1997, p. 187). In pre-modern China, renowned influential writers and educators, such as Zheng Zhenduo, Hu Shi, and Guo Moruo, spoke highly of Li Qingzhao's contribution to ancient Chinese literature. Zheng Zhenduo compared her to Sappho (Egan, 2013, p.284); Hu Shi (1992, p. 9-10) translated a part of "*The Postscript to Jinshilu* (金石录后序)" and the preface to "*Dama Fu*<sup>5</sup> (打马赋 Dama rhyme-prose)" to show her character and domestic life with her husband; Guo Moruo even wrote a poem to commemorate her (Egan, 2013, p.7). In 1987, one crater on the planet Mercury was named after Li Qingzhao by the International Astronomers' Association (Zhu, 2018, p.127), making her the only woman to be nominated for this honour among fourteen male titans from Chinese history, including Li Bai (Dashu, 2019).

Li Qingzhao has also caught the attention of translators and scholars in the Anglophone West. Her works were repeatedly translated by over sixty different translators over the past 100 years, and she was ranked among the top ten poets whose works have been translated into English in the Anglophone West (Tu, 2016, p.5).

Her literary fame and accomplishments make her one of the best ambassadors for classical Chinese culture, but there were some discrepancies about her name and even misunderstandings of her life and works, which might impair her popularity in the world and the dissemination of Chinese culture in general. To take one example, she was named in six different ways in the Anglophone West. In 1918, she was called "Lyy-Hane" by James Whithall (1918); then "Li-I-an" by Arthur Waley (1918, p.17); then "Li Ch'ing-chao" in the 1950s to 1990s by many scholars (Hu, 1966; Rexroth and Chung, 1979; Cryer, 1984; Wang, 1989) except for "Lee Ching-chao" by Lai Ming (1964) and "Li Ching-Jau" by Greg Whincup (1987), and later after 2000, "Li Qingzhao" was used by scholars like Djao (2010), Egan (2013; 2019), Lee (2018) and Coren (2021). The confusion in her name translation could misdirect readers towards a totally different person, and certainly could undermine her great reputation and the circulation of her works. The underrepresentation of her works, analysed in detail in Chapters Four to Six, may aggravate the situation and might cast shade on Chinese poetry more broadly. That is partly the reason this research chooses Li Qingzhao as the particular poet to study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In ancient China, people from gentry class often have several names. The name, Xing Ming (姓名), is given by their parents, composed of the surname and given name, with the surname (*Xing*) coming first, such as Li, and the given name (*Ming*) coming second, like Qingzhao; The *Hao* (号), Style name, with two or four characters, is given by themselves to express their personal ambition, interest or character, such as *Yi'an Jushi* (易安居士); The *Zi* (字), Courtesy name, is given by friends with two characters. Conventionally, *Zi* was used to show respect and friendliness, yet women did not have a Zi. When women got married, they inherited their husband's surname, becoming "Mrs...". This research adopts the above translations of *Hao* and *Zi*, offered by Djao (2010), as they are quite faithful to their meaning.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "*Fu*" was one literary genre popular in the court of Western *Han* Dynasty (202 BC – 9 AD). Back then, it was usually written to praise the imperial accomplishment and power with long length and rhyme. "*Fu*" was translated to "rhyme-prose" by Burton (1984, p.374), Egan (2013, p.177) and Fuller (2011). This research takes "rhyme-prose" as its English translation for clarity.

#### **1.3 The Research Niche**

Li Qingzhao's earliest translation into English dates from 1918 (Whithall, 1918) and the most recent was published in 2021 (Coren, 2021), thus spanning over a century of continuous translation into English. Since 1918, over ninety translators both from China and the West have (re)translated her works into English. Despite the comparatively early translation of her work in the Anglophone West, research on the English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works only began in the 1960s, with more frequent and intensive research starting in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. The existing literature from China and the West delved into Li Qingzhao's (re)translation works from the point of view of stylistics (Wang, 2000), structuralism (Owen, 2010), feminism (Wixted,1994; Wang, 2003; Egan, 2013), biography (Hu, 1966; Djao, 2010), comparative literature (Yu, 1983; Xu, 2005), and translation strategies (Xu, 1984; Li, 2005b), etc.

Most of the above-discussed selected *Shi* or *Ci* by certain translators. None of these studies were systematic as they did not include material from over 90 anthologies, collections and monographs published in the past 100 years for diachronic research as the current research project does. The inclusion of this untapped material falls in line with Frank's observation (2001, p.13) that "translation anthologies were, until recently, part of a 'shadow culture', overlooked, by and large, by cultural critics, literary historians, and translation scholars alike." Seruya also asserted that translation anthologies may "reflect and project an image of the best text, author or genre from a given culture, [and] thus manipulate its reception" (Seruya, 2013, p.2). More importantly, the significance of a diachronic research was highlighted by Gòdia (2022, p. 134) who asserted that,

...a diachronic study of the different versions is therefore key to an analysis of how a work is received (Berman, 1990). It is also key to an understanding of the place that is occupied by a particular author within the literary, cultural and educational system.

Thus, it is necessary to bridge this research gap and include as many translations as possible to sketch out the (re)translation history of Li Qingzhao's works and reveal her reception in the Anglophone West and her impact on the target literature.

Despite these repeated translations in the Anglophone West, the literature also shows that there is a paucity of enquiry into the multiple motives for these (re)translations and the potential connections between them, with the exception of the different cultural identities of (re)translators (Li and Ji, 2014). There is no systematic study of Li Qingzhao's literary impact and reception on the Anglophone literary polysystem, which provides a research gap for this study to bridge. As stated by Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.17), "[t]he act of translation itself is an act of reception, since each translator interprets the literary text in his or her own individual way and within his or her specific socio-historical and cultural context...". Similar contextual consideration of retranslation was stressed by Deane-Cox (2014, p.190) who believed that "retranslation is as much a socially and a culturally embedded phenomenon as it is a textualized one". To further this point, Gulyás (2022, p.229) claimed that "retranslation indicates a need for a different kind of reception of the same source text, i.e., retranslation expresses a change in the way the target culture receives texts". Therefore, this research project first takes (re)translation as a primary and collective act of reception among translators, editors and publishers, especially in terms of the selection of text and specific time and place of its publication as well as the way the text is marketed and disseminated. This primary reception influences "the actual reception of the book", confirmed by Gulyás (2022, p. 222). This project investigates these (re)translations from both internal textual-linguistic and external contextual perspectives with their paratextual information. This specific investigation offers new insight into how and why these (re)translations were received and presented by the translating and publishing agents as initial Anglophone audience and the interaction between (re)translation and reception. In addition, this project then transcends beyond the (re)translation dataset to creative responses produced by artists as receivers to deepen the understanding of the poet's more profound impact and reception in the target culture, and hopefully shedding light on future retranslations and reception research.

# **1.4 The Research Objectives**

This research aims to explore the (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone West and determine the reception of the poet and the potential impact of her works on the English literary landscape of the 20<sup>th</sup> and early 21<sup>st</sup> centuries.

The specific objectives of this research are:

- to systematically identify as many of Li Qingzhao's works translated into English as possible in the Anglophone world and set up a diachronic dataset of her (re)translations;
- to provide an overview of the historical development of these (re)translations;
- to examine the relationship between these (re)translations and reception from an external contextual perspective;
- to enquire about the dynamics between these (re)translations and reception diachronically and synchronically, especially in anthologies;
- to compare and contrast (re)translations from an internal textual-linguistic perspective to see her reception;
- to examine the reception of the (re)translated complete collections with the help of paratextual information;
- to enquire into her literary impact through (re)translations and beyond the dataset in the target culture;
- to identify approaches to increasing her prominence and promoting the reception of her English translations in the target culture;
- to put forward suggestions on retranslation in the current context.

# **1.5 Research Questions and Outlines**

In order to realize the objectives of this research, the project seeks to explore the following questions:

RQ1: How did the (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works develop over the past 100

years in the Anglophone West and mainland China?

RQ2: How are Li Qingzhao's works received in the Anglophone West through (re)translations in a macro-perspective?

RQ3: How are Li Qingzhao's works received in the Anglophone West through (re)translations in a micro-perspective?

RQ4: Beyond her English (re)translations, how does she exert her literary impact in the target culture?

RQ5: What could be suggested to increase the visibility and engagement with the English retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works and enhance her reception in the West?

To look into those questions, seven chapters are organized in the thesis as follows: Chapter One introduces the research background, questions, objectives, and methodologies. It also outlines the poet's cultural background and biography to pave the way for reading the main chapters. Chapter Two explains the theoretical framework of retranslation, reception and current research trends; Chapter Three provides a critical literature review of the existing studies about Li Qingzhao's works (re)translated into English both in mainland China and the Anglophone West and points out the research gap in order to address part of Research Question one. In line with Gulyás' view (2022, p. 230) that "[r]etranslations are also accompanied by paratextual and epitextual elements that explain the socio-cultural and linguistic context that brought them into existence", Chapter Four deals with Research Question Two to provide a macrocontextual examination of Li Qingzhao's English (re)translations through paratextual material. Taking translating and publishing agents as primary receivers, it reveals where and when these (re)translations were published and received, who (re)translated the works, what sources they referred to and how (re)translations were presented. Chapter Five seeks to answer Research Question Three by examining the paratextual information of Li Qingzhao's complete English collections. This reveals how these paratextual elements might exert influence on the reception of the poet and her work. In order to further address Questions Two and Three, Chapter Six takes specific French-English (re)translations as case studies, analyses the contextual factors and scrutinizes them linguistically to reveal potential flaws in these (re)translations and their subsequent impact. To address Research Question Four, Chapter Six also delves into creative responses to reveal Li Qingzhao's deeper impact on the target culture beyond the (re)translation dataset by viewing these creative artists as alternative receivers. The last chapter deals with Research Question Five. It brings together all the findings from the analysed material and proposes strategies for the refinement of retranslation socio-cultural the current context, more accessibility and in better dissemination of classical Chinese poems in a larger sense. It then summarizes the project, comments on its strengths and limitations and suggests further studies. The outlines of this project are shown in the following Figure 1.

Figure 1 Outline of the research project



### **1.6 Research Methodologies**

To address the above research questions, a mixed-methods approach is used in this project, as this methodology offers "a better understanding of the research problem" especially in translation studies, pinpointed by Meister (2018, p. 68) and "mixed method research is likely to provide superior research findings and outcomes", stressed by Johnson et al (2007, p.129).

According to Meister (2018, p. 68),

[M]ixed methods is increasingly seen as a research approach where elements of quantitative and qualitative character (ranging from philosophical assumptions to data) can be mixed at any level of the research design and at any stage of the research process.

In this research, both quantitative and qualitative methods are mixed both at the research design and process. The triangulation of different research methods is nowadays supported by many scholars. For instance, in the book *Using Corpora in Discourse Analysis (second edition)* by Paul Baker (2023, p. 18-21), a great many researchers have adopted triangulation in their research. Among them, Layder in Baker (2023, p.19) asserted its advantages as follows:

"[triangulation] facilitates validity checks of hypotheses, it anchors findings in more robust interpretations and explanations, and it allows researchers to respond flexibly to unforeseen problems and aspects of their research."

Following this kind of triangulation and its justification, this research has been

conducted using the methods listed below.

Materials	Methodology (Quantitative/Qualitative)
A dataset of (re)translations with	Bibliographical data triangulated with
corresponding paratexts	paratextual materials (Quantitative and
	Qualitative methods)
French-English (re)translations	Qualitative methods by case studies
with paratexts and creative	
responses	
Titles, covers, blurbs and notes,	Qualitative methods triangulated with data
etc.	from contextual analysis
	A dataset of (re)translations with corresponding paratexts French-English (re)translations with paratexts and creative responses Titles, covers, blurbs and notes,

Table 1 Research methodology

# 1.6.1 A Bibliographic Research Method

A bibliographic research method is applied to identify as many English versions of Li Qingzhao's works as possible from both Chinese and English libraries and databases, such as the library of UWTSD, the National Library of Wales and the British Library, mainly accessing data from the UK, and the library of WHPU, covering almost all Chinese data; the OCLC (Online Computer Library Centre), *WorldCat*, *Library Hub Discover*, the *Internet Archive* and *Google Scholar* for data from other regions. The versions include both digital and paper editions currently available in the above library databases. *Index Translationum* is also included as a complementary online database, as it contains up-to-date bibliographical information on books translated and published in about 100 languages of the UNESCO Member States between 1979 and 2009. Data gathered from above are used to set up a diachronic dataset, addressing Research Question One.

# 1.6.2 Quantitative Methods

By building up a dataset of English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works, the quantitative method is adopted to answer Research Question Two, including a catalogue of specific publications and relevant publishing information in specific places and periods by specific translators. This data reveals the macro-contextual factors influencing Li Qingzhao's (re)translations and reception. The data on Chinese references and their proportional representation, are analysed to reveal the dynamics of (re)translation and reception between the source and target culture. Individual Chinese source texts are measured against the frequency of their (re)translation. In addition, the frequency with which translators are cited in publications is recorded, compared and ranked to demonstrate the popularity and reception of the source poems and their (re)translators. The data of Li Qingzhao's proportional representation in anthologies is compared with that of other poets from her time, such as Sushi, Qin Guan, Huang Tingjian and so on, to reveal her comparative popularity synchronically and diachronically. These data will address Research Question Two.

### 1.6.3 Qualitative Methods

Qualitative methods are applied for the contextual investigation to analyse the cultural, historical and social conditions in which (re)translations were produced. This is conducted using paratextual materials of (re)translations in the dataset, such as prefaces,

contents pages, information about publishing houses and date of publication, etc. Qualitative examination also scrutinizes and compares peritextual materials of translated collections, such as book covers, titles, blurbs, illustrations, and notes, etc., to uncover their potential impact on readers' reception. Qualitative methods also include close reading into case studies of French-English (re)translations and creative responses for detailed textual criticism. This method addresses Research Questions Three and Four. Qualitative analysis of suggestions for future retranslation and reception is provided in the last chapter to address the last research question.

#### **1.7 Significance of this Study**

This study contributes to the current research into Li Qingzhao's (re)translation in the following respects:

Firstly, this project contributes some knowledge about Li Qingzhao and Chinese classical poetry in the English world. The existing literature shows that the number of her English translations published in mainland China and the Anglophone West is fewer than a hundred, while over a thousand Chinese books about Li Qingzhao are available in the Chaoxing E-library database,<sup>6</sup> and a lot more journal papers written in Chinese are found in the CNKI database.<sup>7</sup> The contrasting amount of literature written in Chinese and English suggests there is much more room left to study Li Qingzhao and her works.

Secondly, the research expands the database of Li Qingzhao's (re)translations in the Anglophone West and acknowledges the contributions of those translators in the past century. The existing studies are mainly concerned with major translators and their translations and have overlooked the contributions of some minor translators in the 20<sup>th</sup> century and some of the latest productions in the 21st century. For instance, The White Pony by Robert Payne (1949) was "the bestselling English language anthology of Chinese poetry of the 20th century", according to Seaton (2006, p.154), but Li Qingzhao's translator Sophia Chen was barely mentioned and almost forgotten in subsequent studies. The most frequently quoted doctoral thesis (Li, 2005b) in mainland China failed to identify over a dozen retranslations in the new century. The complete translated versions of Lee (2018) and Coren (2021) have never been mentioned by any Chinese mainland scholars in any academic publications; this is probably due to lack of access. Similarly, neither Djao's (2010) version nor Egan's (2019) version has been investigated closely in any of Li Qingzhao's (re)translation studies. It was not until April 2022 that Yang (2022), at Wellesley College, United States, included a few translations from Lee's (2018) version, Djao's (2010) text and Egan's (2019) version in her study. The failure to identify a complete list of anthologies compromises both the feasibility and objectivity of the diachronic analysis. The failure to recognize preceding minor translators also neglects translators' visibility, and the failure to include the latest

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Chaoxing database is one of the largest Chinese language e-libraries in the world.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> CNKI, namely, the China National Knowledge Infrastructure, is the most comprehensive full-text database of Chinese journals in mainland China. It has a complete collection of both academic and non-academic journals published since 1915, covering important journals in all disciplines in fast and continuous publication.

translators makes the research not up-to-date. These shortcomings are redressed in Chapters Three and Four.

Thirdly, this research also dispels some stereotyped or biased judgments about Li Qingzhao and the representation of Chinese women. To name a few cases, Hu Pinqing (1966) wrote that Li's second marriage was just a rumour; similar statements are made by Eugene Eoyang (1999, p. 89), and Kai-Yu Hsu (1962), who referred to the poet's second marriage as a "legend". Xu (2005) misunderstood and misinterpreted Li Qingzhao's poems when he suggested that the themes reflect her complicity and submission to patriarchy. These misjudgements may be partly caused by ignorance both of the context in which Li Qingzhao lived and that in which the later (re)translations were produced. Another contributing factor might be the fact that most of the studies dwelt upon fragments of poems without investigating the additional contextual factors.

Fourthly, this research unveils the interaction between retranslation and reception and interprets the mistranslations, enhancing the understanding of Li Qingzhao's works and improving circulation. The misunderstanding of Li Qingzhao in these (re)translations is not uncommon. To take a few examples, Whithall (1918, p. 32) mistranslated the tune title "Langtaosha (浪淘沙)" into "the wild swan", which is neither a literal translation nor creative translation, as this tune title bears nothing close to the source, with more to be discussed in Chapter Six. Rexroth and Chung's (1979) Li Ch'ing-chao Complete Poems is the most frequently quoted English version<sup>8</sup> of Li Qingzhao's works in the last century, but it contains many erotic additions that do not appear in the original text. Among these are the "love-making" line in "Xingxiangzi (行 香子)", and the choice of the words "lasciviously" and "flirtatiously" in "Chubaqiuqian (蹴罢秋千)", as well as many notes, which are discussed in detail in Chapter Five. Similarly, James Cryer's (1984) "Nangezi (南歌子)" and some notes present many sexual hints, too. In addition, other errors caused by misunderstanding include authorship misattribution and possible inattention, such as Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone (1992, p.139) misattributed the poem "Clear Bright" to Li Qingzhao, which was written by another Song poet Gao Zhu according to most poem anthologies and the National Digital Library of China.<sup>9</sup> Sam Hamill (2000) even translated the same Ci twice and listed it on different pages (p. 237 and p. 243) with only one-word difference (sorry/sad), which gave readers the false impression that Li Qingzhao wrote two similar Ci carelessly. Whether intentionally or not, the depiction of the female persona's debauchery, along with misattribution and carelessness in these (re)translations has likely influenced readers' perception of the poet, her works and potentially Chinese women and culture as a whole.

Next, this research provides data that will enrich future research into Li Qingzhao,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See chapter four for statistical evidence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> 清明日对酒 (no date). Available at:

http://find.nlc.cn/search/doSearch?query=%E6%B8%85%E6%98%8E%E6%97%A5%E5%AF%B9% E9%85%92&secQuery=&actualQuery=%E6%B8%85%E6%98%8E%E6%97%A5%E5%AF%B9%E9 %85%92&searchType=2&docType=%E5%85%A8%E9%83%A8&isGroup=isGroup&targetFieldLog =%E5%85%A8%E9%83%A8%E5%AD%97%E6%AE%B5&fromHome=true&fromGuotu=fromGuo Tu (Accessed: 2<sup>nd</sup> July 2024) (In Chinese)

her works and classical Chinese poetry more broadly. As mentioned above, though existing literature from China and the West has investigated Li Qingzhao's translation works from a wide range of perspectives, the qualitative method has dominated the majority of studies. The existing literature shows very few quantitative studies and these are restricted to quite limited databases (Zhang, 2012, Tang and Wang 2012, Liu, 2020, Liu and Li, 2021). None of the above created a dataset as large as this project. Additionally, most of the above only included the English translations of Li Qingzhao's works and neglected paratextual materials. A mixed-methods approach has rarely been adopted in previous studies. This kind of quantitative result from paratextual elements complements the qualitative method. The synthesis of both the textual, contextual and paratextual analysis leads to a more holistic understanding and discovery of her retranslation and reception in the Anglophone West. The integration of the qualitative and quantitative methods in this research is pioneering and may inspire subsequent studies.

Another contribution of this research is its extension of the scope of research subjects. It covers English translations of Li Qingzhao's works in journals, anthologies, women's monographs, complete collections, and even literary history, etc. None of the previous research has covered such a wide range of research subjects. More significantly, it not only includes those popular (re)translated *Ci*, but also her other works, such as *Shi* and essays. By examining wider research subjects, this research is also innovative in its expansion of the bilateral relationship between (re)translation and reception in Li Qingzhao's works and for the first time, it systematically examines her literary impact in and beyond (re)translations by including creative responses from artists as receivers in Chapter Six.

Finally, the study demystifies Ci and deepens the appreciation of Chinese classical literature and civilization to some extent. The inferiority in quantity and quality of Ci translation and its related studies probably resulted from the myth shaped by Arthur Waley (1918, p.18) that "lyrics from *Song* Dynasty are unsuitable for translation as their whole merit lies in metrical dexterity". This idea was later reinforced by Hu Pinqing who claimed (1966, p.7): "[.....] since tz'u [is] considered only a branch of *Shih*, [it] is more subtle and shaded with nuance, and consequently, it is less translatable." She also said (1966, p.7), "there are poems that lend themselves easily to translation and others that are almost untranslatable." As Li Qingzhao's works represent a crucial part of classical Chinese literature, the comprehension of her English (re)translations may augment understanding and translation of other *Ci* and help to dispel the myth of *Ci* and classical Chinese literature more broadly. In so doing, it might make *Ci* less intimidating, thereby mitigating the psychological burden of translators to a certain degree and drawing more readers and translators.

In order to facilitate the understanding of main chapters of this thesis, it is first necessary to examine the cultural context in which Li Qingzhao was writing and the biographical details that may shed light on her work.

### **1.8 Cultural Background**

#### 1.8.1 Chinese Literary Terms and Names

Classical Chinese poetry includes many kinds of poems from different periods in ancient China. There are four-character poems from the pre-Qin (先秦) period (before 221 CE) in Shijing (The Book of Songs<sup>10</sup>诗经), such as "关关雎鸠,在河之洲。窈窕 淑女, 君子好逑...". This poem was translated as "Kuan-kuan, the ospreys. On the river's isle. Delicate, a good girl: A gentleman's fit mate" (Yip, 1997, p. 34-35). Han Yuefu (汉乐府) poems are typically made of five characters, such as "江南可采莲, 莲 叶何田田, 鱼戏莲叶间...". This was translated as "South of the river to pluck lotus. Lotus leaves drift, drift. Fish sport, midst of lotus leaves..." (Yip,1997, p.80-81). Quatrains (绝句) are five-character or seven-character poems in four lines, such as "故 人西辞黄鹤楼,烟花三月下扬州。孤帆远影碧空尽,唯见长江天际流". This was translated as "My old friend takes off from the Yellow Crane Tower, In smoke-flower third month down to Yangchou. A lone sail, a distant shade, lost in the blue horizon. Only the long Yangtze is seen flowing into the sky" (Yip,1997, p. 238). Lv Shi (Regulated Verse 律诗) from the Tang Dynasty (618-907 CE) are often seven-character poems in eight lines, such as one of the masterpieces by Du Fu, which reads "风急天 高猿啸哀,渚清沙白鸟飞回。无边落木萧萧下,不尽长江滚滚来。万里悲秋常作 客,百年多病独登台。艰难苦恨繁霜鬓,潦倒新停浊酒杯". This was translated as "The wind keen, the sky high, the gibbons wailing, Blue islands, white sand and seabirds flying, And everywhere the leaves falling, Then the immeasurable great river in torrent. Ten thousand li from home, in such an autumn, Wasted by sickness and years, alone, climbing the heights. Sorrows and griefs and sufferings have given me new grey hairs. Utterly cast down, I have just drunk a glass of wine" (Payne, 1949, p. 201). The Ci from the Song Dynasty (960-1279 CE) is explained later in this chapter. Sanqu (散 曲) from the Yuan Dynasty (1271-1368 CE), is "similar to the tz'u but freer in execution and including both short lyrics and more complex and longer forms suited to narrative and/or dramatic or operatic creation" (Seaton, 2006, p. 152), such as Ma Zhiyuan's "枯 藤老树昏鸦, 小桥流水人家, 古道西风瘦马, 夕阳西下, 断肠人在天涯". This was translated as "Dried vines, an old tree, evening crows; A small bridge, flowing water, men's homes; An ancient road, west winds, a lean horse; Sun slants west; The hearttorn man at sky's end" (Yip, 1997, p. 340).

In the 21<sup>st</sup> century, the Hanyu pinyin transliteration system is widely accepted and followed both in China and the West. Even the United Nations has adopted the Hanyu pinyin transliteration system. This research recognizes the Hanyu pinyin transliteration system as the most standard pronunciation in spoken and written Chinese and uses this system to refer to Chinese literary terms and names of people for the sake of accuracy, as the English term "poetry or poem" is too general and vague. Additionally, classical Chinese poetry contains over ten different varieties, some of which are discussed above, according to Prof. Kang-I Sun Chang (1996, p. 83-90). The rich connotation makes the word "poetry" insufficient to distinguish one Chinese poetic form from another and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> The translation of the title is from Arthur Waley (1937).

confusion in Chinese terms and proper names may misdirect readers towards a totally different concept. Thus, this research uses Ci as a proper name to refer to poems set to music with tune titles from the Song Dynasty (960-1279 CE), which gradually has been a custom in literary criticism by many sinologists, such as Egan (2013; 2019), Owen (2010) and Chang (1996). Shi is adopted to mean poems like those from the Tang Dynasty (618-907 CE) and the difference between Shi and Ci is explained in the next part. In this research, "poetry" is used to mean the general literary genre different from prose, essay, drama, or novel; "poem" refers to specific Shi and Ci. As Chinese nouns have no change in inflection, the plural form of Ci has no inflectional change in English, and thus inflection for number is only indicated by modifiers. The inflection of verbs corresponds with the meaning of these Chinese proper nouns in this research. The titles of Li Qingzhao's works are written in pinyin transliteration italicized with double quotation marks and bracketed with Chinese characters when mentioned for the first time. As some of her Ci share the same tune title but with different content, the first few words of the first line will also be given after the pinyin as a distinction. For further clarity, some other important Chinese literary terms and proper names are also written in pinyin transliteration, followed by Chinese characters in brackets, to avoid misunderstandings of homophones. Some obscure Chinese terms are footnoted for clarification.

#### 1.8.2 The Introduction of Ci

*Ci* and *Shi* have been the two major poetic forms in ancient Chinese literature for almost a thousand years. *Ci* is commonly believed to have originated in the *Tang* Dynasty, developing in the Five Dynasties and Ten States (907-979 CE) and flourishing in the *Song* Dynasty (Djao, 2010; Yu, 1994; Ward 2008; Zhou, 2013). In the very beginning, it originated from poetic verses of uneven line length, set to music and called new *Yuefu* poems (Djao, 2010; Liu, 1974). The frequent contact between China and its neighbouring tribes, such as those along the Silk Road, during the *Tang* Dynasty accelerated the popularity of foreign music, leading to some Chinese poets writing verses with foreign melodies and later writing folk music to express their personal sentiments as a way of relaxation. Probably its original musical quality is part of the reason many people translated *Ci* into English as "lyrics".

The early *Ci* was composed by female singers or male poets in the voice of females to express their individual sensitivity toward their loved ones. The themes mainly included romantic love, homesickness, missing husbands or friends, sorrows over husbands' cold-heartedness, etc. *Ci* were sung by courtesans from the court, barracks and private houses or tavern girls to entertain their listeners at parties or gatherings. In contrast, the tradition of Chinese *Shi* was believed to express serious and orthodox thoughts about the country, the nation, one's ambitions and career development. Hence, the early *Ci* was labelled as "low culture" with a feminine temperament, while *Shi* was considered "high and noble" with a masculine temperament (Djao, 2010; Yu, 1994).

Originally, *Ci* was mainly composed of three parts: *Cipai*, verse and rhythm. *Cipai* is the title of the *Ci* and sets the main tune and meter, thus many scholars translate it as "tune" in English. The original *Cipai* corresponded to the subject of its following verse, but its melody was lost later in the *Song* Dynasty. Traditional *Shi* titles indicate the

subject, whereas *Cipai* has traditionally been less relevant or even irrelevant to its content (Liu, 1974, p. 9) and people just "filled the words" to fit the *Cipai* (Chang, 1980, p.2). There were over eight hundred *Cipai* in total. The same *Cipai* may be similar in structure but not identical, which gives flexibility in verse characters. Later some *Ci* also had subtitles, often the first sentence of the verse. These subtitles can help to distinguish between *Ci* that share the same *Cipai*.

A "verse" has varied lines and contains a varied number of characters in each line. As mentioned before, Chinese *Shi* was traditionally written in four characters in *The Book of Songs*, then five characters in *Han Yuefu* with even-numbered lines, six characters in *Wei-Jin* Period (220-420 CE), and later, seven characters with four lines and eight characters with eight lines in *Tang* Dynasty. The non-conformity of characters in uneven lines empowered *Ci* with much more flexibility and freedom of expression. The mixture of odd-number and even-number characters and lines enabled *Ci* to apply more "*Xuzi*" (empty words)<sup>11</sup> into the verses, of the kind that were more often used in colloquial language. The alternation between both empty words and "*Shici*" (full words) also endowed *Ci* with more accommodation of poetic elements and feelings. Compared with the abundance of parallelism in *Shi*, there are fewer paralleled lines in *Ci* because of the irregularity of the length of lines, though there are sometimes two paralleled lines in the verse prescribed by the *Cipai*.

Another difference from *Shi* lies in *Ci*'s rhythm. There are four tones in Chinese characters: "*ping*", "*shang*", "*ru*", "*qu*". Among them, "*ping*" was considered as the level tone, and "*shang*, *qu* and *ru*" as oblique tones. Traditional *Shi* only took level tone as the rhyme in the even-numbered lines, whereas Ci, against the convention, began to adopt the oblique tone and later blended both level and oblique tones in one *Ci*. Compared with an unchanged rhyme in *Shi*, *Ci* tended to have changed rhymes in one single piece, sometimes with changed rhymes in each line, thus forming less parallelism. With a more flexible structure, the arrangement of tones and rhyme patterns and the number of characters in each line was still established by *Cipai*. Apart from rhymes, other rhetorical devices, such as alliteration and onomatopoeia, are more often employed in *Ci* to achieve its artistic effects.

The written pattern of Ci was very much the same as that of *Shi*. It was written from right to left in lines and from top to bottom character by character. *Cipai* was situated at the very right corner of a page spaced a little with the poet's name, followed by the next line on the left. Thus, it was read vertically line by line from up to down, and it was supposed to be read with a short pause within a line and a longer pause at the end of each line, though without any punctation in the original manuscript. The layout of *Ci* can be seen in the following Figure 2, the handwritten example of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Empty words and full words are two kinds of grammatical words in Chinese. Empty words do not have much literary meaning and work as functional words to indicate the syntax; while full words are basically nouns, verbs, adjectives, with actual literary meaning, like content words in English. For instance, in Li Qingzhao's *Ci "Shengshengman*" (声声慢), typical empty words are "也, 正, 却, 怎" etc. "也" "正" indicate the tense as when the migrant geese passed her head, she was grieving, and "却" is a conjunction, showing the transition, and "怎" means "how". "淡酒" "梧桐" "细雨" "黄花" "滴" are full words, which tell the actual weather and season and what it is going on.

#### "Rumengling-last night".

Figure 2 "Rumengling-last night" handwritten by my dear friend Ms. Xia Ting



The early *Ci* was very short and consisted of a single stanza. It was called "*Xiaoling* (小令)", short *Ci* or "*Dandiao*". For instance, Li Qingzhao's "*Rumengling-last night*" belongs to *Xiaoling*. It goes as follows:

昨夜雨吮风骤,	Last night the rain was intermittent, the wind blustery.
浓睡不消残酒。	Deep sleep did not dispel the lingering wine.
试问卷帘人,	I tried asking the maid raising the blinds,
却道海棠依旧。	who said the crab-apple blossoms were as before.
知否,知否?	"Don't you know?
应是绿肥红瘦。	Don't you know?
(Egan, 2019, p.101)	The greens must be plump and the reds spindly."

*Ci* later evolved into two stanzas or longer. This was called "*Manci*" (extended or long *Ci* 慢词) or "*Shuangdiao*". "*Manci*" was favoured by a great number of literati and dominated the *Ci* production in the *Song* Dynasty. For instance, among all of Li Qingzhao's works, there were only three *Xiaoling*, and the rest were all *Manci*. The following example "*Wulingchun* (武陵春)" is one representative *Manci* from Li Qingzhao.

风住尘香花已尽,	When the winds stop, the ground is fragrant, the flowers all are down,
日晚倦梳头。	as the day wears on I'm too lazy to comb my hair.
物是人非事事休,	The objects are right, the people wrong, everything is over now!
欲语泪先流。	About to speak, tears first flow.
闻说双溪春尚好, 也拟泛轻舟。 只恐双溪舴艋舟, 载不动、许多愁。	I've heard spring is still lovely at Twin Streams, I'd like to go boating in a light skiff. But I fear the little grasshopper boats they have could not carry such a freight of sorrow.

(Egan, 2019, p.163)

The early *Ci* was circulated mainly orally or written anonymously. The theme of romance, deemed less prestigious than that of *Shi* limited its acceptance in academic circles and its recognition as formal literature. This perception started to shift with the compilation of the specialized *Ci* anthology *Huajianji* (花间集) in 940 CE with the preface written by the famous man of letters Ouyang Xiu (1007-1072 CE) (Chang, 1980, p.15). For the first time, *Ci* was recognized as a literary genre and attributed to its authors even with their official titles. That was taken as the initial stage of *Ci*. Most of the works were *Xiaoling*, speaking of romance with a female persona.

*Ci* evolved into the second phase when Liu Yong (984-1053 CE) extended the preliminary *Xiaoling* to two stanzas and developed a new sub-genre: *Manci*. He found *Xiaoling* was too short to express more complex feelings. A longer piece would allow more space for "the multifaceted description of scenery, the presentation of the twists and turns of complicated human feelings and the narration of the drama of human relationships" (Lian, 2008, p. 263). Liu Yong expanded the structure and slightly broadened the themes beyond the female experience to that of wandering scholars, yet his works were still not taken seriously, marked as coarse and vulgar in the eyes of literary elites. Li Qingzhao made a similar comment in her essay "*On Song Lyrics* (词 论)". Modern critics believe this criticism was unfair, after all the dramatic narration in *Manci* by Liu Yong foresaw and ushered in a new literary genre, "*Yuan Drama* (元曲)" in the *Yuan* Dynasty (Chang, 1980, p. 19).

The popularity of Ci grew immensely in the Northern Song Dynasty as a great number of literati began to absorb popular songs into their literary production. One of the most prominent literati, Su Shi (1037-1101 CE), extended the scope of Ci, beyond entertainment. He wrote Ci on many other occasions, such as eulogies for his wife. He also challenged the tradition of Shi expressing ambition and Ci conveying feelings. Instead, he infused his Ci with the traditional grand matters regarding the state, the empire, the court and people's careers. Rather than assuming a female persona, Su Shi transformed the style to reflect a more 'masculine' temperament and deliver selfexpression. His success and contribution to Ci matured and raised this literary genre to a more popular and widely accepted form of literature, appropriate for the expression of a wider range of subjects. Later in the Southern Song Dynasty, Xin Qiji (1140-1207 CE) incorporated his heroic life experiences into Ci and intensified Ci's heroic temperament. This kind of Ci style was classified as the "haofang" school (豪放派 heroic abandon).<sup>12</sup> During that period, other writers such as Zhou Bangyan (1056–1121 CE) and Su Shi's disciples Huang Tingjian (1045-1105 CE) and Qin Guan (1049-1100 CE), continued to depict delicate feelings of the human heart. They focused on themes related to more personal topics, paying attention to the melody, refining their language and preferring a more indirect and subtle form of expression. Allusions to classical Chinese literature, myths or legends are constantly borrowed to imply their feelings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> *Haofang* and *Wanyue* have been translated into "heroic abandon" and "delicate restrained" by many scholars, such as Chang (1980), Yu (1994), and Egan (2013). This research adopts these translations of the terms.

This kind of style was classified as the "*wanyue*" school (婉约派 delicate restraint). Li Qingzhao was one of the leading poets of the *wanyue* school as mentioned earlier.

These two schools, in content, achieved all *Shi* could convey and allowed a deeper and more intricate articulation of emotion. In form, they transcended *Shi*'s rigour and convention, integrating foreign and folk melodies into literature and embracing the vernacular language more than ever before. Thus, *Ci* was accredited as "the summit of Chinese prosodic literature" (Zhou, 2003, p.11). *Song Ci* was believed to have incomparable publicity and popularity because of its unique form and power of expression (Wang, 2022, p.72).

Many factors contribute to Li Qingzhao's excellence in literature and her status as the empress of Ci, but one of the most important is her "rich dramatic life experience" (Zhuge, 2019, p. 2). It is worthwhile, therefore, to provide a brief biographic background to Li Qingzhao and her works.

#### 1.9 Introduction of Li Qingzhao and Her Works

Though there hasn't been much official historical documentation on the biographical details of Li Qingzhao, it has been generally recognized that Li Qingzhao is the most distinguished female poet in ancient Chinese literature. Only a few words in the official historical book of the *Song* Dynasty, *Song Shi* ( $\mathcal{R} \mathcal{L}$ ) have been written about her, "Li Qingzhao was the daughter of Li Gefei, talented in poetry and prose in her time, later married Zhao Mingcheng, the son of Zhao Tingzhi, and gave herself the style name 'Yi'an recluse'" (Chen, 2021, p.1).<sup>13</sup> The dates and locations of her birth and death were not specified, leaving researchers to piece her life together based on other materials, such as her works, her relatives' biographies and works, friends' letters, related rubbing materials<sup>14</sup> from her husband, and even her peers' and followers' comments on her. Li Qingzhao's literary collections were lost after her death. Since her biography has been controversial for years, what follows is the acknowledged version by most scholars in China and the Anglophone West.

#### **1.9.1 Introduction to Her Life**

#### 1.9.1.1 Early Life in Her Parents' House

Having cross-checked materials, scholars broadly agree that Li Qingzhao was born in Ji'nan, Shandong Province, in the Northern *Song* Period, around the year 1084 CE (Wang, 2020; Chen, 2021; Xu, 2018; Zhuge, 2019). She was born to a scholarly family, with her father Li Gefei as a scholar and follower of Su Shi. He believed in Su's ethos: "to write out of one's true character and sentiment" (Zhuge, 2019, p.14). Li Gefei was renowned for his integrity, honesty and modesty in office. He influenced and nurtured Li Qingzhao in literature, music, painting and calligraphy (Zhuge, 2019, p.12; Wu, 2009, p.2; Wang, 2020, p. 405). Her mother Ms. Wang was believed to come from a wealthy and high-ranking official family with a good home education and likely a skilled writer

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> My translation from Chinese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Rubbing materials refer to Zhao Mingcheng's collection of antiques, such as ancient stone tablets, bronze vessels, books, famous painting and calligraphic scrolls, and rubbings of inscriptions, etc.

(Djao, 2010; Wu, 2009; Chen, 2021; Xu, 2018; Zhuge, 2019).<sup>15</sup> Scholars such as Zhuge (2019), Djao (2010) and Chen (2021) believe that the literary beliefs and personality of Li Qingzhao's father and family environment made her who she was and contributed to what she achieved. According to Wang Zhuo in Wang Zhongwen (2020, p. 239), a *Song* Dynasty writer, "Li Qingzhao was famous for poetry writing at a very early age and her brilliance almost equalled that of her predecessors".<sup>16</sup> As a girl, she wrote some *Ci* and two famous political poems, earning herself a reputation as a talented lady among some intellectuals. Her *Ci*, such as "*Rumengling*" and "*Dianjiangchun-off the swing* (点绛 唇 • 蹴 罢 秋千)", were believed by many scholars to be written at an early age, expressing the joy in her early life. Her talent and courage to write about politics also reflected her extra-ordinariness and the open-mindedness of her family, as women were not encouraged to write in the *Song* Dynasty, less still to discuss politics (Egan, 2013, p. 21).

#### 1.9.1.2 Marriage to Zhao Mingcheng (赵明诚)

When Li Qingzhao was around 18, she was married to Zhao Mingcheng by her parents' arrangement.<sup>17</sup> According to her "*The Postscript to Jinshilu*", the newly married couple was frequently separated by Zhao Mingcheng's study at the Imperial University. Zhao was interested in collecting stone tablets and bronze inscriptions, and their time together was mostly spent scouting artifacts in the market, such as ancient stone tablets, calligraphic and painting scrolls and bronze vessels. Though living a frugal life, they were delighted by collecting and learning about the artifacts and studying art history and literature. Scholars like Djao (2010, p. 5) and Wang (2020, p. 404) believe their marriage benefited both, inspiring Li Qingzhao's writing and prompting her husband to become one of the best archaeological collectors of his time. According to Xu (2018, p.10) and Zhuge (2019, p. 52), some of Li Qingzhao's *Ci* described flirting with a man or longing for lovers or pining for a man's return, which were regarded to be written in this period to reflect her newly married life.

Unfortunately, the subsequent political turmoil involving Li Qingzhao's father and her father-in-law in the Northern *Song* Period (960-1127 CE) destabilized her happy marriage life, placing Li Qingzhao in a difficult predicament between her parents' and husband's family and leading to a separation from her parental family. This separation might offer an alternative, or perhaps additional explanation for the sentiment and nostalgia in her works. Later due to political accusation against Zhao's family, the couple were retired to Qingzhou in seclusion for ten years, collecting artifacts, editing catalogues and compiling *Jinshilu*. In *"The Postscript to Jinshilu*", Li Qingzhao recorded how joyous they were after they had collected one book and how hard they studied. During this period, Li Qingzhao gave herself the *"hao"* (style name) "Yi'an recluse (Lady)", indicating a similar life pursuit for contentment and tranquillity as Tao

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Scholars are still debating Ms. Wang's specific family ranking in the government and her identity as Li Qingzhao's biological mother or stepmother. Nevertheless, it can be surmised that Li Qingzhao was brought up by two members of the literati, in an academic and literary community.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> My translation from Chinese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Legend also says they knew each other, and Zhao fell in love with Li before the marriage.

Yuanming, which can be seen in some of her poems, such as "Duoli (多丽)".

#### 1.9.1.3 The Fall of the Country and Widowhood

The Northern *Song* Period ended by the invasion of the Jurchen<sup>18</sup> army and captivity of *Song* emperors (Zhuge, 2019, p.140). The Southern *Song* Period (1127-1279 CE) began when the youngest son of *Song* Huizong escaped to the South and claimed the throne in Nanjing, naming himself *Song* Gaozong.<sup>19</sup> Constant invasions and the consequent fall of northern cities destroyed the couple's collections in Qingzhou though they managed to transfer some. Sailing up the Yangtze River at Chiyang, Zhao Mingcheng received an imperial summons from Emperor *Song* Gaozong to repost and attend an audience in Nanjing. Zhao Mingcheng rode to Nanjing as fast as he could in the heat of summer and asked Li Qingzhao to protect their collections with her life. Soon, Zhao fell ill and by the time Li Qingzhao arrived in Nanjing, he was close to death. Zhao died of malaria at the age of 49 with no will or plan for Li Qingzhao. Zhao's death hit her gravely and struck her with a serious illness afterward. Her mourning can be seen in some of her melancholy *Ci*, whereas her indignation at the court's appeasement policy and incapability is evident in some of her *Shi*.

#### 1.9.1.4 Second Marriage and Divorce

Her widowhood and her husband's lack of heirs made Li Qingzhao, with considerable collections, very vulnerable to attacks from Jurchen invaders, thieves and envious predators. When Li Qingzhao was around 49 years old and suffering a bout of illness, she remarried Zhang Ruzhou with some other complex factors<sup>20</sup> in the year 1132 CE. Almost one hundred days later, she filed a suit against Zhang Ruzhou, reporting him for cheating and falsifying records for gaining an official position. She demanded a divorce and ended up in jail as the law enforced. In the same year, in her letter to the academician Qi Chongli, a powerful adviser to the emperor and cousin of Zhao Mingcheng, she recorded how she remarried, the consequences she suffered, her divorce and her gratitude for helping her release. Li Qingzhao's second marriage has only recently received recognition from a consensus of historical scholars. Scholars in the *Yuan, Ming*, and *Qing* Dynasties and the pre-modern period falsified and distorted the facts in one way or another "out of social, political, institutional and ideological factors" (Egan, 2013, p. 252). This dramatic experience in the national tragedy added another layer of pathos to her literary production.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Jurchen Army was led by Jin people in the Northern border of the Northern Song Dynasty.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The succession line can be summarised as follows: *Song* Shenzong (reformer)-*Song* Zhezong (conservative)-*Song* Huizong (reformer and abdication)-*Song* Qinzong (together captive with *Song* Huizong, ending the Northern *Song* Dynasty)-*Song* Gaozong (youngest son of *Song* Huizong, beginning the Southern *Song* Dynasty)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> According to Li Qingzhao's autobiographic essay The Postscript to *Jinshilu*, a complex set of factors drove her into the unhappy second marriage. For one, she was gravely ill and had to live with her brother's family. The urgent need to take care of Li Qingzhao day and night and protect her and her collections was physically demanding and placed her brother's family under financial pressure. For another, Zhang Ruzhou proposed marriage with such cunning eloquence and persuasion that Li Qingzhao's younger brother believed in this man and thought the remarriage could lessen their family burden. When she got better, Li Qingzhao began to realize Zhang Ruzhou's foul intentions. He constantly abused her with physical violence and endeavoured to seize her collections.

#### 1.9.1.5 Later Life and Death

After the divorce, Li Qingzhao continued to travel with her collections as she fled frequent Jurchen invasions and tried to follow and reach the emperor. She wrote two political *Shi* to praise the integrity and patriotism of two governmental envoys and a trilogy of *Dama (Capturing the Horse)*.<sup>21</sup> Egan (2013, p.163) describes this period after her divorce as her most prolific and she is thought to have composed some of her most moving *Ci*, such as "*Yongyule* (永遇乐)", "*Wulingchun*", "*Shengshengman*", which express immense pain and desolation, by interweaving personal loneliness with the destiny of her country. With the help of Zhao's family, her relatives and personal talent, Li Qingzhao succeeded in returning to the gentry class and was invited to the court occasionally to write poems for the emperor and ladies, meanwhile continuing where Zhao Mingcheng had left off by adding her postscript to the book *Jinshilu* and still engaging in artistic circles. Though the date of her death was again not recorded in the history books, it is generally believed she died at age 73 in the year 1156 CE (Chen, 2021; Wu, 2009; Zhuge, 2019; Wang, 2020; Xu, 2018).

#### 1.9.2 Brief Introduction of Her Works

Li Qingzhao's versatility in writing lies in her mastery of four different literary genres: *Shi*, *Ci*, *Wen*<sup>22</sup> and *Fu*. Her *Shi* earned Li Qingzhao a reputation as a female talent during her girlhood as mentioned above. Her *Ci* amazed her peers and continue to inspire readers throughout the generations.

Apart from the trilogy of *Dama* mentioned above, she was also the first *Ci* critic in Chinese history and is known for her prose treatise "*Ci Lun*" (*On Song lyrics*). She directly comments on some of her predecessors' works, critiquing Liu Yong's excessive eroticism, Su Shi's poem-like *Ci* and Qin Guan's lack of inter-textual allusions. She expounds on the uniqueness of *Ci*. Her prose "The Postscript to *Jinshilu*" incorporates many allusions to classical poems and essays, offering a record of historical events, and insights into Li's life and her extensive knowledge of Chinese literature. As Yang (2015, p. 148) points out, "*The Postscript*" outperformed many other prefaces or postscripts not just in exquisite literary value, but also in historical value.

Li Qingzhao's works demonstrate the multiplicity of her literary artistry but also her in-depth understanding of Chinese classics. For instance, as Chen (2021, p.14-16) points out, Li Qingzhao was adept at borrowing and transforming materials from classical Chinese literature, such as *Shijing (The Book of Songs)*, *Shiji (史记 Records of the Historians)* and *Shishuo Xinyu* (世说新语A New Account of Tales of the World).<sup>23</sup> Djao (2010) believes Li Qingzhao profoundly understood Laozi's philosophy of Dao.

Her influence reached her peers, later dynasties, and even modern China and the Anglophone West. Despite the literary achievement and impact of her works, Li

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> The Dama trilogy consists of three satirical pieces of writing in which the gambling game "Dama" becomes a metaphor for battling. Invoking the persona of a military strategist, she issues instructions on how to win the game, and expresses her ambition and eagerness to win back lost land in battle.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> "*Wen*" was translated into "prose" by Egan (2013 and 2019) and "essays" by other translators. "Fu" was translated into "rhymed-prose" by many translators mentioned earlier.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> The English title of the book *Shiji* was translated by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang (1974); and the title of *Shishuo Xinyu* was translated by Richard B. Mather (1976).

Qingzhao's remarriage and divorce attracted disapproval and criticism from her peers. As a result, her literary legacy and prospects of being more widely translated have suffered because her literary work was not judged on its own merit but seen through the lens of gendered biases. The existing literature shows that eight *Song* resources recorded the event and criticised her behaviour (Wang, 2020) while subsequent scholars in the *Yuan*, *Ming*, *Qing* Dynasty and even pre-modern China went to great lengths to deny the fact of her second marriage. In addition, other parts of her biography, have also been topics for scholars, including the identity of her mother and her husband's alleged concubines.

As mentioned above, both Li Qingzhao's literary and Ci collections were lost, casting doubt amongst scholars as to the number of her authentic works. The earliest and most authoritative textual annotations on Li Qingzhao's works are in Wang Zhongwen's (1979) edition, but Xu Peijun retrieved two unpublished copies of Li Qingzhao's works transcribed by *Qing* scholars in 1989 from Japanese collectors. Later, Xu found a third copy, transcribed by another *Qing* scholar from Shanghai Library. These three versions were mentioned in Wang's (1979) edition as inaccessible and hence not included. Xu's research efforts to secure authentication in his 2002 and 2009 editions have been already widely acknowledged by many scholars, such as Wang Yunxi, Shi Yidui, Ye Jiaying and Wang Zhiying (Xu, 2018, p.10), Egan (2013), Wu (2009) and Djao (2010). Hence, Xu's (2018) most recent revised edition is widely considered the most complete and authoritative version to date. This research refers to Xu Peijun's (2018) edition of The Annotations on Li Qingzhao's Collection, whereby there are 59 Ci, 17 Shi and 10 Wen. To be noted, this Chinese version classifies all other non-poem genres into Wen. This research takes the English equivalent term "essay" to refer both to Wen and Fu, and when this research uses the Hanyu pinyin transliteration separately, it is meant specifically for two different literary genres.

The background information on Chinese poetry and Li Qingzhao underscores her significance and stature within classical Chinese culture. However, the inadequate representation of the poet and her works in the (re)translated English versions remains problematic, aggravated by a lack of research. This study seeks to rectify these gaps by firstly presenting the theoretical framework of retranslation, as well as relevant research fields and methodologies employed in the next chapter.

# **Chapter Two Theoretical Framework**

Retranslation has been a common phenomenon in many cultures and across languages. Canonical texts by Homer or Shakespeare for example have been retranslated many times from and into a variety of different languages. However, the concept of retranslation has stimulated discussion ever since it was brought forward. (Re)translation is more and more understood as a socially driven activity in academia that plays a crucial role in the cross-border dissemination of literary works, bearing substantial ideological, economic, and cultural significance, as many scholars explored the interaction between (re)translation and reception from a sociological lens. To understand the interplay between retranslation and reception, the following chapter will give priority to the discussion of relevant retranslation theory and research.

### 2.1 Retranslation and its Motives

#### 2.1.1 Definition

The term "retranslation" is contested in academic circles. In the West, "Retranslation" was called "indirect translation" by Gambier (1994, p.13), or "mediated translation" or even "second-hand translation" by Shuttleworth and Cowlie (1997, p.76) to define translating from languages other than the source language. According to Alvstad and Rosa (2015, p.7), it could refer to either "the phenomenon" or a "label (alongside with others, new version)", while Koskinen and Paloposki (2010, p.294) define it as both a product and process, as follows:

Retranslation (as a product) denotes a second or later translation of a single source text into the same target language. Retranslation (as a process) is thus prototypically a phenomenon that occurs over a period of time, but in practice, simultaneous or near-simultaneous translations also exist...

The present research will make use of the above definition, as it intends to gather mainly the repeated English translation products of Li Qingzhao's works published in the Anglophone West over the last 100 years and to investigate the motives behind these retranslations and their connections to see the potential influence of preceding translations on later translators. Furthermore, this definition has been accepted by many researchers on the topic; the frequently-quoted Tahir-Gürçağlar (2020, p. 484), for example, refers to retranslation as "either an act of retranslating or its result - the translated text itself", a view that directly reinforces the product-and-process definition.

"Retranslation" in Chinese has corresponded with different Chinese terms in different periods, such as "重译(chongyi)", and "复译(fuyi)". According to *A Companion For Chinese Translators*, the first comprehensive dictionary of translation ever published in China, "重译(chongyi)" denotes three things: "the polishing and revision of one's own translation; or different translated versions of one source text; or translating from other languages rather than source language" (Lai, 1997, p.93-94); while "复译(fuyi)" refers to "the repeated translations, with little difference from '重

译(chongyi)' in the contemporary Chinese context" (Lai, 1997, p.219).<sup>24</sup> The earliest record of "重译(chongyi)" in ancient Chinese literature can be dated back to the Han Dynasty in Han classics, such as Shangshu Dazhuan (尚书大传The Great Commentary on the Book of Documents) and Hanshi Waizhuan (韩式外传 The History of the Han House),<sup>25</sup> and then in many of the twenty-five historical classics, including the most well-known Shiji (Records of the Historians) (Sun, 2005, p.24-27). That kind of retranslation in ancient China was generally regarded as "转译(zhuanyi)", namely, relay-translation (Sun, 2005, p.24; Chang, 2022, p.337). Retranslation back then meant to translate the central Chinese cultural and political excellence to surrounding minorities from one minority to another minority language. Then the retranslations (still in chongyi 重译) in the 1920s and 1930s were regarded as indirect translations by Chinese scholars, such as Tian (2019), and Chang (2022). After the 1990s, the concept of "重译(chongyi)" and "复译(fuyi)" gradually shared the same connotation as the "retranslation" from the Anglophone West. A great many researchers (Xu, 1994; Li, 2010; Qu, 2014; Peng, 2017; Chang, 2022; Liu, 2021; Zhao, 2012, etc.) generally believe that retranslations in China basically mean the act or the result of one source text being translated into several versions in one specific target culture. Thus, the contemporary retranslation concept in China shares the same idea as mentioned above in the Anglophone West and fits in the context of the Chinese-English retranslation research of Li Qingzhao.

#### 2.1.2 The Motives for Retranslations

#### 2.1.2.1 Retranslation Hypothesis (RH)

The interpretation of the retranslation phenomenon has been debated in academic circles for years. Back in 1819, Goethe defined three epochs of retranslation (Goethe, 1992), believing that "translations in the third epoch aimed to achieve perfect identity with the original" while the first two epochs attempted to pave the way for the final advancement in the target culture (Robinson, 2014, p. 224). Then in 1935, the Chinese scholar Lu Xun (2015, p. 370) believed that retranslation ("fuyi" in Chinese terms in his time) was a necessary step towards the perfection of later translations as it allowed translators to absorb the essence of previous translations and combine this with personal understanding. In line with Goethe, Berman (1990, p.1) claimed that translation is refined through constant retranslation, where the earliest translations are more oriented towards the target culture and therefore sacrifice some true essence of the source texts. Similar views about the historical progress of retranslation were shared by Bensimon (1990) and Gambier (1994), who proposed that earlier translations were likely to contain more domestication while later translations would include more foreignization. The rationale for this view was that readers in the target language would grow more familiar with the translations over time, meaning that later translations could be more source-oriented and get closer to the source texts. This claim was later theorized by Chesterman (2000) as the Retranslation Hypothesis. Berman (1990, p.1-2) also suggested that translations age with time because of changes in linguistic, cultural, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> My translation from Chinese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> My translation of the book titles from Chinese.

translational conventions and norms, and call for new translations, where source texts do not.

Ever since it was first proposed, the Retranslation Hypothesis has sparked considerable academic attention and debate. Some followers tested and supported it with empirical studies (Feng, 2014; Sánchez and Rodríguez, 2016; Sharifpour and Sharififar, 2021) and many other case studies mentioned by Deane-Cox (2014, p.7). Nevertheless, subsequent researchers began to doubt its validity. For instance, Koskinen and Paloposki (2003) presented a counterexample, noting that in the two recent Finnish retranslations of *Alice in Wonderland* (1995 and 2000 editions), the 1995 version prioritizes fidelity to the source text whereas the 2000 edition is more target-text oriented. Then, they conceptualized the supplementary characteristic between retranslations with the example of the retranslations of *The Thousand and One Nights*. Later, Paloposki and Koskinen (2004, p. 36) explained that not all retranslations fit into the proposed Retranslation Hypothesis as many contradictory instances exist, suggesting that the interpretation of linear evolution should be questioned, and other factors should also be taken into account.

#### 2.1.2.2 Arguments against RH

The idea of the ageing of translations as the only grounds for retranslation has been challenged by several researchers. Hanna (2016) refuted the idea using evidence that several retranslations co-existed and were produced within a short period of time. The need for retranslation was not caused by the language becoming outdated; rather it was associated with "the struggle between established translators and the newcomers" (Hanna, 2016, p.155). Other explanations have been offered by Sánchez and Rodríguez (2016, p.159-160) who point out that it is the modernization of our language, the nonestablishment of a translation canon and the unpopularity of translators that leads to a sense of outdatedness. Their argument is also backed by Ladmiral in Sánchez and Rodríguez (2016, p. 160) who argue that neither the translation text itself nor the written textual language really ages. More persuasively, Van Poucke (2017) examined five special academic volumes, with a total of seventy case studies on the retranslation phenomenon and illustrated that in twenty-six out of the total, the ageing facets mentioned by Berman were completely absent. It again proved that ageing cannot be the only motive for retranslation and more sophisticated and scientific models are required to demystify the reasons leading to retranslation. His study overcame the problem of generalization based on particular case studies, guiding retranslation toward a quantitative methodology.

Paloposki and Koskinen (2004), and Brownlie (2006, p.155) suggest viewing retranslations as rhizomatic, requiring a post-structuralist approach, instead of onedirectional linear progress. Exploring multiple motives for five British retranslations of Zola's novel *Nana*, Brownlie (2006) underlined that retranslations are the product of both textual forces and context, such as broad social forces, and specific situational conditions. Later, O'Driscoll (2011) diachronically investigated several English versions of the novel *Le Tour du Monde en quatrevingts jours* by Jules Verne. The findings acknowledged the general and broad validity of the Retranslation Hypothesis to indicate overall trends over a long-time span; however, it also proved that the
Retranslation Hypothesis might be over-simplistic and failed to recognize the complexity of multiple causations. It supported Brownlie's (2006) proposition by asserting that translation is a "complex human, social and political behaviour" (O'Driscoll, 2011, p.252). It is worth noting that the above-mentioned Retranslation Hypothesis supporters Sánchez and Rodríguez (2016, p.158) made a textual comparison of six Spanish translations of *Le Journal d'une femme de chambre* with contextual support and confirmed the universal applicability of the Retranslation Hypothesis, but they still specified that the orientation towards foreignization of translation is not due to historical progress, and the evolution cannot be viewed in a straight linear order. Though Sharifpour and Sharififar's (2021) study supported the Retranslation Hypothesis with the comparison and contrast of three English translations of *Mathnawi* by the poet Rumi, it clearly stated that the validity of the hypothesis was true to some extent but not fully substantiated or entirely rationalized; and more comprehensive consideration with both contextual and textual factors was suggested for further research (2021, p. 37).

Subsequent studies into the motives of retranslations have gone beyond the scope of the Retranslation Hypothesis. For instance, Susam-Sarajeva (2003, p.6) put forward the "spiral-like" evolution pattern to explain retranslation, whereas Cadera (2017, p.11) even argued that a "circular relationship existed between the original and translated text, where multiple actors, situations and contexts are involved". Similarly, instead of historical improvement, the interaction between retranslations and previous translations was earlier considered as a challenge from retranslations (Pym, 2014, p.83) and differentiation (Venuti, 2004). Against the above view, von Flotow (2019) deemed their relation as indefinite, serial and multiple, rather than the simple and definite assumption of retranslations as replacement or assimilation. In her view, the source text was regarded as the mother, and the retranslations as children, forming a matriarchal paradigm, where retranslations are generated and contextualized under different cultural, spatial and temporal situations by different individuals with their own interpretations.

Brownlie's (2006) study demonstrated the way in which later translations were "haunted" by earlier ones. Taivalkoski-Shilov (2015, p.71) again confirmed that the voices of translators could be recirculated in retranslation after observing the intra-and extra-textual features of six Finnish translations of *Robinson Crusoe*. Evidence that retranslations both compete against and inherit from earlier translations was found by Zhang and Ma (2018) in three English renditions of the short story "*Kong Yiji* ( $\mathcal{F} \sqcup \square$ )". It also suggested that "retranslation worked under multiple forces" (Zhang and Ma, 2018, p.590). Moreover, other notions were also mentioned in Deane-Cox's book, such as "the positive identification of the past translations from the present ones" and "the dialogic relationship between retranslations" (2014, p.17). Massardier-Kenney (2015) also recognized the dialogue between retranslations and recommended moving away from the simplistic notion of deficiency as the motive for retranslation, arguing instead for its complexity and multiplicity (Massardier-Kenney, 2015, p.73). She believed that retranslations more often relied on and functioned "in specific socio-cultural contexts", thus fresh translations were required to reflect the dynamics of

contexts. A great many other influences were pointed out by Tahir-Gürçağlar (2020, p.486-487), such as the variation of translation norms; social, political and ideological contexts; publishers' economic considerations; different target readership in the target culture and new interpretations into the source texts. These ideas were also shared by many Chinese scholars specifically studying classical Chinese to English retranslation. For instance, Xu and Xu (2015) and Tan and Xin (2017) perceived that the retranslations of Chinese classics, especially the Library of Chinese Classics were the products of current political and ideological influences as the Chinese government implemented the Culture Export policy in recent years. The motivation behind these retranslations was to assert Chinese cultural identity on the international stage and enhance China's cultural influence. Tian (2020) took an eco-translatological approach towards the motivations for retranslating classic texts. He also speculated the retranslations were the product of new understandings of source texts as archaeologists unearthed new material about the Chinese classic Li Sao (离骚), thus retranslations may be deemed a new adaptation to the source culture ecology. Wang (2014) identified one retranslation: The Wisdom of the Classic in Comics, which was designed to serve the general public and child readers overseas, because this special edition cartooned Chinese classics with audible materials to facilitate reading and understanding.

#### 2.1.2.3 Retranslation and Reception

A recent perspective put forward by Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.13) is to see retranslation and reception as a "symbiotic relationship". They asserted that a reciprocal connection exists between retranslation and reception, as they are perceived to be concepts that rely on each other. "[T]he translator plays a double role: he or she is the reader /receiver of the source text and at the same time also the author /transmitter of the target text," explained Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.13). The double role entitles translators to influence readers by their reading or interpretation of the source text, meanwhile retranslations are produced within particular socio-cultural contexts, which both shape and are shaped by translators' experience. That is to say, under specific socio-cultural contexts, translators as readers reflect the reception of a particular author or text and produce certain retranslations and manipulate its reception. As a result, their reception of the author or text also influences how frequently the source work is retranslated. Specifically, the impact of retranslation on the reception of source text or author is exerted "through the adoption of foreign aesthetics, literary devices, genres, literary conventions or styles, images, myths, conceptions or philosophical thinking or adopting norms." (Cadera and Walsh, 2022, p.14) In their book, they propose that studying retranslations can illuminate the reception history of certain authors or texts. Retranslation history of certain works can demonstrate the trajectory of reception, and at the same time also reflects translators as readers' reception in a certain context.

The concept of "reception" was introduced to literary studies as early as the 1960s, shifting the focus from the text/author to readers. According to Brems and Pinto (2013. p.142), it developed into two major schools to study reception in the 1970s. One is Reader-Response Criticism initiated by the German Konstanz School and also represented by American scholar Stanley Fish, who introduced the concept of interpretive communities; the other is the reception in a certain socio-political

dimension, pioneered by German Hans-Robert Jauss, who believed the way a literary work is interpreted can shift based on the specific time period and location in which it is examined, 'the horizon of expectations' (in Cadera and Walsh, 2022, p. 11, first introduced by Jauss, 1973). Correspondingly, there are two approaches to the reception of translations: reception from a social perspective and readers' personal response. According to Brems and Pinto (2013, p.143), adopting a social perspective to study the reception of translations emphasizes understanding how translated works are collectively received and interpreted within a broader societal framework, a focus that is central to this project.

The bidirectional relationship between retranslation and reception was supported by many empirical and theoretical studies in the book Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context (Cadera and Walsh, 2022). It is the very first complete academic volume systematically dedicated to this theme. The book synthesizes academic papers from different scholars, who examine (re)translations in connection with their socio-historical settings, aiming to demonstrate the symbiosis between retranslations and reception through the analysis of contexts, text, paratexts and actual readers' responses. For instance, through reviewing retranslated Hungarian narrative prose and their socio-cultural reception, Gulyás (2022) argued that various retranslations reveal an evolving reception and interpretation of texts within the target culture. Bocquier (2022) examined the reception of three Spanish renditions of J'irai cracher sur vos tombes from the 1970s to 1980s, focusing on how different translators handled the novel's sexual content. It highlights a shift from cautious and implicit translations under censorship to later translations that more explicitly portray sexual themes, indicating the reception of the book might impact translators' approach to the text and their translation process. Schäpers (2022) illustrates how the title of Joseph von Eichendorff's novel Aus dem Leben eines Taugenichts differs in continuous Spanish retranslations and the consequences of this disparity to the source work. Based on actual readers' responses, Zeven and Dorst (2022) explored the different portrayals of Daisy Buchanan in two Dutch translations of The Great Gatsby from 1948 and 1985, emphasizing the impact of translation choices on the interpretation of female characters and their gender roles. This study furthered Zeven and Dorst's (2021) research on the potential impact of translators' choices on female portrayal and influences on readers' perception of female characters. The non-retranslation case study from Russian literature to Dutch by Van Poucke (2022) revealed that non-retranslation is relevant to the reception of source literature in the target culture. Non-retranslation may be caused by a prejudiced selection of source material for translation, geopolitical struggles between the source and target culture, the lack of relevance of secondary works even though they are written by established writers, or even due to the supreme quality of the first translation.

Many empirical studies in the book proved it is a valid and feasible approach to study retranslation and reception. However, all studies in the book were undertaken in a European context, with no systematic research on retranslation and reception in a Chinese context, which is a gap this research intends to fill. As Koskinen and Paloposki (2010, p. 296) state, "any case study is likely to reveal a web of multiple causations." From this perspective, it is clear that retranslation requires a complex, multi-faceted approach. Multiple methodologies should be employed to uncover the dynamics between retranslation and reception. Given the criticisms of case studies for extremism or anomalism (Koskinen and Paloposki, 2019), a larger dataset is needed for broader generalizations. Specifically, studies on English retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works should consider micro-textual and paratextual layers as well as macro-contextual conditions.

#### 2.2 Research Methodologies of Retranslation

Past retranslation research has expanded from traditionally qualitative case studies to include quantitative and cross-disciplinary approaches.

Brownlie (2006) suggested combining Narrative Theory with Retranslation Theory to frame a post-structuralist retranslation theory. Von Flotow (2009) took a feminist perspective to analyse Beauvoir's English translations, focusing on the Pandora figure and theorizing retranslation with its multiple features. Creatively, Zhao (2012) introduced game theory into retranslation, analysing the strategies of players, and then proving that retranslation was necessary and feasible through the strategy. Jiang (2020) built a framework for exploring Chinese pop culture retranslation with theories from fandom studies, and Mikhail Bakhtin's notion of 'carnival'.

Another popular cross-disciplinary approach is to employ different aspects of Pierre Bourdieu's sociological theories. For example, Hanna (2016) drew insight from his theory of cultural production to analyse the Arabic translations of Shakespeare's four great tragedies through texts and paratexts. Meanwhile, based on Bourdieu's Sociology (especially "field" and "capital" concepts), Al-Shaye (2018) scrutinized the textual and paratextual features of four Arabic versions of *Great Expectations* by Charles Dickens and explicated the effect of socio-cultural powers on these translations. Evidently, retranslations involve more than just the visible linguistic aspects. Hidden social factors, such as cultural and historical elements, should also be considered. These factors will be addressed in this thesis.

More broadly, Koskinen and Paloposki (2019) endeavoured to apply archaeology to retranslation to disclose trends and frequencies of retranslation phenomenon across different contexts. This macro-analysis offered a birds-eye-view of the retranslation phenomenon in Finland and complemented the traditional individual case studies. Other studies have included the use of software tools. For instance, the Tool *CopyCatch Investigator* was used both to identify plagiarism and to compare Turkish retranslations of *Madame Bovary* (Sahin et al. 2019). The online system *Translation Array Prototype* was created by Cheesman (2017) and his fellow researchers to build a dataset of nearly forty German versions of Shakespeare's *Othello* (only Act 1, Scene 3) and compare the variation among them. A new comprehensive multimodal assessment of retranslation quality was put forward by the Chinese scholar Liu Zequan (2021) to consider both the quantitative and qualitative variables by the software *WCopfyfind4* and *Python*. He exemplified the assessment model with six versions of *The Old Man and the Sea* and four versions of poems by Xiangling from *A Dream of Red Mansions* as case studies. The above approaches indicate that retranslation research need not merely be preoccupied with single case studies and qualitative analysis. Traditional qualitative research could be improved with cross-disciplinary enquiries to enhance its depth and provide more comprehensive insight. The quantitative method could widen the research scope and gain more objectivity and credibility. Thus, a larger database of varying material across time with both quantitative and qualitative methods should be exploited to generate patterns and gain more insights into the depth and breadth of research. That is what this research intends to do.

### 2.3 Research Fields and Relevant Research

Traditionally, research on retranslation has centred on canonical literary texts (Brownlie, 2006; Deane-Cox, 2014; Walsh, 2016, etc.), but it has also been extended to other nonliterary texts from the humanities and social sciences (Schögler, 2018). Music is another fertile area of research; the critical edition of Ali Ufuki's notation collections from Haug (2019) and Bob Dylan's songs from Greenall (2015) being good examples. Spoturno (2020) examined the retranslation of the drama Bashir Lazhar, while audio-visual fields such as film subtitles (Raffi, 2020) and pop culture (Jiang, 2020) have also received attention. Other areas of research include Human Rights regulations by the European Convention (Kurmel, 2019), philosophical thoughts from Kant (Kanra, 2019), economic texts, such as Marx's Das Kapital (Konca, 2019), political texts, such as *Manifest der Kommunistischen Partei* (Uslu, 2019), *The Declaration of Independence* (Li, 2010), and *Treaty of Nanking* (Qu, 2014), religious texts (Lei, 2021), sports texts (Peng, 2017), and even medical instrument texts (Larsson et al., 2007). The above broad retranslation fields echo Van Poucke's (2017, p. 111) belief that "the 21st century is not only the age of retranslation but also the age of retranslation studies".

A great number of retranslation studies have focused on textual analysis, describing lexical, syntactical, semantic, and phonological variations, as mentioned above in Sharifpour and Sharififar (2021) and Britto (2019). However, another important factor to consider is paratextual analysis. To assist the understanding of paratextual studies for the following section, the definition and function of paratexts shall be discussed first.

Gennette (1997, p.3), a pioneer in paratextual studies, put it: "[a] text without a paratext does not exist and never has existed". He defined that (1997, p.1), "the paratext is what enables a text to become a book and to be offered as such to its readers and, more generally to the public." However, Genette's (1997, p.4) classification of paratexts "by their spatial, temporal, substantial, pragmatic and functional features" has attracted criticism for its "inherent contradiction" (Batchelor, 2018, p.142). For instance, Genette's spatial and substantial distinction is inadequate to classify modern media and digital texts; neither does his temporal division fit into the translation context as the reference of "original" text could be very confusing. Arguing against Gennette's idea of including translation as a paratext, a school of scholars, including Tahir-Gürçağlar (2002), Deane-Cox (2014) and Dueck (2014) perceived the translation as a text, whereas the paratext constituted additional material with which to approach the translation. This idea became widely quoted and developed into the following definition

by Batchelor (2018, p.142) "A paratext is a consciously crafted threshold for a text which has the potential to influence the way(s) in which the text is received."

In this way, the paratext is defined primarily by its function, rather than the location, an idea which was later supported by Pleijel and Carlström (2022). This more inclusive definition might include materials from translators, editors, publishers and some other agencies. This openness allows more clues as to the ways in which translations are produced and perceived, and better fits the current research, as it encompasses material from over the last century. An overly narrow definition in this scenario might exclude some ancient materials where the texts are presented without many paratextual elements (see McRae's research<sup>26</sup>) or with constrained access to paratexts, which could render the research unsystematic and insufficiently informative.

In her book *Translation and Paratexts*, Batchelor (2018, p.159-160) collates the function of various paratexts offered by Genette, Birke and Christ, Kovala and Rockenberger, summarizing these into the following categories: "referential", "self-referential", "ornamental", "generic", "meta-communicative", "informative", "hermeneutical", "ideological", "evaluative", "commercial", "legal", "pedagogical", "instructive, operational" and "personalization". Among them, the referential, generic, commercial and evaluative function are more prevalent in the paratexts of Li Qingzhao's English (re)translations, as discussed in Chapter Five. For instance, most book titles of Li Qingzhao's retranslated collections serve referential and generic purposes, while blurbs function as evaluations and very often commercial devices too.

Paratextual analysis has been widely applied in retranslation research. Some key research included paratextual "gender, agency and social-cultural studies (Batchelor, 2018, p. 32-39)", etc. For instance, Axelsson (2022) not only explored the different paratextual manners of translating the feminist message of Betty Friedan's classic *The Feminine Mystique* in three Nordic versions, but also the implications for the social changes in the Scandinavian context. Other social-cultural context inquiries into paratextual elements dealt with the shifting of power dynamics through analysis of four English translations of the Chinese classical novel *Jinpinmei* (金瓶梅) (Shi and Yang, 2021); or the diachronic analysis of paratexts in retranslations of Laoshe's *Luotuo Xiangzi* (骆驼祥子). These studies revealed the dynamics of the socio-cultural context in which retranslations were generated (Liu and Li, 2021). This approach has also been popular in poetry retranslation, as seen in Georgiou (2018a), (2018b) and (2019), which is going to be illustrated in the following section.

# 2.4 Poetry Retranslation

The assorted approaches to poetry retranslation include the close reading of target and source texts, single case studies or multiple case studies, diachronic and synchronic comparative studies of texts and synthesis of textual, as well as paratextual and contextual analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> In Ellen McRae (2012)'s research, only 20% out of the 800 English-translated fictions were endowed with preface.

#### 2.4.1 Traditional Approaches to Poetry Retranslation

In poetry retranslation studies, the prevailing approach in past literature has been the close reading of individual texts and comparative literary analysis of multiple cases. Some research has grappled with translation strategies. For instance, Turnbull (1964) discusses three different approaches to translating Greek classical poetry, such as Homer's *Odyssey* and *Iliad* and Sappho's fragments. These are: prose, poems with closeness in meaning and form, and poems with closeness in sense and meter. Rose (2022) analysed some modern experimental English retranslations of Greek, Latin and classical Chinese poems from the *Tang* Dynasty and proposed "a somewhat rebellious approach to retranslation...". Rayor (2016) aimed to provide a reading experience of Sappho's poems 26 and 17 as close as that of the Greek audience, by allowing new interpretations and working with sound, form and other techniques. In another Sappho study, Giustini (2015) delved into the gender and queer identities in retranslations of Sappho's *Fragment 31*, and found that earlier translations disguised her homosexual orientation through mistranslation because of social taboos.

Although Boase-Beier (2006) did not explicitly use the term "retranslation", she theorized a cognitive stylistic approach to translation, illustrated through numerous case studies of different poetry translations. These studies explore aspects like ambiguity, foregrounding in patterns, metaphor and iconicity, etc. which might enhance translators' stylistic awareness of poem translation across different contexts. Similarly, Pantopoulos (2012) concentrated on stylistics in his comparative analysis of Cavafy's English (re)translations. By combining corpus-based methodology with close reading, Pantopoulos scrutinized the stylistic differences between two English versions of Cavafy's poems, offering insights into the interaction between translational "universalism" and "difference". Focusing on the same poet Cavafy, Van Dyck (2016) also explored Cavafy's translated works, employing them as a productive pedagogical tool to facilitate students' understanding of translation as a hermeneutic practice while emphasizing the importance of research and the impact of retranslation on literary taste and cultural perception, such as revealing "changing literary taste, academic canons, and cultural institutions in the receiving situation", thereby providing further support for this research project.

Some researchers have placed emphasis on diachronic comparative research. For instance, Lefevere (1975) compared 20 English (re)translations of Catullus 64 from 1870 to 1969, with a close reading, and found that none was satisfactory. Lefevere (1992) compared (re)translations of Catullus 2 from two centuries, examining their illocutionary strategies and finding that certain of these are constant in (re)translations. Mendelsohn (2011) also compared four rivalled English translations of Homer's *Iliad*, focusing on different phonological effects. Similarly, Britto (2019), as a researcher and translator, contrasted the last line from his first Brazilian Portuguese translation of *Of Mere Being* by Wallace Stevens in 1987 and his retranslation in 2017. Britto addressed the inadequacy of his first translation and deemed his own 2017 edition a better reproduction of the source text's phonetic features. The above research, whether single or multiple case studies, primarily focuses on textual linguistic analysis and offers valuable insights for classical poem translation studies. This research builds on those

foundations and advances the field further.

### 2.4.2 Other Multiple Approaches

In addition to linguistic analysis, research has expanded to explore other perspectives such as retranslation ethics, ecological translation and cultural and socio-historical contexts. For instance, Racz (2013) discussed translation ethics, highlighting how the organic forms adopted in poetry retranslation after World War II departed from traditional poetics based on analogical forms. Retranslators may not share such ethical anxiety as first-time translators regarding borrowing, imitation, or plagiarism. At the same time, there is the danger of artistically, linguistically, and culturally homogenizing the source text, which provokes inquiries into the ethical considerations of retranslation and alerts us to the significance of the retranslator's awareness of their role. Rather than focusing on the equivalence of textual meaning of source text, Scott (2018) proposed an ecological approach to poetry translation through illustrating several selfretranslations of Rimbaud's 'Au Cabaret-Vert' and Mallarmé's 'Mes bouquins refermés', though not adopting the term "retranslation". The ecological approach highlights the perception of translation as reading, considers the broader environment in which a text exists and encourages poem retranslation, as he (2018, p. 72) asserted that "the multiplication of versions is the way in which one ensures that the relational field keeps its dynamic, keeps alive its formative and transformative processes".

The cultural context was also highlighted by Hajj in retranslations across several languages. Hajj (2019) critically compared the Arabic poems "I am the East" and "New York" with their English, French and Italian translations by two well-known and two lesser-known translators as well as the author-translator Rihani himself. Perhaps due to his dual identity as a Lebanese immigrant to America, the author's own English translations exhibit a nuanced understanding of both the source and target culture, something that distinguishes them from other retranslations.

Other studies identified different aspects of contextualization. Massardier-Kenney (2015) points out that in order to understand textual meaning, a poem cannot be separated from the social context in which it was written. She asserted that the continued popularity of some literary texts, such as those by Shakespeare, was in debt to their retranslations. In the discussion of the retranslation history of Shakespeare's sonnets into Hebrew, Jacobs (2018) points out that the early translations aligned with more political and aesthetic considerations. In contrast, Herman's 2006 translation affirmed the previous ones by maintaining the Hebrew neo-formalist trend in form and style and innovating and revitalizing the language for contemporary readers. Proposing the multi-contextualization approach, Sun and Wen (2007) examined three Chinese versions of Shakespeare's Sonnet 14 and concluded that each retranslation needed to respond dialogically with the source and target context, and with authors and readers. Acknowledging the contribution of each retranslation in its social context, they posited the notion of "mutualism" as a way to examine textual translation in dialogue with language and context. Similarly, Sharifpour and Sharififar (2021) recommended conjoint textual and contextual considerations for future research after they examined the linguistic and cultural closeness between Rumi's poem "Mathnawi" and three English versions.

This joint contextual and textual approach is echoed by Armstrong (2008, p.197) in his analysis of the retranslation of Homer's epics. Applying a combination of synchronic and diachronic approaches, he revealed that the retranslations have been implicitly and explicitly informed by previous translations whilst also differentiating themselves from predecessors. Epic retranslation compels scholars to scrutinize the historical evolution of prior translations, emphasizing not only the conventional horizontal axis emphasized in the source-text/target-text model but also the vertical axis. It refers not only to the synchronic relation between the source and target text, but also to the diachronic relations between the series of retranslations, focusing on the cultural and ideological background. In response, Walsh (2016) took five English collections of Lorca's Poet in New York as research subjects, focusing specifically on racial and sexual sensibility in retranslation language to provide a paradigmatical analysis of how these retranslations reflected the social and cultural dynamics across time. Later, Walsh (2019) explored the social and political powers behind retranslation through the close examination of the sexual references in ten English translations of Lorca's "Ode to Walt Whitman", and demonstrated how retranslations diachronically responded to the evolution of social and ideological attitudes and the poet's reception in the target culture. Also noted is Chinese scholar Liao's research (2012), which stressed the socio-cultural context of the target culture and examined the interplay between Li Bai's "Changganxing (长干行)" and the target context. Additionally, the translation history of Dante's Divina Commedia by Blakesley (2021) demonstrated how socio-historical context acted on retranslations with a "distant reading" approach.

From a purely linguistic perspective to expanded contextual considerations, poetry studies have noticed and responded to the complexity of the retranslation phenomenon, as previously mentioned in Section 2.3. This is also the approach of the current research, which conducts both textual linguistic and contextual analysis.

## 2.4.3 Poetry Retranslation in the 21st Century

In the 21st century, intense attention has been given to retranslation with many researchers calling for retranslations with new insights in a new context. The increased variety of retranslations has led researchers such as Collombat (2004, p. 8), Koskinen and Paloposki (2010, p. 297) and Van Poucke (2017, p. 111) to view the 21st century as an age of retranslation. Using Eliot's poem "The Naming of Cats" and two Romanian retranslations for comparison and contrast, Botîlcă (2021, p.143) surveyed 50 students and concluded that retranslation was "a necessity for the 21st-century readers" because of the internal and external change retranslations are susceptible to. Externally, one of the most salient changes is modern technology and the impact of Covid-19. Modern technology has driven a great number of traditional book readers towards devices such as Kindles, iPads and mobile phones. The Covid-19 pandemic might have exerted another influence. Littau (2011) has dubbed this external context "the media turn" after the "cultural turn" by Bassnett and Lefevere (1990). He cites the retranslations of Wang Wei's poem "Wang River Sequence" as an example of a multimedia translation, integrating "the linguistic message and material medium" (Littau, 2011, p.277). This might be the "intertextual, intermodal and intermedia" approach mentioned by Spoturno (2020, p.79). Moreover, Botîlcă (2021) also explained that ever since the

Covid-19 pandemic, the readers' expectations and general reading preferences toward book covers have shifted from dark, and mysterious to light and graphic. This study would have been more compelling, had she provided a larger sample. Nevertheless, it instructs future poem retranslation research to integrate linguistic textual and paratextual factors in different contexts.

Konar (2019) looked at the prose and verse versions of intralingual translations of the Ottoman poetry masterpiece "Hüsn ü Aşk" with data both from texts and paratexts. In order to identify the differences and similarities, the paratexts ranged from book titles, covers, prefaces, introductions, subtitles and labels on the book covers, to acknowledgments, publishers' forewords, footnotes and annotations. The study concluded that the verse retranslations were presented as independent artistic works while the prose retranslations were just supplements. Perhaps because the retranslations were taken from within one culture, Konar focused on the linguistic change in the alphabet that replaced Arabic script. The study failed to examine contextual influences to reveal other complex motives. Georgiou (2018a; 2018b; 2019) draws on paratexts to investigate translators of Modern Greek poetry. Her research covers topics such as the roles translators play in the selection of the source material to be translated (2018a) and the symbolic capital and influence of translators on the reading-for-translation process (2018b). She also provides a comprehensive model of translators as readers (2019).

The research outlined above demonstrates the importance of contextual factors and paratextual information in the development of poetry retranslation studies. The success of these approaches in the European context, provides a useful model for my own research which applies these strategies to a Chinese-English context.

### 2.4.4 Chinese Poetry Retranslation with Paratexts

Paratextual studies in Chinese poetry retranslation, have tended to focus on translation strategy, image-formation, translators' visibility, or the dissemination of translated texts. For example, Wu and Shen (2013, p.113) scrutinized the English translations of "Zhanzheng Jiaoxiangqu (战争交响曲)", comparing Chen Li's version with annotations and Piasecki's version without, and suggesting that paratexts, like "translator's notes, prefaces, interview and critical review" can make the distinctiveness of Chinese concrete poetry translatable, more approachable and comprehensible. Similarly, Holton (2013) has advised translators to make use of paratexts following his use of paratextual commentary on Du Fu's poems, to facilitate his translation of Du Fu's "DuLi (独立)" into Scots, especially in terms of phonological features. Guo and Liu (2018) and Li and Zhu (2021) both compared several English versions of Mao Zedong's poems to reveal the poet's multidimensional image overseas from the perspective of Genette's paratextual theory; Cai (2016) found that the paratexts of five English versions of Tao Yuanming's poems reflected their diverse translatorial subjectivity, while Zeng (2018) emphasized the significance of paratexts to the translation and circulation of Mao's poems. Rather different from above and taking a contextual stance, Teng and Wen (2017) compared paratexts of three English renditions of The Book of Poetry by Legge combined with sociological theory to reveal socialhistorical clues; Tian and his fellow researchers (2022) compared paratexts between five English versions of The Songs of Chu (楚辞) and used Sukhu's translation to

exemplify the recontextualization of history and culture of the source text.

From what has been discussed above, a great many poetry retranslation studies have taken a joint contextual and textual road, and many others have also taken the paratextual bypass. However, contextual paratexts and linguistic textual examinations into Chinese classical poetry retranslations are still sporadic and yet to be systematically presented, which was also pointed out by Tian. et. al. (2022). This insufficiency is shown in the following four figures taken by the CNKI database on Sept. 20th. 2022.

						旧版 使用手	册   检索设	(置 会	员 我的CN		欢迎 登录 ◄
www.cnki.net	主题▼	汉诗英译						٩	结果中检索	高级检索	知识元检索 引文检索 >
<b>总库</b> 中文 862 外文	学术期刊 635	学位论文 114	会议 24	报纸 0	年鉴	图书 3	专利	ł	示/隹 ♀	成果 0	/ *

Figure 4 The No. of entries with the Chinese themes "Chinese to English poetry translation" and "paratext"

NKI首页	手机版	English 网站地	图 帮助中心					旧版 使用手机	册   检索设	置 会员 我的CI	NKI 3	欢迎 登录 🗸
(@ <b>n</b> (	中国; w.cnki	net.	主题▼	副文本						Q 结果中检索	高级检索	知识元检索 > 引文检索 >
<b>ë</b>		中文	学术期刊 4	学位论文	会议	报纸 0	年鉴	图书	专利	标准	成果 0	/ *
科技		社科 く	检索范围: 总库	主题: 汉诗英译 :	> 主题: 副文本	× 主题定制	检索历史				共	找到 7 条结果

Figure 5 The No. of entries with the Chinese theme "paratext"

CNKI首页 手机版	English 网站	地图 帮助中心					旧版 使用	手册   检索设	置 🖇	。员 我的CN	1KI	欢迎 登录 ♥
	副知佩 ki.net	主题 🕶	副文本						٩	结果中检索	高级检索	知识元检索 > 引文检索 >
总库	中文	学术期刊	学位论文	会议	报纸	年鉴	图书	专利		标准	成果	
1151	外文	721	288	14	2		4		a .,	0	0	
科技	社科	く 检索范围: 总库	主题:副文本	主题定制 格	漆历史					共找	到 1,151 条	结果 1/24 >

Figure 6 The No. of entries with the Chinese themes "paratext" and "Chinese to English poem translation"

CNKI首页	手机版	English	网站地图	帮助中心					旧版 使用手	册   检索设	置 会	员 我的CN	IKI -	欢迎 登录 🗸
(@ Ü		知佩 i.net		主题▼	汉诗英译	1					Q	结果中检索	高级检索	知识元检索 引文检索 >
ļ	总库 7	中		学术期刊 4	学位论文 3	会议 0	报纸 0	年鉴	图书 0	专利		示准 ♀	成果 0	/ ×
科技	ĩ	社科	<	检索范围: 总库	主题: 副文本 >	主题:汉诗英译	× 主题定制	检索历史					共	找到 7 条结果

The research results from the CNKI database also show that out of 862 entries of Chinese-English poetry translation (see Figure 3), there were only seven studies with paratextual concerns (see Figure 4); out of 1151 entries of paratexts (see Figure 5), there were still only seven centred on Chinese-English poetry translation (see Figure 6). This paucity of research supports Yin and Liu's (2017, p.26) summary of paratextual studies in China from 1986 to 2016: "paratextual translation studies just began to fledge in recent years as the new hotspot whereas special attention has always been given to translated novels by Lin Shu, contemporary Chinese literature and intertextuality." This under-exploration contrasts with the rich insight that paratexts offer into socio-cultural contexts in retranslation studies of other genres, as was shown in studies by Hanna (2006) and Al-Shaye (2018), etc. mentioned earlier. Drawing from other retranslation

fields, my own research offers a scientific and holistic approach to Chinese-to-English classical poetry retranslation in the 21st century.

# **Chapter Three Literature Review**

Since the first English translation of Li Qingzhao's work in 1918 by James Whithall (1918), academic interest has proliferated. Thus, this chapter offers a summary and critique of existing literature about Li Qingzhao's English (re)translations in mainland China and the Anglophone West and any related research.

# 3.1 The English (Re)translations of Li Qingzhao's Works in Mainland

# China

No literature about the English translations of Li Qingzhao's works has been found before 1900 probably because the Chinese government in the 19<sup>th</sup> century implemented a closed-door policy preventing access to English-language learning. Though Li Qingzhao's works have been repeatedly translated by Chinese translators since 1926 in the Anglophone West, this did not happen in mainland China until the 1980s. During the past century, over thirty different translators in China have translated her selected works into English. This research categorizes these (re)translated works into the following four periods: before 1980, from the 1980s to 1990s, from 2000 to 2009, and from 2010 to 2022/2023.

# 3.1.1 Before 1980

The following Table 2 delineates a silent period of English publications of her works in mainland China, contrasting with publications released overseas.

No.	Time	Authors/Translators	The Title of the Book/Journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces
1	1926	Bing Xin	<i>The Translations and</i> <i>Editing of Li Yi-an's</i> <i>Ci<sup>27</sup></i>	Not published in 1926, officially published in 2007 in mainland.	25
				2007 in mainland, China	
2	1937	Ch'u Ta-kao	Chinese Lyrics	London: Cambridge University Press	1
3	1960	Lin Yutang	The Importance of Understanding	Cleveland. US: The world publishing company	2
4	1966	Pin-Ching Hu	Li Ch'ing-Chao	NY: Twayne Publishers	56
5	1979	Wai-Leung Wong	The River at Dusk is Saddening me	Renditions A Chinese- English Translation Magazine	1

Table 2 Publications before 1980 in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 5)

The earliest English translation of Li Qingzhao's works by a Chinese translator is found in Bing Xin's unpublished Master's dissertation from 1926, completed at Wellesley College. It created a sensation in her graduate school in America and earned her the title "the first English translator of Li Qingzhao's poems", according to the Wellesley College News (Wang, 2017, p.269). Bing Xin's translation was unpublished

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> My translation of the thesis title from Chinese.

in China until 2007 in her posthumous manuscript *The Road I Have Taken Alone* (Wang, 2017, p. 270).<sup>28</sup> Later, retranslations by Ch'u Ta-Kao, Lin Yutang, Pin-Ching Hu and Wai-Leung Wong were published outside of mainland China. No translations of Li Qingzhao's works were published in mainland China until 1980.

# 3.1.2 From the 1980s to 1990s

The period starts from the first introduction of a single Li Qingzhao's poem into English in 1981 and stretches to the next decade with other selected works. The following Table 3 displays the English translations of her works from the 1980s to the 1990s.

Table 3 Publications from the 1980s to 1990s in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 18)

No.	Time	Authors/Translators	The Title of the Book/Journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces
6	1981	Yang Minru	Chinese Literature	Beijing: Chinese Literature	7
7	1985	Weng Xianlang	An English Translation of Chinese Ancient Poems	Beijing: Beijing Chubanshe	1
8	1986	Xu Zhongjie	100 Chinese Ci Poems in English Verse	Beijing: Beijing Yuyanxueyuan Chubanshe	9 <sup>29</sup>
9	1986	Ding Zuxin and Burton Raffel	Gems of Chinese Poetry: From the Book of Songs to the Present <sup>30</sup>	Shenyang: Liaoning University Press	2
10	1987	Chu Dagao	101 Chinese Lyrics	Beijing: New World Press	5
11	1988	Huang Hongquan	Anthology of Song Dynasty Ci-Poetry <sup>31</sup>	Beijing:People'sLiberationArmyPublishing House	11
12	1989	Wang Shouyi and John Knoepfle	Poems from Tang and Song Dynasties	Harbin: Heilongjiang Renmin Chubanshe	2
13	1989	Wen Shu	Shici Yingyi Xuan	Beijing: Waiyujiaoxueyuyanjiu Chubanshe	3
14	1989	Lin Jianmin	Translations of Ancient Chinese Poems <sup>32</sup>	Beijing: Zhongguo Huaqiao Chuban. Corp.	1
15	1990	Xu Yuanchong	Golden Treasury of Chinese Lyrics	Beijing: Peking University Press	10
16	1991	Xu Yuanchong	100 Tang and Song Ci/Poems	Beijing: Zhongguo Duiwaifanyi Chuban Corp.	7
17	1991	Zhu Hongda and Wu Jiemin	100 Ancient Chinese Poems	Beijing: Sinolingua	1
18	1991	Yang Jihe	An English Translation of 110 Chinese Ancient Quatrains with Appreciation	Nanchang: Jiangxi Gaoxiao Chubanshe	1
19	1992	Gorden T. Osing, Min Xiaohong and Huang Haipeng	Forever Tonight at My Window(Chinese vs English) — Ci of Li	Zhengzhou: Henan Renmin Chubanshe	30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> My translation of the book title from Chinese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> For the sake of documentation and with all due respect, her translated lyrics in this book actually tally up to 9, rather than 8, as claimed by the Chinese scholar Li Qing (2005b, p. 14)

 $<sup>^{30}</sup>$  It was later revised, enlarged and republished in 1992, but still enclosed the same translated *Ci* of Li Qingzhao as the original version.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> It was later reprinted and enlarged in 2003, but still with the same translated Ci of Li Qingzhao as the original version.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> My translation of the book title from Chinese.

			Qingzhao		
20	1995	Wang Zhihuan	Selected Lyrics on Themes of Patriotism and Moral Integrity	Beijing: Zhongguo Duiwaifanyi Chuban Corp.	1
21	1996	Zhuo Zhenying	The Chinese Sentiments-As Expressed in 128 Oft- Quoted Poems (1100BC - AD1910)	Guangzhou: Zhongshan Daxue Chubanshe	1
22	1997	Mao Xiaoyu	Tang and Song Poems	Nanchang: Jiangxi Meishu Chubanshe	8
23	1999	Gong Jinhao	Modern Rendition of Selected Old Chinese Ci-Poems	Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan	4

As Table 3 illustrates, the start of English translations of Li Qingzhao's literary works can be pinpointed to 1981, a pivotal moment characterized by Yang Minru's publication of seven translated *Ci* in the English journal *Chinese Literature* in Beijing.<sup>33</sup> The translation of her works maintained a steady pace throughout the 1980s and experienced rapid growth in the 1990s. Apart from the rise in quantity, the translations also covered both *Shi* and *Ci* from her selected source poems, indirectly recognizing her achievement in both genres. However, the coverage and selection of source material were comparatively limited. For instance, among all her works, "*Shi Xiarijueju* (夏日 绝句)" was chosen five times and "*Chuncan* (春残)" was chosen only once to be translated, and the *Ci "Shengshengman, Zuihuayin* (醉花阴), *Wulingchun, Yujia'ao* and *Yijianmei* (一剪梅)" were the top five chosen to be translated. This indicates the translators' preference for poems, while the rest of her works remained untranslated.

More prominently, the first and only collection dedicated to the translation of Li Qingzhao's *Ci* in the last century was published in 1992, as indicated by entry No. 19. The majority of translations are single-authored editions in mainland China, with only four co-authored products (shown in entries No. 9, 12, 17 and 19). Xu Yuanchong became prominent as his translations were reprinted several times in the 1990s, and the new century. This may be related to the first Project of Chinese Classical Treasury launched by China Publishing Group Corp. in 1994 (Zhu, 2011). This project selected top Chinese translators (including Xu Yuanchong) to translate or retranslate traditional Chinese classics to form "*the Library of Chinese Classics* (大中华文库)" and impress readers with a new image of Chinese culture.

### 3.1.3 From 2000 to 2009

The new millennium has witnessed a tremendous increase in the quantity of Li Qingzhao's translated works and emerging translators, as shown in the following Table 4.

Table 4 Publications from 2000 to 2009 in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 16)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> *Chinese Literature* is an English journal published in Beijing by the *Chinese Literature* Publisher and China Foreign Languages Publication Administration, aiming to spread Chinese literature and culture overseas. It was founded in 1951 and discontinued in 2001.

No.	Time	Authors/Translators	The Title of the Book/Journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces
24	2001	Ding Zuxin	An Anthology of Chinese Poetry	Shenyang: Liaoning University Press	4
25	2001	Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang	Song Proses	Beijing: Foreign Languages Press	5
26	2003	Mao Yumei	Picking the Best Ci Poems from the Washing Jade	Beijing: Zhongguo Dabaikequanshu Chubanshe	32
27	2003	Xu Yuanchong	Literature and Translation	Beijing: Peking University Press	60
28	2003	Zhu Chunsheng	Translation From Chinese Translators Journal	Qingdao: Qingdao Chubanshe	1
29	2003	Xu Yuanchong	100 Classical Chinese Poems with Chinese- English Interpretations	Dalian: Dalian Chubanshe	1
30	2004	Xu Yuanchong	300 Gems of Classical Chinese Poetry	Beijing: Peking University Press	1
31	2004	Zhu Chunsheng	Guyixinsheng: Appreciation <sup>34</sup>	Wuhan: Hubei Jiaoyu Chubansshe	1
32	2004	Wen Shu, Wang Jinxi and Deng Yanchang	Guyixinsheng: the beginners' level	Wuhan: Hubei Jiaoyu Chubansshe	1
33	2004	Gong Jinhao	<i>Guyixinsheng: the intermediate level</i>	Wuhan: Hubei Jiaoyu Chubansshe	1
34	2004	Xu Yuanchong	Guyixinsheng: the advanced level	Wuhan: Hubei Jiaoyu Chubansshe	2
35	2005	Xu Yuanchong	Selected Poems and Pictures of the Song Dynasty	Beijing: China International Press	3
36	2006	Qiu Xiaolong	Poems of Tang and Song Dynasties	Shanghai: Huadong Shifandaxue Chubanshe	1
37	2006	Xu Yuanchong/Xu Zhongjie	Discrimination of the English Versions of Classical Chinese Poems of Love	Hefei: Anhui Kexuejishu chubanshe	1
38	2008	Zhou Ji	Pearls of Tang and Song Poetry	Shanghai: Shanghai Culture Publishing House	1
39	2008	Zhuo Zhenying	Selected Ci-Poems of the Song Dynasty <sup>35</sup>	Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Languages Education Press	8

Within less than ten years, the volume of published books containing English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao' works nearly matched that of the entire period from the 1980s to 1999. In this period, her works retranslated into English were shown in a wider variety of textual genres by both experienced and emerging translators with their different features. The textual genres were no longer limited to poem collections or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> The titles of Book No. 30 to 33 are my translations from Chinese, as no English titles are available on covers.

 $<sup>^{35}</sup>$  The same English translated poems of Li Qingzhao in this book were also collected in the book *Readings of Chinese Culture Series-Poetry V* published in 2018 by Shanghai Foreign Languages Education Press.

anthologies like that from the previous century but also extended to literary criticism, such as books No. 37 and 27; literary appreciation, such as book No. 31; literary interpretation, such as books No. 27. and 29; and textbooks for students, such as books No. 32. to 34. Some experienced translators, such as Xu Yuanchong, Mao Yumei, Gong Jinhao, Zhuo Zhenying and Ding Zuxin, were still active, while new translators, such as Zhu Chunsheng, were emerging. This period was also characterized by a notable increase in the identification of Li Qingzhao's other translated works. For instance, her special collection expanded to a total of 32 translated *Ci* by Mao Yumei, while Xu Yuanchong translated and presented 60 *Ci* to mainland readers for the first time. The features of their translations are quite distinctive, as Mao Yumei tended to lay emphasis on the content over form, while Xu Yuanchong intended to keep the beauty of sound, meaning and form.

### 3.1.4 From 2010 to 2022/3

This period is marked by an increase in the number and variety of publications of Li Qingzhao's English retranslations from the last decade to the present, which is demonstrated in the following Table 5.

No.	Time	Authors/Transla tors	The Title of the Book/Journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces
40	2010	Zhuo Zhenying and Liu Xiaohua	An Anthology of Chinese Classical Poetry	Guangzhou: Jinan University Press	1
41	2011	Xu Yuanchong	Bilingual Edition 300 Song Lyrics	Beijing: China International Press	10
42	2011	Shen Fei	Wisdom of Ancient Poems from the Far East	Shanghai: Shanghai Sanlian	1
43	2012	Li Weiwei	Ci-poems of the Song Dynasty	Hefei: Huangshan Shuche	1
44	2012	Chen Junpu	200 Chinese-English Quatrains by Song Poets	Shanghai: Shanghai Jiaotong University Press	2
45	2013	Zhu Manhua	Chinese Famous Poetry Translated by Mansfield Zhu <sup>36</sup>	Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan	6
46	2014	Xu Yuanchong	50 Classical Chinese Ci with Chinese-English Interpretations	Dalian: Dalian Chubanshe	4
47	2015	Xu Yuanchong	Song Lyrics in Paintings	Beijing: Zhongguo Duiwaifanyi Chuban Corp.	4
48	2015	Liu Zhong	100 Classic Chinese Poems with English Translation	Nanchang: Jiangxi Gaoxiao Chubanshe	1
49	2016	Xie Yanming	English Translation of Selected Chinese Classic Poems	Guangzhou: Shijie Tushu Chuban Guangdong Corp.	5
50	2017	Feng Zhijie	Beauties of Song Verses	Beijing: Jiuzhou Press	2
51	2018	Wang Shouyi and John	Snow on the River: Poems from the Tang and Song Dynasties of	Harbin: Heilongjiang	1

Table 5 Publications from 2010 to 2022/3 in mainland China (total No. of anthologies: 22)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> This book was later enlarged and reprinted in 2016, retaining the same translated poems of Li Qingzhao as the initial edition.

		Knoepfle	China	University Press	
52	2018	Zhu Manhua	Complete Collection of Li Qingzhao's Poetry Translated	Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan	96
			by Manfield Zhu		
53	2018	Zhao Yanchun	Song Lyrics in English Rhyme	Beijing: Gaodeng Jiaoyu Chubanshe	9
54	2019	Xu Yuanchong	Selected Lyrics and Paintings of	Beijing: China	4
			the Song Dynasty	International Press	
55	2019	Zuo Zhangjin	Selected English Translations of	Guangzhou: Jinan	5
		and Wu	Chinese Classical Poetry	University Press	
		Mingzhong			
56	2019	Yin Shaodong	A Collection of Classic Chinese	Beijing: China	3
			Poems and Lyrics	Renmin University	
				Press	
57	2020	Xu Yuanchong	Zhiduanqingchang: the most beautiful Ci <sup>37</sup>	Wuhan: Changjiang Wenyi Chubanshe	3
58	2021	Xu Yuanchong	300 Song Lyrics I and II	Beijing: Zhongyi Chubanshe	7
59	2021	Xu Yuanchong	100 Tang Poems and Song Lyrics	Beijing: Zhongyi Chubanshe	7
60	2021	Xu Yuanchong	100 Selected Poems	Beijing: Zhongyi Chubanshe	1
61	2022	Zhu Manhua	100 Selected Ci-Poems of the Song Dynasty	Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan	6

Amidst the burgeoning array of retranslations in the latest decade, this period is also marked by the revision and reprinting of similar poems with varied typographical styles, alongside more emphasis on the Song Ci than in previous decades. Take Xu Yuanchong as an example: regarded as the No.1 translator in modern China, his translations occupy over one-third of the total publications in the latest decade but with different focuses and typographies; some poem collections are combined with the Song paintings, such as book No. 47, some are bilingual, such as book No. 41, while some include both translations and interpretations of source and target texts, such as book No. 57. With a few of Li Qingzhao's translated works included, books No. 58, No. 59 and No. 60 are three anthologies that were newly revised and reprinted in 2021. Apart from books No. 57 to No. 59, there are another eighteen English-translated books of classical Chinese literature, which constitute a comprehensive, newly revised and reprinted collection. The book covers of the entire collection mention that the reprinting and revision were commissioned to celebrate the translator's 100-year birthday. Zhu Manhua, Chen Junpu and Zhao Yanchun also devoted themselves to the translation of the Song Ci. Among them, Zhu Manhua not only compiled and translated the Tang and Song poems, but also translated the complete collection of Li Qingzhao's works. Up to 2022, Zhu Manhua's (2018) collection has been the most expansive and inclusive English collection accessible on the mainland, encompassing poems authored by Li Qingzhao tallying up to 96 pieces.

Another interesting feature is the dominance of major publications. Unlike other periods, an impressive number of books have been published by presses from Beijing, Shanghai and Guangzhou. Most of them are owned by big national enterprises, whereas small publishers from other places were dramatically under-presented. That probably

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> My translation of the book title from Chinese.

reflects the intense publicity that was given to the translation of Chinese classics by mainstream Chinese society. The surge in demand for translated Chinese classics by major national enterprises likely reflects a response to the Chinese government's Culture Export Policy in the new century. For instance, Book No. 54 was among a series of books "Sharing the Beauty of China" and supported by the Project to Promote and Develop Traditional Chinese Cultural Excellence, jointly issued by the CPC Central Committee and the State Council (Academy of Literary and Art, 2021). Book No. 47 was recommended by Confucius Institute Headquarters, in collaboration with China Translation and Publishing Corporation to help Chinese culture spread overseas. China Publishing Group Corp. launched its second project to translate Chinese classics to other languages in 2007 and the project was enlisted and sponsored by the National Publishing Fund in 2011(Zhu, 2011). Book No. 41 was included in the program, and books No. 57 to No. 60 were also initiated by the same publishing group to honour the translator Xu Yuanchong and spread Chinese cultural influence (Yin, 2021). Moreover, Higher Education Press, together with the Chinese Classics Bilinguals' Association, initiated the project "A Hundred Chinese Classics in English" to introduce traditional Chinese classics to the outside world, which included Book No. 53.

The steady increase in the number of English translations over the years reveals the increasing attention paid to Li Qingzhao, yet only three complete collections were dedicated to the translation of Li Qingzhao's works in the past century. This undertranslation contrasts with the vast number of Chinese book entries (1094 in total) with the Chinese title "Li Qingzhao" found in the Chaoxing E-library database up to 2022 (see Figure 7).<sup>38</sup> Those books were primarily published between the 1980s and the 2020s, with a great majority published in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. The extensive body of Chinese literature on Li Qingzhao was also noted by Egan (2013, p. 2), who highlighted that "[i]t has been estimated...that more has been written about her [Li Qingzhao] in Chinese since the founding of the People's Republic than about any other single poet of her dynasty." The current research intends to remedy this dearth of English language research into the poet. The lack of (re)translation of Li Qingzhao's works is not an isolated issue, and it likely led to the limited research into (re)translations in subsequent studies.



Figure 7 The No. of book entries with the Chinese title "Li Qingzhao"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> The final access is on 29<sup>th</sup> July 2022.

# 3.2 Studies on Li Qingzhao's English (Re)translations in Mainland

# China

# 3.2.1 The Overview of Studies

To comprehensively survey the scholarly landscape concerning the English translations of Li Qingzhao's works in China, a systematic keyword search strategy was employed, incorporating specific themes, such as "Li Qingzhao", "Yi'an" (Li Qingzhao's hao, style name), "English translated", "translation", "translate" and "translating". This approach aimed to ensure the inclusion of a broad spectrum of relevant studies. After inputting the above Chinese theme words with various collocations into the search bar of the CNKI database (Chinese version), relatively few studies appeared under alternative search collocations.<sup>39</sup> As shown in the following figures, the Chinese theme words "Li Qingzhao English translation" only yielded around 128 results (see Figure 8), while alternative search terms such as "English translated Li Qingzhao" (see Figure 9), or "translating Li Qingzhao" (see Figure 10) or "Yi'an" spaced with "translation" (see Figure 11) produced fewer than one hundred entries each. Similar procedures were conducted using the English version of the CNKI database. Even fewer entries were found when using English search terms "Li Qingzhao" spaced with "translating" as the theme (see Figure 12). The most extensive array of research outcomes was observed under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao" spaced with "translation", yielding 525 entries (see Figure 13), which are taken as the dataset for the following part of literature review.





Figure 8 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao English translation"

Figure 10 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "translating Li Qingzhao"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> The final access is on 15th June. 2022.

	易安 翻译						ų	结果中检索	高级检索	引文检索 >
学术期刊 <sup>19</sup>	学位论文 13	会议 1	报纸 0	年鉴	图书 0	专利		标/准 ◎	成果 0	∕

Figure 11 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Yi'an" spaced with "translation"

		-								_
Academic Journals	Theses & Dissertations	Conferences	Newspapers	Yearbooks	Books	Patents	Standa	rds Ac	chievements	$\geq$
	29									

Figure 12 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao" spaced with "translating"

主题▼	李清照	翻译				٩	结果中核	索高级检索	知识元检索 > 引文检索 >
学术期刊 232	学位论文 <sup>86</sup>	会议 10	报纸 1	年鉴 0	图书	专利 0	标准 ○	成果 0	$\gg$
检索范围: 总库	主题: 李清照 翻	翻译 主题定制	检索历史					共找到 525 条约	課 1/11 >
□ 全选 已递	先: 0 清除	批量下载 导出	与分析 🔻	排序	5:相关度 发表时间	■↓ 被引 下载	综合	显示 50 🔻	
		题名		作者	来源	发表时间	数据库	被引 下载	操作

Figure 13 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao" spaced with "translation"

主题 -	李清照						۹	结果中检索	高级检索	知识元检索 引文检索 >
<b>学术期刊</b> 3639	学位论文 325	会议 117	<mark>报纸</mark> 32	年鉴	图书 2	专利		标准 0	成果 0	/ ×
检索范围:总质	■ 主题:李清照	主题定制	检索历史					共找至	刂 7,402 条结	果 1/120 ;

Figure 14 The No. of entries generated under the Chinese theme "Li Qingzhao"

The above search outcome demonstrates this topic is still under-researched currently, in contrast to the extensive corpus of over 7400 Chinese papers focused on Li Qingzhao's original works in Chinese (see Figure 14). General observations can be found in the above 525 entries by CNKI metrological visualization analysis. First, the general trend depicted in the following Figure 15 shows that the study on Li Qingzhao's English-translated works began in 1992 and remained relatively stagnant and inactive in the last century. However, there was an obvious uptick in activity from 2007 onwards, reaching its peak in 2014. Subsequently, the number of published papers dropped and experienced a slight decline and fluctuation. The stagnant and inactive research activity coincided with the initial two periods of Li Qingzhao's translated works mentioned previously. The small number of translations in the past led to insufficient research on these translations.





Secondly, in terms of the research contributors, the top five are Ji Shufeng and Ge Wenfeng from Huaibei Normal University, Li Yanlin from Zhongnan University, Liu Jinhui from Beijing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics (BUAA) and Tu Hui from Huazhong University of Science and Technology (HUST) (see Figure 16). All these top five distributors were supported by the National or Provincial Research Fund. However, the frequently co-cited literature also included Li Qing's doctoral dissertation (2005b), which was published as a book later in 2009 and was deemed the first systematic research dedicated to Li Qingzhao's English translation in mainland China. The above contributors were from universities in Anhui, Hunan, Hubei, Beijing, and Shanghai, covering central, northern and eastern China, and contributors from southern and western China comparatively contributed less. The broad range of contributors from Chinese universities also implied the extensive attention given to Li Qingzhao.



#### Figure 16 The research contributors

Among all the published papers, the frequently discussed research themes are outlined in the Figure 17. Li Qingzhao and her *Ci*, particularly "*Shengshengman*", "*Rumengling*", "*Zuihuayin*" and "*Yijianmei*", emerge as the primary focal points. Then some translators were also studied quite a lot, with Xu Yuanchong, Rexroth and Lin Yutang as the top three for research. Other genres of Li Qingzhao's works are barely studied, except by Chen Cheng (2011).





# 3.2.2 Specific Research Foci and Methods

To acquire more detailed and authoritative data, this research filtered data from the above dataset and selected articles published in prestigious academic journals, such as PKU and CSSCI (core Chinese academic journals) as well as SCI journals, along with doctoral and master dissertations. The subsequent presentation showcases the co-occurring keyword network (see Figure 18) from the CNKI metrological visualization analysis, conducted on the total of 107 pieces in the CNKI database.<sup>40</sup>



Figure 18 The keywords co-occurring net

<sup>40</sup> The final access is on 29<sup>th</sup>. July 2022.

From the perspective of research foci, there were mainly two kinds of foci, namely, analysis of source and target texts with relative translation or linguistic theories, and studies on translators or translators' theories or strategies with Xu Yuanchong as the most popular research subject. First, the following theories are applied to analyse Li Qingzhao's poems and translated texts, such as Hermeneutics (Ren, 2022; Mao, 2014; Yin, 2017), Gestalt Heterogeneous Isomorphism (Tang, 2019), Ethics of difference (Yang, 2018), Semantic Translation Theory (Chang, 2017), Adaptation Theory (Xie, 2016; Shi, 2013), Cognitive Stylistics (Liu, 2015), Palmer's Cultural Linguistics (Sun, 2012), Relevance Theory (Zhang, 2014), Semiotics (Wei, 2012), Functionalism (Ma, 2012), Schema Theory (Liu, 2012), Skopos Theory (Cui, 2013), Translation Aesthetics (Zhang, 2014), Domestication and Foreignization (Hou, 2007), Defamiliarization (Dai, 2014), etc. Some also included Eco-poetics (Liu, 2017), Literary Stylistics (Wang, 2012), Intertextuality (Li, 2005a; Pei, 2008; Zhang, 2011; Pang, 2012), Feminism (Bai, 2019; Li, 2021; Zhu, 2019), and Androgyny (Chen, 2009), etc.

Second, from the perspective of translators, many studies explored Xu Yuanchong's translation (Sun, 2015) and his translation theory "Three Beauties" (Yu, 2014; Fu, 2012). Many also did comparative studies about the translation from Xu Yuanchong, Rexroth and Chung (Cui, 2013; Ma, 2012; Bai, 2019); only a few covered the translations from Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang (Zhao, 2014), Hu Pinqing (Chang, 2017), James Cryer (Liu, 2020), Mao Yumei (Liu, 2012) and Zhu Manhua (Wang, 2020) to discuss translators' subjectivity (Jia, 2011) or intersubjectivity (Chen, 2013) or translator's behaviour criticism (Wang, 2020). Clearly, Xu Yuanchong has been well-studied, and other translators are still awaiting attention.

In terms of research methodologies, most researchers adopted one or two specific poems as case studies to do qualitative research, and a few used quantitative research methods to discover the translators' style (Zhang, 2012; Chen, 2016; Liu, 2020). With the perspective of a certain linguistic or translation theory mentioned above, case studies were often used to compare and contrast the source and certain target text(s), and then to be interpreted and assessed which target text(s) were better. These studies suggested different reasons for translation choices and provided new angles for interpreting translation products, yet they appear subjective with limited data. The subjectivity of qualitative research was identified by researchers such as Zhang (2012) and Chen (2016) and was complemented with their corpus-built data. The above two studies tested the effectiveness of corpus-based methodology in literary translation and uncovered the distinctive ways of translating. But these studies (Zhang, 2012; Liu, 2020) mainly highlighted the differences in translators' styles from textual-linguistic material. Though Chen (2016) did tap into the non-textual aspect, such as the preface, postscripts, annotations and translation strategies of Cipai, her analysis of paratextual features only served the purpose of different translation strategies in each version and lacks a contextual investigation. With qualitative case studies, Li (2008) involved ideological manipulation and Hu (2012) explored the cultural context of both source and target texts to compare and see which target text reproduced those elements of the source text.

Few studies mentioned above have used mixed methods for both paratextual and textual examination within the social context, and they generally ignored the interrelationship between different retranslations, a gap this research intends to fill. Though the literary exploration did delve into intertextuality, Li Qing's analysis (2005a) laid more emphasis on the intertextuality of one source poem "*Yijianmei*" in Chinese and English contexts, whereas the intertextuality between target poems was not mentioned. Similar studies were done by Pei (2008), Zhang (2011) and Pang (2012) with different case studies and foci in the source texts. Additionally, there has been little research into the retranslation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works, which this research addresses.

Apart from the most well-known translator Xu Yuanchong, over thirty other mainlanders were identified to have translated Li Qingzhao's works from those 60 publications listed previously. Most translators' works were not well explored or even included in any research. For instance, the first mainland English collection of Li Qingzhao Forever Tonight at My Window (Chinese vs English)—Ci of Li Qingzhao by Gorden T. Osing, Min Xiaohong, Huang Haipeng (1992) has never been inspected in any research so far. Furthermore, probably due to the limited access to materials, Chinese academic journals have so far referenced only a select few other retranslations from the Anglophone world apart from Rexroth and Chung's (1979) rendition and many anthologies including retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works are neglected. For instance, in Tu (2016), the anthologies used for her data were mainly from the 20<sup>th</sup> century, with a majority from the 1960s, and very few were from the 21st century, which compromises the reliability, comprehensiveness and contemporaneity of her study. Thus, the dynamics of different retranslations in history and the reasons behind these repeated translations seem to be underdeveloped territory. Though Li and Ji (2014) suggest the motive for these retranslations in America lies in the translators' different cultural identities, other multiple motives are still waiting to be discovered.

# 3.3 (Re)translations of Li Qingzhao's Works and Relevant Research

# in the Anglophone West

Though the number of Li Qingzhao's translated works is mushrooming in the new century, research into these retranslations and their reception has remained scarce in mainland China. The same is also true in the Anglophone world. This research categorizes the English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works published or distributed in academic journals and books into the following four periods. They are from the 1910s to 1950s, from the 1960s to 1970s, from the 1980s to 1990s, and from 2000 to 2022/2023. Each period is examined by summarizing the published (re)translations and relevant studies. Additionally, this section will conclude with an exploration of efforts in retranslation and reception in other forms, such as digital or newspaper reports.

## 3.3.1 From the 1910s to 1950s

The earliest English translation of Li Qingzhao in the Anglophone West dates from 1918 in the book *Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade* by James Whithall (1918), and since then over sixty different translators have translated her works into English. The published (re)translations from the 1910s to 1950s can be demonstrated in the following Figure 19 and details can be seen in Appendix 3-1.



Figure 19 Publications from the 1910s to 1950s in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 8)

From the above, we can see there were only eight publications including Li Qingzhao's English translations. Most of these publications only contained a selection of Li Qingzhao's works; only Bing Xin translated over twenty-five *Ci*. The major domain is in the US. This period started from the first introduction of Li Qingzhao's one poem in English in the 1910s and stretched to the subsequent decades with intermittent retranslations of a few selected works. As per the scope of this research, this period saw no literature published about studies into (re)translations.

### 3.3.2 From the 1960s to 1970s

Compared with the previous period, these two decades (from the 1960s to 1970s) experienced an increase in the number, genres and places of publications. These included single-authored English retranslations as well as cooperative retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works. Consequently, relevant research followed, but none seemed to be centred on her retranslations, with specific dates and the number of retranslations shown in the following Figure 20. Details can be seen in Appendix 3-2.



Figure 20 Publications from the 1960s to 1970s in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 24)

The number of English retranslations (24 publications) substantially outnumbered that of the preceding period (8 publications). The translation sources varied from book anthologies, complete collections, and journals to special women's collections. Particularly, four complete English collections of Li Qingzhao's works began to emerge in this period with Hu (1966)'s collection as the first. The emergence of Li Qingzhao's English complete collections demonstrated her increasing popularity in the West.

Moreover, Li Qingzhao also secured her position in specialised women's poetry collections both in China and the world, which recognized her prominence at home and abroad. Last but not the least, literary historians showed a growing interest in Li Qingzhao, with more than a quarter of publications focusing on the history of Chinese

literature including Li Qingzhao's work. This gave her works an equal place among all kinds of Chinese literature genres. In contrast, no publications from the 1910s to 1950s were devoted to literary history; almost all of these were poetry anthologies, and a comparatively smaller range of literature genres. Over one-third of the publications were co-authored or co-translated, a figure surpassing that from the 1910s to 1950s and suggesting co-translation as a new way to approach Chinese-English translation. Li Qingzhao's English retranslation expanded her reach from America and Britain to Canada, Germany and Japan.

Studies about English translations of Li Qingzhao's works begin in 1962. Kai-yu Hsu (1962) translated and annotated Li Qingzhao's twenty-two *Ci* in the journal *PLMA*, relating her life experiences to specific *Ci*.<sup>41</sup> Similar biographical research and translation can be found not only in some of these complete collections, but also in journal articles or female-focused monographs and other book chapters. Hu Pinqing (1966) provided a more detailed exploration of the historical background and the evaluation of Li Qingzhao's works, and was followed by Lucy Chao Ho (1968), Chung (1975), Barrows (1977) and Ching in Franke (1976). In addition to the above publications containing Li Qingzhao's translated works, one of her poems was also translated as an example of literary techniques in Chinese poems by Liu (1962;1974). Anthologies containing her translations, such as Kwock and McHugh (1958; 1962) and Rexroth (1956), are recognized as references to Chinese poetry in Bailey (1973), without any emphasis on the translation of her works. Studies on the interrelationship between her retranslations and the reception of retranslations were barely observed during this period and await future development.

### 3.3.3 From the 1980s to 1990s

In this period, Li Qingzhao's English retranslations proliferated with over thirty retranslation publications by different translators and a few other emerging retranslation studies. The trend and the publications containing her retranslations are shown by date in the following Figure 21. Details can be seen in Appendix 3-3.



Figure 21 Publications from the 1980s to 1990s in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 35) Looking at the retranslation publications in the 1980s to 1990s, a wider range of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> For the sake of documentation and with all due respect, this book contains 22 of her translated Ci, rather than 20, as claimed by Chinese scholars (Liu Jinjun and Wen Jun, 2020).

authors and translators were interested in Chinese poetry collections, Chinese literary history, specialized *Song Ci* collections and female literary works by various publishing houses. In terms of authors or translators, C. H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh from the 1960s to 1970s were still active and productive in the early 1980s. Four other scholars with significantly more publications also came to prominence, namely the American poet Sam Hamill, American sinologist Stephen Owen, and Chinese Americans Kang-isun Chang and Pauline Yu. While Hamill translated Chinese poems, the other three carried out both translation and critical analysis along with relevant research. Owen paid more attention to Chinese poetry and literary history in general, whereas Chang and Yu concentrated on the *Song Ci*. It is noteworthy that Jiaosheng Wang was the first Chinese mainland translator to shine a spotlight on Li Qingzhao's works in the United States without any academic background overseas. A more detailed examination into translators and editors can be found in Chapter 4.2.

Publications focusing on comprehensive collections of Chinese poetry and Chinese literary history studies constitute approximately one-third of the total volume. Yet, a growing interest in *Song Ci* is demonstrated by booming publications in this period; around one-third of the publications were solely dedicated to *Song Ci* and *Ci* blended with relevant research, which is more than those from the preceding two periods. Among them, there are three retranslation collections and some analytical articles mixed with retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works.

It is imperative not to overlook the burgeoning enthusiasm for translating and compiling female literary works during this period, exemplified by Hamill (1985) and Chang and Saussy (1999). Neither should examinations of female-authored works be neglected, given that nearly one-third of publications revolve around this thematic focus. Among them, certain retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works are often quoted to account for her personal experiences, historical events and social customs, women's status and education in the *Song* Dynasty, such as Ebrey (1993), Idema and Haft (1997) and Hightower and Yeh (1998). A separate session discussing female-centric monographs can be found in Chapter 4.5. In addition to those volumes focusing on female-authored works, some analyses such as Yu (1983), situated Li Qingzhao within a broader comparative context, or within the framework of world literature, such as Perberg (1981), Bankier and Lashgari (1983), Linthwaite (1987) and Miłosz (1996).

Other comparative studies on retranslations also include Lynn (1984), who briefly introduced, annotated, and compared a few of Li Qingzhao's English complete collections, such as Rexroth and Chung (1979), Hu (1966) and Ho (1968). Later, Dargin and Dresman (1984-1985) compared some particular poems of Li Qingzhao translated by Kwock and McHugh (1962), Hu (1966), Barnstone and Barnstone (1980) and Rexroth and Chung (1979), and identified certain inadequacies in the translations.<sup>42</sup> Lockwood (1984-1985) went on to compare several poems from Rexroth and Chung's (1979) translation of Li Qingzhao's collection with Rexroth's life experience to show the two poets' "sensual and intellectual kinship".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> This is the original version of Barnstone, A. and Barnstone, W. (1992). This research uses the revised edition published in 1992 as research subject in the dataset due to the inaccessibility of the 1980 edition.

During this period, (re)translation studies on Li Qingzhao's works emerged more often than in any previous period, particularly in journal articles. Some blazed a new trail; for instance, Almberg (1994) translated Li Qingzhao's letter to the academician Qi Chongli. That groundbreaking translation is believed to be its first introduction to the Anglophone World. Both Malmqvist (1991) and Owen in Yu (1994) analysed Li Qingzhao's *Ci Shengshengman*, each offering retranslations that reflect their individual interpretative focuses.

Finally, feminist viewpoints are also evident in investigations of Li Qingzhao's identity as a woman and female poet, as well as the reception of her identity, character and works in traditional China, as demonstrated by scholars like Chung in Gerstlacher, A. et al. (1985) and Wixted in Yu (1994), or gender and culture perspective from Tan (1997).

To sum up, the incorporation of retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works in comprehensive poem collections and literary history of China from the 1980s to the 1990s solidifies her status as an eminent poet, while the recognition she received in the context of world literature underscores her heightened literary significance. The rise in scholarly interest in Li Qingzhao's works and relevant retranslations within femalecentric publications or journals is largely propelled by the growing momentum of female discourse during this era. The studies in this period are generally qualitative and descriptive.

#### 3.3.4 From 2000 to 2022/2023

The period of 2000 to 2022/2023 has witnessed sustained and intensified endeavours in retranslating Li Qingzhao's works (see Figure 22), encompassing a broader spectrum of formats, notably more scholarly publications. Concurrently, a multitude of research outcomes has emerged, characterized by a diverse range of methodologies and approaches.



Figure 22 Publications from 2000 to 2022/3 in the Anglophone West (total No. of publications: 29)

In terms of genres of retranslation, the output during this era inclined towards the development of educational materials tailored for students or academic use, such as *Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical* (Lévy, 2000), *Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose* (Yuan, et al. 2005), *How to Read Chinese Poetry* (Cai, 2008) and its workbook (Cai and Cui, 2012), *Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course* (Wu and Yuan, 2019), Puchner (2012), Knight (2012), Luo (2011), Yao, et al (2012), Owen (2010) (for both students

and non-specialists) and Fuller (2017). During this phase, these textbooks and other relevant references constitute over a third of the total output, which indicates a substantial accumulation of previous knowledge about classical Chinese poetry. The prevalence of educational resources underscores Li Qingzhao's burgeoning significance and reception within the Anglophone academic sphere. References, like The *Encyclopedia of Literary Translation into English* (Classe, 2000) (though not listed in the above figure due to fragmental retranslation) provide guidelines to study the poet's biography, (re)translation collections and anthologies. References, such as Wilson and Margolis (2004), predominantly revolved around Li Qingzhao's biography, with minimal attention to retranslations; as such, these are not depicted in the above figure.

Among these textbooks and references, *A Concise History of Chinese Literature: Volume 1* (Luo, 2011) was a product of a co-publication agreement between Fudan University Press from China and Koninklijke Brill NV from the Netherlands. This cooperation ushered in a promising future of Sino-Holland cultural communications through the efforts of Chinese university presses and Holland presses.

Apart from textbooks and references, the number of monographs on Li Qingzhao surpassed previous periods. Some are retranslated collections, such as Egan (2019), Lee (2018) and Coren (2021); some are monographs on her biography interwoven with her retranslated works, such as Egan (2013) and Djao (2010). Ward (2008b), though not listed in the above figure, contains a combination of retranslations by the author and other translators and original poem creations inspired by Li Qingzhao. As the first of its kind, the quantity of inspired poem creations is also unprecedented and elaborated in Chapter 6.4.

In terms of translators, some previously mentioned translators are still active in translating and some researchers are emerging. As a case in point, Stephen Owen and Sam Hamill carried on their works from the last century and continued to devote themselves to Li Qingzhao's English translation. The same is also true of the Barnstone family. Tony Barnstone inherited the work of Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone on translating Chinese poetry from the last phrase. A rising figure is Ronald Egan. He not only published a monograph about Li Qingzhao's biography, works and reception, but also translated all her works. This collection Egan (2019) is by far the most complete retranslation in Anglophone history and is based on an updated Chinese collection Xu (2013).

Research in the new century continues to build upon and expand that of the previous century. There has been an increase in comparative studies between Li Qingzhao and other subjects, such as Wang's (2000) stylistic analysis of *Ci* by Li Qingzhao and Li Yu, or comparative studies with a feminist angle from Xu (2005), Van Bibber-Orr (2013), Egan (2013) and Wang (2023). Through their retranslations and biographical studies, scholars offer an increasingly vivid account of Li Qingzhao's dramatic life. Building on Chung's (1975) work, Egan (2013) and Djao (2010) offer a much more comprehensive overview. In particular, knowledge of her life as a widow and her second marriage has developed from uncertainty in Mayhew and McNaughton (1977, p.20) and rumours in Hu (1966, p.40) and Eoyang (1999, p.89) to an

acknowledged fact in Djao (2010. p.177), Idema and Grant (2004, p.216), and Egan (2013; 2019), supported by newly unearthed evidence.

More importantly, emerging scholars have enriched the research focus and methodology in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. For example, Simmons (2021) applied an innovative computational approach as a quantitative research method to identify the authorship of Li Qingzhao's works. Moving beyond studies on her major *Ci* genre, Wang Ying (2016) analysed Li Qingzhao's biographical essay *The Postscript to Jinshilu* with a triple feminist perspective. Meanwhile, at Wellesley University, Yang's (2022) dissertation compared different English versions of Li Qingzhao's *Ci*. While innovative, this study lacks an objective quantitative method, and depends upon a small sample of case studies for which the selection criteria are unsupported. Just as Pym (2014, p. 39) points out, "little history can be construed from the analysis of isolated translations. Worse, quite superficial history can result from hypotheses that are pumped up after summary testing on just one or two cases." Such a small sample is insufficient to reveal the historic trajectory of Li Qingzhao's retranslation in the Anglophone world, which is addressed in this project.

Despite progress, retranslations and reception of Li Qingzhao's works remain under-researched. Out of over ninety collected books or journals including Li Qingzhao's English translations in this research, the majority are poem or literary anthologies (with or without annotations), and only around ten are published collections. Relevant research on her translations is comparatively meagre. Most studies are excerpts inlaid with other poem studies in the history books of classical Chinese literature. Though some comparative studies were made in the past, those either serve as an introduction to annotated bibliographies of Li Qingzhao, or only contain a few (re)translations. In some cases, the studies are solely focused on the source texts as research subjects, such as Simmons (2021), Rydholm (2017) and Wang (2016). These limited retranslation samples fail to show a full picture of Li Qingzhao's (re)translation over the past century. Thus, a diachronic study is needed, along with a synchronic examination to compare her literary prominence with that of her contemporaries. Moreover, the interrelationship between repeated translations has not been explored, and certain versions in the Anglophone West have not yet been examined in detail. None of the above studies reveal the reception and influence of Li Qingzhao's works in the target culture, a gap which this project intends to fill.

### 3.3.5 Beyond Published Print Academic Journals and Books

Apart from the above publications and relevant research in books and journals, newspapers and some websites have also given some attention to Li Qingzhao. Several newspapers in the United States reported musical performances adapted from Li Qingzhao's poems. See for example *Newsday* (1989), *New York Times* (1993), *The Santa Fe New Mexican* (1994), and *Boston Globe* (2003). These performances are explained in Chapter Six as another form of Li Qingzhao's reception in the Anglophone world, which at the same time demonstrates the dynamics between the source and target culture. A special feature in the magazine *Calliope* (Dec. 2002) profiled Li Qingzhao and included a representative *Ci: Wulingchun*. Newspapers like *Toronto Star* (1992), *Newsday* (1999) and *The Global and Mail* (2001) have also published book reviews on

ancient Chinese culture or poetry, with Li Qingzhao included as a case study.

The number of websites dedicated to the innovative retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works has been increasing. For example, the Asian American Writers' Workshop (AAWW) launched the Transpacific Literary Project. As the fourth instalment of its Pronoun folio for the project, Jenn Marie Nunes (2019) employed a queer-feminist approach to translating four of Li Qingzhao's poems. More importantly, Li Qingzhao ('Li Ching Chao' in Wade-Giles spelling) is given a special entry with her biography and 32 retranslated poems in e-book format on www.poemhunter.com<sup>43</sup>. That website also shows another ten retranslations by Frank Yue, published in 2020 under the search entry of her Hanyu pinyin name Li Qingzhao.<sup>44</sup> An emerging translator, Wendy Chen (2024) translated eight of Li Qingzhao's Ci, which were published on different online platforms and assembled on her website. According to her website, a new English collection of Li Qingzhao, entitled The Magpie At Night is going to be published by Farra, Straus and Giroux in 2025. Likewise, the website www.rhymesandvibes.com (Min, 2021) was devoted to the appreciation of poems from the Song Dynasty, in particular those from Li Qingzhao and Su Shi. Several poems of Li Qingzhao were translated and published by Julia Min and a new book about Li Qingzhao's poems and appreciation Heart Like Water is about to release. Brando Toh translated two Ci sharing the same tune title Rumengling and published them in The Los Angeles Review (2024) online and Shengshengman translated by Yunhe Huang was published in Mascara Literary Review (2018) online. Blogs like Borges' Library (no date) and Crow's Wing (2009) have also posted Li Qingzhao's retranslated poems sporadically. The websites Metatron Press (Bechelany-Lynch, no date) and Itmightbeart (Houng, 2022) feature retranslations mingled with analyses, the former taking five different approaches to Li Qingzhao's Dielianhua-in the evening (蝶恋花-晚止昌乐馆寄姊妹), and the latter comparing three retranslations of Rumengling-remembering.

# **3.4 Conclusion**

To sum up, Li Qingzhao's works were introduced to the Anglophone world quite early, the first English translation appearing in 1918. Subsequent years witnessed a growing interest in Li Qingzhao's works from the 1960s onward. Conversely, the first English translation of her works emerged in mainland China in the 1980s, followed by an increasing number of retranslations in the years that followed. Similarly, the volume of (re)translations has been more substantial in the Anglophone world than in mainland China. The interest in Li Qingzhao and her works continues in the new century, evident in the burgeoning digital reproductions. Nevertheless, literature both in mainland China and the Anglophone West has taken the form either of academic studies, such as Li Qingzhao's biographies and comparative studies, or of English (re)translations of her works. However, little attention has been paid to the examination of retranslations or their impact on reception. This presents an opportunity for this research to contribute

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Accessed: 4th July 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> "Li Qingzhao" Search Results. Available at:

https://www.poemhunter.com/search/?q=Li%20Qingzhao#google\_vignette (Accessed: 18th March 2024)

to the field.

Research on her works translated into English in mainland China and the Anglophone world has touched upon many fields with various theories based on textual analysis, such as feminism, stylistics, comparative literature, biography and other translation theories. Despite this, studies on English retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works and reception were paid scant attention both in China and the Anglophone West, leaving a research gap to be bridged. The contrast between the boom in Li Qingzhao's retranslations into English and the scarcity of research on them probably echoes Deane-Cox's (2014, p.1) claim that "a cogent empirical and conceptual understanding of retranslation remains elusive."

Research methods employed by both Anglophone and mainland Chinese scholars are grounded on more descriptive and qualitative approaches, with quantitative and mixed methods being less prevalent in existing literature. It is also crucial to recognize that the aforementioned research often exhibits a comparatively narrow scope, drawing from a limited pool of samples and failing to delve into the extensive database of retranslations available. Consequently, the overall landscape of interpretation and the reception of Li Qingzhao's works (re)translated into English in the Anglophone world remains largely uncharted territory. This research, therefore, employs mixed methods to probe into the English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone West in the past 100 years for a macro and micro investigation of the interrelationship between retranslation and reception. The following chapter will start with constructing a diachronic dataset of English (re)translations of her works and analysing macrocontextual factors influencing her (re)translations and reception with the help of paratexts, to unveil her complete (re)translation history as well as assessing her prominence synchronically compared with that of her peers.

# **Chapter Four (Re)translations and Reception of Li**

# **Qingzhao's Works: A Macro-Contextual Perspective**

As mentioned in Chapter Three, more than sixty translators have retranslated Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone West in the past 100 years. Yet, it is still unclear why so many retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works have been produced and how they have been received. Past academic literature has not examined Li Qingzhao's (re)translations as much as this research does, nor has it revealed the relationship between retranslation and reception. Literary reception studies employ various approaches, ranging from traditional textual analysis offering individual, well-founded interpretations to contextual analyses examining a work's readership and impact since its publication, as noted by Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.12). Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.3) also emphasized the crucial role of paratexts in shaping a text's reception, particularly in its progression from the initial translation to subsequent retranslations. Therefore, this research investigates the current tendency toward multiple retranslations addressing multiple contextual forces from a macroscopic perspective and textual and paratextual features from a microscopic perspective. Chapter Four endeavours to explore (re)translations and reception from a socio-historical and cultural perspective by analysing factors such as the date and location of published material (when and where), the identity of the (re)translators (who), the material (re)translated and the form in which it is presented (what and how), an approach to retranslation suggested by Alvstad and Rosa (2015), and Peeters and Van Poucke (2023). It begins with a diachronic examination into (re)translations with paratexts and proceeds to a synchronic exploration into the representation of Li Qingzhao's (re)translations compared to that of her peers in anthologies.

# 4.1 Examining Overall Published Paratexts

Using a contextual perspective to address the complexity of retranslation is an approach that is widely recognized by scholars. Just as Cadera and Walsh (2022, p. 7) emphasize,

[O]ver the course of the last two decades, scholars have broadly agreed that the phenomenon of retranslation is a complex one, and that it has to be studied in each specific cultural, social and historical context in order to obtain consistent research results.

Thus, this part starts with a contextual examination to reveal the external factors that influence the relationship between retranslation and reception, such as where and when the (re)translations were published and their relevant sponsors.

## 4.1.1 Selection of Material

Li Qingzhao's English (re)translations in the Anglophone West exist in different research journals, poetry or literary anthologies, collections, websites, newspapers and

pamphlets. To draw a complete trajectory, some material mentioned below must be filtered.

Firstly, for legal and ethical reasons relating to intellectual property, this part does not include material from websites or newspapers because some translations on these platforms are not attributed to specific translators with the date or source text. For instance, the website www.poemhunter.com exhibits several of Li Qingzhao's English retranslations without indicating the translator, whereas www.rhymesandvibes.com specifies the translator yet with no date of each publishing, and the online pamphlet *One Hundred and One Classical Chinese Poems* was offered free to download by Terence B. Foley from the Asia Centre, University of Kentucky. It did not state the date of publication, either.

Secondly, newspaper articles are excluded due to the difficulty in the accessibility of old newspapers. Likewise, due to its unavailability anywhere in the library or online, Catherine Cleeves-Diamond's (1980) *Selected Tz'u Poems of Li Ch'ing-Chao* is not included in this part. It cannot be accessed within the scope of this research because it is out of stock at www.amazon.com.us.<sup>45</sup>

Thirdly, this study does not include books containing only a few sentences or phrases or other fragments of the poems, such as James Liu (1974) as these are not comparable with the other complete translations in the study.

Fourthly, English journal articles originally published in mainland China and later reprinted by Anglophone publishing houses are not included, because these materials are more likely to circulate in mainland China and belong to the achievement of Chinese mainlanders. For instance, Yang (1981) retranslated four Ci and One Shi of Li Qingzhao and published the article "Li Qingzhao, a Poetess of the Song Dynasty" in the journal Chinese Literature, in Beijing. China. This article was later reprinted in 2005, USA by Thomson Gale, Detroit, in the book Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism. Similarly, some other reprinted retranslations are also excluded. For example, Kwock and McHugh's (1980) Old Friend from far away: 150 Chinese poems from the Great Dynasties contains all the poems listed in their earlier 1958 anthology-Why I Live on the Mountain: 30 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties and 1962 version-The Lady and the Hermit: 30 Chinese Poems. The same is also true of the translations from D.C. Lau (1980) and Wai-leung Wong (1980) in both A Chinese-English Translation Magazine and Song without Music: Chinese Tz'u Poetry. This part only adds one of the above sources to the dataset. Hsu's (1962) translations are only included once, though they were reprinted in the books Images of Women in Chinese Literature (1994) and Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism (2005).

English (re)translations published in mainland China, as discussed in Chapter 3.1, are primarily produced by Chinese mainland (re)translators, representing the interpretation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works by contemporary Chinese readers. This also applies to the publishers and editors involved. These (re)translations

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> It is accessed on 1st. April 2023. The author of this research had contacted Professor Diamond through www.Researchgate.com and got a reply from her. Unfortunately, she didn't have a copy of the book at her hand, and she said probably it was lost due to her several moves.

predominantly circulated in mainland China, targeting Chinese readers learning English or translators honing their Sino-English skills, particularly those from the 20<sup>th</sup> century. For instance, the editors and translator of Mao (1997) explicitly stated that the publication was intended to assist young English learners while immersing them in classical Chinese literature; likewise, the editors of Translation from Chinese Translation Journals (2003) emphasized its value for young translators and English learners. While poetry anthologies such as Gong (1999) and Qiu (2006) mention foreign readers interested in Chinese as a potential audience, their focus still remains on Chinese readers or translators, with some later retranslations in the 21<sup>st</sup> century aimed at promoting Chinese culture abroad. Additionally, Chu Dagao's translations-Chinese Lyrics (1937) and 101 Chinese Lyrics (1987)-illustrate this distinction. The preface to the 1937 edition, published in the UK, positioned Chinese poetry as a therapeutic resource for European poets during wartime, whereas the 1987 edition, published in mainland China, included parallel Chinese text with English translations to accommodate both Chinese and English readers. Therefore, these (re)translations from mainland China do not reflect the perceptions and reception of Li Qingzhao's works by Anglophone translators as readers and are excluded from the dataset.

Excluding the above material, this research has examined 95 (re)translations in open-published journal articles, monographs, anthologies and collections, spanning from 1918 to 2021. The larger, heterogeneous dataset offers a comprehensive and accurate map of Li Qingzhao's (re)translation and reception history and mitigates the risk relying on limited samples from a single source (an issue discussed in Chapter 3.2.). This rich and complex dataset captures the contributions of translators in the past 100 years, providing a more holistic and nuanced understanding of the evolution of Li Qingzhao's reception. An added strength of the dataset is that, despite requiring more extensive efforts, the dataset encompasses a broader range of translators from diverse backgrounds, extending beyond editors of poem collections or literary anthologists.

The paratexts examined mainly include publishing pages, and some other places where publishing information was located, such as acknowledgments, prefaces, or translators' notes.

#### 4.1.2 Sourcing from Published Paratexts

With the aid of publishing paratexts, the following Table 6 lists the volumes of (re)translations published and the country of publication every ten years. Detailed information can be found in Appendix 4-1: Publishing information of 95 (re)translations.

Time	Total No. of	The No. of publications by country/regions
period	retranslation	
	publications	
1910s	1	US
1920s	1	US
1930s	3	UK (1)/US (1)/US+UK (1)
1940s	1	UK
1950s	2	US (2)

Table 6 The No. of (re)translations published in countries/regions every decade
1960s	12	Canada+US <sup>46</sup> (1)/US (7)/UK (2)/Hong Kong under the British rule <sup>47</sup> (1)
		/US+UK (1)
1970s	12	US(6)/UK(1)/Japan <sup>48</sup> (1)/Hong Kong (1)/Germany (1)/ US+UK (1)
		/US+Japan (1)
1980s	15	US (10)/UK+US (3)/Hong Kong (2)
1990s	18	US(8)/UK (1)/Hong Kong(1)/US+Canada (2)/US+UK (5)/
		Czechoslovakia (1)
2000s	15	US (14)/US+UK (1)
2010s~	15	Canada(1)/UK(2)/US+Germany <sup>49</sup> (1)/US+UK (2)/The Netherlands (1)/US
		(8)

Li Qingzhao's works (re)translated into English in the past 100 years follow a general upward trend in the number of publications and diversity of publishing locations. Her debut was launched in 1918 and the latest retranslation came out in 2021. From the 1910s to the 1950s, there were only sporadic (re)translations in every decade, published in the US and the UK. Before the 1960s, fewer than ten publications in total were accessible to the public. Since the 1960s, a prevailing effort has been paid to Li Qingzhao's retranslation in a wider range of countries, with more than ten published retranslations in every decade. That number surmounts the total translations from the 1910s to the 1950s. The trend continues in the new century.

### 4.1.3 Discussion

The above trajectory of Li Qingzhao's (re)translations suggests a belated beginning, albeit with promising potential. Compared with other Chinese poets such as Li Bai and Du Fu whose work was translated to the Anglophone world in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, Li Qingzhao came to the Anglophone world much later. In the early days, she received sporadic attention, primarily from the US and the UK. Her introduction in the 1910s might have been catalysed by the first wave of feminism in the West or the American Poetry Renaissance, happening in the late 19th century and early 20<sup>th</sup> century. It might

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> "Canada+US" means the material was published both in America and Canada, for example, *The Importance of Understanding* edited and translated by Lin (1965) was published by The World Publishing Company both in Canada and US. Similarly, US+UK means the material was published both in the US and the UK, for example, *Remembrances: The experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature* written by Owen (1986) was published by Harvard University Press both in Cambridge and London. The numbers in parentheses refer to the number of books published by the country or region.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Hong Kong before 1997 is regarded as an English-speaking area for the purposes of this project, as there were important publications by Chinese University of Hong Kong. However, publications after 1997 are not included in this research to avoid political issues and respect the integrity of China's sovereignty.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> The retranslation collection *As Though Dreaming* translated by Mayhew and McNaughton (1977) was first published by the Japanese Press Mushinsha Limited in Tokyo, and later distributed in the United States. This research selects publications largely based on linguistic criteria, not entirely restricted to Anglophone regions, as mentioned in Chapter 1. The same criteria are applied to other publications in English but not within the Anglophone world. Similarly, the article "A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao (1084-1151)" was first published in a journal in the Czechoslovakia in 1991 and later reprinted by an American publisher in 2005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> "US+Germany" means the material was published by both American and German publishers, for example, *The Works of Li Qingzhao* by Egan (2019) was published by Walter de Gruyter Inc. both in Boston and Berlin.

also be ascribed to the migration of young Chinese scholars to America and Britain following the 1911 Chinese Revolution. This is evidenced by the presence of early translators who were mainland Chinese studying overseas, such as Bing Xin and Chu Dagao.

From the 1960s onwards Li Qingzhao's retranslations spread in various published forms in broader geographical areas. As mentioned in the Literature Review (Chapter 3.3.2), her (re)translations were widely seen in journal articles, monographs, full collections, anthologies and literary histories. The new enthusiasm for Li Qingzhao's works retranslated into English cannot be separated from socio-cultural dynamics in the era of feminism. As von Flotow (1997, p.7) points out, gender issues, "motivated researchers in diverse areas" which in literature in particular led to the unearthing, examination and translation of ignored female writers, making their work more accessible. Specifically, the "lost" or silenced works of women writers were rediscovered in the 1980s. As Li Qingzhao is from ancient China, a country from the third world, it might also be attributable to the so-called "democratic-with-minorities" trend in Western feminism (Flotow, 1997, p. 83). The increased availability and accessibility of Li Qingzhao's works retranslated into English in the Anglophone world could be attributed to what Spivak in Flotow (1997, p. 84) calls "the liberal Anglo-American feminists' benevolent interest in translating literary texts into English, [which] meanwhile redressed the radical prejudice within western feminism". With the emergence of cultural differences in feminism during the 1990s, the retranslation of Li Qingzhao's works may have served to diversify existing Anglophone culture by introducing elements of Chinese female culture from the Song Dynasty. It could account for the proliferation of Li Qingzhao's retranslations in many female monographs from the 1990s onward.

The paratexts referring to place of publication suggest a predominant engagement from US publishers, less active UK publishers, and occasional Canadian, Japanese and British-ruled Hong Kong publishers.<sup>50</sup> The enthusiasm for translating Chinese poems into English in the US might be fuelled by a plurality of cultural, historical, economic and political drives. To start with the modernist movement in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, Ezra Pound not only launched a fashion for translating Chinese poems into English, but also creatively embedded Chinese elements into his writing, such as *The Cantos LII– LXXI* published in 1940.<sup>51</sup> After World War II, the Beat Generation writers and readers were drawn to Oriental culture. For instance, Rexroth (1956, p. xiv) in his introduction of *One Hundred Chinese Poems* mentioned that "the spirit of the *Song* Dynasty was congenial to the Western Romanticism, empirical myth and antinomian taste in contemporary arts ever since 1940." The diplomatic peace established between China and the US in the 1970s might be another political factor. Political factors in publishing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Among these 95 publications, 68 come from the US publishers, 15 come from the UK publishers, 5 from British-controlled HK regions, and the rest are from other places.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Pound not only incorporated some Confucian concept into *The Cantos*, but also the form of some chapters also took Chinese characteristics. The incorporation of Chinese elements into Pound's *The Cantos* is extensively and meticulously illustrated in Chapter Five of the book *Translation of Politics in The Cantos* by Yao (2002).

translations have been noticed by many scholars such as Jacquemond, Venuti and Popa, etc, mentioned in Sapiro (2008, p.159).<sup>52</sup>

Czechoslovakia (now the Czech Republic and Slovakia) has demonstrated a longstanding interest in poetry translation, and a curiosity for international literature since the 1920s, as noted by Kufnerova and Osers (2001, p.332). Their interest in sinology was reflected in the establishment of the journal "*Archiv orientální*" by the Oriental Institute in 1929, later supported by the Prague School scholars. However, political tensions, including World War II, the Sino-Soviet split and the Soviet occupation, severely disrupted Chinese studies, which were only revived in the Czech Republic after the Velvet Revolution in the 1990s (Lomová, 2023). According to Fogel (2023, p.253), Czechoslovakia probably experienced the most significant disruption of Chinese studies due to political turmoil in Europe. This context might help explain why the analysis and English retranslation of Li Qingzhao's poems appeared in the journal only after the 1990s.

Europe suffered two World Wars in the first half of the 20th century, which devastated economies and disintegrated the British empire politically. While the American publishing industry suffered, the effects were not as significant as in Britain, where the unstable social and political situation shattered some small publishing houses and precipitated the public funding of publishing. As Hale (2001, p.193) notes, translation subsidies were not only limited but primarily allocated for contemporary works between source and minority languages, as exemplified by the Kaleidoscope Programme initiated by the European Commission. Another factor could be the slower acceptance of gender studies in the UK, which Hale points out were imported from North America (2001, p.194). Publishing paratexts reveal that the copyright of Li Qingzhao's retranslations owned by UK publishers were mostly academic presses, such as Cambridge and Durham University Press, etc. The same is true of British-ruled Hong Kong. According to Hale (2001, p. 193), this may be due to the immunity of academic presses to economic pressures, allowing them to contribute more to the introduction of foreign authors. Alternatively, poetry is perhaps often a scholarly pursuit that brings very little if any profit to commercial publishers, so it is not surprising that it would be academic presses that mostly published her work.

Literary translation in Canada started very late, around 1960, and was limited compared with European countries such as Sweden, Finland and Portugal, according to the *Index Translationum* (1986).<sup>53</sup> According to Delisle (2009, p. 368) literary translation in Canada was substituted by more lucrative opportunities in business or administrative translation and interpretation. In the case of Li Qingzhao's retranslations, only one book by Djao (2010) was published in Canada, yet Lin (1960) and a few others were published simultaneously in the US and Canada. Among them, both the two translators Lin and Djao have Chinese backgrounds, as Lin was a visiting Chinese scholar in America and Djao spent her childhood in Shanghai. Translators' backgrounds

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Sapiro (2008, p.159) stated, "the international market of translation was increasingly embedded in the formal cultural exchanges between countries".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Cited by Delisle (2009, p. 367)

could be another parameter to consider later in this research.

Interestingly, Japan published two English retranslations of Li Qingzhao in the 1970s. The origins of the Japanese language in Chinese and the extensive historical interactions between the two countries substantiate the significant impact of Chinese culture on Japanese society. According to Kondo and Wakabayashi (2009, p. 468), Chinese was adopted for academic works, whereas Japanese was used for literature till the 19<sup>th</sup> century in Japan. After World War II, post-war aid from America boosted Japan's economy and exerted American cultural influence to some extent. Another factor to consider is the late arrival of post-war feminism and English translations of Western women's studies in Japan which, according to Watanabe (2000), did not happen until the 1970s.

The wider reach of Li Qingzhao's works over time can be seen in the Englishlanguage publication of *A Concise History of Chinese Literature (Volume 1)* in the Netherlands, which was done in cooperation with Fudan University in China. This represented the first introduction of Li Qingzhao to the Netherlands. The delayed retranslation might stem from English not being the official language there, despite some bilingual readers. In addition to this, the politically tumultuous bilateral relationship between the two countries throughout the last century could have posed another obstacle.

The slight decrease in published quantity in the new century might be affected by the digital revolution and the new wave of worldwide economic crisis. Some websites do offer different versions of Li Qingzhao's retranslations with or without attribution to translators, as mentioned earlier in Chapter 3.5.

Hence, socio-cultural movements, economic, historical, and political factors are all factors that might give a boost to retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works.

#### 4.1.4 Further Findings from Paratexts

Publishing paratexts also reveal that the bulk of Li Qingzhao's retranslations were shouldered by university presses, or small, non-profit publishers with funding from various sources. The following Figure 23 shows the categorization of 88 book publishers. The seven journal publishers are investigated separately afterward.



Figure 23 Types of book publishers

Among 88 book publishers, 33 of them are university presses, representing around 37% of all presses, and the rest are publishers with subsidies and unsubsidized commercial presses. Specifically, the largest contributors were leading US university publishers such as Columbia University Press (6), Harvard University Press (6), Indiana

University Press (3), University of Chicago (2) and University of California (2).<sup>54</sup> Meanwhile, Cambridge University Press led the way in the UK while the University of Hong Kong (3) was also a committed publisher of Li Qingzhao's retranslations.

Out of 88 books, 19 were supported with governmental, local or private subsidies, representing 22% of the whole. Not only did the non-profit university presses independently publish relevant books, but 2 out of 19 funded publications were also sponsored by university grants. That suggests universities play a pivotal role in fostering the English translations of Chinese literature. Other grants came from the National Endowment for the Arts, the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Rockefeller Foundation, the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, and the Asian Literature Program of the Asia Society. One grant came from the Bureau of Cultural Planning and Development of the Republic of China to finance the publication of Owen (1996). According to Chamberlain and Bernstein (2000), the Rockefeller Foundation, Andrew W. Mellon Foundation and the National Endowment for the Humanities have provided generous support for women's studies in the US. This is evident in the publication of The *Penguin Book of Women Poets* (1978) and *The Works of Li Qingzhao* (2019).

There were 36 non-subsidised commercial presses, accounting for 41 percent of all publications. Among them, there were indeed some large publishing enterprises, such as *New Directions Publishing* which headed the list by bringing out 6 books, followed by *Shambhala* and *Penguin* which issued three books, then *Random House* and its divisions, *Routledge* and *Macmillan*. The rest were smaller presses, representing almost half of the non-subsidised presses.

Given that editors and publishers were among the initial readers alongside translators, academic and renowned publishing houses to some extent played a role in shaping the reception of Li Qingzhao's retranslations in the Anglophone world. Initially, her works appealed to university publishers and handsome grants were given to endorse the publication of retranslations of her works. Additionally, well-known international publishing corporations, and academic publishers, like *Routledge*, invested in her retranslations. At the very least, this demonstrates that publishers acknowledged the literary value of her works and Chinese poetry in general, and willingly introduced them to a wider audience. The endorsement of these renowned publishers might have improved her reception. Moreover, the involvement of small independent presses in publishing her (re)translations further underscores editors' and publishers' appreciation of her legacy and belief in its market potential.

Of the seven periodicals that included retranslations of Li Qingzhao's work, three were university affiliated. For instance, Yu (1983) was published in *Comparative Literature Studies*, a periodical affiliated with Pennsylvania State University, whereas Malmqvist (1991) was found in *Archiv Orientální* by Czechoslovak Oriental Institute, and Almberg (1994) was included in *Renditions: a Chinese-English Translation Magazine*, by the Chinese University of Hong Kong. The remaining periodicals mostly focused on feminism, poetry or literary research.

To sum up, universities played an essential role in the English retranslations of Li

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> The numbers in parentheses refer to the number of books published by the press.

Qingzhao's works. When considering all publications pertinent to university patronage, including direct publications and funding for books or periodicals, 40 of the 95 publications had university backing in some form, accounting for about 42% of the total publication. As Hale (2001, p.193) stated, "the kudos of a university imprint can help raise the profile of a particular writer or school of thought and so play a major part in the reformulation of canons." This research argues that the imprints from university presses, international publishers and small presses with financial support could enhance the credibility of Li Qingzhao's English retranslations and expedite her reception in the target culture.

# 4.2 Examining Translators

The above publishing information provides clues as to the context of Li Qingzhao's retranslations and explains some possible motivations. More than these contextual clues, retranslations and reception are deeply conditioned by translators. Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.9) proved that "the immense literary prestige of the putative translator was and remains a key factor in Kafka's reception among the readership." In addition to translators' fame, Cadera and Walsh (2022, p.10) suggest other complex motivations, such as promotion by publishers, the quantity and quality of reviews, endorsement by renowned authors (or perhaps mostly editors in Li Qingzhao's case), and other sociopolitical factors. The following section collects paratextual information about translators or authors of Li Qingzhao's English (re)translations and considers the impact of translators' fame and visibility/popularity.

## 4.2.1 Selection of Materials

In Li Qingzhao's English retranslations, some translators mixed old and new translations, some poet-translators blended translations with their own poetry, some editor-translators gathered different versions of one poem and then translated some poems or even imitated Li Qingzhao to create responsive poems. All these cases complicated the data, so it is necessary to clarify the selected data.

Ward's (2008b) *Li Ch'ing-chao Remembered* is excluded from the dataset, because there are certain poems that list several different retranslations by different translators, and the author/editor is sometimes unsure of the source. This particular book is a synthesis of retranslations by many different translators and poem creations by the author, who responded to Li Qingzhao and her works. It is approached later in a separate section in Chapter 6.4.

Kwock and McHugh's (1980) Old Friend from far away: 150 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties shall be included, though it contains all the poems listed in their earlier 1958 anthology, Why I Live on the Mountain: 30 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties and the 1962 version, The Lady and the Hermit: 30 Chinese Poems. Kwock and McHugh (1980) blurred the boundary between retranslation and reprinting. While it was indeed an anthology of Chinese classical poems translated by authors, the first two parts of the book reprinted Li Qingzhao's translations from the earlier 1958 and 1962 versions and the latter part of the book added new translations of other Chinese poets. This part of the research includes all three books, as they gave more exposure to translators and might affect translators' visibility. Thus, the current database takes these two alterations from the previous one and contains 95 entries, spanning from 1918 to 2021.

### 4.2.2 Visibility /Popularity of Translators

According to Cadera and Bunge in Cadera (2022, p.74), the frequency of inclusion or citation in literary anthologies can serve as one index of canonical translation standards. Miralles (2022, p. 191) further emphasized the importance of citation and anthological inclusion in a text's reception, asserting that individuals who reference works in literary histories, anthologies, book reviews, editions, translations, or adaptations significantly influence the general reception and dissemination of literary masterpieces among general readers. Additionally, Gulyás (2022, p. 229) defined "primary reception" as "to incorporate the selection and translation of texts for publication in a target culture". This research suggests that the number of translations produced by translators, alongside the frequency of their translations anthologized within the dataset, could to some extent, reflect the translators' visibility/popularity----criteria modelled on Tu (2016) and Mourinha (2022, p. 311). Here visibility/popularity is not an absolute measure but rather a signifier of broader circulation and positive reception. Similarly, the frequency of (re)translations of certain source texts in the dataset investigated in Section 4.4 to 4.7 can indicate their popularity and preference within the target culture. The following Table 7 displays the frequency with which major translators' retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works were reproduced to see how much exposure publishers gave certain translators.

No. of 6 4 3 7 6 4 3 3 3 3 2 3 2<	Translator	Rexroth <sup>55</sup>	Rexroth and Chung (1972)	Rexroth and Chung (1979)	Owen <sup>56</sup>	Kwock and McHugh	Hamill	Egan	Wang (1989)	Lin(1960)	Eoyang (1975)	Cryer (1984)	Barnstone and Sun	Hsu (1962)	Mayhew and McNaughton	Landau	T.Barnstone and Chou Ping
		6	4	3	7	6	4	3	3	3	3	2	3	2	2	2	2

Table 7 Major translators and	d their popularity
-------------------------------	--------------------

The examination of all the translators in the dataset finds the above 15 (pairs of) translators gained more attention in the Anglophone West. Some of the most influential

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> The translator Rexroth here refers to the translations by Rexroth alone in *One Hundred Poems from Chinese* (1956) and *One Hundred More Poems from Chinese* (1970) and other translated works by Rexroth alone with no specified date and source. Both the retranslation by Rexroth (1956; 1970) and Rexroth and Chung (1972) are included in Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone's (1992) poem collection. Thus, in this research both Rexroth and Rexroth and Chung (1972) are identified as selected translators.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> The translators Owen, Kwock & McHugh, Hamill, Egan, Mayhew & McNaughton and Landau here with no date refer to several translations produced by them or anthologized translations by them with no date reference.

translators retranslated Li Qingzhao's works several times, such as Hamill and Landau; some translated Li Qingzhao's works once and the translations were included later in literary or poetry anthologies, such as Lin (1960), Hsu (1962), Eoyang (1975), Cryer (1984) and Wang (1989). Li Qingzhao's works were both retranslated by some translators and later anthologized by editors, such as Kwock and McHugh, Kenneth Rexroth, Stephen Owen and Ronald Egan, etc. Among them, Rexroth was the most influential translator; his retranslations and anthologization account for 13 out of 95 entries, around 14% of the total number. This is followed by Owen, Kwock and McHugh and Sam Hamill. Of the composition of popular translators, 10 are solo translators, whereas 5 pairs are co-translators, such as Rexroth and Chung (1972;1979), Kwock and McHugh, Willis Barnstone and Sun Chu-chin, Mayhew and McNaughton and Tony Barnstone and Chou Ping.

Other contributions of Li Qingzhao's (re)translations include 53 translators who only translated once. Detailed information may be seen in Appendix 4-3: Translators and Popularity. Though some of their translations haven't been anthologized much, their contributions were still acknowledged and researched by academics, as mentioned in Chapter Three: The Literature Review (section 3.3), especially those complete collections, such as Hu (1966), Ho (1968), Djao (2010) and Lee (2018).

#### 4.2.3 Discussion

The above table and Appendix 4-3 show that sixty-nine translators have participated in the English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works in the past one hundred years, but nearly 77% of retranslators were one-time translators. The great number of one-time translators and their engagement in Li Qingzhao's (re)translation demonstrates that Li Qingzhao had a considerably wide readership in the Anglophone West and successfully aroused curiosity in Chinese culture. These translations multiplied and enriched the interpretation of Li Qingzhao's works. Whether conscious or not of other translators, these occasional reader-translators transitioned from merely reading Li Qingzhao's works to translating them. This active involvement reflects the evolution of Li Qingzhao's reception to include multiple feedback loops that ensure a lasting after-life for Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone world.

A comparison of the number of most influential translators with one-time translators, reveals that only a few translators hold significant sway over anthologies. Generally, those who produce more English retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works are more likely to be cited or included in anthologies. Take the example of Rexroth and Kwock and McHugh: Rexroth himself translated Li Qingzhao's poems three times and co-translated with Ling Chung twice, and his productions were included six times in other literary anthologies, besides being the subject of numerous critical studies. Similarly, Kwock and McHugh translated her poems twice and reissued them once and their works were cited twice. Moreover, translators who show greater commitment to retranslating Li Qingzhao's works may attract more attention from publishers and readers, as in the case of Sam Hamill. He published four books containing Li Qingzhao retranslations and received funding for three of them, indicating a heightened interest in his work. In this sense, reception strongly correlates with the volume of retranslations.

Most translators are from America, with only a few Chinese mainlanders, such as

Lin Yutang and Jiaosheng Wang. Some (teams) are poet-translators, such as Rexroth (Rexroth and Chung), Hamill, Mayhew and McNaughton, Landau, Kwock and McHugh. Others are sinologists, such as Kai-yu Hsu, Eoyang, Owen, Egan and Coren. Among these, Hsu and Eoyang are Chinese American. Aside from these more visible translators, there are still over 20 one-time translators with Chinese backgrounds, either as Chinese mainlanders or Chinese Americans. Since more than one-third of translators have Chinese backgrounds, it can be inferred that this plays a role in the motivation for these retranslations.

From the perspective of translating modality, an examination of translators also indicates Li Qingzhao's (re)translations were mostly done by solo translators. There were only 12 team translators out of over 60 translators. However, 5 out of 12 team translators ranked highly on the above visibility/popularity list. Among these, the product of Rexroth and Chung's cooperation was highly represented in anthologies, as was the work of Kwock and McHugh, Mayhew and McNaughton, Barnstone and Sun, and Barnstone and Chou.

examining When the connections between translators' backgrounds. visibility/popularity, and translating modality, the following pattern emerges from the data. First, apart from established team translators like Rexroth and Chung, solo translators, particularly sinologists, such as Stephen Owen, Ronald Egan and Eugene Chen Eoyang, are also frequently cited and tend to be more visible and popular. Team translation does not necessarily guarantee a favourable reception, as evidenced by the 7 pairs of one-time team translators,<sup>57</sup> whose translations were not cited in any literary anthologies. This challenges the assertion made by Chinese scholars like Wang and Fan (2022, p. 115) that Sino-Western team translators have definitive advantages over solo translators, as well as the claim by Wang (2015, p. 63) that Sino-Western team translators are the best modality. Nevertheless, collaborative translation merits consideration since some team translators have demonstrated a greater success rate and garnered more publicity and reception.

Second, translations by poet translators are not necessarily better received, as indicated by the limited attention received by some translations from one-time poet translators. Thus, the above results debunk the view stated by Kufnerova and Osers (2001, p. 381), that "poetry could only be translated by a poet, a norm practiced in the former Soviet Union" and a similar view stated by Raffel in Connolly (2001, p. 175) that "one must be a poet to translate poetry." Some American poet-translators such as Mark Perberg (1981) were even less included than Chinese scholars.

Thirdly, the cultural identity of translators does not consistently dictate the reception of their translations. While some Chinese mainland translators and Chinese Americans found acceptance in the Anglophone world, in other cases, there is a potential preference for translations by native English speakers.<sup>58</sup> Nevertheless, the reception of Li Qingzhao's translated works by Chinese mainlanders and Chinese

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Three out of these 7 one-time teams are made up of Chinese and native-English translators.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> In Zhang and Egan (2022, p. 374), Zhang mentioned the rarity of translation from Chinese translators used by Western scholars and confirmed by Egan.

Americans indicates a comparatively inclusive American readership and a promising publishing market for future translation. This evidence refutes suggestions by Chinese scholars Wang and Fan (2022) and Wang (2015) that Chinese mainlanders produce inferior, or incompetent translations of Chinese classics in the Anglophone world. Retranslations of Li Qingzhao's autobiographical essay by Lin (1960) and Owen (1986) are more visible in literary history books, surpassing other versions in representation. Perhaps the racial prejudice from American readers and publishers was not as considerable as they thought, and the retranslations by translators with Chinese backgrounds were not as substandard as they presumed. On the contrary, this research suggests that the contribution of over a third of translators with Chinese backgrounds boosted Li Qingzhao's reputation and reception in the Anglophone world and exalted her status. Their contribution cannot be understated. Therefore, this research argues that more active involvement by translators from all backgrounds could enhance Li Qingzhao's influence in the Anglophone world. Translators' cultural backgrounds do not determine Li Qingzhao's reception. Nevertheless, the reception of Lin's (1960) and Wang's (1989) retranslations might not have been as favourable as they were, without the endorsement of American publishing houses and editors, especially Professor Mair.

If the popularity list of translators is put in historical context, it can be seen that before the mid-1990s, Rexroth's (or Rexroth and Chung's) retranslation was highly cited, but its inclusion decreased significantly in the new century. Conversely, Owen's retranslation increased in popularity after the mid-1990s. Unlike merely translating Li Qingzhao's poems, Owen's (1986) initial retranslation was The Postscript to Jinshilu, the less retranslated source material. This text was included three times after its completion. Later he translated more poems and was more frequently anthologized. The shifts in translators' popularity probably reveal different tastes and reception of readers in various historical periods. It again demonstrates the close connection between retranslation and reception within the prevailing socio-historical context. This results in the lack of a definitive canonical English translation of Li Qingzhao's works, since no existing translation has lasting durability. Furthermore, a detailed examination of translators within their historical context reveals a gradual increase in native sinologists after the 1980s, rather than Chinese American sinologists. The rise in the number and prominence of native sinologists, like Owen and Egan, indicates the subtle shift in Li Qingzhao's readership from poets to academics. The increased interest from academics and academic publishers (discussed in Section 4.1) underscores their recognition of Li Qingzhao's literary and broader Chinese cultural significance, beyond mere aesthetic appreciation from poets.

To conclude, the above research into translators and publishers reveals a diverse readership for Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone world. This readership includes occasional translators, retranslators, poet translators, sinologists, and those with Chinese backgrounds and those without. The shared Chinese heritage among some translators might drive the retranslation effort for Li Qingzhao's works. Both individual and cooperative translators contribute to her (re)translations, thereby enhancing her visibility and appreciation in the Anglophone world. However, translators' visibility and popularity in the past century might be linked to many factors, such as the volume of their translation output, socio-historical contexts, or even endorsement from publishers or editors. Considering the aforementioned publishing parameters, retranslations by translators with greater recognition, such as Rexroth, Owen, Hamill and Egan, are typically published by prestigious presses, like university or international publishers. This suggests the translators' popularity might also wield a certain influence on the reception of their work. Therefore, this research suggests that there is a reciprocal relationship between retranslations and reception. Another possibility is that Owen's retranslation gained more prominence in later periods due to his choice of relatively novel source materials, indicating that retranslations based on newer or different source materials might attract new readership. Thus, the following section will explore the source materials used in these (re)translations and how they might affect their motivation and reception.

## 4.3 Examining the Origin of Source Work

The previous discussion about translators' popularity implies, to some degree, that Owen's rising reputation could be partly ascribed to his choice of source materials. In Chapter Two of this thesis, we also referred to Tian's (2020) paper in which it was suggested that newly unearthed material caused a new understanding and interpretation leading to retranslation. This section will gather materials from the past century to assess the influence of the source work on (re)translations. For instance, how complete is the source work? How accessible is it to the Anglophone translators? How discoverable is it? To what extent did the source work influence (re)translation and its reception?

## 4.3.1 Definition of "Source Texts"

Before researching deeper, source materials shall be defined. Because Li Qingzhao's own manuscript collection was lost, her Chinese collections or anthologies containing her poems were compiled later by her peers or scholars in later dynasties. Even in these collections and anthologies, Li Qingzhao's Chinese texts were not unified. In this sense, materials used as source texts cannot technically be equal to the original texts, as Ivaska and Huuhtanen (2020, p. 313) point out: "ST does not necessarily equal what is commonly understood as 'the original text." With the constant emergence of archaeological materials unearthed in China around a thousand years, Li Qingzhao's works cannot be unified into a single Chinese source text for translators in the Anglophone world to draw upon.

In addition, the progress of authentication and verification of Li Qingzhao's works by Chinese experts in the past has promoted several versions of her Chinese collection. Some of these Chinese source texts are updated and revised based on past versions, and some provide new interpretations with slight differences in the selection of her works. Generally speaking, they are all variations or "different representations" (Ivaska and Huuhtanen, 2020, p. 317) of Li Qingzhao's work. Therefore, source texts in this research are defined as "different variations of Li Qingzhao's Chinese work" accessible to the Anglophone world. While Koskinen and Paloposki's (2010, p.294) definition of retranslation refers to a "single source text", this study refers to "single source work" simply, Li Qingzhao's Chinese work.

## 4.3.2 Selection of Materials

To outline a clearer picture of different variations of the source material, some material must be filtered from the previous dataset. To avoid repetition, Kwock and McHugh (1958; 1962) are not counted, because their 1980 edition includes all the poems listed in their earlier anthologies. Excluding the above material, this research has checked 93 (re)translations in open-published journal articles, monographs, anthologies and collections from previous dataset, spanning from 1918 to 2021.

## 4.3.3 Sourcing from Paratexts

To ascertain which source texts (re)translations were based on, it is necessary to access relevant paratextual information. Taking the functional definition of paratext from Batchelor (2018, p.142) mentioned in Chapter Two, paratext in this part refers to any place where the author or editor might indicate the source text - except the retranslation text itself. Hence, prefaces, forewords, introductions, bibliographies, notes, or even footnotes of selected materials are examined. The origin of primary source texts can be categorized and seen in the following Table 8. Secondary source texts of some significance are shown in the following table but are not counted again to avoid confusion. The detailed source can be seen in Appendix 4-4 Chinese source references.

Table 8 Chinese source references		
Shu Yu Ji (unspecified date), Shu Yu Chi (1930) <sup>59</sup>	5	
Shu Yu Yz'u (1964)	1	
Li Qingzhao Ji (1962); <sup>60</sup> Li Ch'ing-chao (1961)	9	22
Wang Xuechu (1979), Wang Chung-wen (1979), Wang Zhongwen (2000)	3	
Xu Peijun (2002) (2009) (2013)	4	
Ming-Qing Women's Writings Digitalization Project at the Yenching Library of	1	
Harvard University	1	
	3	
	1	

Table 8 Chinese source references

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Shu Yu Chi (1930) was co-referenced with Li Qingzhao Ji (1962) by Lucy Chao Ho in her book More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao (1968) on page 47, but then it was listed as Shu Yu Chi (1929) with the same author in the selected bibliography at the end of the book on page 148. Due to its antiquity and unavailability, it cannot be accessed to check its exact publishing date and taken as the secondary source for the sake of academic integrity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Li Qingzhao Ji (1962) was the Chinese mandarin translation by me to represent the same edition mentioned by editors and translators in different spelling forms, such as Li Ch'ing-chao Chi (1962), or Li Qingzhao Ji (1962) or in Chinese characters.

The statistics show that no source text was specified in around 47 entries, accounting for over half of the totality. Among them, some mentioned they chose representative poems (Faurot, 1998. p. vi; Barnstone and Chou, 2005. p. xxxv; Wu and Yuan, 2019), or poets or works of importance (Owen, 1996, p. xlii; Owen, 2010, p. xvii; Hinton, 2008), or famous poems (Cai, 2008, p. xxi; Cui and Cai, 2012), or even less famous poems (Owen, 1996, p. xlii; Barnstone and Chou, 2005, p. xxxv) as well or simply poems of literary value or excellence (Wang, 1989, p. xiii; Sze, 2001, p.10).

Apart from the above 47 entries using anonymous source texts, three retranslations were identified without specific source text references. But the translators' or editors' preference was stated clearly and publicly in the preface or foreword, as evidenced by Rexroth (1970, p. xv.), Davis (1962, p. xxxix) and Deeny and Li (1976, p.2). In addition, there are 10 other cited retranslations from multiple translators or cited translators, making it harder to identify source texts. Though two retranslations were translated from Chinese literary history, it is not known on which specific edition of Li Qingzhao's works in Chinese these were based, adding another layer of anonymity to the source texts. The additional four (re)translations were based on French, which also casts doubt over the source texts and perhaps also undermines the faithfulness of (re)translations. These four translations will later be approached in detail separately in Chapter Six. In total, there are around 66 (re)translations without a clear source base.

Another esteemed source text is *Quan Song Ci* ( $\pounds \mathcal{R} i \overline{\partial}$ ), though the date and editor are not provided in the book *The Art of Chinese Poetry* (Liu, 1962) and the book *Hsin Ch'i-chi* (Lo, 1971) only mentions its editor. But *Quan Song Ci* (Tang, 1965) is referenced together with *Li Qingzhao Ji* (1962) for *Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism* (Chang and Saussy, 1999), while *Quan Song Ci* (Tang, 1999) is also referenced alongside Wang Zhongwen (2000) in the book *Just a Song: Chinese Lyrics from the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries* (Owen, 2019). More reliably, the rest of the entries offer complete publishing information about the source material. Among them, *Li Qingzhao Ji* (1962) published in Shanghai was referenced eight times, while the book *Li Ch'ing-chao* (1961) was published in Taibei. Xu Peijun's edition was also cited four times, whereas Wang Xuechu's was referenced three times.<sup>61</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> To be noted, Wang Xuechu (1979) and Wang Chung-wen (1979) are actually the same book with different translations of the author's name, and Wang Zhongwen (2000) is the later edition. Wang Xuechu, Wang Chung-wen and Wang Zhongwen are actually the same person with different spellings. Wang Xuechu is the "Courtesy name", while Wang Chung-wen is the Wade-Giles Romanization spelling of Wang Zhongwen, the standard mandarin spelling.

#### 4.3.4 Discussion

From the above, it can be observed that the majority of English (re)translations are not extensively based on verifiable Chinese sources. For those with named Chinese source texts, there is still some absence of publication information. Meanwhile, Chinese sources could not be tracked in most poem or literary anthologies, because editors chose to cite translations from others or translators chose their favourites. Technically, there are only 17 entries including standard Chinese source references, namely, book titles, authors, publishers, dates and places of publication.

Out of these 17 clarified Chinese sources, American publishers dominated the market and eight of these are American university presses. The number of American publishers suggests greater access to authentic Chinese sources in America compared to other places, universities in particular, and it strengthens the academic integrity of American university presses. Out of these entries, the participation of female translators and editors is almost equal to that of males.

In terms of retranslation types, those with larger quantities, especially complete collections, are well-established on more dependable Chinese sources, as evidenced by works such as Lucy Chao Ho (1968), Rexroth and Chung (1979), Cryer (1984), Egan (2019) and Coren (2021). Some defined Chinese sources can also be found in analytical research papers about Li Qingzhao's retranslations and monographs on women's issues, such as *Women Poets of China* (Rexroth and Chung, 1972), *Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism* (Chang and Saussy, 1999), *The Red Brush: writing women of imperial China* (Idema and Grant, 2004), etc. That is to say, almost all detailed studies about Li Qingzhao are well-supported by source materials.

A comparison of specified Chinese source materials demonstrates that Li Qingzhao's collection remains the primary source for most translators and editors, with *Quan Song Ci* serving as the secondary complementary source. *Shu Yu Ci* was the original Chinese title of Li Qingzhao's collection, named by the poet herself. Later, modern Chinese compilers renamed it *Li Qingzhao Ji*. Additionally, Wang Zhongwen and Xu Peijun authenticated and annotated her collection based on various historical literature. In summary, all the different editions of her source collection constitute 22 entries out of the entire 93 entries, while *Quan Song Ci* contributes only three.

Another notable observation in the diachronic examination concerns the evolution of specified Chinese source materials. Translators and editors in the last century tended to rely on *Li Qingzhao Ji* or *Shu Yu Ci*, regardless of its edition, with the *Li Qingzhao Ji* (1962) edition being more popular. However, translators and editors in the 21<sup>st</sup> century count more on the newer version of Li Qingzhao's collection, particularly the annotation by Wang Zhongwen or Xu Peijun. This preference might be related to the popularity and authority of these Chinese collections in the domestic publication market. According to Liu and Wang (1997, p. 39), Wang Zhongwen's annotation (1979) was the more popular and authoritative Chinese collection, reprinted three times even before the 1990s. As discussed in Chapter One, Xu Peijun's annotation was the latest and most comprehensive version in Chinese, building on Wang Zhongwen's work. The increasing reliance on Chinese source materials published in the 21<sup>st</sup> century,

particularly Xu's version, indicates a recognition of the advancements in Chinese research on Li Qingzhao by modern translators and editors in the Anglophone world. This is evidenced, in part, by the following correspondence between the researcher Ronald Egan and the author of this study (see Figure 24). Professor Egan's preference for the newest version of Chinese source material suggests an acknowledgment of the progress in Chinese academia.<sup>62</sup> It reflects improved availability and accessibility of source language culture compared to the last century, and a more immediate reception in the Anglophone world, especially the academic world.

Figure 24 The correspondence between Prof. Egan and the author



Though it may be hard to explain the motivations of retranslations with unspecified sources on the surface, a closer examination of retranslations based on similar source materials may unravel some mysteries. Xu's (2002) edition was cited by Fuller (2017) and Xu's (2009) edition was cited by Egan (2013) and Xu's (2013) edition was used by Egan (2019) and Coren (2021). One explanation is that retranslations were made from different source variations for different purposes. Egan (2013) critically analysed Li Qingzhao's biography, works and reception with only a few dozen translations as cases for critical analyses, whereas Egan (2019) and Coren (2021), fully devoted to translating all of Li Qingzhao's works, referred to Xu's (2013) edition.<sup>63</sup> Thus, the second motivation might be to generate a complete or wider-ranging collection of translations based on a larger scope of the source material. Furthermore, based on the same Wang's (1979) edition, only The Postscript to Jinshilu was translated in the book *Remembrances: The Experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature* (Owen, 1986), whereas twenty Ci, four Shi and one Wen were translated in the book The Red Brush: writing women of imperial China (Idema and Grant, 2004). That means, translating previously untranslated source material of the same poet might also be the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Similar acknowledgment is seen in Coren (2021, p. 60).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Xu's (2013) version was revised upon Xu's (2009) edition. Apart from relying on the newer authentic Chinese source text, the newest retranslation by Coren (2021) might also be made to distinguish itself from the existing Westernized elaborations and length of the text, as stated in her preface (p.v).

third motivation, opening a new market for her reception. The above three reasons also apply to Ling Chung because she co-translated nine poems of Li Qingzhao with Kenneth Rexroth for the book *Women Poets of China* (1972). Then again, with Rexroth, she co-translated fifty *Ci* and seventeen *Shi* for the collection *Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems* (1979), a larger volume than Ho (1968). A similar approach is also applied to Lee (2018) as it is promoted as the first English retranslated collection to integrate Li Qingzhao's poetry with her prose. Lee also felt a personal connection with Li Qingzhao and was intrigued by this woman poet as they shared the same surname.<sup>64</sup> Retranslations based on the same Chinese source text, such as Rexroth and Chung (1979) and Cryer (1984), might be motivated by parameters other than the source text itself, such as paratextual differentiation. This is further explored in a subsequent chapter.

To sum up, the acceptance of different versions of Chinese source materials and updates or the attempt at untranslated source materials may mobilize a new round of retranslation and gain entrance to the new market of reception. In this sense, retranslations are affected by the reception of the source culture. Though the reasons behind many other retranslations without verified source works remain unclear, their diverse representation of Li Qingzhao's works may reflect their individual preference for her poems, a matter to be addressed in the subsequent section.

## 4.4 Examining (Re)translated Source Texts

For Chinese texts in the Anglophone world, translators and editors, as the first group of readers, must choose a particular Chinese poet and a particular piece of work they would like to include. In line with what Gòdia (2022, p.142) argued, "[T]he choice of texts is no accident; it reveals the predilection of the age for [...] the poet and in particular, [...] the establishment of certain works as cannonical", this research also believes this choice represents and projects an image of the best works in the eyes of translators and editors. Among all of Li Qingzhao's retranslations, some may be used to educate students, such as How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology (Cai, 2008) and Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics (Wu and Yuan, 2019), and some represent Chinese culture as mentioned in 4.1. As Frank (2001, p. 15) suggests, "these selected flowers lead the readers to the garden where flowers have been culled." The choice of source texts to (re)translate moulds the perception of target readers towards the poet and influences the reception. Therefore, the following part investigates translators' and anthologists' choices to ascertain whether or not they have certain preferences for specific Chinese poems and how these projections might influence general readers in the Anglophone West.

### 4.4.1 Overall Preference for Ci

Taking the same dataset as in Section 4.3, this part investigates the individual pieces of Li Qingzhao's works (re)translated into English to find out if certain works are more worthy of (re)translating in the eyes of translators and editors. As mentioned in Chapter One, Xu Peijun (2018)'s source text is the most up-to-date recognized and authenticated

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> The translator also mentions this in her preface.

based on Wang Zhongwen's annotation. After cross-checking all the (re)translations in the selected material and Xu Peijun's (2018) source text, the frequency of Li Qingzhao's source works included in (re)translation dataset has been quantified. This analysis aligns with the empirical example provided by Doty (2022), illustrating the impact of frequent and significant re-editions and retranslations on the evolving changing reception of an author's work.

Generally, the statistics of the dataset stretching from 1918 to 2021 show that Li Qingzhao's works were quite unevenly (re)translated. Some of Li Qingzhao's source *Ci* are more frequently retranslated and chosen by editors than other works, especially the following ten *Ci* listed in Figure 25. Certain *Ci*, *Wen* and *Shi* were also rarely included. The specific proportion of each piece of work and its ranking can be seen in Appendix 4-6: popularity of individual pieces (re)translated and the details of works (re)translated in each publication can be seen in Appendix 4-5: individual pieces (re)translated. Specifically, the *Ci Shengshengman* and *Wulingchun* were included once in almost every two entries. *Zuihuayin* and *Yijianmei* were chosen more than once in every three entries.



Figure 25 The frequency of inclusion and ranking of Ci (re)translated in overall dataset

### 4.4.2 Discussion

To a certain degree, the choice of top five favourite *Ci* between Chinese and Anglophone readers are broadly similar, though with a slight disparity in ranking. The ranking of preferred source texts by Anglophone translators and editors partially corresponds to the selections of modern Chinese researchers, mentioned earlier in Chapter Three, who favoured "*Shengshengman*, *Rumengling* (two *Ci*), *Zuihuayi*n and *Yijianmei*" as their research subjects. That means both Anglophone and Chinese readers appreciated *Shengshengman* and thought this *Ci* stood out from all Li Qingzhao's works. The consensus on the preference for "*Shengshengman*" was also shared by nineteen ancient Chinese poets from the Southern *Song* Dynasty to the reign of Kangxi in the *Qing* Dynasty (1127 CE to1722 CE). They wrote 23 poems in reply to *Shengshengman* (Liu, 2008, p. 6). That made "*Shengshengman*" rank first on the list of Li Qingzhao's fifteen poems replied to by poets in later dynasties. As Liu's (2008, p.6) quantitative analysis claimed, "those poems he found which generated the greatest number of creative responses are the most frequently anthologized in Chinese poetry books and

more popular among Chinese readers." <sup>65</sup> Shengshengman's reputation also went beyond Li Qingzhao's works and stood fast among all *Ci* produced in the *Song* Dynasty. Quantitative analysis from Wang and Yu (2008, p.418) proved that *Shengshengman* was the third most influential among three hundred famous *Song Ci*, based on data collected from websites, modern research papers, anthologies, annotations from ancient critics, and poets from later dynasties.

The recognition of the *Ci* at the top of the list by both Anglophone and Chinese readers suggests a shared appreciation of Li Qingzhao's predominant *Ci*. This collective acknowledgment may be indicative of their common appreciation for *Ci*'s distinct attributes, particularly its delicate, subtle and restrained expressions of personal emotion. Moreover, the prominence of these top-ranked *Ci* pieces may also reflect the influence of the Chinese anthologist's selection. As discussed earlier in Section 4.3, some translators or editors referenced the authoritative Chinese *Ci* anthology *Quan Song Ci*. More convincingly, this ranking of the top five also partially coincides with "the two most frequently anthologized *Ci* in Southern *Song* anthologies and even today", as noted by Egan (2013, p. 232-233): "*Rumengling-last night*" and "*Zuihuayin*." However, "*Rumengling-last night*" fell out of the top five among Anglophone readers, meanwhile, "*Rumengling-remembering*" managed to remain on the list of top five for both Chinese and Anglophone Westerners.

The shared fondness for the top few Ci between Chinese and Anglophone readers also demonstrates that certain writing techniques and feelings are universal and therefore well-received in the target culture. It again confirms David Hawkes' (1964, p.106) view that "it is the emotions evoked rather than the themes which evoke them that are universal in the case of those poems which travel most easily." The top four Ci are shining examples, mainly expressing sorrow, grief and a sense of loss. These are common sentiments to all readers regardless of their cultural background. They are easily echoed in many English poems, such as In Memoriam A. H. H. by Alfred Tennyson (no date), and many poems by W. B. Yeats and Emily Dickinson. To be specific, the repetition of words and sound devices such as rhyme and alliteration in Li Qingzhao's "Shengshengman" might remind Anglophone readers of Alfred Tennyson's poem Break, Break, Break. Even the metaphor comparing the sadness to rain in Shengshengman could be found in the same simile in the English poem Sorrow by Edna St. Vincent Millay (no date). Her reflection on springtime in "Wulingchun" is similarly reflected in Julia Cooley (no date)'s Spring Sorrow. Li Qingzhao's allusions to classical literature and synthesis of different images in Zuihuayin and Yijianmei could be shared in Ode to a Nightingale by Keats (no date) and The Sorrow of Love by Yeats (no date). Her economy of language in "Rumengling-remembering" and "Rumengling-last night" is as simple and natural, sometimes colloquial as As if the Sea Should Part and I'm Nobody, Who are you by Emily Dickinson (1891). This means that the acceptance of certain translated pieces might be related to their resonance with the target literature.

Larger differences lie in the ranking of poems in the lower part of the list. It is striking that "Yujia'ao-the sky" (渔家傲 • 天接云涛连晓雾) was more popular with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> My translation from Chinese.

Anglophone translators than "*Rumengling-last night*", because "*Yujia'ao-the sky*" was not even on the top ten list by ancient Chinese poets; neither was "*Yongyule*" or "*Jianzimulanhua*". The popularity of "*Jianzimulanhua*" among Anglophone readers might shock some Chinese readers. Chinese critics like Zhao Wanli in the past doubted the authenticity of "*Jianzimulanhua*" and "*Dianjiangchun-off the swing*" (ranking 16<sup>th</sup>), believing the meaning of these *Ci* was too shallow to come from a *Ci* master, like Li Qingzhao (Zhuge, 2019, p. 53; Wang, 2020, p. 85; Xu, 2018, p.4). Yet, modern experts on Li Qingzhao, such as Xu (2018) and Wang (2020), found they are authentic based on various historical materials.

### 4.4.3 Overall Preference for Other Types of Works

Apart from the above list of *Ci*, this research also investigates other works of Li Qingzhao (re)translated into English. Out of her seventeen *Shi* and a few *Wen*, not many were noticed and retranslated. The following Figure 26 displays the most frequently translated six pieces of work, apart from *Ci*.



This figure demonstrates her *Shi*, such as "*Xiarijueju*(夏日绝句)", was also highly appreciated and was included 13 times in the dataset. Li Qingzhao's *Wen*, "*The Postscript to Jinshilu*", still drew a lot of attention from scholars and translators. Rather than showing the female temperament, "*Xiarijueju*" was highly heroic, whereas "*The Postscript to Jinshilu*" was concisely written, with sophisticated literary skills, drawing on personal experience, emotion, and life philosophy. Those works represented Li Qingzhao's literary prowess in other modes, in addition to her status as a crowned *Ci* master. Despite a comparatively late entrance into the Anglophone world, Li Qingzhao's sophistication in a variety of literary genres was still recognized to some extent. These works reflect unconventional social values, which dramatically diverged from Chinese tradition regarding images of women and women's writing. They gave readers more leeway to appreciate Li Qingzhao's other personal traits.

Reviewing *Ci* not included on the top ten list, a preference for "*The Postscript to Jinshilu*" and "*Xiarijueju*" was observed. These were translated even much more frequently than the remaining thirty *Ci*. Since "*The Postscript to Jinshilu*" reminisces about Li Qingzhao's marriage with Zhao Mingcheng, its relative popularity for retranslation suggests that readers in the target culture were also intrigued by the poet's biography. The popularity of "*Xiarijueju*", might have something to do with Chinese anthologists because it was often selected as a classical poem of patriotism in modern Chinese textbooks for students.

Aside from those listed in the above two tables, other types of Li Qingzhao's works

were less frequently translated. As a case in point, some *Ci*, *Shi* and *Wen* were only translated once. Furthermore, in some cases, their introduction to the Anglophone West began much later than *Ci*. For instance, "*The Letter to Qi Chongli*" was not translated into English until 1994 (mentioned in Chapter Three), whereas her first *Ci* was translated into English in 1918. Nonetheless, the letter offered a good glimpse into Li Qingzhao's life after the death of her husband.

## **4.4.4 Further Discussion**

The prevalence of specific works in (re)translations by Anglophone translators and editors reveals the uneven distribution of attention among Li Qingzhao's literary corpus. It also highlights the substantial retranslation of certain selected works. These repeated translations reflect both the preferences of translators and editors as well as the enduring popularity of selected pieces.

Certain *Ci* and their representation of the poet were better received by readers than others. In general, the top four *Ci* dwelt upon the theme of lovesickness and contained images of a forlorn, anguished female protagonist. A certain image of Li Qingzhao was created and reinforced by these *Ci* in traditional biographical interpretations so that both Chinese and Anglophone readers tended to recognize Li Qingzhao as a poet of primarily feminine sentiment. Egan believes that historically, the choice of the most frequently anthologized *Ci* was influenced by an implicit desire to "validate the conventions of representing women in works written by men" (Egan, 2013, p. 231); in other words, to serve the patriarchal ideology and augment women's dependency on men in the feudal Chinese society. The present research seeks to demonstrate that the reason for the choice by later Anglophone translators is more complex.

Other *Ci* on the top ten list do not bear the same themes featured in the top four. *"Rumengling-remembering"* features a carefree young girl, while "*Yujia'ao-the sky"* presents male ambition and "*Jianzimulanhua*" depicts a mischievous bride. The above three *Ci* radically deviate from the image of the traditional Chinese woman as emotional but restrained. "*Yongyule*" was more concerned with lost land and country though from a female perspective, and "*Huanxisha-a small courtyard*"(浣溪沙 • 小院闲窗春色深) demonstrates a young lady's eagerness for love to bloom in Spring, but without the deep level of sorrow and desperation seen in the top four *Ci*.

Therefore, the most frequently retranslated of Li Qingzhao's *Ci* and *Shi* embodied femininity, masculinity, patriotism, heroism, lovesickness and freedom of expression about life. The similarities and differences between Chinese and Anglophone readers in the popularity of individual *Ci* might indicate the poet's reception to some extent. The list above demonstrates that readers in the Anglophone West accepted Li Qingzhao's complexity, her multi-faceted character and her 'masculine' temperament. This acceptance might be related to the rise of feminist studies and their impact on literary studies, enabling an Anglophone readership to access a more complex and diverse view of the female poet - one that challenges male authority. The popularity of Carl Jung in the last century might also have allowed readers to identify an inner masculine side hidden in the female poet's psyche and evident in her works, such as "*Yujia'ao-the sky*" and "*Xiarijueju*". That might suggest that women experience greater societal acceptance of androgynous gender expressions in the Anglophone world, rather than

adhering to the feminine-masculine dichotomy found in traditional perspectives, as hinted by Rydholm (2017).

Nevertheless, the degree of popularity and reception of certain *Ci* might also relate to the themes of the books in which they feature. The following part will explore these factors in detail.

# 4.5 Examining Monographs on Women's Literature

In the previous dataset, there are two major genres, namely, comprehensive literary or poem anthologies and female-centric monographs. This part will first present the choice of Li Qingzhao's works in female-focused monographs to see if certain book themes are related to the selection of works retranslated.

## 4.5.1 Selection of Materials

Overall, there are 16 monographs on the theme of women along with another fifteen Li Qingzhao's collections in the dataset. As mentioned in 4.1, some repeated material is excluded from the dataset, such as the reprinted book chapters of Hsu's (1962) translation. This journal article was taken as a special contribution to women's literature translation and reprinted twice in female-centric monographs. Hsu's original (1962) translation will therefore be categorized later in this study to include only one book: *Images of Women in Chinese Literature* (1994).<sup>66</sup> The present section also excludes Egan's (2013) *The Burden of a Female Talent*, as it refers only to Li Qingzhao. Of the 16 total entries, six books are dedicated to women of the world, and the rest focus on Chinese women past and present. These monographs cover publications from 1937 to 2013.

# 4.5.2 Preference of Female-centric Monographs

Generally, the selection of Li Qingzhao's works included in female-themed monographs is not as limited as that of the overall entries. Out of all female monographs, the following ten *Ci* in Figure 27 were more recurrent than others. The ranking of the top five is similar to that of the overall preference. The five on the lower end of the list differed slightly. *Guyaner* (孤雁儿), *Jianzimulanhua*, and *Dianjiangchun-off the swing* were more frequently translated than "*Rumengling-last night*" and "*Huanxisha-a small courtyard*", as shown in the following figure. Both "*Rumengling-last night*" and "*Huanxisha-a small courtyard*" fell out of the top ten list, ranking 13th and 35th respectively, whereas "*Dianjianchun-off the swing*" jumped to the top ten list. While her *Wen* "*The Postscript to Jinshilu*" did not make the top ten list, it ranked 18<sup>th</sup> in popularity, almost as popular as her renowned *Ci* "*Rumengling-last night*". A detailed ranking is seen in Appendix 4-7: female-focused monographs and the popularity list of individual works.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> As mentioned in 4.1, the later monograph including Hsu's 1962 was reprinted in 2005. Here the earlier reprinting was gathered for data.



Figure 27 The frequency of inclusion and ranking of works in female-themed monographs

As mentioned in Chapter Three - Literature Review (section 3.3), the first femalethemed monograph containing Li Qingzhao's works was published in 1937 (Ayscough), but after this, there followed around three decades of silence. The 1970s began to see a slight rise in the number and diversity of Li Qingzhao's works occurring in monographs, as is shown in the following Figure 28. The attention grew more intense from the 1990s to the new century and this might be related to third wave of feminism.



Figure 28 The No. of works included in monographs by date

A chain of social and historical factors led up to the publication of the 1937 femalecentric monograph by Ayscough. Amongst these, there was the growing number of Chinese young students studying abroad who brought aspects of Chinese culture to America; this might have intrigued some American scholars. For example, the writer Ayscough might have been aware of the translation of Li Qingzhao's *Ci* by BingXin in 1925, in Wellesley College. Aside from these factors, the 1930s were a time of American economic depression and included the outbreak of war between China and Japan, as well as World War II. Both Chinese and American people were suffering physically and psychologically. As an American born in Shanghai, China, Ayscough had a few years of Chinese life experience and might have empathized with what the Chinese were going through, as she mentions in the introduction of her volume (Ayscough, 1937, p. xiv). Here, Ayscough (1937, p. xi) notes her amazement at the calmness and self-respect a Chinese woman preserved during a family ordeal and it may be that this motivated her to share inspiring Chinese women's stories to call upon people in the world to gather up their strength to overcome difficulties.

#### 4.5.3 Discussion

Figure 27 shows little contrast in the frequency of retranslations, which tend to be more balanced than that of the whole dataset. In contrast to the large difference between the most and least preferred texts in the complete dataset, Figure 27 shows only moderate differences in the frequency of inclusion. This implies that the translators and editors working on female-centric monographs did not only spotlight the best-known *Ci*, but they also spared some attention to others. Their more balanced effort allowed Li Qingzhao's *Ci* to speak for different sentiments. A comparison of monographs focusing on Chinese and international female writers shows more retranslations of Chinese women, as is shown in the following Figure 29. To be specific, the number of Li Qingzhao's *Ci* included in these 6 monographs focusing on world women writers comprised 29, and only 10 of them were retranslations, accounting for about 34% of the total. By contrast, 72 retranslations out of the total 124 pieces included in these books focused on Chinese women, representing about 58% of the total.



Figure 29 The proportion of retranslations included in female-centric monographs

The newer translations mingled with retranslations in international female-centric monographs might suggest translators or anthologists trying to show different sides of Li Qingzhao, to emphasize the importance of "diversity" (Barnstone and Barnstone, 1992, p. xxiii), or the "multiple voices of women" (Bankier and Lashgari, 1983. p. 8). The rise of *Dianjiangchun-off the swing* on the list may be seen as evidence of this increasing diversity. The poem highlights a maiden's coyness and nervousness at the sight of her lover, a theme that was not the main feature in Li Qingzhao's *Ci*. Thus, their choices differed slightly from previous translations. The selection of fewer retranslations might also be caused by the limited space for individual poets in the world poem anthologies, as Cosman et al. (1978, p.32) stated, "limitation of space restricted the selection."

Comparing the overall ranking and Figure 27 above, it can be inferred that translators and editors almost reached a consensus on the literary value of most of the top ten retranslated *Ci. Ci* on the top five of the list were generally highly thought of and well-received, regardless of the themes of translation books or anthologies. In the eyes of Anglophone readers, they are the gems of Li Qingzhao's works, and can best represent her literary excellence.

Thus, the thematic focus of a retranslation book does not exclusively dictate the

selection of source texts and the reception of retranslations. Factors such as the diversity of material or limitation of space may exert some influence on retranslations. Further efforts should be extended to other retranslation works for more revelations.

# 4.6 Examining Anthologies

Since female-centric monographs have been studied earlier in Section 4.5, the majority of what remains in the dataset are anthologies from various anthologists and translators from 1918 to 2021. According to Barbara Benedict (quoted in Seruya, 2013. p. 2), "[t]he basic function of anthologies is always and inevitably to reflect and shape contemporary literary taste." Apart from reflecting the anthologists' taste, they can, as Essmann and Frank (1991, p. 74) noted "in principle, offer concerted evidence about the revaluation of authors, periods, genres, national literatures." Moreover, as Seruya (2013, p.1) suggests, translation anthologists "select and through selection, evaluate collectibles for a certain public, thus configuring and/or manipulating the reception of a foreign culture by native readers." Therefore, anthologists exert a tangible impact on the dissemination of source culture in the target culture, whether it be literary taste, or assessment and reception of a foreign author, literature and culture at large. The following section of this study will investigate the decisions made by anthologists, examining how their choices relate to motivations for retranslation or other contextual factors, and how their choices reflect their reception of Li Qingzhao's works.

## 4.6.1 Selection of Material

The materials gathered in this part are mainly poetry or general literary anthologies containing work from a variety of poets. Taking out female-focused monographs from the dataset in Section 4.3 (93 entries), the following material is further filtered as follows.

Firstly, this research excludes all texts that focus exclusively on Li Qingzhao, since these do not entail a selection process from a variety of poets. For the same reason, research papers and anthologies focusing only on Li Qingzhao and one or two other poets, such as *Lotus Lovers* by Hamill (1985), are also excluded.

Secondly, this part also excludes the general historical introductions to Chinese literature or poetry in research papers and book chapters. Certain books of literary history, laying emphasis on literary themes, are excluded because most of these books contain a lot of analysis and only a few translations as examples and are not structured by the list of authors.

Thirdly, collections of essays containing translations are also excluded, such as Soong (1985), because these texts were submitted by different translators, reflecting their own literary tastes rather than that of the editors.

The remaining anthologies are mainly English literary syntheses of a single genre such as *Chinese Lyrics* (Chu, 1937) or different genres written by different Chinese authors and translated by a single or multiple translator(s) from Chinese, such as *Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century* (Birch, 1965). Translation anthologies included in this part comprise 36 entries, spanning from 1918 to 2019.

### 4.6.2 Preference from Anthologies

Four major types of translation anthologies are identified in this section, namely: anthologies of world literature by various authors from different countries; anthologies of Chinese literature by many authors from different dynasties; anthologies of Chinese literature by only a few prominent authors from certain dynasties, and anthologies of *Song Ci* by poets from *Song* Dynasty. This part begins with an analysis of the overall preference of anthologists for certain works of Li Qingzhao and then moves to comparative studies of the popularity of her *Ci* and her peers.

The following Table 9 demonstrates the most frequently included works of Li Qingzhao in the 36 anthologies. The details can be seen in Appendix 4-8: anthologies and the popularity of individual pieces.

Specific Ci included	frequency	Specific Ci included	frequency		
Wulingchun	18	Yujia'ao-the sky	8		
Shengshengman	17	Huanxisha-a small courtyard	7		
Zuihuayin	13	Yongyule	6		
Yijianmei	13	Jianzimulanhua	6		
Rumengling-remembering	10	Dianjianchun-off the swing	6		
Rumengling-last night	9	The Postscript to Jinshilu	5		

Table 9 The top included pieces in anthologies

Research findings gleaned from anthologies suggest a conspicuous inclination among anthologists towards the *Wen, The Postscript to Jinshilu*. This was included five times in Lin (1960), Owen (1996), Mair (1994; 2000) and Puchner (2012), ranking 12<sup>th</sup> among the surveyed pieces. Its ranking represents a more favourable position in anthologies compared to its placement within the overall dataset. Among these anthologies, Lin's (1960) rendition of this particular *Wen* is the most frequently included retranslation, with Owen's (1986) second.

The fascination with The Postscript to Jinshilu was probably due to its content. As mentioned in Chapter One, The Postscript narrated Li Qingzhao's first marriage and antique-collecting life and her attempts to protect her antiques on the way to finding refuge after the sudden death of her husband during the national crisis. This autobiographical Wen was written by Li Qingzhao as a postscript to the archaeological catalogue Jinshilu. Though mainly ascribed to Zhao Mingcheng, scholars such as Tian Yiheng from the Ming Dynasty (Xu, 2018, p. 293) and Hu Weiyuan and Fu Zhaolun from the Qing Dynasty (Xu, 2018, p. 263 and p. 295) claim that the work was likely a collaborative effort. Hence, the translation of The Postscript is technically autobiographical. According to Ji (2010, p.130), "the Western tradition highly valued literature, which results in great respect for literati and expectation for learning about their biographies." In light of this, the translation of The Postscript might be aimed at satisfying readers' curiosity about the poet thereby enhancing her reception in the target language culture. Moreover, in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, Arthur Waley and his friends were great biographers, the former translating and adapting biographies of Chinese poets such as Bai Juyi, Li Bai and Yuan Mei. As a result, Ji (2010, p.131) suggests that a "booming biographical literature increased readers' expectation." The anthologists above might have been influenced by Arthur Waley, a leading Chinese-English poem

translator, since references to him are found in the paratexts of works by Whithall (1918) and Payne (1949).

For the top five *Ci* on the list, there is little contrast between the overall preferences of the dataset and female-centric monographs. Changes can be found in the specific ranking of these *Ci* on the top ten list. The top ten list in Table 9 very much resembles that of Figure 25, the overall preference of the whole dataset. This suggests Li Qingzhao's (re)translation history was mostly fashioned by anthologists, with over a third of publications from anthologies as further proof. It is likely then that these anthologists shaped the taste of the general public. After all, the power of editors and translators on reception is emphasized by Gulyás' examination of Hungarian retranslations. She argues that:

"... two key figures [...] play a decisive role in the selection of texts to be retranslated nowadays, the translator and the editor. Their agreement to retranslate and republish a text can be considered as a sort of primary reception, translation itself being an act of reception". (Gulyás, 2022, p. 220)

### 4.6.3 Discussion

The striking disparity in the data from the overall preference of the dataset and that of female-focused monographs lies in the singularity and concentration of literary genres included in those anthologies. Putting aside The Postscript, these anthologies predominantly included Li Qingzhao's Ci, and other literary genres were almost obscured in these anthologies. These anthologies only included 43 Ci, 3 Shi and 2 Wen. The only Shi included were Xiarijueju, Oucheng and Chuncan, each appearing only once or twice among the 36 entries. Even the most popular Shi, Xiarijueju, ranking 1st among all her Shi in the overall dataset, was only included once in all anthologies. Conversely, there were more than 40 Ci, four Shi and three Wen included in all the 16 female-focused monographs. Hence, this research argues that English translations of Li Qingzhao's works included in anthologies demonstrate more singularity and centrality, which might reflect the conservative, conventional attitudes of anthologists. Alternatively, that singularity could also be a deliberate attempt to mask her literary diversity. Such an approach risks silencing Li Qingzhao's other literary genres leading to an under-representation of Li Qingzhao's achievements and cultural significance. That kind of negative impact was also pinpointed by Van Poucke (2022, p. 34), who highlighted that:

"In terms of reception of canonical authors into a particular culture, the nonretranslation of certain parts of their oeuvre can significantly alter the image of that author and their legacy in the receiving culture."

This research aims to identify differences in selection preferences between anthologies and female-focused monographs, considering the gender of the editors or authors. As is shown in the following Figure 30, 15 out of 16 female-focused monographs were authored (edited/translated) or co-authored by female authors and published in the United States, with the exception of Lawrence Lipking.<sup>67</sup> Meanwhile, only 4 out of 36 anthologies were authored or co-authored by women, such as Clara Candlin (1933), Julie Landau (1994), Jeannette Faurot (1998) and Shu-Ling Wu (2019). The details can be seen in Appendix 4-7: Female-focused monographs and popularity list and Appendix 4-8: Anthologies and popularity list of individual pieces. It is unlikely that the relatively few women authors among anthologists had much say in the selection of works anthologized. As a result, the choices were almost all made by male anthologists, reflecting men's stereotypes and preferences.



Figure 30 Contrast in genders

To conclude, the preferences of anthologists may reflect the reception of Li Qingzhao's works among Anglophone readers. Additionally, their choices could be affected by readers' expectations regarding biographies of literati, but also by male editor-authors' conventional stereotyping of Li Qingzhao. There seems to be a correlation between the under-representation of female editors and authors in anthologies and the underrepresentation of Li Qingzhao's achievements. After all, Gualtieri (2011) identified a "direct correspondence between the number of females in editorials and the percentage of works by female writers" in several editions of the *Norton Anthology of English Literature*. While the above study showcases the insufficient representation and reception of Li Qingzhao's literary prowess among Anglophone anthologists, her comparative literary prominence among her peers remains unknown. The analysis of Li Qingzhao's retranslation rates compared to those of her peers is dealt with later in the next part.

# 4.7 The Dynamics in the Proportion of Li Qingzhao's (Re)translated

# Works

Apart from the aforementioned lack of representation of female editors and translators in anthologies, female writers' contributions are not always duly recognized in contrast to male writers, and anthologies serve as valuable repositories for tracing their presence and readers' perception of their significance. As highlighted by Horowitz (2015, p. 11), "decisions about what to translate into which language fundamentally affect the transmission and preservation of culture [...] Examining the inclusion and exclusion of writers in anthologies from synchronic and diachronic perspectives provide one way to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> The female-focused monograph *Jade Mirror: Women Poet of China* was edited by Micheal Farman (2013), but translated by Grace Fong, Emily Goedde, Jeanne Larsen, Geoffrey Waters and Micheal Farman himself. Notably, three of these translators are women, although Li Qingzhao's works were translated by a man, Michael Farman. Hence, this study still considers this book to be influenced by female contributors.

gauge the transmission of literature." Seruya, et al. (2013, p. 9) also note, "these clusters (anthologists) may change in time and different groups may privilege different elements", reflecting the principles of "dynamics" and "relationality". In this context, a diachronic examination studies the chronological changes in the English anthologization of Li Qingzhao's works in the literary repertoire over time; whereas a synchronic examination entails the comparison of her contribution against those of her peers in anthologies to evaluate her prominence. This combination of diachronic and synchronic examination enables an effective exploration of the "dynamics" and "relationality" among anthologists.

#### 4.7.1 Data Filtration and Collection

To reveal Li Qingzhao's impact diachronically and compare her prominence with her peers synchronically, data filtration and collection must be clarified and unified. This requires a definition of the works selected for this dataset.

As mentioned in Section 4.6, there are three subgenres of literary anthology: anthologies of Chinese literature; anthologies of Ci, and anthologies of world literature. They are also organized differently. Some are organized chronologically by Chinese dynasties, such as Payne (1949) and Birch (1965). These anthologies make it clear and easy to find all poets' contributions during the Song dynasty in which Li Qingzhao lived. Some are organized by different literary genres, such as Owen (1996), and some are organized by themes, such as Lin (1960) and Cui and Cai (2012), or by author, such as Rexroth (1956) and Davis (1962). In these cases, poets of different dynasties were often mixed. Based on the timeline of ancient Chinese history, the translated works selected for data analysis in this research are restricted to poets living in the Song Dynasty (960-1279 CE), covering both the Northern (960-1127 CE) and Southern Song Period (1127-1279 CE). The same selection process is applied to Ci collections, such as Chu (1937) and Mackintosh and Ayling (1965). The reason for this is that Ci budded in the Late Tang dynasty, grew and developed in the period of Five Dynasties and Ten States (907-979 CE), matured in the Song Dynasty and withered in later dynasties, as mentioned in Chapter One. If all Ci and Ci poets were included in the research, it would be endless and meaningless; after all, some modern poets such as Mao Zedong also wrote Ci. Furthermore, certain anthologies on Chinese literature or poems only cover Ci from the Song dynasty and do not cover those from other dynasties, probably due to limited space. The criteria of data collection are more consistent therefore if it is restricted to poets from the Song dynasty in all 36 entries.

Moreover, out of all the poets in the *Song* dynasties, some were known as *Shi* poets, such as Yang Wanli, Fan Chengda and Zhu Xi, etc., and others as *Ci* poets, such as Liu Yong, Zhou Bangyan and Jiangkui, etc. Some are more well-known as *Ci* poets writing *Shi* at the same time, such as Su Shi, Li Qingzhao, Lu You and Xin Qiji. Those *Song* poets known for their *Shi* are not included in this research due to their complete absence in the majority of anthologies, particularly *Ci* collections. Thus, it makes more sense to include *Ci* poets and *Ci/Shi* poets in this research, since Li Qingzhao is one of them.

As mentioned in Chapter Three, the Literature Review, Chinese scholar Tu (2016) identified the top ten most popular *Ci* poets in ancient Chinese literary history based on twelve selected anthologies published in the English-speaking world mainly from the

20<sup>th</sup> century. Of these ten, six hailed from the *Song* dynasty: Li Qingzhao, Su Shi, Xin Qiji, Liu Yong, Ouyang Xiu, and Zhou Bangyan. Building on Tu's groundwork, this research considers these five poets as Li Qingzhao's peers and assesses their contributions as subjects for investigation. To ensure a comprehensive examination, this research also includes four additional poets mentioned in Wang and Liu's (2003, p. 59) list of the top 30 and 10 most influential *Ci* poets in Chinese literature. They are Yan Jidao, Qin Guan, Jiang Kui and Wu Wenying. In addition, Yue Fei and Lu You are included in this study due to their *Ci* ranking among the top ten most influential among all three hundred well-known *Ci* in the *Song* dynasty, according to Wang and Yu (2008, p. 12).

Selecting the above twelve poets as subjects, the data collected in this part of the research examines how many of them were anthologized in these books, how many works were selected from each poet, and Li Qingzhao's total contribution. To move one step forward from Tu (2016), this research takes not just Li Qingzhao's anthologized *Ci* into consideration, but also her other works, so as to develop a fuller picture of Li Qingzhao's position in history. For some anthologies on various kinds of Chinese literature, all types of works from the twelve poets are collected.

### 4.7.2 Synchronic Examination

This part first examines Li Qingzhao and her peers' overall contribution to these 36 anthologies, namely, how many times they are anthologized, as is shown in the following Table 10. Details can be seen in Appendix 4-9 Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies.

Poets	Li	Su	Xin	Ouya	Lu	Liu	Qin	Zhou	Jia	Wu	Ya	Yu
	Qin	Shi	Qiji	ng	You	Yon	Gu	Bang	ng	Wenyi	n	e
	gzha			Xiu		g	an	yan	Kui	ng	Jid	Fei
	0										ao	
Anthologize	36/3	34/	23/	23/36	22/	17/	14/	10/36	8/3	8/36	6/3	3/3
d	6	36	36		36	36	36		6		6	6
frequency/to												
tal												
anthologies												

Table 10 Popularity of Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies

As Table 10 demonstrates, Li Qingzhao is the most frequently anthologized writer in these 36 anthologies, a finding coinciding with the result of Tu's (2016) study based on 12 anthologies. Some other results from this table contradict Tu's findings. For instance, five of 36 anthologies exclude writers from the period of *Five Dynasties and Ten States* (907-979 CE), making it impossible for Li Yu, who lived during this period, to still rank second among all *Ci* poets. Instead, Su Shi, as a versatile writer, excelling in *Ci, Shi, Wen, Fu*, calligraphy and painting, ranks second. As for the place of Xin Qijji and Ouyang Xiu, the results are not much different from these of Tu (2016) and Wang and Liu (2003). It is quite unexpected that Lu You, not listed among the top ten *Ci* poets by Wang and Liu (2003), emerges as the fifth most popular translated poet in the Anglophone West. He is not on Tu's list (2016), either. Qin Guan, who was not nominated in Tu's list (2016), still ranks among the top ten most frequently translated poets in the Anglophone West. Meanwhile, other poets, such as Jiang Kui, Wu Wenying, and Yan Jidao, were not that much translated into the Anglophone West, though they made some impact in Chinese.

#### 4.7.3 Discussion

The extensive representation of Li Qingzhao in anthologies underscores her unique place among her peers in the Anglophone world. She is rightfully recognized as the greatest female poet not only of the *Song* Dynasty, but also in the broader history of ancient Chinese literature.

The discrepancies between current and previous research probably arise from two aspects. For one, Tu's research (2016) was based on limited data, drawing on only 12 anthologies. For another, the study only focused on the translated Ci and neglected other translated works. Some poets, like Su Shi and Lu You, wrote many Shi along with their Ci. In Lu You's case, sometimes his Shi was translated, whereas his Ci was not, as in Faurot (1998). As for poets at the bottom of the list, their influence was comparatively less far-reaching in China than the leading poets. Their limited anthologization in the Anglophone West reflected that Anglophone choices of representing Chinese literature were probably influenced by Chinese views to some degree, leading to limited translation in the Anglophone West. Yue Fei was probably a special case. His Chinese *Ci-Manjianghong(满江红)* was on the top ten popular *Ci* list, but his other works and influence were less significant than those of other poets. According to Wang and Yu (2008), Manjianghong, though obscure in the Song dynasty, ascended in the Ming dynasty and entered the top ten Ci in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Wang and Yu (2018, p.14) stated that the dynamics of its impact were probably related to Yue Fei's identity as a poet and national patriot as well as the wider Chinese social context. Imbued with heroic glory among Chinese readers in Chinese culture, Yue Fei may not have found the same amount of popularity in the Anglophone world, where readers do not share the same historical and cultural context.

Compared with her peers, Li Qingzhao's more frequent inclusion in anthologies implies – at first glance - her favourable reception. However, the dynamics of her retranslated works in anthologies may provide more specific information about her reception.

#### 4.7.4 Diachronic examination

This part counted the exact number of Li Qingzhao's retranslated works in each anthology and then compared the ratio of her works to the total works of the above 12 poets included in anthologies in order to explore the dynamics of this ratio over the last century. Measured against the previous dataset, the following Figure 31 shows the evolving dynamics in years. Details can be seen in appendix 4-9: Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies.



Figure 31 The proportion of Li Qingzhao's retranslated works in anthologies by date

As a latecomer in the 1910s, Li Qingzhao's contribution to anthologies has grown over the years from the 1930s to 2019. Before the mid-1960s, her inclusion in anthologies was minimal, accounting for around 10% or less of the total works of the twelve selected poets. However, from the 1970s to 1980s, her share began to grow visibly in poetry anthologies in particular, such as Rexroth (1970), Kwock and McHugh (1980), Hamill (1985) and Whincup (1987). It increased to around 50% or even more of the total content. Her rising position was also reflected in Chinese literature anthologies of the 1960s and 1970s, such as Birch (1965) and McNaughton (1974). From the 1990s to the early 2000s, the interest in Li Qingzhao's translated works remained steady in poem anthologies and her contribution among Song poets accounted for about 50% of the total. Later on in the new century, Li Qingzhao's translated works constituted around 30% of the total, which does not necessarily indicate a decline in her impact in the Anglophone world. Rather, her works were included in only two world literature anthologies of 36 entries. Among the two anthologies, A Book of Luminous Things (1996) was edited by Miłosz, a Nobel prize winner of literature. The inclusion of works from Li Qingzhao and her three peers in his book reaffirmed her achievement in world poetry. The other, The Norton Anthology of World Literature, Third Edition edited by Puchner (2012) highlighted Li Qingzhao's works as the sole representative from the Song Dynasty for Medieval Chinese Literature.

### 4.7.5 Discussion

Though Li Qingzhao was the most frequently translated poet in the *Song* dynasty, the inclusion of her works was not extensive. Her initial minoritization in the early period of the last century (before the 1960s) was reflected not only in the comparison of translated works between her and her peers, but also in the limited publications (only 7 books), mentioned in Chapter Three, the Literature Review (Section 3.3). Li Qingzhao's early marginalization in literature might be due to a plurality of social, cultural and historical influences.

First, her peripheral place could be ascribed to the first English *Ci* collection in the Anglophone world: *The Herald Wind* (Candlin, 1933). In this first attempt to introduce *Song Ci* to the Anglophone world, the emphasis was on well-established Chinese poets, and tribute was paid to Chinese literary canons, which also served as a buffer against

resistance in the target culture. It is not uncommon for anthologists to select wellestablished poets in order to secure access and acceptance in the target culture. As Gombár (2013, p.271) writes, "producing tried-and-true classics also prevented publishers from promoting writers whose acceptance by the critics or the public was still in doubt, and potentially wasting foreign currency on copyright fees". Before the 1960s, many Chinese mainland critics still slandered Li Qingzhao's personal conduct and smeared her second marriage. Some even frowned on her literary achievements because of her "misconduct", as mentioned in Chapter One (Section 1.9). She was perceived as a woman of controversy and uncertainty.

Second, Li Qingzhao's underrepresentation in anthologies was shared by many women writers worldwide. The traditional Western and Chinese educational systems before the last century led to only a handful of canonized female writers. As Gilbert and Gubar (1979) mention in Gualtieri (2011, p. 99), "Western literary history is overwhelmingly male—or, more accurately, patriarchal" and literary anthologies are characterised by a gender imbalance. Gualtieri (2011) quantifies women writers in all eight editions of *The Norton Anthology of English Literature* and points out that the women writers in earlier editions were substantially fewer than those of the latest editions. Women writers also faced underrepresentation in Romantic-period anthologies, though there was a slight increase in their inclusion in later anthologies, as evidenced by Levy and Perry (2015). Similarly, research by Georgiou and Van Der Meer (2022) revealed that female writers in English anthologies of Modern Greek and Yiddish poetry over the last century held peripheral positions.

Li Qingzhao's prominence from the 1960s onward, and her remarkable visibility in the 1970s to 1980s, aligns with the impact of the women's movement on literary translation mentioned in Section 4.1 and the subsequent rise in the number of published anthologies. The slight decline after the mid-2000s reflects a more balanced approach compared to previous periods. It is important to note that assessing her significance solely based on the number of works retranslated and anthologized is inadequate, given the relatively small body of her existing work - some 70 pieces. This is considerably less than the extensive collection of over three thousand poems authored by Su Shi that have endured over time. The moderation in the inclusion of her works might be conditioned by the evolving landscape of feminism in the late 1990s, which was marked by less overt political activism and a shift toward greater inclusiveness. The backlash against certain radical feminist perspectives from critics and mass media may have modified the anthologists' choices in the Western literary context.

To conclude, the changes in the proportion of Li Qingzhao's works included in anthologies, compared to the total works of 12 prominent *Song* poets, almost mirror the dynamics of her publications. From the number of publications including her works to the number of retranslated pieces included in anthologies, the trajectory of her (re)translation history rises from early occasional translations before 1960s to later more frequent retranslations, evidenced by a growing number of female-centric monographs and complete collections. This progression also reflects her reception in the Anglophone world, evolving from an initially minor status, towards a more prominent position. The dynamics of (re)translation and reception can be attributed to a multitude of complex contextual parameters, including political, economic, sociocultural, and historical factors, with more involvement of institutions and publishers in the US and UK.

Translators' subjectivity also plays a role. Translators from diverse backgrounds have contributed to Li Qingzhao's (re)translations, yet no canonical translators or translations are manifest. Rexroth has been identified as the most prominent translator in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, while Owen has gained increasing visibility in the 21st century. The reception of (re)translations also correlates with the volume of individual translators' output and the endorsement of renowned publishers.

The acceptance of Chinese source references and individual texts might further drive retranslations and influence the reception of certain pieces. For instance, those works expressing universal accepted emotions or well-established works acknowledged by Chinese anthologists are most frequently included in the dataset across various genres. However, detailed investigation into the sub-dataset reveals her reception has been predominantly shaped by male-dominant anthologists and editors, leading to a stereotypical and limited representation of Li Qingzhao's oeuvre. Despite her increased prominence and wider reception, a synchronic and diachronic examination of the data still reveals her initial marginalization and the neglect of her diverse literary achievements. Alongside the macro-analysis, further micro-analysis is needed in the subsequent chapters to gain a more nuanced understanding of the (re)translation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works.

# **Chapter Five (Re)translation and Reception of Li**

## Qingzhao's Complete Collections: A Peritextual Analysis

In Chapter Four, this research examined the (re)translation and reception of Li Qingzhao's translated works in anthologies and monographs from a macro perspective. The research outcome reveals that certain translators' retranslations are more frequently anthologized, with Rexroth's renditions being particularly favoured. This observation prompts an in-depth exploration of how Rexroth's version might influence readers' reception. Thus, this chapter undertakes a comparative micro-analysis of his rendition of Li Qingzhao's complete collection alongside other collections. As defined by Batchelor (2018, p.142) in Chapter Two, "a paratext is a consciously crafted threshold for a text which has the potential to influence the way(s) in which the text is received". The impact of paratexts on reception is also stressed by Lüsebrink in Doty (2022, p.295) as follows:

Paratexts [...] constitute important components of the inter-cultural reception of literary works. They play a crucial role in the marketing of literary works, shape their interpretation and aim to respond to the reception patterns and expectations of the foreign target audience through various forms of adaptation.

This chapter will delve into Rexroth and Chung's (1979) *Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems,* the largest translated volume of Li Qingzhao by Rexroth. By compiling paratextual materials from Rexroth and Chung's (1979) and other collections, this research aims at revealing how this version is received by translators and why, what the interaction is between (re)translations, and how (re)translation exerts its potential impact on target readers through its paratextual materials.

Following Genette (1997), paratexts are generally classified into two types, according to their spatial relationship to a physical copy of a book. These are epitext and peritext. Epitext, as defined by Genette (1997, p. xviii), encompasses paratextual elements outside the book, such as reviews from critics, interviews with translators and translators' diaries, etc., whereas peritext refers to paratexts within the book. This includes titles, subtitles, cover, contents pages and presentation, notes, blurbs on dust jackets and flaps or front and back covers and other information. Both peritexts and epitexts exert some effect on readers' reading experience.

In terms of epitexts, Rexroth and Chung's (1979) collection garnered the highest number of critical reviews among all complete collections. Conversely, other collections were reviewed little or not at all by critics. Thus, the skewed distribution of critical reviews among (re)translation collections does not provide sufficient grounds to assert definitively that Rexroth and Chung's (1979) rendition is more prominent or better received than other (re)translations based solely on epitexts. A more nuanced examination of peritext is warranted for deeper exploration in the subsequent section.

# 5.1 Titles, Subtitles and Cover Design

According to Pellatt (2018, p.168), "[t]he title of a work must be its most compelling feature, for, along with the cover design, it is what makes a reader pick up the book". She contends that the four functions of the title proposed by Genette (1997)— designation or identification, description of the work (including content and genre), connotative value, and the allure for the reader—continue to be relevant in the current century. More detailed examination into various functions of titles have been conducted by Christiane Nord and Maurizio Viezzi. Nord (1995) identified six functions of titles, namely, distinctive, metatextual, phatic, referential, expressive, and appellative, based on an investigation of over 12,000 titles and headings from a multi-lingual and multigenre corpus. Viezzi (2011) constructed a taxonomy of title functions as naming, phatic, informatory, distinctive, descriptive, expressive, suggestive, seductive, intertextual and poetic function. Despite minor differences in interpretation, the consensus among the above scholars is that the title serves to identify and describe a product, suggest its value or interpretation, and engage or attract potential readers. The following part examines the titles of these complete collections based on their common understanding.

## 5.1.1Titles and Subtitles

Titles are mainly located in four places: cover page, title page and spine, and occasionally half-title page. This section will mainly discuss titles on covers and spines for the following reasons. Genette (1997, p.31-32) stated that "'[t]he printed cover came along to repeat the title page, or relieve it of some of its function", and a half-title page "[...] has nothing on it but the title, possibly in shortened form" (Genette, 1997, p.65). In this research, not all collections have a half-title page, such as Wang (1979), Lee (2018) and Coren (2021). Thus, it does not make much difference to include titles on the half-title page and title page.

Figure 33 Rexroth and Chung's (1979) cover





The complete title of Rexroth and Chung (1979) is Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete

*Poems*. It clearly designates the book's genre and content: a poetry collection and its original author: Li Ch'ing-chao. The simple and clear title is set in the middle of the front cover, in a large bold font that catches the eye and is memorable (see Figure 33), thereby establishing initial contact with prospective readers. The complete title also appears on the book spine alongside the names of its translators, making it easily noticeable for readers in a library or bookstore to locate and read.

The titles of certain (re)translations are ambiguous, making it difficult to discern their genres or the content they represent. For instance, the title of Hu (1966) is *Li Ch'ing-chao* (see Figure 32), which might give readers a false impression that it is a biography about Li Qingzhao or fiction. It is hard to tell from the title if the book is a poetry translation, whereas its preface states its first aim is to "study analytically the complete poetical works" (Hu, 1966, p.7).

In contrast, the length of some retranslation titles limits their effectiveness in reaching audiences. Nord (2019, p.338) believed that "the longer a title, the weaker its appellative effect". In Li Qingzhao's case, Ho's (1968) title might be too long for readers to remember at the first glance. There are 12 words in the title "*More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-Chao*" (see Figure 34). The title comes from the last line of Li Qingzhao's poem *Zuihuayin*. It is poetic, but the full title with the name of its translator in very small font on the book spine is presented in two lines, almost invisible to readers.



Figure 35 Mayhew and McNaughton's (1977) cover



Figure 34 Ho's (1968) cover

Other collections with lengthy titles include Mayhew and McNaughton's (1977) *As Though Dreaming:*<sup>68</sup>*the Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao*, also with 12 words (see Figure 35); Cryer's (1984) *Plum Blossom: Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao translated by* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> The title "As Though Dreaming" is deemed to derive from and mimic one of Li Qingzhao's famous tune titles-如梦令.
James Cryer (see Figure 36) and Wang's (1989) The Complete Ci-poems of Li Qingzhao: A New English Translation (see Figure 37). Only partial titles, "As Though Dreaming" and "Plum Blossom," are displayed on their respective spines. This mirrors Genette's observation (1997, p. 65) that a "spine's narrowness often requires a telltale abbreviation...". It is challenging for readers to discern from the abbreviated title on the spine whether the book is a translation of poetry. Though suggesting its value in novelty by "new", Wang (1989) lacks the title on its spine, resulting in potentially reduced visibility in bookstore and library displays. After all, the spine, is a narrow site "with obvious strategic importance", as stressed by Genette (1997, p. 26).







Figure 37 Wang's (1989) cover

For retranslations in the  $21^{st}$  century, no book titles contain more than 10 words, though the titles of Djao (2010) (see Figure 38), Lee (2018) (see Figure 39) and Coren (2021) (see Figure 40) are still long, with subtitles. The title *A Blossom Like No Other: Li Qingzhao* from Djao (2010) is a poetry collection mixed with biography, but it might be mistakenly taken as a biography or fiction to readers unfamiliar with Chinese. The title "*A Blossom Like No Other*" is also poetic and derives from the last line of Li Qingzhao's *Ci "Yujia'ao-snow* (<sup>2</sup>/<sub>4</sub>) Figure 38 Djao's (2010) cover

*Ci"Yujia'ao-snow*(渔家傲•雪里已知春信

 $\underline{\Xi}$ )". The verbose yet artistically crafted titles employed by Ho (1968), Mayhew and McNaughton (1977) and Djao (2010) might impact the reception of Li Qingzhao's works among diverse readerships. The abbreviated titles on the spine likely diminish the likelihood of their being selected by readers who are unversed in the Chinese language and Li Qingzhao's poetry. On the other hand, the expansive titles on the cover might also discourage engagement, as their intertextual references primarily relate to the source culture and fail to establish a connection with the target culture for less experienced readers. Conversely, seasoned poetry enthusiasts and individuals wellversed in Chinese literature and Li Qingzhao's oeuvre



might be captivated by the ornate presentation of these titles, enticing them to delve into the content.

Figure 39 Lee's (2018) cover



The absence of titles on the spines of Lee

(2018), Coren (2021), and Wang (1989), might also contribute to lower visibility when showcased in bookstores and libraries. It is noteworthy that the title of Egan (2019) (see Figure 41) is also quite memorable and recognizable, featuring a complete title on its spine. The succinctness of Egan's title might follow Genette's (1997, p. 72) remark regarding titles by famous writers such as Scott, Austen, and Dickens, that "[o]n all of these and numerous other occasions, an irresistible tendency toward reduction is evident."

The diverse retranslations of Li Qingzhao's name on covers might reveal subtle cultural dynamics between English and





Chinese, such as the gradual acceptance of Chinese cultural impact within the Anglophone literary context. Before 2010, almost all collections, with the exception of Wang (1989), used a Wade-Giles Romanisation translation of the poet's name as "Li Ch'ing-chao". Wade-Giles Romanisation was developed by two British scholars in the 19<sup>th</sup> century for the convenience of English speakers. However, four collections published after 2010 consistently translated her name as "Li Qingzhao", using Hanyu Pinyin transliteration. The Hanyu Pinyin was developed by Chinese linguists in 1958 for the international system and was later embraced by the UN and the International Organization for Standardization in the 1980s. The shift from a Westernized name to a standard Mandarin Chinese name on collection covers post-2010 reflects translators'

Figure 40 Coren's (2021) cover

acceptance of Chinese cultural influence. This transition mirrors the evolution of Li Qingzhao's name translation across the broader dataset.<sup>69</sup> It also sheds light on Rexroth's declining anthologization in the new century despite his status as the most popular translator in the dataset, while Owen's popularity has gradually increased.

Among the titles mentioned earlier, most lack a prominent suggestive function; however, those featured on the covers and spines of Rexroth and Chung's (1979) and Egan's (2019) stand out as the most concise, facilitating easy and rapid memorization. The titles of other (re)translations lack clarity or are lengthy, which might compromise their ability to fulfil the descriptive or alluring or phatic function of titles mentioned by above scholars. This may to some degree, undermine their subsequent exposure to the public and their reception, as titles "prepare the readers for the reception of the co-text [...and] guide [their] interpretation, paving the way to the text, highlighted by Nord (2019, p.340). Apart from titling, inconspicuous or inappropriate cover designs might also exacerbate the issue, something which is discussed in the next section.

### 5.1.2 Cover Design

As covers are the most important visual texts, some conceptions about Western visual design are introduced first. Kress and van Leeuwen (2020, p. 216) assert that any visual text should be read from three perspectives: informative value, framing and salience. The composition of text elements (left-right, top-bottom, centre-margin) conveys different information values. Framing an element highlights its connection or disconnection with the surroundings. Salience establishes a hierarchy of importance among elements through contrasts in size, colour, focus, and visual perspective. According to Pellatt (2018, p.171), "cover graphics of source and translated works may be expected to reinforce the information contained in the title of a work." However, a close examination of the (re)translations' covers shows that not all of them meet this expectation. The cover of Rexroth and Chung (1979) (see Figure 33) is designed with both Chinese and Western features. The English title "Li Ch'ing-chao Complete Poems" is presented in the largest font size of all the (re)translations and is particularly attention-grabbing. Even more striking are the white hand-written Chinese characters "帘卷西风人比黄花瘦" on the black background column. This adds some calligraphic beauty to the cover that may add an exotic appeal to Western readers. The white background featuring the black English title on the left and the black background adorned with white Chinese calligraphy on the right create a striking contrast for readers. According to the Western design tradition mentioned by Kress and van Leeuwen (2020, p. 187), the left part of the page represents given knowledge, and the right part is the new information to be foregrounded. The painting of a slender Chinese lady smelling

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> In the overall dataset, Li Qingzhao's names are translated into seven different ways. Before the 1980s, all retranslations are attributed to the poet in the Wade-Giles translation: Li Ch'ing-chao, except Barrows (1977) and Wang (1989). In the 1990s, Li Ch'ing chao was still more frequently chosen than Li Qingzhao as a retranslation of the poet's name. In the 2000s, the amount of naming in the Wade-Giles Romanization almost equals that of the retranslations in Chinese Mandarin, whereas after 2010s, all retranslations adopt the Chinese Mandarin Li Qingzhao as her name. This part of the study is not discussed and supported with details owing to limitations of space and the scope of this research. Further research will be conducted by the author afterwards.

flowers on the lower part on the left side might be a monochrome portrait of Li Qingzhao. The smaller portrait of the lady functions as an additional specification for the upper English title, aligning with the Western upper-lower design custom as outlined by Kress and van Leeuwen (2020, p. 191). The portrait may also work as a prelude to arouse readers' interest in the poet's story and poems. The monochromatic black-and-white colour scheme seems to replicate the aesthetic of traditional Chinese ink painting, offering readers a delightful visual experience in anticipation of the content. The Chinese calligraphy and artistic painting demonstrate a certain extent of foreignization in cover design and may be more intriguing and attractive to general readers than the English title alone, such as in Wang (1989). In this context, "foreignization" pertains to the incorporation of foreign elements, exemplified by Rexroth's Chinese calligraphy and the portrait of Li Qingzhao.

Certain cover designs employ a comparable foreignization, reminiscent of Rexroth and Chung (1979), as observed in Djao (2010) (see Figure 38) and Egan (2019) (see Figure 41). In both Djao (2010) and Egan (2019), the Chinese titles are vertically aligned on the right-hand side of the cover. Djao (2010) features Chinese calligraphy, while Egan (2019) incorporates traditional Chinese serif style that evoke the appearance of classical Chinese writing. The Chinese characters are printed in AGaramond Pro-Bold, which is recognized as one of "a few widely distributed typefaces with the highest quality" by Lupton (2010, p.80). The dark green cover background of Egan (2019) probably echoes the title of Li Qingzhao's original Chinese collection, *Shu Yu Ji* (漱玉 集), where the colour green is reminiscent of the varied hues of jade ( $\pm$ ). In his introduction, Egan (2019, p. xxxxvi) states:

In naming her collection, Li Qingzhao substituted "jades" for "rocks." Odd as it first sounds, the collection title has a certain appropriateness as a designation for something produced by this poet. It evokes hardness, purity, and unexpected convergences (jade and water, or even jade as something that cleanses), something bracing and bold.

Cover designs from some (re)translations may not support the information conveyed in the title of the work, especially in earlier versions. The above dust jacket of Hu (1966) in Figure 32 resembles its front cover inside, except that the front cover is red and the dust jacket is white. The cover does not indicate anything about the contents of the book. The red covers of Ho (1968) (see Figure 34) and Hu (1966) might just be an indication of cultural stereotype, for as Pellatt (2018, p.171) points out, "[f]or the greater part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century ... many English translations of Chinese books are published with red covers." For readers familiar with Chinese culture, the yellow chrysanthemums and red background on the cover of Ho's (1968) retranslation might be seen as discordant. The colour red signifies auspiciousness and joy in Chinese culture. Conversely, yellow chrysanthemums in Li Qingzhao's poems are predominantly associated with melancholy, and the desolation of autumn. This could, potentially undermine the translation product. However, readers unfamiliar with Chinese culture are unlikely to register the incongruity. The dark black cover of

Mayhew and McNaughton (1977) renders its title almost illegible due to the small font size. The graphics of Coren (2021) (see Figure 40) present a phoenix hairpin, a collection from the Ming Dynasty in the Beijing Museum, according to the translator, which bears little relation to the content of the book. The yellow cover of Lee (2018) is a little ambiguous (see Figure 39), as Genette (1997, p. 24) claims, "[a]t the beginning of the twentieth century, yellow covers were synonymous with licentious French books". The potential problems with these book covers might decrease visibility to readers, potentially leading to a smaller readership and subsequently impacting the reception of the works.

Cover designs in certain retranslations do not prominently showcase the title or thematic elements. Under the Western cover design conventions outlined by Kress and van Leeuwen (2020), factors such as placement in the foreground or background, relative size, tonal value (or colour), contrast, sharpness differences, etc., contribute to varying degrees of viewer attention. For instance, the covers of Cryer (1984), Lee (2018) and Coren (2021) (see Figure 36, Figure 39 and Figure 40) foreground their graphics, rather than their titles. Cryer (1984) (see Figure 36) displays a scene of the *Ci* "*Yijianmei*", wild geese returning. This abstract graphic occupies almost the entire cover page, thereby providing minimal space for the title. Similarly, the graphic of the phoenix hairpin occupies 3/4 of the cover page in Coren (2021) (see Figure 40). In these examples, the titles are minimized and obscured by large graphics.

Additionally, the black chrysanthemums against a white background frame are positioned at the very centre of Lee's (2018) cover page. According to Kress and van Leeuwen (2020, p. 205), when framing is absent, it accentuates collective identity while downplaying "individuality and differentiation", whereas framelines serve to perpetuate "segregation" of distinct elements. Here framing in their words (Kress and van Leeuwen, 2020, p. 182-183), refers to "the presence of framing devices, (realized by elements which create dividing lines, or by actual frames) disconnects elements of the image, signifying that they are, in some sense, to be understood as separate elements". The black frame lines in Lee's cover (2018) surrounding the central graphic create a pronounced sense of disconnection from the title at the top and the translator's name at the bottom. This disconnection results in a lack of poetic aesthetics and harmony in the cover design.

Even more dissonance and confusion lie in Lee's (2018) Japanese cover graphic for the Chinese translation collection. The Katagami textile stencil with flowing chrysanthemum design from the late Edo-Meiji period is a Japanese cultural token. The utilization of a Japanese graphic for the English poetry and prose collection of Li Qingzhao might be perceived as an inadvertent oversight or could potentially reflect ingrained cultural stereotypes of Orientalism within the Anglophone world. To many Westerners, the representation of Chinese culture may be conflated with that of Japan, both categorized under the broader umbrella of Orientalism. Alternatively, the selection of the Japanese graphic might hint at underlying political denotation among Anglophone editors, translators and designers involved in the project. In Japanese culture, the chrysanthemum is a symbol of the imperial family and Japan itself. Its presence could subtly evoke notions of national identity and pride, potentially conveying a sense of Japanese cultural influence or dominance, accompanied by its conspicuous centrality on the cover. Given the historical context of the late Edo-Meiji period, the use of this design may also prompt considerations of historical sensitivities and diplomatic relations between Japan and China during that time, adding layers of political nuance to the cover design. This kind of inconsistency between the cover graphic and book content might impede the understanding and reception of Li Qingzhao's works and the Chinese culture she represents.

Pellatt (2018, p.172) highlights the importance of visual paratexts to potential readers, stating that "choice of typeface, font size and the way print is distributed on the page are factors in readability and apprehension of the text." Capitalized letters with New Times Roman font in titles, such as Ho (1968), Wang (1989), Djao (2010), Lee (2018) are harder to read than non-capitalized ones by Rexroth and Chung (1979). The font of the title from Rexroth and Chung (1979) is Copper Black, which was considered "homely and reassuring", by Garfield in Pellatt (2018, p.172).

In conclusion, these findings of this study suggest that the peritext of Rexroth and Chung (1979) was indeed a success, in terms of titling, font and cover design. The concise and easily memorable title not only indicates the text genre on the cover, but also on the spine, enhancing its visibility to readers. The title aligns most effectively with both its visual presentation and the content within the book. While its exoticized characteristics may entice readers, the prominent English title and large font emphasize its accessibility. As a result, these peritextual elements work synergistically and may contribute to the work's popularity.

### 5.2 Blurb on Dust Jackets, Flaps and Back Covers

According to Pellatt (2018, p.170), "naming of authors, translators, benefactors and assistants, in writing everywhere, is all part of the appeal to authority intended to seduce the reader." Apart from titles and cover design, blurbs on dust jackets, flaps and covers are another way to draw the attention of readers and promote a book's prestige and reputation. Similar view is held by Kathpalia (2022, p. 47) who states that the persuasive purpose of blurbs for winning readers is increasingly emphasized in addition to their descriptive and evaluative purpose. After scrutinizing 500 book blurbs from different genres, Kathpalia (2022) pinpointed that there has been a specific correlation between the form and function in the "moves" of conventional book blurbs, such as "headlines, justifying the book, appraising the book, targeting the market, establishing credentials and endorsements".<sup>70</sup> Headlines are excluded from the discussion as no blurbs of Li Qingzhao's English collections are presented with any headlines. According to Kathpalia (2022, p. 50), "justifying the book" is composed of three submoves, namely "establishing the field (or context), indicating the importance of the book and establishing a niche", while "appraising the book" consists of two sub-moves, "describing and indicating value (or evaluating) the book". The following section examines and compares blurbs on Li Qingzhao's (re)translated collections to see the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Kathpalia (2022, p. 34) defines "moves" as "the stages or steps" in the presentation of texts or discourses, a term for "top-level functions" in genre studies.

possible effects of blurbs on readers.

### 5.2.1 Blurb on the Back Cover of Rexroth and Chung (1979)

The paperback blurb on the back cover of Rexroth and Chung (1979) (see Figure 42) introduces the book, the poet Li Qingzhao and then the two translators. The emphatic first sentence goes like this: "[this version] brings together for the first time in English translation all the surviving verse of China's greatest woman poet." This attracts the reader's attention by justifying the book, establishing the niche of retranslation and declaring this version is peerless. The emphasis on its completeness could indicate its importance and canonized position in some cases, as it was highlighted by Tahir Gürçağlar (2008, p. 155) that "[f]ullness of translations was an important criterion for the canonical status of works, especially in the 1940s ....". Following accrediting the poet Li Qingzhao, the second paragraph further promotes translators' credibility and establishes credentials by selling Rexroth as the "long distinguished translator for his superb translations of Chinese and Japanese poetry." The combination of the completeness of the collection, the fame of the Chinese poet, and the reputation and credibility of the translators is organized into an exemplary, eye-catching blurb.

Figure 42 Rexroth and Chung's (1979) blurb

# Li Ch'ing-chao Complete Poems

Translated and edited by Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung

The Complete Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao (1084–c. 1151) brings together for the first time in English translation all the surviving verse of China's greatest woman poet. Written during the final years of the Sung Dynasty, with its political intrigues and collapse in the face of Tatar invasions, her poems reveal an imaginative freshness, sensuous imagery, and satirical spirit often at odds with the decadent Confucian code of the day. Her life was colorful and the very picture of renaissance versatility, while her early marriage to Chao Mingch'en has been celebrated as an ideal one for a thousand years. Besides being a poet, Li Ch'ing-chao was a scholar of history and the classics, a literary critic and an art collector specializing in bronze and stone inscriptions, not to mention painter, calligrapher, and political commentator. She is considered the finest writer of tz'u poetry, lyric verse set to tunes of the Sung Dynasty, while her few extant poems in the more regular *shih* form show a mastery widely admired by her contemporaries.

Kenneth Rexroth has long been distinguished for his superb translations of Chinese and Japanese poetry, both classic and modern. Ling Chung has taught at the University of Wisconsin and the State University of New York at Albany; a leading Chinese poet and film producer, she now lives in Hong Kong.

> Cover painting of Li Ch'ing-chao, 11th century, with calligraphy by Chu Kuang-fu; design by Susan Shapiro

### 5.2.2 Blurbs on Other Collections

Apart from Rexroth and Chung (1979), the employment of blurbs on the back cover was also quite common among Li Qingzhao's other English collections. For instance, Cryer's blurb (1984) appraises the book and the translator by acknowledging his creativity in syntax and recreation of the beauty and image of the Chinese source texts in the translated collection (see Figure 43) through the endorsement of the American

sinologist Dr. J. P. Seaton. It also pinpoints its target readership. However, the language used in this blurb is not as powerful as Rexroth and Chung's (1979) rendition in terms of justifying the book and establishing credentials. To be specific, "a fluency in the classical Chinese language with a real talent for the English language" does not necessarily mean Cryer is a long-standing and experienced translator with credibility. It does not establish the context, indicate the importance of the book or establish a niche, three sub-moves of justifying the book, according to Kathpalia (1992; 2022). Most importantly, compared with Rexroth and Chung's (1979) version, the blurb downplays the credit and literary prowess of the poet Li Qingzhao by "remarkable both for her range and depth and for the delicate precision of her word choice", which could hardly convince readers to admire her as "the greatest women poet" in China.

Li Ch'ing-chao, China's greatest woman poet, is remarkable both for her range and depth and for the delicate precision of her word choice. Jim Cryer's translations offer clear evidence of her greatness.

Cryer is one of the very few translators of Chinese poetry in the West who combines a fluency in the classical Chinese language with a real talent for the English language. His creative use of varied line lengths allows him to capture consistently the imagistic power of the Chinese to an extent seldom, if ever, achieved.

These translations will be widely discussed among the growing number of American scholars and poets who are attempting the recreation of the Chinese aesthetic monuments in English. They are, more importantly, poems which can be enjoyed by every lover of poetry in English. I enjoyed these translations and look forward to more in the near future from this poet-translator.

### Dr. J.P. Seaton, Professor of Chinese, UNC Chapel Hill Figure 43 Cryer's (1984) blurb

Karen An-hwei Lee renders the work of the Song dynasty poet and writer Li Qingzhao with a startling clarity. The words of China's most famous female poet are read with a remarkable beauty and sharpness. This is the adept hand of a translator who both admires the work of her subject and is herself possessed of a singular awareness of the nuances of both languages. The work of Li Qingzhao sings anew in Lee's translation.

—Afaa M. Weaver 尉雅風, author of Spirit Boxing

Li Qingzhao is probably the most important woman poet in Chinese literary history. Her stature is indisputable, and she deserves ample praise and recognition and to be in the same high tier as that of the more famous male poets of the Tang and Song dynasties, which includes the likes of Li Bai, Wang Wei and Du Fu. This book of new translations by Karen An-hwei Lee has the clarity, quality, and thoroughness that will help glorify Li Qingzhao's name. The volume is successful in capturing the beauty, grace, and wit of the original.

- Marilyn Chin, author of Hard Love Province

Figure 44 Lee's (2018) blurb

In the blurb of Lee (2018), two authors acknowledge the position exceptional of Li Qingzhao in Chinese literature and praise Lee for the clarity, beauty, excellence, and thoroughness of her translation (see Figure 44). If there were endorsements from diverse backgrounds on the back cover blurbs, that could have enhanced the promotion and its appeal to readers. The fact that this was the first attempt at translating both poetry and prose of Li Qingzhao into English is not emphasized here in the blurb, failing to justify the book.

With the lengthiest blurb of all, Djao (2010)provides an extensive introduction to Li Qingzhao's life and literary prowess, earning acclaim from university scholars in China (Hong Kong), America and Canada. They credited Diao with producing an accessible translation and an enjoyable reading experience (see Figure 45). However, the use of a small font size alongside uniform typography, devoid of any variations like bold type, presents challenges for readers in pinpointing key elements within the text. According to Kathpalia (1992; 2022), blurbs are usually short, and some publishers in Kathpalia (2022, p.47) even claim that the length should not exceed 120 words, though without mentioning specific

### Figure 45 Djao's (2010) blurb

K. Qingzhao (- 1084 - 1156 CE) of the Song dynasty is indiputably the most brilliant woman writer in Chinese history. This biography offers an insightful interpretation of her character and a new translation of some of her writings. Wei Djao's English render and a new translation of some of her writings. Wei Djao's English render and a new translation of some of her writing. Wei Djao's English render and a new translation of some of her writing. Wei Djao's English render and a minently rendeable narrarive, the events of her fife are set against the backdrop of political and socio-cultural developments in the Song Dynasty.
Li Qingzhao in her extant poems expresses many different moods and feelings about personal relationships that still resonate poignantly with the readers today. In her more private that still resonate poignantly with the readers today. In her more that her of attack and occupation of northern China by involates. Her versatility is also shown in a trilogy about a gambling game known as *dama* (Whipping Horse).
In one of her poems, Li Qingzhao sings praise of the small but exquisite plum blosom that buds forth in deep winter, symbolizing the human qualities of integrity and culturance. It is a blossom like no other. It very aptly describes her own life.
"So much research into Chinese history, yet the book makes such pleasant reading native Chinese speaker/reader, Have had great joy in savouring the beautiful verses in Chinese and then admiring the flowing translation in English."
"Don Choi Po-king, Chinese University of Hong Kong.
"Me author provides a prodigious amount of information about Li Qingzhao, and the foico-political background of Song China. Undoubtedly, A Blossom Like NO Other, written in an easy and fluent style, sets a new standard for scholarly works in this gener."
- Allen Wittenborn, San Diego State University.
"With profound imagination and learning in litterature, history, and philosophy of both China and t

#### Figure 46 Coren's (2021) blurb



Li Qingzhao (1084 - c1150) is China's most celebrated woman poet. She wrote both lyric and political verse. She also wrote literary criticism, a piece on gamesmanship, and an account of the antiquarian studies she shared with her husband and of their flight with the Imperial court from the Tartar invasion in 1127.

My feelings about poetry are like the magpie in the night: they circle three times and never settle in one place.

genres. Consequently, it runs the risk of reader disengagement owing to the extensive information in small font and condensed layout.

Coren's (2021) blurb (see Figure 46) introduces the poet Li Qingzhao with two quotations translated into English and a black-and-white picture, showing the scene of her *Ci Tianzichounver-banana trees* (添字丑奴儿·窗前谁种芭蕉树). There is no advertisement or endorsement either for the translator or her translation, failing to appraise the book and the translator and justify the book. It results in a scenario where the translation is overshadowed, with the poet taking the sole forefront.

Ho's (1968) blurb (see Figure 47) was penned by the book distributor, the

Chinese-American writer Pearl S. Buck and the American professor Charles A. Baatz, endorsing the translator. They complimented Ho's attempt to uphold authenticity and appreciated her presentation of the English translation along with the Chinese original text, including Wade-Giles Romanization. However, the lengthy blurb offers very

#### Figure 47 Ho's (1968) blurb

"Mrs. Ho has been true to the original in this scholarly work. Her explanation and translations of an exceedingly difficult form of poetry have the flavor of authenticity."

- Miss Pearl S. Buck

"Rarely does one find a scholar such as Lucy Chao Ho who is intellectually honest enough to present a matchless translation side by side with the classical original. A beautiful and indispensable introduction to Li Ch'ing-Chao, this work is also a masterpiece of bookcraftsmanship."

> Professor Charles A. Baatz Seton Hall University

Lucy Chao Ho received her B. A. in Western Languages and Literature from Fu Jen University, Peking and her M. A. in Asian Studies from Seton Hall University, South Orange, N. J., and has been a Lecturer in Chinese Language and Literature at China Institute in America, New York City, and in the Department of Asian Studies at Seton Hall University. In this publication, for the first time a complete and faithful translation of the poetry of a leading Chinese woman poet is given side by side with the original Chinese text with romanization. A clear exposition of that special form of Chinese poetry called tz'u is also offered in the work. Western scholars and students will find it valuable and most essential to the study of Chinese literature.

Yu Fang Book Company, Distributor 28 Pell Street New York N. Y. 10013

#### readers.

## LI CH'ING-CHAO

### by

#### HU PIN-CH'ING

This is not only a critical-analytical survey of the poetry of Li Ch'ing-chao, China's great poet of the Sung dynasty, but also an introduction to the poetry for singing called tz'u in which she excelled. The author, equally at home in Chinese and English—and a poet herself—has translated many of Li Ch'ing-chao's poems in a way that combines elegance with accuracy. Her comments on the poems give insight into the imagery, symbols, allusions, and other features of Chinese poetry in general.

All available historical and autobiographical materials and the researches of other scholars have been drawn upon in this book. But literature is never subordinated to social history. Li Ch'ing-chao emerges through this appreciation of her writings as a vibrant human being, a woman who created enduring works and achieved perfection in a new and important genre. limited insights into the poet Qingzhao, merely Li characterizing her as "a Chinese leading woman poet " . This translatorcentric approach gives credibility to the translator at the expense of Li Oingzhao herself. Like Cryer (1984), such a blurb suggests potential а imbalance in the representation of credit and recognition between the translator and the author. As a result, it might affect Li Qingzhao's reception by potentially overshadowing or diminishing her role in the eyes of Anglophone

### ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Hu Pin-ch'ing is Professor of French Literature and Dean of the French Department, College of Chinese Culture, Taiwan. She received her first instruction in poetry and classics from her grandmother, and began the study of English at an American missionary school in Nanchang. Graduating from the University of Chekiang, she continued her studies at the University of Paris and specialized in the Symbolist poets. While she was in Paris she edited two anthologies of Chinese poetry, one classical and one modern, and published a volume of her own poems in French.

#### Figure 48 Hu's (1966) blurb

A blurb on the dust jacket and flap can be found in Hu (1966). The blurb (see Figure 48) fails to justify the book by establishing the niche that it is the first English collection of Li Qingzhao's works published in the Anglophone world, though it

introduces the poet. It gives credit to the author's proficiency in both languages, her poetic prowess, the harmonious combination of grace and accuracy in her translation and her insightful commentary.

Certain works, like Mayhew and McNaughton (1977), Wang (1989), and Egan (2019), lack blurbs. However, additional information, such as a foreword by renowned anthologist Victor Mair in Wang (1989), fulfils a similar function to a blurb, though positioned in a different part of the book and not immediately visible to prospective readers. The absence of blurbs may have a dual impact. On one hand, it deprives collections of a promotional avenue, and on the other hand, it avoids imposing preconceived evaluations on readers' minds, enabling them to form independent judgments about collections. The absence of a blurb on the back of Egan (2019) and its plain and simple cover design could stem from the publisher's specialization in academic literature.<sup>71</sup> The publisher's catalogue includes other works of notable Chinese male poets translated into English like Wang Wei, Du Fu, Meng Haoran and Li He. Li Qingzhao's inclusion in the catalogue suggests her esteemed and established position within the Anglophone literary sphere. The uniformly simplistic cover design across publications in the catalogue confirms Pellatt's (2018, p.170) claim that, "[u]nembellished covers have an equally strong impact: they may be regarded as more dignified and authoritative...". The case is the same in Turkey where Tahir Gürçağlar (2002, p. 48-49) notes that the minimalistic and unembellished cover layout of the Translation Bureau became the trademark of translated canonical literature.

Table 11 Approaches to blurbs in collections			
Collections with blurbs Hu (1966), Ho (1968), Rexroth and Chung (1979), Cryer (1984), D			
	(2010), Lee (2018) and Coren (2021)		
Collections without blurbs	Mayhew and McNaughton (1977), Wang (1989) and Egan (2019)		

From the above, it can be seen that the blurbs exhibit varying degrees of effectiveness in acknowledging and promoting the esteemed position of the poet Li Qingzhao and her literary prowess. Rexroth and Chung's (1979) rendition might be the best representative of blurbs being used to advertise the poet, translators and collections. For other collections, some are too lengthy, such as Ho (1968) and Djao (2010); some blurbs fall short in justifying and accrediting translations with their unique contributions, as seen in Hu (1966) and Lee (2018); some neglect to promote and praise the translator or translations, as observed in Coren (2021); and some do not sufficiently credit the poet, as exemplified by Ho (1968) and Cryer (1984). Those versions lacking blurbs, such as Wang (1989) and Mayhew and McNaughton (1977), may substitute them with alternative paratextual elements. The omission may imply a disregard for the allure of blurbs or a deliberate decision to encourage readers to contemplate the value of retranslations independently. Alternatively, the absence of blurbs might align with a minimalist design that signifies the canonized status of the volume, as in Egan's (2019) case. The common presence of blurbs on dust jackets, flaps, and covers among retranslations could have established a standard that subsequent retranslations adhere

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> About US (no date). Available at: https://www.degruyter.com/publishing/about-us (Accessed: 5<sup>th</sup> March 2024)

to. This suggests a level of influence from previous (re)translations on the latter ones. Alternatively, it could be part of a wider shift within the publishing industry marketing trends (see Table 11). The shift underscores the crucial role that blurbs play in both marketing and shaping readers' perceptions of collections, for as Pellatt observes, "the blurb on a cover, ...can be one of the most arresting of the small verbal paratextual statements" (2018, p. 175). In addition to blurbs, other peritextual elements, such as contents pages and organization, might also impact the popularity and reception of her collections, which are explored in the following section.

### **5.3 Contents Pages and Organisation**

### **5.3.1 Contents Pages**

Rexroth and Chung (1979) classified Li Qingzhao's poems into seven themes, namely: youth, loneliness, exile, the poet's death, politics, mysticism and old age. Under each theme, corresponding poems are listed without numbering them. Poems under some themes, such as "Exile" "His death (the death of her husband)" "Mysticism" and "Old Age", are a mixture of Li Qingzhao's *Shi* and *Ci* (see Chapter One the difference between *Shi* and *Ci*). It is hard to distinguish their genres and the source text of those poems at first glance, as most *Ci* are titled with a creative name and the free translation of its *Cipai* as "to the tune ... ".<sup>72</sup> A similar arrangement was taken by Mayhew and McNaughton (1977). There are ten chapters, thematically titled with major events in each part of Li Qingzhao's life; the translated poems themselves are not listed under each chapter in the table of contents. Djao (2010) provided more detailed chapter synopses, featuring eight chapters and numerous sub-sections. The organization in all these three versions is based on Li Qingzhao's biographical experience. A simple and short contents page without list of works translated can also be seen in Hu (1966).

The thematic categorization does have some merits for the general public. It is better than collections without a content page, such as Cryer (1984) and Wang (1989), because it works as a guide for general readers to appreciate the beauty of her poems, suggesting a context in which to read them and serving a designative function in part. As Genette (1997. p. 316) notes, the table of contents can announce and remind readers of where to begin and where to end or be handy for consultation. Some general readers might have no idea where to start and if they do not want to read all the poems, then Rexroth's "guide" might help. At least readers can easily pick any poem or any theme that interests them and turn to the specific page just by glancing at the poem titles, or thematic titles in the table of contents. In addition, the combination of Rexroth's Chinese calligraphy and English internal thematic titles in each part might also charm some readers with its exotic features or give them a break during their reading.

It has to be pointed out that Rexroth's thematic division was denounced by some critics, such as Palandri (1981), for its inappropriateness. As Li Qingzhao's poems are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> To give an example, the *Ci Rumengling* in Rexroth and Chung (1979) is rendered as "Joy of Wine, to the tune "A Dream Song", where "Joy of Wine" is a creation by the translators and "to the tune A Dream Song" is a free translation of the source title. Meanwhile, the *Shi "Ganhuai"* is translated as "Sentiment" to show its different genre. Distinguishing between these mixed genres in the list can be challenging and time- consuming.

not clearly ascribed to an exact date, a simple list of her poems might be more appropriate and accurate. Other translators do list her works in the table of contents, such as Ho (1968), Coren (2021),<sup>73</sup> Lee (2018)<sup>74</sup> and Egan (2019). This study contends that the content page of Rexroth and Chung (1979), which features English poems categorized by themes, lacks the same academic relevance found in the content page of Egan (2019) and the poem list provided by Ho (1968).<sup>75</sup> These two contents pages are more efficiently organized, as there is a list of both the titles of Chinese source poems and English versions. The most academically rigorous might be Egan's (2019)<sup>76</sup> categorization of translated works into genres, in the order of classical poetry (*Shi* and *Fu*, *Wen* and *Ci*) with a list of corresponding works below. Egan (2019, p. xxxv) explains that this arrangement of order "is intended to facilitate taking seriously her writing in forms other than *Song* lyric." As Palandri (1981) points out, the content arrangement facilitates easy reading, indexing, and quick access to Chinese source poems.

### 5.3.2 Organisation and Presentation

As mentioned above, Rexroth and Chung's (1979) text was divided into seven themes. There is a separate page with Rexroth's Chinese calligraphy and its English equivalence as a chapter head for each theme. The hand-written Chinese calligraphy by Rexroth showcases the translator's personal artistic temperament beyond translation and highlights his visibility, thereby shortening the distance between translators and readers and making him approachable. Each theme is followed by several English translations on following pages. There is no introduction, acknowledgment, foreword, preface, dedication, epigraph or afterword, only a biography of Li Qingzhao by Ling Chung with notes. Compared with other collections, this is the most concise of all. Egan's (2019) version is similarly concise, with shorter end-notes, but it replaces Chung's biography with an introduction covering Li Qingzhao's life experiences and acceptance.

Other versions come with more paratexual elements and have their own virtues in terms of presentation. For example, the historical timelines of ancient China presented by Hu (1966) and Djao (2010) can enrich readers' comprehension of Chinese history and contextualise Li Qingzhao's position within it. Specifically, Djao's (2010) maps of the *Song* Dynasty offer additional support. Djao's own sketch of Li Qingzhao also allows readers to appreciate her artistic talent. The English translations are listed page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> In Coren (2021), all titles of Li Qingzhao's works are rendered through free translation. For example, *Ci Rumengling* is translated "To the tune 'As in a dream", whereas *Shi* omit "to the tune" to denote a slight distinction, such as "*Ganhuai*" being translated as "Stirred by Feeling."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> In Lee (2018), titles are a blend of transliteration and free translation, such as *Rumengling*, No1: As if a reverie. This uniform titling approach makes it difficult to distinguish Ci from *Shi* in the table of contents.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> In Ho (1968), all *Ci* are clearly listed in the contents with three components: the Chinese transliteration in Wade-Giles Romanization, the complex Chinese characters in brackets and the English free translation, which facilitate the identification of source texts. For example, "*Ju Meng Ling (如夢令) Like A Dream*". However, *Shi* are not listed there.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> In Egan (2019), all translated pieces are presented with both complex Chinese characters and English translation on the same line. Different literary genres are categorized into sub-sections for clear distinction. Additionally, all *Cipai* are translated as "to the tune..." with the first Chinese line included in brackets to distinguish between *Ci* that share the same *Cipai*, which is unprecedented.

by page with titles both in Chinese Mandarin and English in Lee (2018); this makes it comparatively easier for readers to identify the Chinese source text. Poems in Cryer (1984) and Coren (2021) are separated by illustrations, graphics, ink paintings, sketches and other art forms, adding more visual variety to the reading experience. A similar measure was taken by Mayhew and McNaughton (1977) with illustrations under each chapter head. Particularly for non-academic readers, the most pleasant reading experience may be Cryer's (1984) text in which his English retranslations are accompanied by an illustration side by side to aid the reader in feeling the scene and visualizing images in the poem. Thoughtful readers have also to consider if these illustrations are true to the source text, and how these illustrations may affect their comprehension. After all, as Genette argues (1997, p. 410), "[...] the paratext sometimes tends to go beyond its function and to turn itself into an impediment, from then on playing its own game to the detriment of its text's game." Therefore, a concise presentation may also be a good choice, as it gives readers more room to think and reduces the publishing and designing costs.

For academic readers, the more reader-friendly material presentation might be Ho (1968), Wang (1989) and Egan (2019). Ho (1968) and Egan (2019) not only present a list of poems in Chinese and English on the contents page, but also provide the Chinese source text side by side with its translation. Though there is no list of poems on the content page, Wang (1989) offers his own calligraphy of the Chinese source text, highlighting his originality and cultivating a sense of intimacy between him and his readers. The Wade-Giles romanization along with Chinese characters and English translations in Ho (1968) enables readers to compare the differences between the source and target text both in sound and meaning.

To conclude, the paratextual elements in the table of contents and presentation discussed above indicate that various versions exhibit diverse paratextual elements related to organization. Some lack a table of contents for clarity, while others stand out by providing more academically rigorous material. Among all the collections, Rexroth and Chung (1979) is the most concise in terms of presentation featuring thematic chapters and a well-structured order of poems listed in the table of contents. This organization provides a clear demonstration for readers, though it is less academically rigorous. The importance of displaying the order of material is highlighted by Genette's claim (1997, p. 218) that "[i]t is sometimes useful to inform the reader, in the preface and as if to clarify the table of contents, about the order of the material in the book." This study contends that diverse organizational approaches may impact how collections are received by readers. Collections with a well-structured organization are more likely to enhance the reading experience, providing readers with greater accessibility and convenience, and thereby earning a better reception.

### 5.4 Notes

In terms of peritexts, one of the main features distinguishing Rexroth and Chung's (1979) text from its predecessors, is the large number of end notes attached to the collection. These end notes belong to authorial notes, according to Genette (1997) and there is some useful, necessary background information in these 22 pages.

Some versions take a different approach to notes from that of Rexroth and Chung (1979). Earlier collections, like Hu (1966) and Ho (1968), use footnotes. In Hu's (1966) version the translation of Li Qingzhao's poems is mixed with analysis. Background information and cultural connotations are provided after each translation, making end notes unnecessary. Only a few footnotes are given to explain that certain tune titles are untranslated due to their unclear meaning to the translator, such as the tune title "*Shengzhazi*" (Hu, 1966, p.35). A similar approach was also taken by Djao (2010) whose mixture of translation and analysis uses footnotes rather than end notes. Ho (1968) provides footnotes and an analysis of Li Qingzhao's *Ci*, while Wang (1989) provides some footnotes and a postscript that functions almost as end notes. In Egan's version (2019), both footnotes and end notes are provided. While footnotes serve an interpretative function for poems, end notes are much fewer, mainly justifying his choice of source texts.

In the notes of Rexroth and Chung (1979), certain images are eroticized and reduced to a romantic interpretation, something that has been critiqued by critics like Palandri (1981). The text also contains potential misunderstandings and confusion concerning Chinese allusions to proper names, coupled with instances of overannotation of irrelevant allusions. This section will look at how Rexroth and Chung (1979) interpreted the source culture and misled readers through notes, and similar related misunderstandings in other collections, like Cryer (1984), Lee (2018) and Coren (2021), etc.

### 5.4.1 Eroticisation

Examples of eroticism in Rexroth and Chung's (1979) notes are summarized in Table 12 alongside alternative interpretations by translators and Chinese experts.

Interpreters\Images	秋 千	犀(rhino horn)	三山 (three	兰舟 (orchid
	(swing)		mountains)	boat)
Translators Rexroth and Chung (1979)	have erotic significance	have a strong aphrodisiac effect	erotically mystical	floating pleasure houses/Female sexual organ
Chinese experts (Xu, 2018; Chen, 2021; Zhuge, 2019; Wang, 2020)	sport equipment	an ornament made of rhino horn put on bed curtains	the places where immortals dwell	boat

Table 12 Eroticised images

As the table shows, Rexroth and Chung (1979, p.100) interpreted the Chinese image "swing (秋千)" in a very particular way: "swings in Chinese love poetry have erotical significance and apparently once had a family ritual connection with the Day of Cold Food". However, a swing might simply be a piece of equipment used in traditional folk sports and entertainment. According to Zhao (2011) and Zhao and Zhou (2007), swings originated in the *Spring and Autumn Period* (770 BCE – 476 BCE), centuries before the *Han* Dynasty (202 BCE-220 CE). They were introduced to ladies at court in the *Han* Dynasty and become very popular in the *Tang* Dynasty. "Swing" has been incorporated in poems ever since the *Tang* Dynasty, appearing in around 320

poems till the end of the *Song* Dynasty, according to the corpus of Chinese poems.<sup>77</sup> I have yet to find evidence to support the erotic connotations in any of these Tang poems, nor those *Song Ci* from Li Qingzhao's peers, such as Liu Yong, Qin Guan, Su Shi and Yan Jidao, etc.<sup>78</sup> According to Zhao (2011) and Zhao and Zhou (2007), the image "swing" in *Tang* and *Song* poems is often linked with women and mainly contains three kinds of connotations, from the outdoor celebration for the Cold Food Day and Qingming Festival in ancient China in early periods, to the joy and love for freedom, youth and life, and to the lament over the late spring and the fleeting nature of youth and life in later periods. In the course of this research, no evidence has been found to support this erotic interpretation from Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao, such as Xu (2018), Wang (2020), Chen (2021) and Zhuge (2019), etc.

Similarly, Rexroth and Chung (1979, p.101) claim that rhino horn ( $\mathbb{F}$ ) is said to have a strong aphrodisiac effect, when in fact, it is believed to ward off the cold and is therefore more likely to be used as an ornament that is commonly added to bed curtains. This interpretation has been adopted by many other Chinese poets before *Song* Dynasty and is annotated as such by many Chinese scholars such as Xu (2018, p.62) and Wang (2020, p.106). It is even more bizarre to think that "three mountains ( $\Xi$ III)" are also erotically mystical (Rexroth and Chung, 1979, p.116). They are more often used to refer to the places where immortals dwell, according to Taoism. This interpretation has a long tradition recorded in *Shiji (Records of the Historian)* (Xu, 2018, p.108).

Rexroth and Chung's interpretation of the Ci "To the Tune Yijianmei" (1979, p.101) is particularly dubious. The suggestion that 'orchid boats (兰舟)' refer to "floating" pleasure houses" and metaphorically noted "the female sexual organ" is not substantiated by evidence. In Chinese culture, 'orchid' is often used in the laudatory names of boats, something that is a common image in many other poems before the Song Dynasty (Xu, 2018, p.20). In Chinese culture, orchids traditionally symbolize purity, elegance and nobility (Palandri, 1981, p.271), a tradition that is evident for example in Li Sao (离骚) by Qu Yuan (屈原). More thoroughly, Van Gulik (2004) identified the erotic elements in ancient Chinese literature from the Han to Qing Dynasty and listed Chinese terminology for sex; notably absent from this list are the aforementioned images: "swing" "orchid boats" and "three mountains". Rexroth and Chung's note (1979, p. 98) also erroneously suggests that "one way to spend the Double Ninth Day was outdoor love-making". However, this does not align with the actual customs of Double Ninth Day in Chinese culture. Furthermore, as stressed by Lung (2003, p. 255), "[i]n the conservative Chinese culture, sex is a taboo and crude topic which is not expected to crop up in any circumstances." Erotic written texts were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> 中华诗词网 (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/ (Accessed: 28<sup>th</sup> July 2024). (In Chinese) The online corpus includes around 80 million Chinese words and over 1.4 million poetic pieces of 45 000 writers from Pre-Qin Dynasty to Pre-modern China.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> 包 含 " 秋 千 " 的 诗 词 (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E7%A7%8B%E5%8D%83.html (Accessed: 28<sup>th</sup> July 2024). (In Chinese). Due to the limited space and scope of this research, not every entry of poems containing this word is examined thoroughly. Further research could quantify its interpretation by building a separate corpus with frequency analysis in *WordSmith Tools 8.0*.

banned in ancient China and were not readily accessible to the general public until they faced less censorship in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Given that sex was a taboo in Li Qingzhao's times, the chance that outdoor love-making was a custom to celebrate the Double Ninth Day is quite slim, and it would be difficult to imagine a woman in the position of Li Qingzhao infusing her writing with sexual elements.

The erotic annotation of "秋千" and "兰舟" by Rexroth and Chung (1979) might be related to the socio-cultural context in which their corresponding English equivalents "swing" and "orchid boat" ("orchid" in particular) were produced. According to Moscoso (2023), the sexual connotations of swings have been found in Isaic religions, ancient Roman and Egypt. Swing's amatory usage has been featured in European erotic museums and today's adult toy market. Its carnal symbolism has become more prevalent ever since the oil painting "The Swing" by Fragonard in the 18<sup>th</sup> century. Subsequent poets, musicians, artists, film and TV producers have alluded to this painting with erotic implication. For instance, the poem "Portrait of a Lady" by William Carlos Williams is believed to allude to the painting (*Portrait of a Lady*, 2020).

The etymology of "orchid" dates back to 1845 and is connected to the male reproductive organ "orkhis" in Greek, meaning testicle (Online Etymology Dictionary, no date). According to *Orchid: A Cultural History* by Endersby (2018), European culture has associated orchids with sex, seduction and illicit romance since the time of the ancient Greeks. Evidence can be found in various novels, plays, poems and films, though with nuanced symbolic representation (Endersby, 2018, p.6). He also argues that science, the British Empire, and European exploration have all contributed to the ongoing association between orchids and sexuality. In this context, Rexroth's erotic interpretation could reflect European social and cultural influences. Therefore, even the subtle notes added during retranslations reveal the specific context and perspectives of the translators.

There are other examples where the European cultural context has influenced translations by emphasizing erotic imagery. Some of the translations by Rexroth and Chung (1979) also highlight this erotic element. For example, in the *Ci* "To the Tune *Xingxiangzi* (行香子)", the final two lines '甚霎儿晴,霎儿雨,霎儿风' are translated as 'Now suddenly in the midst of their love-making/The wind blows first clear and then rain' (Rexroth and Chung, 1979, p. 74). See Table 13 for different versions. In this case, Rexroth's rendition might be produced under the influence of European mythology where rain and sunshine are sometimes interpreted in an erotic manner.<sup>79</sup> In Chinese cultural context, the word "clouds and rain (云雨)" used together could refer to sex. However, used separately, the words "sunshine" "rain" and "wind" are not listed in sexual terminology by Van Gulik (2004). As per the information gathered in this study, Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao, such as Xu (2018), Wang (2020), Chen (2021) and Zhuge (2019), provide no such interpretations that align with the erotic viewpoints presented in these annotations. On the balance of evidence, this line is more likely to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> For instance, in Greek mythology, Zeus appeared in the form of golden rain in front of Danae and mated with her and after that she had the demigod Perseus. In Norse mythology, the goddess Freyr was believed to represent sunshine and fertility. Thor, as the god of thunder, storms and lightning, is also seen as a fertility god capable of bringing rain and good harvests.

talk about the unpredictability and volatility of weather, mood or maybe life, as suggested by Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao (Chen, 2011, p.42-43; Zhuge, 2019, p.99). Wang's (1989) rendition of the poem includes similar sexual overtones to the Rexroth and Chung's translation. Whether this interpretation is Wang's own, or influenced by Rexroth is unclear. However, the lack of overt sexual references in the source *Ci* means that any explicit interpretation risks over-translation, thus compromising the subtlety of the Chinese source text.

Collections	Different Renditions
Rexroth and Chung (1979)	Now suddenly in the midst of their love-making/The wind
	blows first clear and then rain.
Hu (1966)	Why is the night now fine, now rainy, now windy, Is it the sad
	hour of farewell?
Но (1968)	While the night is one moment fair/The next moment
	rainy/And another moment threatened by storm.
Mayhew and McNaughton (1979)	and brightness passes with the wind into black rain.
Cryer (1984)	for this moment in time/ this time of rain/this time of wind.
Wang (1989)	But whence these sudden changes/Of sun and rain and wind/In
	the midst of their love-making?
Djao (2010)	Why otherwise suddenly sunshine, suddenly rain, suddenly
	wind?
Lee (2018)	(Perhaps this is why, with our partings, our emotions clear for
	only an instant,) followed by sudden rain, sudden wind.
Egan (2019)	Truly, theirs is a moment of clear sky, a moment of rain, a
	moment of wind.
Coren (2021)	Their only certainty-an instant-fair weather, an instant-rain, an
	instant-breeze.

Table 13 English renditions of "甚霎儿晴,霎儿雨,霎儿风"

The proclivity to interpret Li Qingzhao's poetry through the lens of eroticism extends beyond the end notes of Rexroth and Chung (1979). In Mayhew and McNaughton's (1977) notes, "spring winds" as an equivalence of the Chinese source "风情" are interpreted as "the stirring of those desires appropriate to the season, i.e., erotic (p.107)". The word "风情" has been incorporated in poems ever since the *Tang* Dynasty, appearing in around 190 poems till the end of the *Song* Dynasty, according to the corpus of Chinese poems. The word has been more often referred to as "the charm" or "the view" in *Tang* poems and in many *Song Ci* from Li Qingzhao's peers, such as Liu Yong, Qin Guan, Su Shi and Lu You, etc.<sup>80</sup> The word "spring winds" contains far richer connotations in classical Chinese poems than the above erotic interpretation. For example, the spring breeze, the season, a good mood, good looks, king's favour,

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> 包含"风情"的诗词 (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E9%A3%8E%E6%83%85.html (Accessed: 28<sup>th</sup> July 2024). (In Chinese). Due to the limited space and scope of this research, not every entry of poems containing this word is examined thoroughly. Further research could quantify its interpretation by building a separate corpus with frequency analysis in *WordSmith Tools 8.0*.

departure, and homesickness, etc., according to Hong (2023). Moreover, "spring wind" has been interchangeably used with "eastern wind(东风)" to refer to the season in Chinese literature since the Han Dynasty, as can be seen in classical Chinese poems by Li Bai, Li Shangyin,<sup>81</sup> Li Yu and others. Some of these are translated to "eastern wind" by translators like Fuller (2017, p.326 and p.378). On the balance of evidence, the translation of "风情" into "spring winds" with its erotic note, not only narrows down the connotation of the Chinese source "风情", but also causes confusion. Mayhew and McNaughton (1977, p.114) also assert that in Chinese poetry "to climb the tower" (their interpretation of "画楼") is "to go upstairs to make love". However, since its first use in the Tang Dynasty, "画楼" has been incorporated in some 300 poems right up to the Song Dynasty. In all of these poems, it referred to "a magnificently and elaborately decorated building", according to the corpus of Chinese poems.<sup>82</sup> Meanwhile, "to climb the tower" has a rich tradition of connotations in poems ever since The Book of Songs. According to Xu (1997), these connotations include homesickness and longing, sorrow over unfulfilled ambitions or lost land or the fall of the country, and anxiety and concerns for one's country and state. An erotic interpretation of "画楼" and "风情" is not substantiated by any of the annotations by the aforementioned Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao, and neither "风情" nor "画楼" is in the Chinese sexual terminology list by Van Gulik (2004).

In Cryer (1984), more pronounced instances of these issues are evident. The image "orchid boat" is referred to as "the vagina"(p.86); "lotus pod shoes" are suggested to be "an erotic fetish" (p. 86); "Pi Han powder" is described as "evidently an erotic stimulant used by women topically to warm and shrink internal tissues" (p86); "Shui Nan scent" is characterized as "an aphrodisiac incense" (p.87), and "spring" is explained as "often suggestive of erotic thoughts to the Chinese" (p. 87). These interpretations, with some appearing to veer excessively into erotic territory, generally do not align with those provided in the Chinese Dictionary  $\mathcal{R}$ , or annotations by Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao (see the discussion on Rexroth and Chung's notes). They are not listed in the Chinese terminology of sex by Van Gulik (2004), either. Additionally, a straightforward assertion was made in Cryer's notes (1984, p.88) that *Song Ci* in general are often erotic, implying that Li Qingzhao's *Ci* are also likely to be erotic.

In the 21st century, later translators, like Lee (2018), contribute valuable cultural insights in their notes to enhance readers' understanding of Li Qingzhao's essays and poems. However, it is worth noting that one of Lee's notes also takes a sexual interpretation of the legend of The Cowboy and the Weaving Maid in the context of the *Ci* "To the Tune *Xingxiangzi* (行香子)". It is claimed, "[a]fter the weaver maiden and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> In Li Shangyin's "*Wuting*(无题)", one line goes as "东风无力百花残". Hightower and Yeh (1998, p.78) believed that the imagery "eastern wind(东风)" refers to spring wind. More examples of interchangeable usage of "spring wind" and "eastern wind" by other poets can be found in Zhang (2024, p. 214) and Hong (2023, p.52).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> 包 含 " 画 楼 " 的 诗 词 (no date). (In Chinese). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E7%94%BB%E6%A5%BC.html(Accessed: 28<sup>th</sup> July 2024). Due to the limited space and scope of this research, not every entry of poems containing this word is examined thoroughly.

cattle hand fall deeply love, they abandon their duties and offend the immortals with their constant love-making"[sic] (Lee, 2018). This might be influenced by Rexroth and Chung (1979) as it is listed as her reference.

Another instance of oversimplification and romanticisation of the poet's work is seen in the interpretation of poems related to homesickness or relationships. Certain images are interpreted to represent Li Qingzhao's husband Zhao Mingcheng in the notes provided by Rexroth and Chung (1979). For instance, "Spring (东君)" in "To The Tune *Xiaochongshan* (小重山)" was thought to be a metaphorical reference to her husband (Rexroth and Chung, 1979, p.97) and translated into "my lord". This is also the case in the translation of "东君" in another *Ci* "To The Tune *Yuanwangsun* (怨王孙)". "东君" denoted "spring" in many Chinese poems, long before the *Song* Dynasty, as attested to by many Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao (Xu, 2018, p.132; Chen, 2011, p.46; Wu, 2009, p.36; Wang, 2020, p.35).

Similarly, in Mayhew and McNaughton's notes (1977, p. 112), "lotus (莲)" is also romanticized. "Lotus", pronounced as "lian" in Chinese, is noted to be associated with "lian (恋)", a word with a similar pronunciation yet in different tones, conveying the concept of affection or love (p.112). However, this appears to overlook the alternative semantic association of "lian" as "to sympathize (怜)". After all, 莲 and 怜 are homonyms.

In Cryer's (1984) notes, the images "Eastern Lord (东君)" and "wild geese (大 )" are oversimplified and romanticized as instances only happening between lovers. According to Cryer (1984, p.85), "Eastern Lord" is referred to as "here a euphemism for Li Ch'ing-chao's loved one". This simplification and romanticization is a similar interpretation to that of Rexroth and Chung (1979) mentioned above. Cryer (1984, p.87) also claimed that "wild geese" are "often conceived of as carrying messages between separated lovers". However, the imagery of "wild geese" has its origins in the *Han* Dynasty, as documented in *Shiji (Records of the Historian)* and symbolizes separation and the conveying of messages more generally - not necessarily between lovers.

### 5.4.2 Cases of Ambiguity

When assessing poetry translation, it is important to distinguish between pure errors and the deliberate decisions translators often have to make to retain a poem's rhythm, rhyme, and style. Since not every shift in translation should be considered an error, the uncertainty surrounding a translator's intentions often leads to cases of ambiguity. This distinction becomes particularly relevant when examining the translation challenges in the notes of complete collections, which contain not only evident misunderstandings of Chinese traditional festivals and terms but also broader questions about translation choices.

In the aforementioned note by Rexroth and Chung (1979, p.98), it is claimed that "Ninth Day, Ninth Month [...] was originally both a harvest festival and the autumn Feast of the Dead". The translators seem to conflate Double Ninth Day with both the Mid-autumn Festival and the Hungry Ghost Festival. However, these three festivals occur on different dates and are characterized by distinct customs and traditions in Chinese culture.

Likewise, Cryer (1984, p.86) also describes "Seventh Day Seventh Month" as

"[a]n autumn festival consecrated to the dead...". This note reflects a confusion between the Double Seventh Festival and the Hungry Ghost Festival, with the latter falling on the 15<sup>th</sup> of July in the Chinese lunar calendar.

In addition to these cultural misinterpretations, Coren's (2021) end notes also contain typographical errors and raise points of contention around translation choices that could be viewed as stylistic or aesthetic decisions, rather than clear-cut errors. For instance, the interpretation of "道人" in the context of "To The Tune *Yulouchun* (玉楼春)" is presented as "a Taoist recluse (p.52)," which referred to Wang's (1989. p.79) notes. However, Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao such as Xu (2018, p. 25-26) and Chen (2011, p. 37) argue that it is not a noun but a verb, signifying "to understand people". They substantiated the verb usage of "道人" by citing poems from celebrated poets like Du Fu (杜甫) and Yang Wanli (杨万里) that predate the *Song* Dynasty. The misspelling or maybe misprinting of the renowned concubine Yang Yuhuan (杨玉环) as "Yang Yuhan" is also evident.

### 5.4.3 Over-annotation

Over-annotation here refers to the explication of irrelevant allusions, such as the silkworm and horse's spirit (Rexroth and Chung, 1979, p.114), and the legendary death of Emperor Li Longji's concubine Yang Yuhuan (Rexroth and Chung, 1979, p.98). According to some Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao, the former straightforwardly alludes to the time of silkworm weaving (Wang, 2020, p.143; Xu, 2018, p.218). The elaboration of the story in the notes provided by Rexroth and Chung tends to complicate the interpretation unnecessarily. The latter simply compares the beauty of the chrysanthemum to that of Yang Yuhuan, as annotated by Chinese experts Xu (2018, p. 34), Chen (2011, p. 52) and Wang (2020, p.11). There is no need to explicate these allusions since they do not contribute to better comprehension of the poetry, and only make them more complex.

## 5.4.4 Possible Causes and Impacts

An analysis of the above notes suggests that the socio-cultural contexts discussed earlier affect translators' decision to represent the source text and the poet, with Rexroth and Chung's (1979) rendition as a typical example. Interpreting Li Qingzhao's poems with an erotic tendency also appeared to be a trend back in the 1970s to 1980s, a result of a broader socio-cultural context of San Francisco Renaissance and Feminism mentioned later in Chapter 6.1. The fashion for eroticisation during this period can be attributed to the infusion of Freudian psychology in literary criticism, as stated by Palandri (1981, p. 271). It is plausible that Rexroth was influenced by this prevailing trend. Consequently, this trend, to some extent, contributed to his prominence as the most popular translator in the last century, whose alignment with the societal and cultural context of the time is discussed earlier in Chapter Four. This might constitute a form of domesticated interpretation. It appears that some retranslations may have been influenced by preceding ones to a certain extent. The influence of earlier translations on subsequent ones is suggested by Lee's (2018) acknowledgment and reference, openly recognizing Rexroth and Chung (1979) as one of the sources and inspirations. Cryer (1984) also cited Rexroth and Chung (1979) in his sources as recommended further reading. Additionally, Ling Chung's reference to Hu (1966) for Li Qingzhao's biography and

Coren's note (2021, p.52) referencing Wang (1989, p. 59) further support this notion. Thus, retranslations influenced by translators' socio-cultural context have an impact on the later reception of the source work. The trend in the interpretation of notes progresses from non-eroticisation in earlier periods to eroticisation in the 1970s and 1980s, and then a reduced emphasis on eroticisation in the new century. This trend in interpretation technically transitions from foreignization to domestication, and then back to foreignization. This circular tendency in the interpretation of notes contradicts the Retranslation Hypothesis, which posits a linear progression from domestication to foreignization.

Another interpretation for this prevalent eroticisation may stem from a stereotypical misconception of "Orientals". Lemaire, cited in Alem (2023, p. 1023) points out, "[f]or the Western upper middle class, Orientalism is [a] synonym with sensuality, the exciting mystery of nudity suggested by light and diaphanous silks." This eroticisation is not unique to Li Qingzhao's poems and her translators. Female imagery in the *Tang* Dynasty poems is also subject to eroticisation. For example, in Fletcher's (1919, p. 25) translation of Li Bai's *Lushuiqu* (渌水曲) "愁杀荡舟人", the last line is rendered as "And tinge with shame each boat borne wanton's cheek", whereas the Chinese word "荡舟人" literally just means "a wife who misses her husband", rather than a "wanton" (Gu, 2012 and Yelin, 2011).

The prevalence of romanticisation in notes by Rexroth and Chung (1979), Mayhew and McNaughton (1977) and Cryer (1984) also suggests a potential patriarchal intervention in translations. By simplifying and narrowing down the interpretations of certain images to a romantic context, these translators perpetuate stereotypes about women and limit alternative interpretations of women's roles and activities in the poems. They depict women as emotionally dependent on men and emphasize male authority and dominance over women.<sup>83</sup>

This kind of patriarchal practice is not confined to these instances but is also evident in other translations from other languages. For example, many male translators of Homer's *The Odyssey* are now deemed gender-biased. Translators of *The Odyssey* in the past often glorified the male character Odysseus by shaping him as a heroic protagonist and downplaying his violence against the Cyclops Polyphemus, for instance, and his manipulation of women, such as Circe, as suggested by Ahlin (2017), Higgins (2017) and North (2017). It was not until Emily Wilson translated *The Odyssey* (2018) that the androcentrism and misogyny present in previous translations was addressed, and the complexity of Odysseus and the multi-models of female characters were more accurately portrayed. Von Flotow (1997, p. 60-61) also provides a telling example of gender bias in translation with Lattimore's rendition of Saphho's work. Lattimore's rendering alters the neutral expression 'whatever one loves' into 'she whom one loves best', "making it read like a cliched love poem" in stanza one *Fragment 31*. This alteration implies that romantic love is the primary concern of women, echoing the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> This can even be applied to a larger context, like the power and gender imbalance between translators, observed in the co-translation of Rexroth and Chung. Palandri (1981, p.271) suggests "Chung's deference to the whims of Rexroth" during their translation collaboration since Rexroth was the research subject of Chung's dissertation and is probably highly esteemed by her.

romanticized translations mentioned earlier. In summary, these examples underscore how patriarchal attitudes can shape translation practices, reinforcing gender stereotypes and limiting the representation of women in translated literature. Furthermore, this shared female stereotype among Li Qingzhao's collections retranslated into English also demonstrates the role translators can play in shaping gender stereotypes and the possible influence and reinforcement of that bias through the practice of translation and retranslation. That kind of influence was identified with actual readers' response in the case of translating the female character Daisy in *The Great Gatsby* by Zeven and Dorst (2022).

The process of eroticisation and romanticization misleads readers and excessive annotation overwhelms them with unnecessary complexities. Li Qingzhao's poems offer a glimpse into the lives of Chinese women in the 12<sup>th</sup> century but framed through the eroticisation and romanticization in these translation notes, women's lives are rendered profoundly erotic, revolving around themes of lovesickness. This interpretation discussed above not only distorts the variety and scope of Li Qingzhao's poems but also fosters a potentially inaccurate and adverse perception of her literary contributions, personal image, and, on a broader scale, the image of Chinese women and Chinese cultural expressions.

As Genette (1997, p.328) points out,

[T]he chief advantage of the note is actually that it brings about local effects of nuance, or sourdine, or as they also say in music, of register, effects that help reduce the famous and sometimes regrettable linearity of discourse.

In this scenario, excessive annotation might nullify the potential benefits that notes could yield. Rather than assisting comprehension, too much annotation of irrelevant allusions complicates cultural information, making texts less comprehensible and accessible to readers. The result might be to intimidate some readers, deterring them from reading the notes at all, or boring readers with too much background information, and preventing them from reading further.

### 5.5 Conclusion

The above peritexts, such as titles, covers, tables of contents, presentation, blurbs and notes, show that the Rexroth and Chung's (1979) version merits attention in its own right. It excels in proper titling, sophisticated cover design, structured content pages and well-organized presentation, accompanied by a compelling blurb, and vivid domesticated notes. These paratextual elements are meticulously crafted to coax readers to read and shape their perceptions. Sometimes they may go too far, leading readers to misconstrue the poet Li Qingzhao, her works, and on some occasions the Chinese culture at large. What's more concerning is that this kind of misguidance seems to influence some later translators in their notes and potentially in their translations, which might enhance stereotypical female characterization through retranslations on readers.

Other paratextual elements, such as acknowledgments or dedications, epigraphs, forewords and prefaces, etc. still play important roles in understanding how

retranslations are received in the target culture, how they influence target readers, and how they interact with previous translations. Given that Rexroth and Chung (1979) is the primary focus in this section, it stands as the most concise rendition among all collections. The exploration of other paratextual elements mentioned above is not addressed here and awaits further study.

The examination also finds there might be an interaction between the older and newer translations among translators, editors or publishers. Some later retranslations somehow take on certain paratextual features of older translations, whether it is the titling, cover design, blurbs, or notes, which demonstrates retranslations affect later reception. They do not stand exactly on the opposite side of older translations. They sometimes potentially imitate older translations and sometimes differ and distinguish themselves from older translations. Their approaches to paratextual elements are neither solely domesticated nor foreignized but sometimes a mixture of both. The tendency of their technical approaches does not present a regular linearity. In this sense, the aging of older translations and the linear advancement from domestication to foreignization, claimed by the Retranslation Hypothesis, is refuted in the case of Li Qingzhao's complete English collections. This research sides with Liu (1991, p.154) that every translation deserves to be recognized for its own value and purpose.

As time advances, contemporary readers are reevaluating these retranslations with their new fresh perspectives and evolving tastes. Given the prevalence of misrepresentation, misinterpretation and misunderstanding outlined above and the ambiguous nature of Chinese poems, there is a growing need for additional retranslations to breathe new life into Li Qingzhao's work in the Anglophone world. Such endeavours are essential to establish a just and dignified representation of her literary legacy.

# Chapter Six (Re)translation and Reception of Li Qingzhao's

# Works: Within the Dataset and Beyond

What is left unexamined in the dataset of (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works are four works including Li Qingzhao's poems retranslated into English via another European language, particularly French. To be specific, the first one is Chinese Lyrics from The Book of Jade, originally a Chinese-French translation by Judith Gautier, and then retranslated into English by James Whithall (1918); the second one is One Hundred *Poems from The Chinese* translated by Kenneth Rexroth (1956), mostly based on the Chinese-French translation from Soulié de Morant and G. Margouliès; the third book is About Chinese Women, written by Julia Kristeva (1974) in French, translated into English by Anita Barrows in 1977, and the last one is Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical, written in French by André Lévy in 1991, and translated by William H. Nienhauser, Jr. in 2000. These are all English retranslations of French translations, referred to as "indirect translations" by Pieta (2021, p. 113), who defines indirect translations in both a narrow and broad sense, with "retranslation" falling under the broad definition. In the context of Chinese texts in previous scholarly publications, the term "indirect translation" has frequently been used interchangeably with or as a subset of retranslation, as noted by Rosa et al. (2017, p117). Therefore, this section acknowledges the above four translations as indirect translations and relates them to retranslation in a broader sense. This section first considers the macro-contextual factors of these translations to reveal the possible motivation through paratexts and then analyses the micro-textual features to reflect Li Qingzhao's reception by case studies.

# 6.1 A Contextual Analysis of French-English (Re)translations through

# Paratexts

The translation from French into English was caused by a plethora of historical, cultural and social factors, reflecting the cultural power dynamics in the past century among Chinese, French and English languages.

# 6.1.1 Whithall's (1918) Chinese Lyrics from The Book of Jade

Whithall (1918) ushered Li Qingzhao into the Anglophone world with the poem translation *Langtaosha-outside the curtains*(浪淘沙 • 帝外五更风).<sup>84</sup> As mentioned in Chapter Three, Li Qingzhao's debut in English in the 1910s was probably associated with the American Poem Renaissance in the 1910s, the first wave of Feminism, the outbreak of World War I and the 1911 Revolution in China that resulted in Chinese youth studying abroad. Whithall's (1918) book sheds no light on his motivation for translating from French to English, but reviews of the French version *Chinese Lyrics from The Book of Jade* suggest that French culture exerted an influence on America, and this may have inspired the indirect translation. Rexroth (1987) also suggests that a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> My translation from Chinese.

dozen of American translators and writers from the 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century were influenced by French. Some of them, such as Erza Pound, Amy Lowell, Witter Bynner and himself, were inspired by Judith Gautier's French volume, *Chinese Lyrics from The Book of Jade* which was the first poem anthology of Chinese poems. Alternatively, the indirect translation might be due to the unavailability of Chinese source texts, as Détrie in Yu (2007, p. 479) claims that "[i]n many countries, [Judith Gautier's] translations and their imitations were often … the only means of access to Chinese poetry".

### 6.1.2 Rexroth's (1956) One Hundred Poems from the Chinese

Likewise, Rexroth's (1956) translation used French as an intermediate language, due to the lack of Chinese texts, stating (1956, p. xiii)

"[w]here I did not have a Chinese text at hand in the first place, for about half the poems, I usually translated from other Western languages, mostly the French of Soulié de Morant and G. Margouliès".

Furthermore, Rexroth, proficient in both spoken and written French, explicitly acknowledged that the French poet Reverdy exerted the greatest influence on him among all literary figures (Gibson, 1986, p.100). This might also contextualize his reliance on French sources when Chinese materials were inaccessible. Or it could be related to the hegemonic status of the French language at the time. Rosa et al. (2017, p123) point out that "due to French's hegemonic status in the World Republic of Letters until the mid-twentieth century, these translations were frequently used as mediating texts in the making of different European TTs".

Other factors, such as the San Francisco Renaissance and the rise of feminism, likely inspired Rexroth's engagement with translating Chinese poetry. According to Davidson (1989), the San Francisco Renaissance merged in the late 1950s to early 1960s, building on the elegiac poetics of the 1940s. This movement was spearheaded by young poets, such as Robert Duncan, Jack Spicer, Allen Ginsberg and others, together with the senior poet Kenneth Rexroth. They organized literary seminars and poetry readings, often accompanied by jazz music which emphasized the performative quality of the poetry, encouraging audience interaction. The Renaissance was marked by the publication of Allen Ginsberg's *Howl*, and was characterized by its performative, interactive and self-representational qualities. The movement advocated for "returning to the romantic movement itself" and a renewed connection with nature (Davidson, 1989, p. xiv). For Rexroth, the movement offered "hope for a literary revival on the order of the one that occurred in Paris in the 1920s" (Davidson, 1989, p. xiv). Characterised by political liberalism and social tolerance, especially toward sexuality, the movement at times appeared satirical or radical.

Chung (1972, p. 2) described Rexroth as "the mentor of those wild young poets in the San Francisco Renaissance in the 1950s." During this period, he "became a spokesman for Far Easter culture" as a columnist for the *San Francisco Examiner* (Chung, 1972, p.29). His role as a mentor and advocate for cross-cultural exploration is evident in his efforts to introduce Chinese poetry to Western audiences. For instance, he often read his translations of Chinese poetry accompanied by music to audiences in literary clubs. Rexroth found personal resonance in the elegiac and nature-focused works of Chinese poets, such as Du Fu, Yuan Zhen, Su Dongpo and Li Qingzhao. These affinities likely prompted his interest in translating and introducing Chinese poetry to a wider audience.

In addition, Hamalian (1991, p.340 and p. 418) speculates that Rexroth translated women poets as a response to contemporary social-cultural trends, within the context of "the wave of the new feminist consciousness" and in his attempt "to understand why his three marriages had been such disasters, and why his relationship with his daughters was growing distant. Perhaps if he could enter the psyche of women poets, he would learn more about women than he had while living with them." Gibson (1986, p.1) further attributes Rexroth's promotion of female poets, especially those from China and Japan, in part to the influence of his mother's feminist ideals.

# 6.1.3 *About Chinese Women* (Barrows, 1977) and *Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical* (Nienhauser, 2000)

The third French-English retranslation including Li Qingzhao's poems was Barrows' (1977) edition, and this might be related to the second wave of Feminism<sup>85</sup>, which was ushered in by Betty Friedan's *The Feminine Mystique* (1963) in the US, calling for reshaping femininity to allow women to attain self-identity and maturity (Thornham, 2006, p. 30). The second wave of Feminism (the 1960s to 1980s) featured a number of feminism theorists, such as Julia Kristeva, Hélène Cixous, and Chantal Chawaf, etc., with a focus on marginalized groups, among whom are women in developing nations. As noted by Yu (2015, p. 4), feminist translation emerged in the late 1970s alongside a shift in focus toward translating feminist literature, particularly works by women, in Western Europe and North America.

According to Lowe (2018, p.141), the French book was written to critique the absence of psychoanalytic depth in French and North American women's movements and to challenge Freudian and Lacanian theories of sexual difference. The references to China and Chinese women serve primarily to engage with Western debates and address Western political and theoretical issues. In the last part of "Afterword to the American edition" (Barrows, 1977, p. 209), it points out that both American and Chinese women face the complex task of creating new social spaces and identities in their respective cultures, despite their different histories and challenges, and argues that the experience of Chinese women, marked by a longstanding tension between conformity and creativity, may "accelerate or modify our specific history-times into new social spaces".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> "Feminism" is generally defined as "the belief that women, purely and simply because they are women, are treated inequitably within a society which is organised to prioritise male viewpoints and concerns" (Gamble, 2006a, p. vii). While the exact timeline of the three waves of feminism remains debated, it is widely accepted that the first wave emerged in the late 19th century, spreading across European nations and extending to North and South America by the early 20th century. This wave primarily focused on achieving equality through individual efforts, ultimately transforming women's societal and political participation—such as securing the right to vote—into a widespread public concern (Sanders, 2006). The third wave of feminism began in the 1990s in the US, with Rebecca Walker serving as a prominent spokesperson. This wave emphasized the diversity and multiplicity of women's identities, embracing pluralism, hybridity, and even ambiguity (Gamble, 2006b).

The last French-English retranslation was driven by the translator's personal interest in producing "a concise history of Chinese literature in about 125 pages, which is the exact length of Professor Lévy's original text" (Nienhauser, 2000, p. ix). Nienhauser claims that retranslating French texts into English led to a distancing from the originals, so that he translated almost all the excerpts using the original Chinese texts alongside the French version as a guide. This suggests that the translator himself knows Chinese, English and French, so the indirect translation was not due to a lack of language skills, but perhaps a certain market segment, serving the need of market niche. The representation of the book may be tailored for a specific readership, such as the general public, in order to meet the demands of the Western literary market for a concise history of Chinese literature.

The motivations for these French-English (re)translations were driven by several factors including the inaccessibility of Chinese source texts in the Anglophone world, the market niche, a broader cultural-historical movement and the prestige of French in the international cultural world. They not only reflect but also reinforce the peripheral position of Chinese on the international cultural stage where a European cultural centre dominates. Taken in conjunction with the status of anthologies previously analysed, this study reveals that the dissemination of Chinese classics to the Anglophone world has been far from satisfactory. To know how the source texts were read and received requires a textual analysis as follows.

### 6.2 A Textual Analysis of French-English (Re)translations by Case

### Studies

The contrast between the meagre amount of French-English (re)translations and a great many Chinese-English retranslations may also correlate with some negative reviews about the French-English (re)translations, namely errors in translations, or unfaithfulness to the Chinese source. For instance, Bailey (1973, p. 28) once annotated Rexroth's *One Hundred Poems from the Chinese* (1956) as follows: "Rexroth's translations while consistently pleasing as poetry, are quite free, and on occasion one is tempted to suggest that the translator has actually misread his originals." More detailed case studies are analysed to make this point.

In form, the earlier French-English translations, such as Whithall (1918) and Rexroth (1956), almost abandoned all the original Chinese *Cipai* (tune titles) and titled them randomly, either based on themes or meaning. Barrows (1977) did not title them at all. Comparatively, Nienhauser (2000) was more faithful to the forms of the Chinese source texts, rendering *Cipai* into English with a bracket of Chinese Mandarin spelling and characters.

In content, there are indeed flaws in these retranslations. Take Rexroth's (1956) retranslations as an example: in his *Ci* translation "Autumn Evening Beside the Lake" (Rexroth, 1956, p.105), the Chinese verse "红稀香少" is translated as "boats grow rare on the river", whereas the Chinese means the red lotuses are drooping and their fragrance fades; "眠沙鸥鹭不回头, 似也恨, 人归早" is translated as "the herons and seagulls sleep on the sand with their heads tucked away, as though they did not wish to

see the men who pass by on the river", whereas the Chinese actually means these seagulls are reluctant to say goodbye to people, so they tuck their head away, a sign of their grudge against people going home too early. In the Ci translation "Two Springs" (Rexroth, 1956, p.106), "江梅些子破" is translated as "the pink buds of the peach trees are still unopened little balls", whereas the Chinese refer to the budding plum blossoms. Less accurate still, is the translation of "碧云笼碾玉成尘" which is rendered "The clouds are milky white jade bordered and spotted with green jade. No dust stirs." Rather than referring to the cloud, "碧云" here in Chinese denotes the colour of the tea pie,<sup>86</sup> and "玉成尘" means the tea pie is ground into bits. In "Quail Sky" (Rexroth, 1956, p.107), an error in the placement of subject and object means that "酒阑更喜团茶苦" is translated as "A little wine makes the return to tea more enjoyable". In fact, it is the tea that alleviates a hangover. At the end of the poem, "不如随分尊前醉, 莫负东篱 菊蕊黄" is translated as "I refuse to be burdened by the yellowing heart of the chrysanthemum along the wall". Instead, the poet means just the opposite. She suggests drinking with a light heart and enjoying beautiful chrysanthemums, just like the famous ancient poet Tao Yuanming, who made peace with the world and found inner ease and tranquillity in chrysanthemums.<sup>87</sup> In "Alone in the Night" (Rexroth, 1956, p.108), "暖 雨晴风初破冻" is rendered as "The warm rain and pure wind have just freed the willows from the ice", which concretizes the Chinese images "暖雨晴风" by placing them in a specific physical environment. The original Chinese text does not specify the objects being liberated from the ice. In addition, "柳眼眉腮,已觉春心动" is translated as "As I watch the peach trees, Spring rises from my heart and blooms on My cheeks. My mind is unsteady as if I were drunk." The original Chinese personification and pun is misinterpreted and lost in translation. The eyebrows of willow trees and cheeks of plum blossoms are the personification of their buddings which betoken spring's approaching and stir the poet's state of mind.<sup>88</sup> That is, she longs for her husband to return and enjoy the spring scenery together. "夹衫" in the poem refers to the poet's jacket, not the "doubled quilt" in the English translation. Similar errors in translating nouns can be found in the poem "The Day of Cold Food" (Rexroth, 1956, p.110). "沉 水" and "斗草" are Chinese proper names, referring to a special fragrance and a competitive game in the Song dynasty respectively. A particularly controversial translation is "轻解罗裳, 独上兰舟" in "Plum Blossoms Fall and Scatter" (Rexroth, 1956, p.108). This is condensed and mistranslated into "torches gleam on the orchid boats", whereas some Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao such as Chun Zumei (2021, p. 29) interpret this as "the poet undressed herself and went to bed alone". Others, such as Xu Peijun (2018, p. 20) read the line as "the poet pulled up her dress and stepped onto

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Tea pie is pie-shaped tea block, made up of ground tea after several complex procedures, such as steaming, grinding, moulding, drying and sealing the tea, etc.  $\square \cancel{x}$  (no date). Available at: <u>https://baike.baidu.com/item/%E5%9B%A2%E8%8C%B6/559037</u>(Accessed: 11<sup>th</sup> July 2024). (In Chinese)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Here chrysanthemums alluded to Tao Yuanming's verse "采菊东篱下, 悠然见南山" to express Li Qingzhao's self-consolation and optimism despite her homesickness and personal distress.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> The use of "eyebrow/cheeks" serves to personify the plants, imbuing them with human-like characteristics.

a boat alone." Rexroth's (1956) translation fits neither of these Chinese interpretations and omits the image of her "clothes" altogether. The image of "秋千(swing)" in "The Day of Cold Food" is also omitted. In "Mist" (Rexroth, 1956, p.111), "梨花欲谢恐难 禁" was translated as "O bright pods of the pepper plant, you do not need to bow and beg pardon. I know you cannot hold back the passing day", whereas the Chinese original text refers to pear blossoms and bears no reference to a pepper plant.

Similar errors are also found in the other three French-English translations. For example, "回首紫金峰" in Whithall (1918, p.32) is translated as "I turn to look at the mountain", whereas the Chinese experts on Li Qingzhao, such as Zhuge (2019, p.174) and Wang (2015, p. 106), interpreted the line as "looking back on the days in Jiangkang (where Zijin Mountain is located)".<sup>89</sup> Moreover, "冷冷清清" in Barrows' (1977) was translated as "cold cold green green". However, the poet's loneliness cannot be read through the colour "green", and this is a misinterpretation based on the fact that "green" is a homonym of Chinese "清". Finally, in Nienhauser (2000, p. 97) "最难将息" is translated as "it's hardest to breathe", yet the Chinese "息" is read by many Chinese scholars (Chen, 2021, p.73; Wu, 2009, p.78; Xu, 2018, p.136) as "take care of".

To sum up, there are errors in proper names, such as "碧云" "夹衫" "红稀香少" "江梅" "斗草", etc., or the deliberate omission of images, such as "秋千", "罗裳", or the misplacement of Chinese syntactical structures, such as, "酒阑更喜团茶苦", or ignorance of allusions, such as "莫负东篱菊蕊黄", the concretization of images, such as "初破冻", and other types of mistranslations in French-English (re)translations.

### 6.3 Influence of French-English (Re)translation on the Source Culture

The aforementioned errors in the French-English (re)translations might have something to do with the lack of source texts, or the mistranslation from Chinese to French, or the misunderstanding or misinterpretation of French or Chinese in one way or another or even translators' deliberate renditions. The errors could cause some misunderstandings about Chinese culture, or the poet and her reception. To name a few cases, "斗草" was a type of competitive game with a long tradition among men and women, young and old in ancient China. It was a game played in spring and originated in the Southern and Northern Period (around 400 C.E). Initially, it was a competition to collect as much wormwood as possible to prevent summer diseases. The game evolved into more varieties in the Tang and Song Dynasty. Competitors picked special kinds of straw to test the resilience of the straw; some picked as much grass and flowers as possible in a limited time; others tested competitors' knowledge about certain types of plants, while others gambled on the winner or loser. These games reflect ancient Chinese people's connection with nature, though the game is no longer played in modern China. Rexroth's (1956) translation: "men begin again, fighting for straws" offers no explanation of the game and its cultural context. Readers might therefore assume that Chinese culture is odd, or that Chinese people were fighting for straws out of stupidity or boredom. The positive image of Chinese people's love for nature was not delivered at all. His translation of "负东篱菊蕊黄" fails to convey Li Qingzhao's sophistication

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> My translation from Chinese

and supremacy in Chinese literature, and reflect her pursuit of inner tranquillity, peace and union, and her optimism towards life. The poet's image is reduced and simplified to that of a lonely woman longing for her husband's return. The multi-faceted nature of her character is not transmitted through the translations. To some degree, errors in the above (re)translations not only obscured the versatility of the poet, but also diluted the richness and positivity of Chinese culture, such as the love for life and nature, sometimes suggesting the very opposite and evoking negative associations.

Nevertheless, critics cannot deny the contribution of the above French-English (re)translations in transmitting Chinese culture and enlarging its readership. The importance of Whithall's (1918) version in bringing Li Qingzhao to Western readers cannot be overemphasized. According to Chung (1972), not only did Rexroth's (1956) version One Hundred Poems from the Chinese sell substantially, but it was also reprinted and anthologized, studied by academics, and read with music in cafes or salons; it was even retranslated into Finnish. It certainly brought more visibility to Li Qingzhao in the Anglophone world. The initial attempt by Rexroth (1956) to translate Li Qingzhao appears to have kindled the translator's growing interest in her and the initial positive reception in the market led to more retranslation productions in subsequent decades. The translations by Barrows (1977) from French may have influenced feminist literary critics such as Gayastri Spivak, Lisa Lowe and Rey Chow who interpreted and commented on theories in About Chinese Women in a debate that lasted nearly 20 years (Long, 2015, p.85). Furthermore, Nienhauser's (2000) version added another voice for Chinese literature, enabling the poet to be heard and spread on the world stage in the new century. As Chinese literature is not a major cultural element in international literary society, these French-English (re)translations, in essence, have facilitated the dissemination of Chinese culture in the Anglophone world, enriched the cultural diversity in the European-language-centred literature elites, and promoted cross-cultural communication, thereby advancing the reception of Chinese culture and the poet implicitly. Perhaps just as Venuti (2013, p. 107) highlighted,

"[T]ranslating cannot be viewed as a simple act of communication because it creates values in social formations at specific historical moments, and these values redefine the source text and culture from moment to moment".

Therefore, the criticism and negation of these translations above should not be over-amplified and exaggerated. After all, it has to be admitted that even direct translations from Chinese to English may also carry errors.

### 6.4 Reception and Influence of Li Qingzhao on the Target Culture

## **Beyond the (Re)translation Dataset**

Chinese-English translations have never been just an isolated literary production in the Anglophone world; they have interacted with local target literary productions. Their reception and interaction with the local target literature can be best exemplified by Ezra Pound and Arthur Waley. For instance, both *The Norton Anthology of American* 

*Literature, Ninth Edition, Volume D: 1914-1945* (Loeffelholz, 2017, p. 297-298) and *The Oxford Book of American Poetry* (Lehman, 2006, p. 301-302) include Pound's English translation of Li Bai's "*Changganxing* (长干行)", and *The Penguin Book of Contemporary Verse 1918-60 New Revised Edition* (Allott, 1962, p. 111-112) includes two poems of Bai Juyi translated into English by Waley. The impact of translation on the target language has been confirmed by many scholars, such as Lynn (1984, p. x.), who mentioned that "translations from the Japanese and Chinese have had an undeniably profound influence on contemporary American poetry." Back in 1990, Even-Zohar (1990, p.51) put forward the idea of the literary/translation poly-system, in which "translation is no longer a phenomenon whose nature and borders are given once and for all, but an activity dependent on the relations of Chinese literature made its way into the target culture and to a certain degree shaped the target culture.

As Yao (2002, p. 9) points out, particularly in America, "translation came over the course of the Modernist period to function and be recognized as a distinctly vital and generative writing practice." The incorporation of translated texts or foreign elements into writers' compositions has long been a tradition in the work of many famous writers, especially American Modernist poets and translators. According to Zhao (2013), even before the 1910s, Chinese elements had already been included in American poems, such as those by Oliver Holmes, Henry Longfellow, Richard Stoddard, Bret Hart and Wallace Irwin. Further evidence can be found in the Modernist period, in poems by Ezra Pound, Wallace Stevens, T.S. Eliot, and William Carlos Williams (Yao, 2002). Pound borrowed a large piece of translated text from Confucius's books, such as The Four Books, modified in one way or another, and created his poem collection Canto XIII and Cantos LIII-LXI (Yao, 2002, p. 155). His short poem "In a Station of the Metro" uses a typical juxtaposition of images modelled on Chinese Tang poems. According to Zhao (2013), over a dozen contemporary American poets, such as James Wright, John Haines and Gary Synder also absorbed some features of Chinese poems and incorporated them into their creations. Moreover, contemporary writers continue to embed Chinese elements, especially English translations of Chinese literature, into their literary productions, for instance, Jose (2015) stated, his novel The Red Thread was based on his understanding of Lin Yutang's translation of the Chinese novel Six Chapters of a Floating Life. He then expanded this to a contemporary time-travel fiction novel.

According to Doty (2022, p. 295), "the processes of reception involve the integration of discourses, texts, objects and practices of the culture of origin transferred to the social and cultural horizon of the target culture." In the case of Li Qingzhao, in addition to the (re)translations in the aforementioned dataset, the more profound influence and reception of the poet can also be approached through creative responses by artists as alternative receivers generated in the target language system. Here the creative responses refer to literary works explicitly inspired by Li Qingzhao in books or journals and other forms. These include poems published in print and digital journals, such as Beeler's (1975) "Holy Woman"; Barnstone's (1984) "Reading Li Qingzhao", Alexander's (1986) "Poem to Li Ch'ing-Chao", and Atkinson's (2007) "Remembering

Rexroth's Li Ch'ing Chao in Cordova, Alaska", etc., as well as book chapters or sections in Wang (2003), Hamill (2005), Ward (2008b) and Coray (2011), and Waldman (1984).

## 6.4.1 Examining Poems Published in Print and Digital journals

### A. "Holy Woman-The Poetess Li Ch'ing Chao" (Beeler, 1975)

To begin with poems published in journals, "Holy Woman-The Poetess Li Ch'ing Chao" (Beeler, 1975) shares a theme of sorrow and anguish that is very similar to most of Li Qingzhao's *Ci*. Indeed, many images are directly taken from Li Qingzhao's *Ci*, including "mirror, wine, black chrysanthemum, blanket and wind screens". Beeler takes the second-person perspective, which seems to travel across time to talk to Li Qingzhao herself, picturing her holding up a mirror to reveal the image of an unhappy burnt-out human. The cause of her woe is revealed by the line "when he had gone", reflecting the major tragedy of her life. Anguish becomes a part of her life and daily routine; only wine can paralyze her feelings. Beeler suggests long sleepless nights as we watch the poet "seated at her dressing table" before creeping "into her blanket" and waiting for "the white rim of morning". The last line, "your fingers rustled into a nest for your cheek" leaves much room for imagination and implication. The reader visualizes Li Qingzhao covering her face with her hands in a gesture of helplessness, that reflects her heartache.

### B. "Poem to Li Ch`ing-Chao" (Alexander, 1986)

Alexander's (1986) "Poem to Li Ch'ing-Chao" is a biographical poem for Li Qingzhao. It begins with the first-person perspective before switching to a second-person perspective, as if the author is writing a letter to the old friend Li Qingzhao. Using some direct quotes from Li Qingzhao's *Ci Shengshengman*, the poem narrates her significant life experiences, such as her study of bronze and stone tablets and inscriptions, fleeing the Jurchen invasion, mourning the death of her husband and the loss of her motherland. This poem also alludes to Li Qingzhao's *Ci "silk washing brook*" and images, such as the wild geese and snow, to set the mood of separation, coldness and melancholy.

### C. "Reading Li Qingzhao" (Barnstone, 1984)

Barnstone (1984) also interweaves Li Qingzhao's life events into the poem "Reading Li Qingzhao", but with the third-person perspective. The short poem takes many original images from Li Qingzhao's *Ci* to narrate her biography, for instance, "drunk", "empty bamboo bed", "geese" and "lying hairpin" express her loneliness due to the separation from her husband while he was posted and reposted from one place to another. Meanwhile, the poem also records the happy memories between Li Qingzhao and her husband and friends, studying "the old scrolls" in her garden.

**D. "Remembering Rexroth's Li Ch'ing Chao in Cordova, Alaska" (Atkinson, 2007)** The poem begins with a quotation from Rexroth's (1956) English translation of Li Qingzhao's "Quail Sky (鹧鸪天)" to set the tone for the speaker's contemplation. As the speaker observes the surrounding scenes, vivid imagery and multi-sensory details, such as sight, smell and sound, are employed to evoke the rugged beauty and harsh realities of the environment. The poem also touches upon the themes of change and nostalgia, particularly in the conversation overheard on the *Ginny R*'s stern in the end. The description of the bleak environment and woman's reminiscence about the "old days" to some degree echoes Li Qingzhao's homesickness and the surroundings in her poem "Quail Sky".

The last part of the poem mimics the beginning quotation of "Quail Sky" by Li Qingzhao. In Li's poem, the lines "If I indulged my sad heart/The days would be still more/Frozen and sad..." express a sense of melancholy and resignation. The speaker's observation of the woman on the boat who expresses a resigned acceptance of change and adversity mirrors the sentiment conveyed in Li Qingzhao's lines. Despite the hardships, the woman from the *Grinny R*'s stern, still chooses to stop complaining and focus on the present task, whereas the speaker in Li's poem chooses to enjoy the autumn scene and wine. Both passages convey a sense of recognition of the inevitability of hardship and the need to move forward despite it. By echoing Li Qingzhao's words, the poem deepens its connection to her themes and emotions, creating a dialogue between the past and the present, and highlighting the enduring relevance of Li's poetry across time and cultures.

### **E.** Creative Poems in Digital Journals

Certain poems inspired by Li Qingzhao have been published in E-journals. For example, the poem "Spring in Hangzhou", written by Edward Harness (no date), was published in the online literary journal *Triggerfish Critical Review*, Issue 26. The poem captures one morning's separation between Li Qingzhao and her husband and reflects on love, yearning, loss, the transience of time and the enduring power of art. "A Letter to Li Ch'ing-chao, While I Drink Bai Mu Dan Tea", written by George Kalamaras (2018), was published in *The Literary Journal of The University of Montana*, 2018. The poem begins with a quotation from Li Qingzhao's poem about aging, and resonates with Li Qingzhao in several themes, such as the reflection on the passage of time, leaving hometowns, the loss of loved ones, loneliness and longing, across time and space.

### 6.4.2 Examining Poems and Prose in Book Chapters

# A. "Away from the Day Shift's Bullhorn and Dazzle" in *A Measure's Hush* (Coray, 2011)

Apart from poems published in print and digital journals, poems published in book chapters also contain direct quotations from Li Qingzhao's *Ci*. For example, the poem "Away from the Day Shift's Bullhorn and Dazzle" by Anne Coray (2011) sets the nighttime scene in darkness and tranquillity, far away from the day's hustle and bustle. The night sky is decorated with the light of the polar star. Just then, the author wonders how Li Qingzhao would describe such a scene. Quoting a line from Li Qingzhao's "*Chunguanghao* (春光好)" by the translator Robert Payne (1960), she writes "Last night, among the deep snows of the village. One blossom opened." The poem ends with the magic power of this amazing landscape on people's hearts, just like God baptizing his followers. In the poem, the author tries to draw an analogy between the grace of the polar star among the tranquillity and the beauty of the first plum blossom in the deep snow at night. Perhaps the author views this as a moment to witness the co-existence of peace and wonder. Borrowing the scent and colour of plum blossoms from Li Qingzhao's *Ci*, Coray adds beauty to her night.

# B. "A Woodsplitter's Meditation" in *Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations* (Hamill, 2005)

In contrast to the creative pieces above, in his collection *Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations* (2005), Sam Hamill not only retranslates five of Li Qingzhao's *Ci*, but also produces one new poem "A Woodsplitter's Meditation", directly alluding to Li Qingzhao. The four-stanza poem begins with the woodsplitter's ordinary work in autumn, and then articulates the changes in the body and mind of the narrator over the years. It is perhaps the death of a friend's husband that kindles the woodsplitter's meditation. Though he makes peace with time, natural aging and death, he is at a loss for how to ease the widow's pain when she asks for help. Turning to Li Qingzhao and Yuan Zhen's mourning poems, the woodsplitter confesses his failure to understand a widow's grief, and praises Li Qingzhao's extraordinary gift in representing grief, with the line: "Shall I say Li Ch'ing-Chao mourned beautifully?" More importantly perhaps, the poem suggests the agony and pain of a widow can only be understood and shared by people who have gone through similar experiences. The implication here is that Li Qingzhao's poems might offer better comfort and support to those in mourning.

### C. Li Ch'ing-Chao: Remembered (Ward, 2008b)

In terms of creative responses, Jean Elizabeth Ward's (2008b) *Li Ch'ing-Chao: Remembered* offers one of the best examples of how Li Qingzhao and her works have been received. In addition to a brief biography of Li Qingzhao and her *Ci*, the book consists of English translations of her *Ci* by the author and other anonymous or credited translators as well as some original poems inspired by Li Qingzhao. A special section is dedicated to different retranslations of her renowned *Ci* at the end of the book. There are around 120 poems, along with some paratexts, such as notes, sketches, or illustrations. These poems are arranged as Found poems, Kimo poems and modern Senryu poems<sup>90</sup>. Kimo poems are presented in Kimo Medley, Kimo Trio, Kimo Duo, and Kimo Suite, etc.

Careful reading of the book reveals that a great number of the poems are adapted from original Chinese texts or parts of translated texts into different variations of Kimo poems. For example, *Tanpohuanxisha-cassia* (摊破浣溪沙•揉破黄金万点明) is rendered into a Kimo Suite poem in English. The original Chinese text starts to describe the colour and shape of cassia, then praises the spirit it represents, comparing cassia with plum blossoms and lilacs, before lamenting its overpowering fragrance. In a different syntactical order, the English poem (Ward, 2008b, p.27) starts with judging other flowers, and then describes the cassia, its fragrance and spirit. Reducing the Chinese proper noun "the scholar Yen Fu" into the common noun "a scholar", the English poem prioritises the flow of the poem over culture-loaded translation, making

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> According to Ward (2008a, p.3), "Found Poetry is the rearrangement of words, and sometimes whole passages that are taken from other sources and reframed as poetry by changes in spacing and/or lines (and consequently meaning), or by altering the text by additions and/or deletions". Kimo poetry, an Israeli adaptation of Haiku, consists of three lines with 10, 7, and 6 syllables. It arose to accommodate Hebrew's linguistic nuances, emphasizing a single, static scene without requiring rhyme. Deluty (2006, p. 356) stated that Senryu were poems capturing the essence of observed, imagined, or recalled moments. While haiku focus objectively on nature and seasonal themes, senryu explore subjective human experiences, often with satire, pathos, or irony. They typically consist of three lines with a total of seventeen or fewer syllables in English.

it more accessible to Anglophone readers. Similarly, the Chinese *Ci "Yiqin'e* (忆秦 娥•临高阁)" is rendered into a Kimo Trio poem (Ward, 2008b, p.88). The English poem inverts the Chinese original texts and moves the final part up to the beginning. What's more, the poem edits images which convey the bleak autumn and the poet's desolation. In a similar act of simplification, *Duoli* (多丽•咏白菊) is rendered into a Kimo Medley poem (Ward, 2008b, p.15). The poem simplifies most of the Chinese proper nouns, such as "*Guifei* (贵妃)" "*Sunshou* (孙寿)" "*Hanling* (韩令)", etc., into a single collective phrase: "other men's wives" to mitigate the difficulty of reading. Additionally, the last line is domesticated and converted into more idiomatic English phrases "orchids gathered on London's old riverbanks, or the chrysanthemums picked by England's Elizabeth". This is perhaps because the original Chinese proper nouns carry too many culture-loaded figures, such as *Qu Yuan* (屈原) and *Tao Qian* (陶潜), which are hard for Anglophone readers to understand and need quite a lot of annotation.

Kimo poems might also be constituted by the juxtaposition of Chinese original texts or images taken from Li Qingzhao's works. For instance, fragments of the two famous *Rumengling* by Li Qingzhao are juxtaposed to make a Kimo Trio poem. In the English poem (Ward, 2008b, p.33), the first part of *Rumengling-remembering* is taken to begin the poem, yet the last stanza shifts into ending with the first part of *Rumengling-last night*.

The juxtaposition of images is more often seen in modern Senryu poems, too. They are generally only three lines. For instance, one modern Senryu poem (Ward, 2008b, p.21) takes "plum blossoms", "pussy willows" and "soft breeze" "spring" from *Dielianhua-warm rain* (蝶恋花 • 暖雨晴风初破冻) to make a short poem of 13 words to reflect the vibrant essence of spring. Taking different images from various Chinese source texts, "parasol trees", "yellow chrysanthemums", and "breeze" are juxtaposed to make one Senryu poem (Ward, 2008b, p.78) of an autumn scene.

Kimo poems sometimes imitate Li Qingzhao's works, especially her syntactical structure and way of expression. For instance, the Chinese original *Rumengling: last night* goes like this: I ask the maid rolling up the blinds, who replies that the crab-apple blossoms remain the same. "Don't you know? Oh, don't you know?" "The greens must be plump and the reds must be lean."<sup>91</sup> The second stanza of the Kimo poem "Rumors Just Rumors" (Ward, 2008b, p. 91) picks up a similar syntactical structure, which goes as follows: 'I question one who raised a curtain, and replies: "The roses-are as they are." But no, but no! I said...'. More imitation of syntactical structure can be found in another poem "Tune: Dark Clouds" (Ward, 2008b, p. 52). Inspired by Li Qingzhao, the beginnings of two English stanzas read as follows: "O' weary me! Year after year I grow weary of doing everything by myself..." "Night after night you go away...". The structure follows the beginning of Li Qingzhao's *Ci Shengzhazi-year after year* (生査 子•年年玉镜台), which reads "year after year, I have been too tired to do my hair."<sup>92</sup> It also resembles the opening of her *Qingpingyue-year after year* (清平乐•年年雪里), which begins like this: "year after year, in the snow, I have put the plum blossoms in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> My translation from Chinese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> My translation from Chinese.
my hair and been intoxicated...."93

In terms of expression, rhetorical devices like repetition and end rhyme are also imitated in some Kimo poems, such as "I Lack" (Ward, 2008b, p. 62). The poem reads as follows:

A heavy job lays on my back, I lack,

I lack, O God, how I lack.

That's why my poor head aches!

How I wish I could regain my spirit,

My child; run and jump, and freely smile.

Recovering my heart, my inward child.

The phoneme /ack/ recurs in "back, lack, lack, lack", forming an end rhyme for the first stanza. And /ail/ recurs in "child, smile, child", with one end rhyme for the second stanza. These rhetorical devices are employed quite dexterously and many a time in Li Qingzhao's *Ci*, such as the first stanza of *Shengshengman*, *Tianzicaisangzibanana trees* (添字采桑子), and *Linjiangxian* (临江仙) and the last stanza of *Suzhongqing* (诉衷情). To be specific, *Shengshengman* starts with "search, search, seek, seek, cold, cold, lonely, lonely".<sup>94</sup> *Tianzicaisangzi* (添字采桑子) begins with "Who planted a banana tree in front of the window? Its shade fills the central courtyard. Its shade fills the central courtyard. Leaf after leaf, heart after heart...dripping leaf to leaf, through a steady drizzle. Dripping leaf to leaf, through a steady drizzle (Egan, 2019, p. 149)." Meanwhile *Linjiangxian* (临江仙) opens with "Deep, the deep courtyard, how deep is it (Egan, 2019, p.125)?" *Suzhongqing* (诉衷情) closes with "voices stilled, silent, a lingering, clinging moon, jade green screen hanging; crush some more petals, stir up some more fragrance, while away some more time (Djao, 2010, p.127)".<sup>95</sup>

Imitation also includes taking Li Qingzhao's themes to generate new poems, either without or rarely using her images. A typical case in point is "Autumn Love Thoughts" (Ward, 2008b, p. 35). According to the author, it is inspired by *Shengshengman*. It imitates the elegiac theme from the Chinese *Ci*, though the content, structure, and images are quite different. Similarly, "Wood Surrounded Springs" (Ward, 2008b, p. 130) barely takes any images from Li Qingzhao's *Wulingchun*, but just imitates the theme of grief in spring and ends with frustration at the deadlock in writing.

Imitation is also seen in borrowing images to create new Kimo poems. A case in point can be found in "Perfumed Garden of Spring" (Ward, 2008b, p. 78-79). The Kimo trio poem just takes the images "plum tree" and "pale moon" from the original Chinese and expresses the grief for the plum's vacancy in the flower garden, the search for a plum tree and the careful plantation. In contrast, the Chinese *Ci Mantingfang* (满庭 芳 • 小阁藏春) pities the fate of plum blossoms in poor weather and extols their spirit and grace.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> My translation from Chinese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> My translation from Chinese.

 $<sup>^{95}</sup>$  This research chooses different translations for these Chinese *Ci* just based on the criteria that the translations keep the most of Chinese syntactical structure and rhetorical devices to exemplify the closeness of rhetorical devices employed in Kimo poems with the original Chinese texts.

A combination of adaptation and imitation or different kinds of imitation sometimes exist in a single poem, such as "Drunk Like But Never Being So" (Ward, 2008b, p. 56-57). Taking the imagery of "chill" "wine" and "west wind" from Li Qingzhao's Ci Zuihuayin, the poem describes a wakeful night and ends with a slight adaptation. The last two lines are adapted into "Now when the West wind flaps through—I am more frail than even you could know." This is inspired by Li Qingzhao's line: "When the west wind furls up the curtains, I'm frailer than the yellow chrysanthemum."96 Similarly, the Kimo trio poem "Intoxicated Under The Shadows" (Ward, 2008b, p. 66) adapts the above Chinese into "I'm more flexible than the rose flowers—when west winds stir the curtains". It also imitates the theme of melancholy from the above Ci, and the image of "drinking" to bewail her senior years and coming death. A combination of imitation in terms of syntactical structure, theme and way of expression is seen in "So Long Sixty-Four" (Ward, 2008b, p. 105). In the first stanza of the poem, the line "I am old, too old to do my hair" follows the syntactical structure of Li Qingzhao's Shengzhazi-year after year mentioned above. The last stanza imitates the syntactical structure of her Suzhongqing. The poem takes the theme of grieving over aging, and employs end rhyme and repetition, both of which are very typical of Li Qingzhao's Ci.

Further biographical poems are also found in Ward (2008b), such as "Driven From My Home" (p. 53), "See Why I...Li Qingzhao Smile" (p. 101). The former narrates what happened to Li Qingzhao and her husband after the Jurchen invasion; the latter focuses on the bright side of her life, such as her compatible marriage, poetic accomplishments and fame.

#### D. "Stones and Bronzes" in *The Magic Whip* (Wang, 2003)

While the poems above offer a glimpse of Li Qingzhao's life, Wang Ping's *The Magic Whip* (2003) offers a more nuanced and complete account, based on *The Postscript to Jinshilu*. In addition to the poem collection, Wang dedicates one chapter, "Stones and Bronzes" to a prose text in which the writer's imagination draws on the historical facts of Li Qingzhao's life. Wang starts with the first-person perspective "I" to imagine Li Qingzhao herself in conversation with her dead husband Zhao Mingcheng on her fiftieth birthday. The conversation permits a panoramic view of Li Qingzhao's life, from her early girlhood to her enviable marriage, to her lifelong trauma, the invasion of Jurchen, the loss of her homeland, the sudden death of her husband, the drama of her second marriage and its aftermath. Despite this, she still finds a way to blossom in poetry.

The chapter interlaces the author's retranslations of five pieces of Li Qingzhao's poems with her creative prose and poems. The collage between the translations of ancient poems and the recreation of English modern poems and prose allows Wang Ping to be a time-traveling translator and author. The book has won many awards and caused a sensation in America. The positive feedback, to some extent, still reflects Anglophone readers' reception of Li Qingzhao, though Wang Ping was born in China and immigrated to the US in her adulthood. More significantly, the prose foregrounds how

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> My translation from Chinese.

a Chinese American, as a bilingual and bi-cultural author-translator, has understood and received Li Qingzhao. This text is the first and most complete narrative prose-fiction based on Li Qingzhao's life story and the first piece of creative writing in the Anglophone world to openly model Li Qingzhao as an independent woman with a temperament that defied the gender expectations of her era. The prose portrays her as an independent woman who experienced both romance and tragedy and was the equal of her husband and any other men of her time.

#### E."After Li Ch'ing-Chao" in Makeup on Empty Space (Waldman, 1984)

The poem "After Li Ch'ing-Chao" by Anne Waldman (1984) opens with a domestic scene in which the narrator is "drinking strong *geng mai* tea" when her hairpin slips to the floor. In her "slithery robe", she wants to "telephone beloved far off", introducing themes of longing and connection, juxtaposed with the image of meditators sleeping under a new moon and the serene landscape of snow-coated lake and mountains. The poem then shifts to a more introspective tone as the speaker reflects on her own experiences and struggles, particularly her time spent at a seminary and the toll it has taken on her appearance. Applying creams and painting cheeks highlights the speaker's efforts to maintain a facade of youthfulness and vitality, perhaps in contrast to the inner turmoil she is experiencing. The poem then delves into deeper existential questions, as the speaker grapples with the concepts of impermanence and non-existence. These philosophical musings are juxtaposed with a raw, physical desire for intimacy and connection, as the speaker longs to be reunited with her lover.

The content and historical context of this poem do not directly resemble any of Li Qingzhao's poems, yet the themes and emotions and even some images resonate with her work. For instance, both poets explore the motif of longing and love for their loved ones, one by telephoning, the other by writing letters. Both poets engage in self-reflection and introspection by drinking tea or in Li Qingzhao's case sometimes drinking wine. Both poets employ the description of a cold exterior environment (snow) to heighten the speaker's desolation and loneliness. Both poets lament the impermanence and transience of life by pinpointing their aging faces and a reluctance to dress up as before. Though the poem is written from a contemporary Western perspective with a much bolder confession of desire and longing for her lover, it acknowledges and pays homage to Li Qingzhao's cultural legacy. The title of the poem directly references Li Qingzhao, suggesting a cross-cultural dialogue and appreciation of her contributions to literature.

To conclude, an analysis of creative writing pieces inspired by Li Qingzhao in journals and books, reflects varying degrees of her influence and the reception of her works by artists. These range from allusions to the poet and her work, to biographical poems written for her, to imitations of Li Qingzhao's works in terms of syntactical structure, expression, imagery, and theme. Certain creative pieces imitate Li Qingzhao's writing techniques by juxtaposing poem fragments and images; adaptation and direct quotation; and the choice of resonating motifs. Sometimes several of the above influences can be seen in one literary production.

#### 6.4.3 Other Forms of Creative Responses

Apart from the above overt creative poems and proses as the reception and impact of

Li Qingzhao, some less conspicuous influences might also be found in other texts. For example, Zhong (2003, p.160) thinks "The Widow's Lament in Springtime" by William Carlos Williams imitates themes of Chinese poems because the lamentation of a lady in her boudoir is a rare theme and tradition in Anglophone love poems. He uses flowers, trees, and grasses to reflect a widow's feelings. According to Zhong (2003, p.160), its theme and imagery share Li Qingzhao's *Shengshengman* and *Yijianmei*. Though without direct reference to Li Qingzhao, Williams' poem perhaps reflects her subtle and less obvious influence. Likewise, beyond the aforementioned published poems and proses influenced by Li Qingzhao discussed in Sections 6.4.1 and 6.4.2, her subtle impact in the Anglophone world can also be observed through other forms of creative responses, such as adapted novels, musical performances and video games.

#### A. Adapted Novels

The adaptation of Li Qingzhao's persona in English-language fiction by Western authors reveals her profound impact. For instance, the central female protagonist Lin Shan in the novel *River of Stars* (2013) by Guy Gavriel Kay is modelled on Li Qingzhao, alongside other remodelled historical figures from the *Song* Dynasty, such as Su Shi brothers and Yue Fei (2013, p. 635).

In this historical fantasy, Li Qingzhao's biography and some of her poems are woven into a dramatised narrative of "Jing Kang Change" (靖康之变) in the Song Dynasty. Lin Shan in this fiction is portrayed as a multifaceted and compelling figure whose journey serves as a lens through which to explore gender dynamics, intellectual freedom and individual agency in a patriarchal society. Because of her father's upbringing, Lin Shan defies traditional gender norms by writing poetry and engaging with other intellectuals in the Song Dynasty. In addition, she confronts social taboos and challenges powers by participating in several political conspiracies and provoking the prestigious male poet Lu Chen and even the emperor. Yet her exceptional perception and sensitivity also enable her to navigate various relationships and evolve into a resilient woman. She rises up with courage and strength to face the exile of her father, her assassination, the betrayal of her husband, the sacking of her capital, the fleeing of the emperor, the appeasement of the court, and the imprisonment of the General Commander Ren Daiyan (her lover). In the end, she displays remarkable courage by wielding a sword to confront an invading Altai soldier, exemplifying individual agency and power in adversity.

The front cover of *River of Stars* declares it "The Number One International Bestseller" alongside a quotation from the *Washington Post*, describing it as "[a] major accomplishment, the work of a master novelist." Such a positive review indicates that historical fiction inspired by Chinese poets like Li Qingzhao can be favourably received within the Anglophone world.

#### **B.** Musicals

Apart from books and journals, Li Qingzhao's influence has also reached other cultural modes such as musical performances. For example, back in April 1989, *Newsday* (1989) reported that Chiang Ching presented a contemporary dance theatre production inspired by Li Qingzhao at the Guggenheim Museum, New York, featuring interpretations and readings of different renditions of her poems. Then in March 1993, Chiang Ching again

performed the new "Variations on a Poetess's Lament" in Taipei Theatre with music, lighting, and costume. The New York Times (1993) noted that the opening poem was from Li Qingzhao's "Every Sound, Lentemento", which was uttered by the actress in both English and Chinese. Later the same year in July, Chen Shizheng brought a Mongolian musical performance to the US. One of the pieces of music, "Autumn Sound" used Li Qingzhao's Ci, according to the newspaper The Santa Fe New Mexican (1994). In 2003, "The Silken Phoenix" was performed in Boston. The performance was a feast of music, poetry and drama. The Boston Globe (2003) claimed that the narrative drama fleshed out three Asian female roles, one of which was Li Qingzhao. The show was later again performed at the University of Rhode Island (no date) in August. 2005. In Victoria, Canada, the Maritime Museum of British Columbia hosted musical shows featuring works inspired by Li Qingzhao. These included "Li-Ching Chao Madrigals" by Rudolph Komorous, composed in 1985, and "Handmade Proverbs" by Toru Takemitsu in 2009, according to Victoria News (2009). Likewise, Yehudi Wyner's composition (no date), "The Second Madrigal: Voices of Women" composed in 1999, draws inspiration from texts found in A Book of Luminous Things; an international anthology of poetry edited by Czeslaw Miłosz (1996), mentioned in Chapter Four of this study. The texts include a translation by Rexroth of Li Ch'ing-chao's poem "Hopelessness". This musical piece has been performed four times between 2008 and 2012 in the United States, featuring soloists and sinfonietta, or solo voices with 1-6 players. Moreover, a live performance of Li Qingzhao's poem recitation was held by East Asian Studies Program, at Princeton University (no date) on Feb. 25th, 2020. Performers created music with Li Qingzhao's English retranslations by Egan (2019) through traditional Chinese musical instruments Pipa, Ruan and Guqin, complete with modern videos, electronics and lighting. One aim of the performance was to preserve the recitation tradition of Changzhou, which was once widespread across China, but is now in danger of being lost.

## C. Video Games

Surprisingly, Li Qingzhao's impact has been observed in animated games. Launched globally, the game "Li Qingzhao Invades!" on Crash Fever Lore Wiki (no date) features many famous poets such as Li Bai, Du Fu, Xin Qiji, Bai Juyi as the main characters. The story includes a confrontation between two branches (*Yin* and *Yang*) with respective poets taking sides. More information may be found on the website: https://cf-lore.fandom.com/wiki/Li\_Qingzhao\_Invades!#Quest\_Overview

# 6.5 Conclusion

In summary, paratexts surrounding the four French-English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works discussed above reveal that these (re)translations might be driven by complex socio-cultural contexts, such as French cultural influence, American Poem Renaissance, San Franciso Renaissance and the second wave of Feminism, or market niche, not to mention a lack of access to proper Chinese source texts. A micro-textual analysis of these (re)translations reveals certain inadequacies that could potentially compromise Li Qingzhao's literary legacy. Some of these (re)translations deviate so significantly from original Chinese source texts that scholars like Li and Ji (2014)

consider them poetic creations rather than faithful translations. However, their significance should also be recognized in terms of widening the reach of Li Qingzhao's influence and introducing Chinese culture to new audiences, potentially sparking interest among followers.

Beyond Li Qingzhao's English-retranslated dataset, her more in-depth reception could be found in artists as receivers, such as their creative responses evident in published poems and prose appearing in both print and digital journals and book chapters. They are inspired by the motifs, imagery, or writing techniques found in her works, and sometimes draw from her biography. Furthermore, creative adaptations extend to novels, musicals and online games, reflecting the breadth of her impact in diverse cultural and artistic contexts. The creative responses mentioned above in different modes in the target culture showcase how Li Qingzhao's works have transcended boundaries of time, space, culture, society and language, and have been received beyond translators as readers to artists in the Anglophone target culture. They exemplify how her works have exercised influence and been exploited and merged with the target culture, bridging the cultural gaps. This might be seen as evidence for the process of "transculturalization" in Hajj (2019, p. 921), as mentioned by Naji Queijan, who emphasized that "translated literary works would not only aid in the transculturalization process but also in the cultivation and enrichment of the target cultures." According to Laviosa, et al. (2017, p.7), translation transmits some cultural forms of the source language to the target language system, which then are absorbed and appropriated by the target language culture, resulting in a new cultural creation.

Furthermore, analysis within and beyond the dataset illuminates not only the evolving reception of Li Qingzhao's works in the Anglophone world, but also the intricate cultural power dynamics through languages between Chinese and European cultures, perhaps even nations. Within the dataset, the few early French-English translations signify the peripheral position of Chinese culture in the Anglophone world, in contrast to the significant number of Chinese-English retranslations analysed in Chapter Four. The proliferation of Chinese-English retranslations serves as an indication that the prestige of French has been supplanted by the diffusion of Anglophone culture and the growing impact of Chinese culture. This contrast within the dataset signifies the development of Chinese cultural impact, with Li Qingzhao as a representative, in the Anglophone world, while also reflecting the residual and waning influence of French culture on American literature. These dynamics reaffirm Venuti's (2013, p.107) claim: "Retranslations reflect changes in the values and institutions of the translating culture, but they can also produce such changes by inspiring new ways of reading and appreciating the source texts." Beyond the dataset, Li Qingzhao's works have been integrated into the target culture and inspired various forms of cultural creation. This study of the (re)translation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works within and beyond the dataset subtly charts the translation history between Chinese and English over the last century.

# **Chapter Seven Conclusions**

The aim of this chapter is multi-fold. Initially, it is to revisit the research questions proposed in Chapter One. This is followed by a comprehensive recapitulation of the major contributions of this project, to shed light on retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works. Additionally, it discusses the research limitations and suggests future research directions to address unresolved issues identified in this research.

## 7.1 Revisiting the Research Questions

The central research question is framed within the context of Li Qingzhao's works (re)translated into English in the Anglophone West, aiming to explore the forces shaping the poet's reception and her potential impact. This research captures (re)translators' double roles in cross-cultural communication, namely as both "readers/ receivers of the source text and at the same time also authors/transmitters of the target text" (Cadera and Walsh, 2022, p. 13). Through this perspective of translators' double roles and taking the translating and publishing team as the primary receivers and artists as alternative receivers, several research questions set out in Chapter One are subsequently revisited and addressed.

# **RQ1:** How did the (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works develop over the past one hundred years in mainland China and the Anglophone West?

This research question is explored in Chapter Three and Chapter Four. Chapter Three-Literature Review reveals that around sixty English (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works have been published in mainland China by about thirty mainland translators since the 1980s. Over ninety (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works by over sixty translators have been published or distributed in the Anglophone West, resulting in approximately ten accessible complete English collections. The total volume of her (re)translations remains a modest number contrasted with over a thousand Chinese books and over 7000 academic publications relevant to Li Qingzhao and her works found in Chinese Chaoxing E-library and CNKI database. Inadequate attention has been paid to researching her English (re)translations. Existing studies revolve around only a few famous translators, based on limited samples paying little attention to Li Qingzhao's retranslation and reception. Most studies employ dominant descriptive and qualitative methods through micro-textual analysis, while a few studies use quantitative or mixed methods to conduct macro-and-micro investigations through both texts and paratexts. This research seeks to address this under-explored area and contributes to the field accordingly.

# **RQ2:** How is Li Qingzhao received through (re)translations in a macroperspective?

This question is addressed in Chapter Four and part of Chapter Six. Following the selection process, a dataset comprising 95 (re)translations is established and scrutinized from multiple angles. By charting a (re)translation history of Li Qingzhao's works, the process of her reception is presented through translating and publishing agents as primary receivers in a macro-contextual lens.

**First**, the major contributions are American and British publishers affiliated to or supported by academic institutions, such as Harvard University Press, Columbia University Press and Cambridge University Press, etc., or smaller presses with financial sponsors, or prestigious publishing corporations, such as New Directions, Penguin and Routledge, etc. Other agents from other Anglophone countries make relatively limited contributions. That means Li Qingzhao has received relatively more recognition among academic institutions in the US and UK, and less recognition in the public sector, by readers, reviewers and literary critics. The publishing data also demonstrates that the volume of her retranslations has notably increased since the 1960s. The major recipient countries to publish Li Qingzhao's (re)translations in major periods could be affected by the acceptance of socio-cultural trends, such as Feminism and American Poem Renaissance, etc., or the diplomatic relationship between China and the target country, economic and historical factors, etc. Those contextual factors might also be related to a few French-English (re)translations in the dataset.

**Second**, the investigation into (re)translators uncovered that over sixty (re)translators as readers from a variety of backgrounds have contributed to Li Qingzhao's (re)translations, as seen in the paratextual material accompanying the retranslations, yet there is no single translation that endures. Rexroth, a poet-translator, emerges as the most popular translator of Li Qingzhao in the 20<sup>th</sup> century and Owen, a sinologist, assumes prominence in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. The investigation into the popularity of translators and their diverse readership reveals that the reception of (re)translations correlates with the volume of the translator's output, socio-historical factors and endorsement from renowned publishers. Less significant, are factors such as the translators' subjectivity may exert only a limited influence on the reception.

Thirdly, examining the source materials reveals that the reception of source culture might affect retranslations. For instance, retranslations might be prompted by the use of different source materials or the revision and supplementation of the same source material, as demonstrated by works like Egan (2019), Fuller (2017) and Egan (2013), or the interest in previously untranslated source materials, exemplified in works such as Owen (1996), Idema and Grant (2004), Rexroth and Chung (1979) and Lee (2018). Additionally, personal connections, such as a shared surname, may serve as a motivating factor for retranslation efforts as evidenced by Lee (2018). The four French-English (re)translations resulted from the unavailability of Chinese source texts in Anglophone spheres, the niche of the market, or the prevailing prestige accorded to French within the global cultural hierarchy which encouraged translating teams to use it as a source text. The above illustration suggests retranslations are conditioned by the reception of source materials and the broader source culture.

**Fourthly,** by examining (re)translated texts in the dataset, Chapter Four identifies the most frequently included and (re)translated pieces, highlighting a list of the top ten *Ci* and noting that certain *Shi* and prose even exceed some *Ci* in terms of popularity. The list demonstrates some similarities and differences in preference between Chinese scholars and Anglophone translators as readers. For instance, they share a preference for certain source *Ci* featuring traditional sentimental motifs of female loss, sorrow and

solitude, such as "Shengshengman", "Wulingchun", and "Zuihuayin". This could indicate the influence of Chinese reception on the Anglophone world, but it could also reflect the fact that these are universal themes and feelings. Other source texts, encompassing both *Ci* genre, *Shi* and essays, diverge from conventional motifs and explore themes of masculinity, chivalry and patriotism. For example, "Yujia'ao-the sky", "Xiarijueju" and "The Postscript to Jinshilu" are also recurrently chosen. These favoured source texts elucidate Anglophone translators' aesthetics and their predilections as well as their reception of Li Qingzhao's works as readers. These preferences have filtered foreign authors' works and may also affect readers' perception later on.

The uneven distribution of attention on Li Qingzhao's works in the overall dataset was contrasted with more balanced attention in the sub-dataset of female-centric monographs. Specifically, the sub-dataset of monographs focusing on global women, exhibits a greater abundance of (re)translations featuring newly introduced source materials, whereas monographs dedicated to Chinese women, tend to prioritize retranslations of frequently chosen source texts. That discrepancy reflects a slight variation in reception between the two kinds of female-themed monographs, with the international publications displaying a broader inclusiveness towards Li Qingzhao's diverse literary contributions while the others adopt a more reserved and exclusive approach.

In the sub-dataset of anthologies, the retranslations of Li Qingzhao's *Ci* genre are predominant, focusing on a narrow range of works and largely obscuring the breadth and diversity of her literary contributions. This contrasts with the source text choices in female-centric monographs, suggesting potential biases in editorial decisions influenced by male-dominated editor-authors and an underrepresentation of women in the translating/publishing teams. The hierarchy of preferred source texts for (re)translation in anthologies closely mirrors the top ten list observed across the entire dataset, implying that anthologies exert a strong shaping force on Li Qingzhao's reception in the Anglophone world.

Last but not least, a detailed analysis of the presentation of Li Qingzhao's (re)translations against those of her peers (11 Chinese poets from the *Song* Dynasty) in anthologies provides a synchronic and diachronic reflection of her prominence. Synchronically, Li Qingzhao's works are (re)translated and anthologized most frequently, securing her unrivalled position among Chinese poets of the *Song* Dynasty in Anglophone anthologies. However, the proportion of her works (re)translated into English contrasted with that of her peers fluctuates diachronically. Prior to the 1960s, English (re)translations of her works were marginalized in terms of quantity and scholarly interest, indicative of her peripheral position in the early years. Subsequently, there was a notable increase in the volume of retranslations, especially during the 1970s to 1980s, coinciding with the second wave of the women's movement and suggesting her growing reputation. Later, her representation in retranslated works is moderate, yet she was included in a larger number of anthologies, signifying her enduring impact. The publication of five English collections of Li Qingzhao's works in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, including Ward's (2008b) edition, collectively represents a significant volume of

translated work, comparable to that of all collections published throughout the entire 20<sup>th</sup> century. This underscores the sustained scholarly interest and engagement with her works in contemporary times.

The above macro-contextual investigation suggests that reception of Li Qingzhao's works have transitioned from early marginalization to broader recognition and increased prominence through (re)translations by translating and publishing agents as primary receivers. The shifts in her visibility, as evidenced by the number of published works and her comparative standing among her contemporaries over the past 100 years, might be related to the influence of various contextual factors on retranslations, such as socio-cultural trends, political ties, economic considerations and historical contexts. Through these retranslations, her literary image and reception in the Anglophone world are moulded by successive translators. To be specific, despite limitations in representing her literary breadth and the lack of female editorial/authorial input, certain pieces of her works enjoy lasting popularity through retranslations in publications across different thematic contexts. However, no canonical translation has emerged, as no single translator has sustained enduring popularity across the last 100 years. The retranslation of her works is also guided by the acceptance of variations within Chinese source texts and beyond. Consequently, this macro-contextual investigation illustrates a reciprocal relationship between the retranslation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works.

# **RQ3:** How is Li Qingzhao received through (re)translations from microperspective?

This inquiry is explored in Chapter Five and the first part of Chapter Six.

Chapter Five scrutinized the distinct micro-peritextual attributes of ten English collections of Li Qingzhao's works published across the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries, shedding light on why Rexroth emerges as the most prominent retranslator in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, as found in Chapter Four and how those peritexts potentially influence the reception of Li Qingzhao's works. The examination includes titles, subtitles, cover design, blurbs, contents pages and organization, and notes of ten English collections. Amongst these, Rexroth and Chung's (1979) rendition emerges as a standout example, featuring meticulous titling, a captivating cover and inventive presentation, alongside an engaging blurb and vividly domesticated notes. Even those notes that have been overly eroticized can be said to cater to the socio-cultural trends in the last century or be influenced by translators' socio-cultural contexts. These peritexts could both entice readers and fashion their perceptions of Li Qingzhao. However, there exists a risk of overreach in notes, potentially resulting in readers' as well as some subsequent translators' misinterpretation of Li Oingzhao, her works and occasionally broader Chinese cultural facets. These deliberate interventions in notes could not only obscure Li Qingzhao's literary depth and breadth but also diminish her contribution and misrepresent her personal identity and that of Chinese women and culture more broadly. The analysis of peritextual elements also uncovers an interaction between retranslations. For example, certain subsequent retranslations, display both emulation of and differentiation from prior translations, particularly regarding the strategies of domestication and foreignization.

The micro-investigation also includes textual analysis of works by Whithall (1918), Rexroth (1956), Barrows (1977) and Nienhauser (2000), the English renditions derived from French translations, which are also termed "indirect translations" in a narrower sense by Pięta (2021, p. 113). The textual examination of these (re)translations unveils some issues, such as translation inaccuracies or departures from the original Chinese source material, particularly in the translation of proper names and certain images. These deficiencies obscured Li Qingzhao's literary achievements and Chinese cultural authenticity more broadly. This may explain the limited number of French-English indirect translations in contrast with the plethora of direct Chinese-English retranslations.

# **RQ4:** Beyond the retranslation dataset, how does she exert her literary impact on the target culture?

This inquiry is addressed in the second part of Chapter Six. Apart from the aforementioned dataset in Chapter Four, Li Qingzhao's resonance and reception can be further assessed through the lens of creative engagements by artists as alternative receivers emerging within the target linguistic framework listed in Chapter Six. Drawing inspiration from the literary legacy of Li Qingzhao, creative responses have manifested in various forms, spanning from poems published in print and digital journals, poems and proses featured in book chapters to an entire volume of creative responses crafted by Ward (2008b). Li Qingzhao's literary impact in these creative responses is evident through allusions to her life and works, imitation of her imagery and themes, use of her writing techniques, a juxtaposition of her poem fragments and images, adaptations and quotations, and echoes of her motifs. The expansive portrayal of her reception also transcends conventional mediums to encompass multi-modal expressions, such as adapted novels, musicals and video games. These creative engagements within the recipient culture serve as a testament to Li Qingzhao's deeper impact in the Anglophone world and attest to her integration into the cultural landscape of the recipient society. Taking the timeline of those creations into consideration, it suggests the rising prominence of Li Qingzhao in the new century and the widening reach of Chinese culture.

**RQ5:** What could be suggested to increase the visibility and engagement with Li Qingzhao's works and enhance her reception in the West?

# 7.2 Proposals for Retranslations and Circulation of Li Qingzhao's

#### Works

To increase the visibility and engagement with Li Qingzhao's works and improve her reception, it is essential to confront not only the previously identified issues but also the transformations brought about by the digital age, which impact both readership and modes of dissemination. Notably, shifts in reading habits among audiences have emerged, with an increasing amount of time spent reading on digital devices. This trend has engendered the fragmentation and superficiality of reading experiences, highlighting the need for a more immersive and multimodal reading experiences, as ascertained by Long (2020, p.123). These transformations advocate for a departure

from conventional static linguistic forms to potentially "inter/intra/multilingual, intertextual, intermodal and intermedial" practice, as highlighted by Spoturno (2020, p.79). Thus, this section offers several recommendations for the retranslation of Li Qingzhao's works and their subsequent circulation to accommodate these shifts in the new era, move with time, and address the issues revealed in Chapters Four to Six and mentioned in Section 7.1.

Firstly, addressing the uneven distribution of retranslations across regions delineated in Chapter Four would involve broadening the reach of retranslations of Li Qingzhao's work to cover more countries and regions, particularly targeting underrepresented areas such as New Zealand, Australia, Canada and other English-speaking nations where such translations are currently scarce. Furthermore, exploring the possibility of multilingual retranslations could further amplify her global impact. With the support of the "Chinese Cultural Going Abroad" policy, increased Chinese governmental funding of retranslation endeavours for Li Qingzhao's works could attract more retranslators, as Chapter Four reveals that a considerable number of retranslations are funded by public organizations from the US/UK/China. Additionally, retranslators are advised to forge partnerships with university publishers and prestigious international entities to bolster readership and assist wider circulation of her literary oeuvre, akin to the strategies employed by current Anglophone agents of retranslation outlined in Chapter Four.

Secondly, in light of the burgeoning creative endeavours sparked by Li Qingzhao's literary legacy, as detailed in Chapter Six, retranslations could extend beyond conventional printed formats, and venture into diverse multimedia platforms. For instance, in the last century, the lyrics of the renowned symphony "Das Lied von der Erde" by Austrian composer Gustav Mahler are drawn from some famous Tang Shi of Li Bai and Wang Wei. Similarly, Austrian composer Anton von Webern and French composer Albert Roussel have also set some Tang Shi to music (Yelin, 2011). Such instances exemplify the potential for retranslations of Li Qingzhao's works to be disseminated through analogous channels. These could also include web-based presentations, videos, live streams, condensed film adaptations, and even interactive gaming experiences. Ideally, an online bilingual corpus should be established, comprising recognized English collections of Li Qingzhao's works alongside their Chinese source texts. This platform would allow audiences to compare multiple translations simultaneously with the original texts. Long suggests (2020, p. 121) the use of hyperlinks to restructure the text, organize the information into distinct layers, and incorporate non-verbal modes as supplementary elements to verbal translation. The development of mini-interactive gaming applications could enable users to engage with retranslations more interestingly. These may include features like fun dubbing for retranslations, fun translation using given literally-translated words, fun dance match incorporating retranslations, and fun picture matching or illustration or Chinese ink painting based on retranslations. Hence, general readers could become more acquainted with these Chinese texts through their participation in the translation process, thereby crafting their own personalized retranslations based on their own interpretations. A similar interactive initiative was undertaken by "The 85 Project".<sup>97</sup>

Alternatively, retranslations could be brought to life through live performances, theatrical productions, musicals, dances or even presented in immersive 4D environments employing virtual reality (VR) technology, showcased in museums, art centres, and bookstores. These live performances could also be recorded and transformed into videos, complete with established retranslation transcripts tailored for various audiences. The videos could feature individuals showcasing their talents by reading bilingual texts, singing with accompanying background music, or performing traditional Chinese musical instruments simultaneously. Moreover, if feasible, retranslation videos be disseminated on digital platforms and social networks such as TikTok, YouTube, Meta (Facebook), and X (Twitter).

Primarily, it is crucial to ensure that the multimedia renditions mentioned above allow open access for interaction with the retranslations. This may involve enabling comment sections on web pages or facilitating comments within videos. Such measures establish a precedent and offer direct channels for retranslators and general readers to engage in dialogue. These feedback mechanisms lay the groundwork for subsequent revisions or retranslations.

Thirdly, based on the findings from Chapter Four, no single retranslation enjoys enduring favour among all readers over time. Hence, various versions of retranslations, employing diverse forms and techniques tailored to different readerships, could be pursued. Furthermore, the significance of paratextual elements in presenting retranslations to diverse audiences is underscored, as elucidated in Chapter Five.

In the case of printed editions, a target-oriented approach for Anglophone children might involve incorporating more visual components to captivate their interest. Simplifying and localizing Li Qingzhao's poetry to resemble Western nursery rhymes could enhance accessibility and memorability, drawn from the reception study of Bob Dylan's songs in bilingual picture books by Xi (2020). Additionally, bilingual retranslations geared towards general readers may strike a balance between foreignization and domestication to facilitate comprehension, and while allowing the readers to read both the source and target text simultaneously. Both types of publications may consider elements such as cover design, titling, and blurbs to attract readers and encourage further exploration. In particular, eye-catching covers and proper titles with both Chinese and Western feature may help capture readers' attention and appropriate blurbs might also promote marketing the retranslation. Retranslations targeting academic audiences may prioritize linguistic sophistication and cultural depth through an authentic bilingual approach enriched with foreignization. Emphasis may be placed on information delivery and maintaining academic rigour, with paratextual elements serving as supplementary aids. Additionally, more efforts involve ensuring accessibility for visually impaired individuals, including the availability of large-font editions and audiobooks. To facilitate reader engagement and feedback, QR codes could

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup>Cross-Cultural Transfers: The 85 Project (no date). Available at: https://www.85bawu.com/About.aspx (Accessed: 29th Mar 2024)

be incorporated into the text, allowing readers to provide input or access audio recordings simultaneously.

Fourthly, as elucidated in Chapter Four, the reception of retranslations is not solely dictated by the translators' backgrounds. Therefore, it is advisable to involve professional translators from diverse backgrounds proficient in both Chinese and English. This could include sinologists, poet-translators, or academic translators. Both solo and collaborative translation efforts are encouraged, with a particular invitation extended to female translators and those well-versed in Chinese culture. Their involvement could help mitigate the patriarchization and Orientalist stereotypes identified in previous retranslations examined in Chapter Five.

Lastly, based on the insights gleaned from Chapter Four, a notable disparity emerges in the retranslation of Li Qingzhao's works. Some of Li Qingzhao's essays and *Shi* are overlooked or obscured by sparse translation, while some *Ci* are repeatedly translated over time. To address this imbalance, it is imperative to broaden the scope of retranslation efforts to encompass all facets of Li Qingzhao's oeuvre, extending beyond her *Ci*. This inclusive approach encompasses her essays and diverse poetic forms, thereby presenting a more comprehensive portrayal of her artistic prowess within the Anglophone sphere. Such measures aim to counteract the risk of stereotypical generalizations and foster a more nuanced understanding of Li Qingzhao's literary legacy.

# 7.3 Major Contributions

Although the dynamics between the retranslation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works cannot be completely and exhaustively unravelled by this project, it is still possible to identify the following contributions:

In terms of research materials, Chapter Three of this project meticulously assembles all available English (re)translation publications of Li Qingzhao's works in mainland China and the Anglophone West from 1918 to 2021, and recognizes the contribution by many translators overlooked in the only relevant doctoral thesis in mainland China (Li, 2005b). By compiling the most extensive and current dataset to date, this research presents a comprehensive overview of Li Qingzhao's (re)translation trajectory in both mainland China and the Anglophone West, a gap left unaddressed by the latest dissertation on Li Qingzhao (Yang, 2022). This dataset could pave the way for conducting further studies on English retranslations of her works.

In terms of research methodologies, this project has employed mixed methods, an integration of both quantitative and qualitative methodologies to conduct thorough macro and micro-analyses of both texts and paratexts. Chapter Four adopts straightforward quantitative techniques, such as summation, averaging, frequency analysis and percentage calculation, to unveil the macroscopic view of the interaction between (re)translations and reception of Li Qingzhao's works. This entails discerning dominant periods and countries of (re)translation publication, primary source materials selected for (re)translation in general, and subtle shifts observed in female monographs and anthologies, and the leading translators involved. These methods are further applied to conduct a comparative assessment of the relative visibility of Li Qingzhao and her

contemporaries both diachronically and synchronically within anthologies.

Qualitative methods, such as textual criticism and case studies are also used in Chapters Five and Six to offer more nuanced insights into textual and paratextual elements within English collections, French-English (re)tanslations and creative responses. Notably, prior literature on Li Qingzhao's works has not engaged with methodologies as exhaustive and comprehensive as those incorporated in this project. These methodologies not only augment the research approach to studying Li Qingzhao's retranslations, but also set a precedent for research on classical Chinese poets.

In terms of theoretical framework, this project advances the understanding of the retranslation phenomenon within the realm of Chinese-English classical poetry. By investigating the retranslation of Li Qingzhao's works, it challenges the conventional Retranslation Hypothesis predominantly formulated within European linguistic contexts and offers fresh insights into the motives behind retranslation through the analysis of paratextual elements. This analysis, in turn, sheds light on the interplay among various retranslations. Moreover, the exploration of the correlation between (re)translation and the reception of Li Qingzhao's works contributes to the growing body of literature in this area within a European context, laying a solid groundwork for future investigations into the reception of Chinese-English classical poetry within the Anglophone sphere.

In terms of the poet and her literary corpus, this research offers an in-depth exploration of the (re)translation history of Li Qingzhao's works across various formats. This depiction serves to elucidate her genuine reception by translators as readers and publishing team as initial receivers in the Anglophone world over the past century. The investigation into (re)translation and her reception not only aids in unravelling her identity and her impact in the Anglophone domain, but also brings about some observations of potential issues within the (re)translation and reception of her works, neither of which have been discussed thoroughly by previous studies. To name a few, Chapter Four exposes instances of under-representation of the poet and her works, including imbalanced retranslation efforts, the marginalization of certain texts, and the minorization of her stature relative to her contemporaries in anthologies during the early 20th century. Chapter Six reveals evident inaccuracies in French-English (re)translations, while Chapter Five highlights misrepresentations of her works stemming from oversimplification, romanticisation, eroticisation and a patriarchal influence in peritextual elements.

In response to the aforementioned concerns, the previous section 7.2 of this research also puts forward specific proposals to promote future retranslation and reception, catering to a diverse target audience and the evolving digital landscape. It emphasizes diversifying and customizing retranslations, as well as fostering interaction between translators and readers. By embracing these varied mediums, retranslations of these ancient works can be rendered more accessible, engaging, and comprehensible to audiences with diverse tastes and preferences. Through these interactive strategies outlined in Section 7.2, both print editions, as well as multimedia formats facilitate an open and dynamic system for translators to engage with readers' feedback, thereby

integrating readers into translation studies. Through the interchange of their perspectives, translators could gain deeper insights into the preferences of readers and adjust in the future, thereby enhancing the reception of retranslations.

In terms of both the breadth and depth of research, this project undertakes a comprehensive examination of the (re)translations of Li Qingzhao's works, encompassing a wide spectrum of publications. It not only explores the overall landscape of Li Qingzhao's (re)translations but also examines their representation across various text types such as anthologies, monographs, collections, and journals in Chapters Four to Six. This approach surpasses previous research endeavours, which often focus on a narrower selection of texts. Moreover, rather than limiting its inquiry solely to Li Qingzhao's Ci, this study extends its scope to encompass her essays and Shi, thereby providing a more holistic analysis of her oeuvre. Beyond merely examining (re)translations from the perspective of translating and publishing team as initial receivers, this project delves into the intricate interplay between (re)translations and the reception as well as the broader impact of the poet on the target culture, particularly through the lens of creative responses inspired by her works in Anglophone contexts. The systematic analysis of creative outputs by artists as alternative receivers across various mediums, including journals, book chapters, and multimedia platforms in Chapter Six sheds new light on the depth and breadth of Li Qingzhao's influence and her reception in target cultures, a facet that has almost been an uncharted territory in scholarly discourse.

Last but not the least, the discussions so far showcase the gradual rising prominence of Li Qingzhao in the Anglophone world over the past century. This evolution began with the introduction of her *Ci* through French-English translation, followed by occasional French-English retranslations, and eventually led to a growing number of Chinese-English retranslations by various retranslators across journals, collections, monographs and anthologies. Her influence also extended to various creative responses within the target culture. This process demonstrates the interaction between (re)translation and reception of Li Qingzhao's works in the past 100 years, which also mirrors the power dynamics between cultures through languages within the Anglophone world in the past 100 years.

From a micro-perspective, the (re)translation of Li Qingzhao's names on covers of (re)translation collections has shifted from Wade-Giles Romanization to Chinese Mandarin, indicating (re)translators' increasing acceptance of Chinese cultural impact, as discussed in Chapter Five. Another micro-level indication of this reception is the involvement of numerous academic publishers and native sinologists with their rising popularity in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, revealed in Chapter Four, suggests the growing academic recognition of her literary heritage and broader Chinese cultural influence in the Anglophone world.

From a macro-perspective, the shift from French-English (re)translations to Chinese-English retranslations showcases the greater accessibility of Chinese literature and a larger audience of Chinese culture. A discernible contrast emerges between the limited number of French-English (re)translations discussed in Chapter Six and the substantial volume of Chinese-English retranslations mentioned in Chapter Four, hinting at complex power dynamics intertwined with linguistic and cultural nuances. The contrast indicates evolving cultural shifts within Anglophone literary circles throughout the past century, marked by the diminishing French prestige and rising Chinese cultural influence within traditionally Euro-centric literary realms. This transformative landscape is further evidenced by the diverse array of creative endeavours inspired by Li Qingzhao's oeuvre, which extends beyond literature into other cultural domains. As discussed in Chapter Six, those creative responses from enthusiastic artistic receivers, together with other integration of Chinese cultural impact in the Anglophone literature, signify the ascendance of Chinese cultural insights into cultural evolution through its unique lens, deserving due attention for its role in understanding cultural evolution and meriting future research.

#### 7.4 Limitations and Suggestions for Future Research

Despite the aforementioned contributions, the current project is not exempt from limitations. From the perspective of data collection, this project is not exhaustive, despite offering the largest and newest dataset of Li Qingzhao's works (re)translated into English so far. It fails to collect a few printed retranslations from Australia and other translators due to inaccessibility in the UK and mainland China, such as Clifford and Pannam (2009) and Catherine Cleeves-Diamond (1980) mentioned in Chapter Four. Xu Yuanchong's (2012) retranslation of Li Qingzhao's poems in mainland China is also not included in the literature review due to its late identification. It is also possible that certain retranslations might not be included in the dataset of which this research is not aware. Due to the uneven distribution of paratextual elements in English collections, this research is limited in analysing main peritextual information. Some deliberate limitations are imposed, including a textual analysis of Li Qingzhao's autobiographic essay The Postscript to Jinshilu, approached through corpus-based methodology by the software WordSmith Tools 8.0 and case studies. This examination aims to reveal how translators as readers perceive the poet as both a female writer and a wife, with findings intended for publication in academic journals following the submission of this dissertation for further scholarly reference. Moreover, conducting textual scrutiny of all existing English collections of Li Qingzhao's works using corpus-based methodology is deemed worthwhile to reveal translators' distinct styles. However, due to constraints of time and space, this aspect of the study is deferred to further research endeavours.

In addition, it is proposed that additional paratextual analyses, such as introduction, foreword, and acknowledgment, be conducted to achieve a more nuanced comprehension of retranslation and reception. For Li Qingzhao's retranslations produced in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, it is advisable to undertake empirical inquiries to explore the more in-depth reception of translators as readers, employing methods like face-to-face interviews, questionnaires, surveys and verbal protocols, inspired by the work of Georgiou (2019). Furthermore, alternative avenues for investigating retranslation and reception could involve analysing online readers' reviews of various retranslated collections in major library catalogues. An innovative attempt could encompass digital platforms for

assessing reception beyond conventional print publications. This could entail capturing real-time video retranslations and their associated paratextual materials across platforms, like TikTok and YouTube, thereby investigating more informal modes of reception in the contemporary era.

# **Bibliography**

#### **English Sources:**

*"Li Qingzhao"* Search Results (no date). Available at: https://www.poemhunter.com/search/?q=Li%20Qingzhao#google\_vignette (Accessed:18th March2024).

About US (no date) Available at: https://www.degruyter.com/publishing/about-us (Accessed: 5th March 2024).

Ahlin, C. (2017) 'The Odyssey' Has FINALLY Been Translated By A Woman. Here's Why That's So Important. Available at: https://www.bustle.com/p/how-emily-wilson-the-first-woman-to-translate-the-odyssey-into-english-is-rethinking-gender-roles-in-the-greek-epic-3540304 (Accessed:25th Jan 2024).

Alem, H. (2023) The Representation of the Oriental Woman in Sylvia Plath's Poetry: Liberating the Veiled Body in "Purdah" and "Ariel". *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, Vol. 13, No. 4, pp. 1023-1030, DOI: https://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.1304.24. (Accessed: 5<sup>th</sup> February 2024).

Alexander, M. (1986) 'Poem to Li Ch'ing-Chao', *Journal of South Asian Literature*, Vol. 21, No. 1, *South Asian Women Writers: The Immigrant Experience.* (Winter, Spring 1986), pp. 2-3.

Allott, K. (1962) The Penguin Book of Contemporary Verse 1918-60. New Revised Edition. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd.

Almberg, Shiu-Pang E. (1994) 'Li Qingzhao: Letter to the Academician Qi Chongli', Renditions: *A Chinese-English Translation Magazine*, nos. 41& 42 (spring & autumn 1994):79-84. Reprinted in *Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism*. Vol. 71, edited by Krstovic, J. Detroit: Gale, 2005.

Al-Shaye, S. A. A. (2018) The Retranslation Phenomenon: A Sociological Approach to the English Translations of Dickens' Great Expectations into Arabic. unpublished PhD thesis. University College London.

Alvstad, C. and Rosa, A. A. (2015) 'Voice in Retranslation', special issue of Target 27 (1). pp.1-25.

Armstrong, R. H. (2008) 'Classical Translations of the Classics: The Dynamics of Literary Tradition in Retranslating Epic Poetry', in Lianeri, A and Zajko, V. (eds.) *Translation and the Classic: Identity as Change in the History of Culture*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp.169-202. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199288076.003.0009 (Accessed:4<sup>th</sup> February 2024)

Atkinson, J. (2007) 'Remembering Rexroth's Li Ch'ing Chao in Cordova, Alaska', *The Missouri Review*, 30(3), pp. 14-15.

Axelsson, M. (2022) 'Translating Feminism. Paratexts in the Danish, Norwegian, and Swedish Translations of Betty Friedan's *The Feminine Mystique* (1963)', in Pleijel, R. and Carlström, M.P. (eds) *Paratexts in Translation: Nordic Perspectives*. Berlin: Frank & Timme. pp. 93-121.

Ayling, A. and Mackintosh, D. (1965) *A Collection of Chinese Lyrics*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Ayscough, F. (1937) *Chinese Women Yesterday and Today*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Riverside Press.

Bailey, R. (1973) Guide to Chinese Poetry and Drama. Boston: G. K. Hall & Co.

Baker, P. (2023) *Using Corpora in Discourse Analysis* (second edition). London/New York/Oxford/New Delhi/Sydney: Bloomsbury Academic.

Bankier, J. and Lashgari, D. (1983) trs. *Women Poets of the World*. NY/London: Macmillan Publishing. Co. Inc.

Barnstone, A. and Barnstone, W. (1992) *A Book of Women Poets: from Antiquity to Now*. New York: Schocken Books.

Barnstone, T. and Chou, P. (2005) *The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry*. NY: Anchor Books, a division of Random House, Inc.

Barnstone, W. (1994) 'Reading Li Qingzhao', *The Massachusetts Review*, Vol. 25, No. 2 (Summer), pp. 222.

Bassnett, S., and Lefevere, A. (1990) Translation, History and Culture. London: Printer Publishers.

Batchelor, K. (2018) Translation and Paratexts. London: Routledge.

Bechelany-Lynch, E.T.E. (no date) *Five Ways of Translating Li Qingzhao's Poem《蝶恋花 - 晚止昌 乐馆寄姊妹》*. Available at: https://metatron.press/glyphoria/translating-language-and-sound/vivian-liyilin-wang-five-ways-of-translating-li-qingzhaos-poem/ (Accessed:3rd March 2024)

Beeler, J. (1975) 'Holy Women: The Poetess Li Ch'ing Chao', *The New Orleans Review*, Vol. 4(4). pp.316.

Bensimon, P. (1990) 'Présentation', *Palimpsestes*, 13(4), pp.9–13. Available at: https://journals.openedition.org/palimpsestes/598 (Accessed: 20th October 2022).

Berman, A. (1990) 'La retraduction comme espace de la traduction', *Palimpsestes*, 13(4), pp.1–7. Available at: https://journals.openedition.org/palimpsestes/596 (Accessed: 20th October 2022).

Blakesley. J (2021) 'Translating the classics', in Rundle, C. (ed.) *The Routledge Handbook of Translation History* (1st ed.) London: Routledge, pp. 372-388. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315640129. (Accessed: 16<sup>th</sup> January 2024).

Blennerhassett, P. (2009) 'Sounds of the sea at museum', *Victoria news (Victoria)*, pp. 1. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/sounds-sea-at-museum/docview/373027044/se-2?accountid=130472 (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Boase-Beier, J. (2006) *Stylistic Approaches to Translation*. London &New York: Routledge. Taylor &Francis Group.

Bocquier, X. (2022) '(Re)Translation of Sex-Related Language in the Spanish Versions of *J'irai cracher* sur vos tombes by Boris Vian', in Cadera, S. M and Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception:* Studies in a European Context. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp. 155-170.

Borges' Library (no date) *To the Tune of the Proud Fisherman, by Li Qingzhao*[blog]. Available at: https://www.borges-library.com/2021/03/fisherman.html (Accessed: 3rd March 2024).

Borges' Library (no date) *To the Tune of Wuling Spring –Li Qingzhao\_*[blog]. Available at: https://www.borges-library.com/2021/03/to-the-tune-of-wuling-spring-li-qingzhao.html (Accessed: 3rd March 2024).

Botîlcă, C. M. (2021) 'Retranslation as a Necessity for the 21st Century Reader', *Old Possum's Book of Practical Cats – T. S. Eliot, Philologica Jassyensia'', an XVII,* nr. 1 (33), pp. 143–152.

Brems, E. and Pinto, S. R. (2013) 'Reception and translation' in Gambier, Y. and Doorslaer. L. V. (eds.) *Handbook of Translation Studies. Volume 4*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. pp.142-147.

Britto, P.H. (2019) 'The Retranslation of Wallace Stevens' "Of Mere Being", *Ilha do Desterro*, 72(2), pp. 57–65. Available at: https://doi.org/10.5007/2175-8026.2019v72n2p57.(Accessed: 6th July 2022).

Brownlie, S. (2006) 'Narrative Theory and Retranslation Theory', *Across Languages and Cultures* 7 (2), pp. 145–170. DOI: 10.1556/Acr.7.2006.2.1.

Cadera, S.M. (2017) 'Literary Retranslation in Context: A Historical, Social and Cultural Perspective', in Cadera, S. M. and Walsh, A. S.(eds.) *Literary Retranslation In Context*, Oxford/New York: Peter Lang. pp.5-18.

Cadera, S.M. (2022) 'Canonical Translation and Retranslation. The Example of Franz Kafka's Metamorphosis in Spain', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill. pp.66-85.

Cadera, S.M. and Walsh, A.S. (2022) 'Retranslation and Reception-a Theoretical Overview', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill. pp.1-20.

Cai, Zongqi. (2008) *How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Chamberlain, M. and Bernstein, A. (2000) 'Women's Studies: Funding', in Kramarae, C. and Spender, D. (eds) *Routledge International Encyclopedia of Women: Global Women's Issues and Knowledge*. New York/London: Routledge. pp. 2092-2095.

Chang K. S. (1980) *The Evolution of Chinese Tz'u Poetry: From Late Tang to Northern Sung*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Chang, K.S. (1996) 'Chinese Poetry', in Brogan, T.V.F. (ed.) *The Princeton Handbook of Multicultural Poetries*. 1st edition. Princeton: Princeton University Press. pp. 80-90. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1515/9780691228211. (Accessed: 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2024).

Chang, K.S. and Saussy, H. (1999) *Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism.* Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Cheesman, T., Flanagan, K., Thiel, S., Rybicki, J., Laramee, R.S., Hope, J., and Roos, A. (2017) 'Multi-Retranslation Corpora: Visibility, variation, value, and virtue', *Digital Scholarship in the Humanities* 32(4): pp.739–760.

Chen, W. (2024) *The Magpie at Night forthcoming 2025*. Available at: https://www.wendychenart.com/the-magpie-at-night (Accessed:3rd March 2024).

Chesterman, A. (2000) 'A causal model for Translation Studies', in M. Olahan (ed.) *Intercultural Faultlines: Research Models in Translation Studies I: Textual and Cognitive Aspects*. Manchester: St Jerome, pp.15–27.

Ching, J. (1992) 'What women have suffered for the sake of male desire: SA2 Edition', *Toronto Star*. April. 4<sup>th</sup>, K15. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/what-women-have-suffered-sake-male-desire/docview/436630381/se-2?accountid=130472 (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Chu, T. k. (1937) Chinese Lyrics. London: Cambridge University Press

Chung, L. (1972) Kenneth Rexroth and Chinese Poetry: Translation, Imitation, And Adaptation. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of Wisconsin.

Chung, L. (1975) 'Li Ch'ing-chao: Another Side of Her Complex Personality', *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association* 10, No.3 (October 1975): pp.126-36.

Chung. L. (1985) 'Li Qingzhao: The Moulding of her Spirit and Personality', in Gerstlacher, A., Keen, R., Kubin, W., Miosga, M., and Schon, J.(eds.) *Woman and Literature in China*. Bochum: Studienverlag Brockmeyer, pp.141-164.

Classe, O. (2000) The *Encyclopedia of Literary Translation into English Volume I A-L* (2000). London and Chicago: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers

Cleve, E. V. (1994) 'Chen Takes us on Musical Trip to Mongolia'. *The Santa Fe New Mexican*. July. 29<sup>th</sup>. pp.13. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/chen-takes-us-on-musical-trip-mongolia/docview/331432011/se-2?accountid=130472 (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Collombat, I. (2004) 'Le XXIe siècle: l'âge de la retraduction. The 21st Century: The Age of Retranslation', *Translation Studies in the New Millenium. An International Journal of Translation and Interpreting* 2: pp.1–15.

Connolly, D. (2001) 'Poetry Translation', in Baker, M. and Saldanha, G. (eds.) *Encyclopedia of Retranslation Studies*, First Edition. London and New York: Routledge, pp.170-176.

Cooley, J. (no date) *Spring Sorrow*. Available at: https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poetrymagazine/browse?contentId=13333 (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

Coren, P. (2021) *Li Qingzhao, Poet. A selection of poems, edited and translated by Pamela Coren.* FeedARead.com Publishing.

Corey, A. (2011) 'Away from the Day Shift's Bullhorn and Dazzle' in *A Measure's Hush* (Coray, 2011). Boreal Books. pp.80. Available at: https://www.thefreelibrary.com/Away+From+the+Dayshift%27s+Bullhorn+and+Dazzle-a0109085482 (Accessed: 12th May 2023).

Cosman, C. Keefe, J. and Weaver, K. (1978) *The Penguin Book of Women Poets*. Middlesex: Penguin Book Ltd.

Crash Fever Lore Wiki (no date) *Li Qingzhao Invades!* https://cf-lore.fandom.com/wiki/Li\_Qingzhao\_Invades!#Quest\_Overview (Accessed:14<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

*Cross-Cultural Transfers: The 85 Project* (no date) Available at: https://www.85bawu.com/About.aspx (Accessed:29th March 2024).

Crow's Wing (2009) *Two Springs (Li Ch'ing-chao)* [blog]. Available at: https://blackasacrowswing.blogspot.com/2009/12/two-springs-li-ching-chao.html (Accessed: 20th. March 2024).

Cryer, J. (1984) Plum Blossom: Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao. Chapel Hill: Carolina Wren Press.

Cui, Jie. and Cai, Zongqi. (2012) *How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Houng, C. (2022) *Like A Dream: Li Qingzhao's Poetry*. Available at: https://itmightbeart.org/2022/09/01/like-a-dream-li-qingzhaos-poetry/ (Accessed:18th March 2024).

Dargin, P. and Dresman, P. (1984-1985) 'Forms of Open Form: A Comparison of English Translations of Li Ch'ing-chao', *Tamkang Review: A Quarterly of Comparative Studies between Chinese and Foreign Literatures* 15, nos.1,2,3,4 (autumn-summer 1984-85): 285-306, Reprinted in *Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism*. Vol. 71, edited by Krstovic, J. Vol. 71. Detroit: Gale, 2005.

Davidson, M. (1989) *The San Francisco Renaissance: Poetics and Community at Mid-century*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Davis, A.R. (1962) The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse. Middlesex. UK: Penguin Books.

Deane-Cox, S. (2014) *Retranslation: Translation, Literature and Reinterpretation*. London/New York: Bloomsbury Academic.

Deeny, J. and Li, K. (1976) A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry. HK: The Chinese University of Hong Kong.

Delisle, J. (2009) 'Canadian Tradition', in Baker, M. and Saldanha, G. (eds.) *Encyclopedia of Retranslation Studies*, Second Edition. London and New York: Routledge, pp.367-368.

Deluty, R. H (2006) 'Senryu', Food, Culture & Society, 9:3, pp. 355-359, DOI:10.2752/155280106778813251

Dickinson, E. (1891) *I'm Nobody, Who are you?* Available at: https://allpoetry.com/I'm-nobody!-Who-are-you- (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

Dickinson, E. (no date) As if the Sea Should Part. Available at: https://allpoetry.com/As-if-the-Sea-should-part\_(Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

Djao, W. (2010) A Blossom Like No Other: Li Qingzhao. Toronto: Ginger Post Inc.

Doty, C. C. (2022) 'Retranslation of Mario Vargas Llosa's Bildungsroman La tía Julia y el escribidor: Relaunching and Retitling as a Case in Point', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp. 285-304. Dueck, E. (2014) *L'Etranger intime: les traductions françaises de l'oeuvre de Paul Celan* (1971–2000). Berlin/Boston: De Gruyter.

Dunning, J. (1993) 'Dance in Review', *The New York Times*. Late Edition (East Coast). March. 29<sup>th</sup>. Pp.14. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/docview/428949922?accountid=130472&sourcetype=Newspapers (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Ebrey, P. B. (1993) *The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period*. Berkeley and Los Angeles/ London: University of California Press.

Egan, R. (2013) *The Burden of Female Talent: The Poet Li Qingzhao and Her History in China*. London and Cambridge (Massachusetts): Harvard University Asia Center.

Egan, R. (2019) The Works of Li Qingzhao. Boston/Berlin: Walter de Gruyter Inc.

Endersby, J. (2018) *Orchid A Cultural History*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press; Surrey: Kew Publishing.

Eoyang, E. (1999) 'Li Qingzhao', in Chang, K.S. and Saussy, H. (eds.) *Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism.* California: Stanford University Press. p.89-99.

Essmann, H. and Frank, A. R. (1991) 'Translation Anthologies: An Invitation to the Curious and a Case Study', *Target* 3:1 (1991), 65-90. DOI 10.1075/target.3.1.05ess. pp.65-90.

Even-Zohar, I. (1990) 'The Position of Translated Literature within the Literary Polysystem', *Poetics Today*, Spring, 1990, Vol. 11, No. 1, pp. 45-51

Faurrot, J. (1998) *Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry*. San Fransico: China Books & Periodicals. Inc.

Feng, Lei. (2014) 'Retranslation hypotheses revisited: A case study of two English translations of Sanguo Yanyi--the first Chinese novel', *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics Plus*, Vol. 43, pp. 69-86; doi: 10.5842/43-0-209.

Fletcher, W.J.B. (1919) *Gems of Chinese Verse: Translated into English Verse*. Shanghai: Commercial Press, Limited.

Fogel, J.A. (2023) 'Introduction: National Traditions of Sinology'. *Journal of Chinese History*, 7, pp. 253 - 255.

Frank, A.P. (2001) 'Anthologies of Translation', in Baker, M. (ed.) *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. 1<sup>st</sup> edition, London/New York: Routledge, pp.13-16.

Franke, H. (1976) Sung Biographies. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag Gmbh.

Fuller, M. (2017) *An Introduction to Chinese Poetry From the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Gambier, Y. (1994) 'La retraduction, retour et détour', *Meta*, 39(3), 413–417. https://doi.org/10.7202/002799a (Accessed: 20th October 2022).

Gamble, S. (2006a) 'Editor's Introduction'. in Gamble, S. (ed.) *The Routledge Companion to Feminism and Postfeminism*. New York: Routledge. pp. vii-x.

Gamble, S. (2006b) 'Postfeminism', in Gamble, S. (ed.) *The Routledge Companion to Feminism and Postfeminism*. New York: Routledge. pp. 36-45.

Genette, G. (1997) *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*. Translated by Lewin, J.E. from French. Cambridge/New York/Melbourne: Cambridge University Press.

Georgiou, K. (2019) *The translator as reader: the case of poetry translators from Modern Greek into English*. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of Surrey.

Georgiou, N. (2018a) 'Poetry translators as cultural ambassadors: Communicating Modern Greek poetry in English', *Selected papers of the CETRA Research Summer School 2015*. Leuven University Press.

Georgiou, N. (2018b) 'Regarding Symbolic Capital: Poetry Translators from Modern Greek into English', *Hermes: Journal of Language and Communication in Business*. https://doi.org /10.7146/hjlcb.v0i58.111676, pp. 99-115.

Georgiou, N. and Van der Meer, G. (2022) 'Degrees of marginality: the representation of women poets in 20th century Modern Greek and Yiddish poetry anthologies in English translation', Enriching the Global Literary Canvas: Celebrating Less Translated Languages, special issue of *The AALITRA Review: A Journal of Literary Translation* 17: 58-75.

Gershenson, A.S. (2003) 'Mating the Marimba with Chamber Music, Fittingly an Ensemble Tackles Repression of Women in Seeking a New Audience: Third Edition'. *The Boston Globe*. Jan. 26<sup>th</sup>. Pp.CW.14. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/mating-marimba-with-chamber-music-fittingly/docview/405507609/se-2?accountid=130472 (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Gibson, M. (1986) Revolutionary Rexroth Poet of East-West Wisdom. Hamden: Archon Books

Giustini, D. (2015) 'Gender and Queer Identities in Translation from Sappho to present feminist and lesbian writers: translating the past and retranslating the future', *Norwich Papers*, 23. pp.1-12.

Gòdia, M. F. (2022) '(Re)Translating Goethe into Catalan', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill. pp. 133-154.

Goethe, J. W. von (1992) 'Translations', in Schulte, R. and Biguenet, J. (eds.) *Theories of Translation: An Anthology of Essays from Dryden to Derrida*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, pp.60-63.

Gombár, Z. (2013) 'Translation anthologies and British literature in Portugal and Hungary between 1949 and 1974', in Seruya, T., D'hulst, L., Rosa, A.A. and Moniz, M.L. (eds.) *Translation in Anthologies and Collections (19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Centuries)*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, pp. 259-274.

Gordon, E. (1999) 'Poetry Without Pain / Adverse To Verse? Good! For National Poetry Month, Here Are Three Books To Stir The Stanza Lover In You: [All Editions]'. *Newsday*, Apr 25th. B09. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/poetry-without-pain-adverse-verse-goodnational/docview/279178362/se-2?accountid=130472 (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Greenall, A.K. (2015) 'Translators' Voices in Norwegian Retranslations of Bob Dylan's Songs', *Target*. 27(1): pp. 40-57.

Gualtieri, G. (2011) 'Canonized Women and Women Canonizers: Gender Dynamics in *The Norton Anthology of English Literature's Eight Editions'*, *Gend. Issues* (2011) 28:94–109. DOI 10.1007/s12147-011-9099-y.

Gulyás, A. (2022) 'Retranslation and Their Reception in Context', <u>in</u> Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp. 215-232.

Hajj, E. M. (2019) 'Translation, Retranslation and Recreation in the Literary Field', *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, Vol (10), No. (5), pp:914-925, DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.1005.03 (Accessed: 21<sup>st</sup> July 2023).

Hale, T. (2001) 'Publishing Strategies', in Baker, M. (ed.) *Encyclopedia of Translation Studies (first edition)*. London and New York: Routledge, pp.190-194.

Hamalian, L. (1991) A Life of Kenneth Rexroth. New York & London: W. W. Norton & Company.

Hamill, S. (1985) *The Lotus Lovers: Tzu Yeh: Li Ch'ing-Chao. Poems & Songs translated by Sam Hamill.* Saint Paul: Coffee House Press.

Hamill, S. (2000) *Crossing the Yellow River: three hundred poems from the Chinese*. New York: BOA Editions, Ltd.

Hamill, S. (2005) 'A Woodsplitter's Meditation' in *Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations*. Boston: Shambhala Publications. Inc, pp. 206-208.

Hanna, S.F. (2016) Bourdieu in Translation Studies: The socio-cultural dynamics of Shakespeare translation in Egypt. London: Routledge.

Harkness, E. (no date) 'Spring in Hangzhou'. in *Triggerfish Critical Review*, *Issue 26*. Available at: https://triggerfishcriticalreview.com/edward-harkness-spring-in-hangzhou/ (Accessed:3<sup>rd</sup> March 2024).

Haug, J.I. (2019) 'Critical Edition as Retranslation: Mediating 'Alī Ufuķī's Notation Collections (c. 1630–1670)', in Albachten, O.B. and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (eds.) *Perspectives on Retranslation: Ideology, Paratexts, Methods,* New York: Routledge, pp.107-128.

Hawkes, D. (1964) 'Chinese Poetry and the English Reader', in Dawson, R. (ed.). *The Legacy of China*. Oxford: Clarendon, pp. 90-115.

Higgins, C. (2017) *The Odyssey translated by Emily Wilson review – a new cultural landmark*, Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/books/2017/dec/08/the-odyssey-translated-emily-wilson-review (Accessed:25th Jan 2024).

Hightower, J. R. & Yeh, F. C. (1998) *Studies in Chinese Poetry*. Cambridge, Massachusetts, and London: Harvard University Press.

Hinton, D. (2008) Classical Chinese Poetry: An Anthology. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Ho, L.Ch.(1968) *More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao*. Hong Kong: Mayfair Press.

Holton, B. (2013) 'Dubbing Du Fu: Paratext and Hypertext', in Pellatt, V. (edited) *Text, Extratext, Metatext and Paratext in Translation*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, pp121-126.

Horowitz, R. (2015) 'A Review of Yiddish Women Writers in English-Language Anthologies', in Horowitz, R. (ed.) *Women Writers of Yiddish Literature. Critical Essays.* Jefferson: McFarland and Company, Inc., Publishers, pp. 11-25.

Hsu, K-Y. (1962) 'The Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao', PMLA, Vol. 77, No. 5. pp. 521-528.

Hu, Pc. (1966) Li Ch'ing-chao. New York: Twayne Publishers, Inc.

Hu, Sh. (1992) 'Women's Place in Chinese History', in Li Yu-ning (ed.), *Chinese Women Through Chinese Eyes*. London/New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc, pp 3-15.

Idema, W. & Haft, L. (1997) *A Guide to Chinese Literature*. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies. The University of Michigan.

Ivaska, L. & Huuhtanen, S. (2020) 'Beware the source text: five (re)translations of the same work, but from different source texts', *Meta*, 65(2), pp.312–331. https://doi.org/10.7202/1075838ar (Accessed: 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2023).

Jacobs, A. X. (2018) 'Anna Herman Translates the Sonnets', *European Judaism*, Vol. (51). No. (2). pp: 97–105; https://doi.org/10.3167/ej.2018.510215 (Accessed: 27<sup>th</sup> July 2022).

Jiang, Mengying. (2020) 'Retranslation in popular culture: a multimodal extension of taboo love', *The Translator*, 26:1, pp. 91-108, DOI: 10.1080/13556509.2019.1707385.

Johnson, R.B., Onwuegbuzie, A.J. and Turner, L.A. (2007) 'Toward a Definition of Mixed Methods Research', *Journal of mixed methods research*, 1(2), pp. 112–133. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1177/1558689806298224. (Accessed: 18<sup>th</sup>. July 2024).

Jose, N. (2015) 'Translation Plus: On Literary Translation and Creative Writing', *The AALITRA Review: A Journal of Literary Translation* 10: pp. 5-17.

Kalamaras, G. (2018) 'Letter to Li Ch'ing-chao, While I Drink Bai Mu Dan Tea', in *The Literary Journal* of *The University of Montana*. Available at: https://www.cutbankonline.org/literary-letters/2018/1/xjxq8eokli011q78ae7oeib44gkz2u (Accessed: 9th March 2024).

Kanra, Y.T. (2019) 'Turkish Retranslations of Philosophical Concepts in Kritik der reinen Vernunft', in Albachten, O.B and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (eds.), *Studies from a Retranslation Culture: The Turkish Context*, Singapore: Springer, pp.41-60.

Kathpalia, S. S. (1992) A genre analysis of promotional texts. Unpublished PhD thesis. National University of Singapore.

Kathpalia, S. S. (2022) *Persuasive Genres: Old and New Media*. London and New York: Routledge. Taylor & Francis Group.

Kay, G. G. (2013) River of Stars. London: Harper Collins Publishers.

Keats, J. (no date) *Ode to a Nightingale*. Available at: https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/44479/ode-to-a-nightingale (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

Knight, S. (2012) *Chinese Literature: A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Oxford University Press, Inc.

Konar, A. H. (2019) 'Elucidating or (Un)breaking the Chain? Intralingual Translations and Retranslations of Seyh Galib's *Hüsn ü Aşk'*, in Albachten, O.B and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (ed), *Studies from a Retranslation Culture: The Turkish Context*. Singapore: Springer, pp. 27-40.

Konca, I. (2019) 'The Turkish Retranslations of Marx's *Das Kapital as a Site of Intellectual and Ideological Struggle*', in Albachten, O.B. and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (eds.) *Studies from a Retranslation Culture: The Turkish Context.* Singapore: Springer, pp.81-94.

Kondo, M. and Wakabayashi, J. (2009) 'Japanese Tradition', in Baker, M. and Saldanha, G. (eds.) *Encyclopedia of Retranslation Studies*. Second Edition. London and New York: Routledge, pp.468.

Koskinen, K., & Paloposki, O. (2003) 'Retranslations in the Age of Digital Reproduction', *Cadernos De Traducao*, 1(11), pp. 19–38

Koskinen, K. and Paloposki, O. (2010) 'Retranslation', in Gamber, Y. and Doorslaer, L.V. (ed.) *Handbook of Translation Studies*. Vol.1, Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, pp.294-298.

Koskinen, K. and Paloposki, O. (2019) 'New directions for retranslation research: Lessons learned from the archaeology of retranslations in the Finnish literary system', *Cadernos de Traduçao*, 39(1), pp.23–44.

Kress, G. and Leeuwen, T.V. (2020) *Reading Images: The Grammar of Visual Design* (3rd ed.). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003099857. (Accessed: 27<sup>th</sup> January 2024).

Kristeva, J. (1977) About Chinese Women, trans. Anita Barrows. New York: Urizen Books.

Kufnerova, Z. and Osers, E. (2001) 'Czech Tradition', in Baker, M. and Saldanha, G. (eds.) *Encyclopedia Of Retranslation Studies*. First Edition. London and New York: Routledge, pp.376 -383.

Kurmel, D.K. (2019) '(Re)translations of the European Convention on Human Rights in Turkish', in Albachten, O.B and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (eds.) *Studies from a Retranslation Culture: The Turkish Context.* Singapore: Springer, pp.61-80.

Kwock, C.H., and McHugh, V. (1958) trs. *Why I live on the Mountain: 30 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties*. San Francisco: Golden Mountain Press.

Kwock, C.H., and McHugh, V. (1962) trs. *The Lady and the Hermit: 30 Chinese Poems by Li Ch'ing-chao of the Sung and Wan Fan-chih of the Tang.* San Francisco: Golden Mountain Press.

Lai, M. (1964) A History of Chinese Literature. New York: The John Day Company.

Larsson, C., Axell, A.G., and Ersson, A. (2007) 'Confusion assessment method for the intensive care unit (CAM-ICU): translation, retranslation and validation into Swedish intensive care settings', *Acta Anaesthesiol Scand* (51): pp:888–892.

Laviosa, S., Pagano, A., Kemppanen, H. and Ji, M. (2017) *Textual and Contextual Analysis in Empirical Translation Studies*. Singapore: Springer.

Lee, K. A-H. (2018) Double Radiance: Poetry & Prose of Li Qingzhao. Singing Bone Press.

Lefevere, A. (1975) Translating Poetry: Seven Strategies and a Blueprint. Assen: Van Gorcum.

Lefevere, A. (1992) *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*. London/New York: Routledge. Taylor & Francis Group.

Lehman, D. (2006) The Oxford Book of American Poetry. New York: Oxford University Press.

Lei, Tianyu. (2021) 'Retranslation: A Comparative Study of Two English Translations of *Vimalakīrti Sutra'*, *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, Vol. 11, No. 4, pp. 350-355, DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/tpls.1104.03 (Accessed: 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2022).

Levy, A. (2000) trans by Nienhauser, W. *Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical*, Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Levy, M. and Perry, M. (2015) 'Distantly Reading the Romantic Canon: Quantifying Gender in Current Anthologies', *Women's Writing*, 22:2, 132-155, DOI: 10.1080/09699082.2015.1011836.

Li Qingzhao and Jenn Marie Nunes (2019). *Everyone is here but the one who matters*. Available at: https://aaww.org/everyone-is-here-but-the-one-who-matters/ (Accessed:18th March 2024).

Lian, Xinda. (2008) '*Ci Poetry-Long Song Lyrics (Manci*)', in Cai, Zq. (ed.) *How to read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology*. New York: Columbia University Press, pp: 262-246.

Liao, Chia-hui. (2012) 'The Reception and Translation of Classical Chinese Poetry in English', *NCUE Journal of Humanities*. Vol. 6, pp. 47-64.

Linthwaite, I. (1987) *Ain't A Woman! A book of Women's Poetry from around the world*. NY: Barnes &Noble Books.

Littau, K. (2011) 'First steps towards a media history of translation', *Translation Studies*, 4:3, pp. 261-281, DOI: 10.1080/14781700.2011.589651.

Liu, C. J. (1991) 'Review of *The Complete Ci-Poems of Li Qingzhao: A New English Translation*, by Jiaosheng Wang', *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews (CLEAR)*, Vol. 13, pp. 151-154.

Liu, J.Y. (1962) The Art of Chinese Poetry. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Liu, J.Y. (1974) *Major Lyricists of the Northern Sung: 960-1126 A.D.* New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Lockwood, W. J. (1984-1985) 'Kenneth Rexroth's Versions of Li Ch'ing-chao'. *Tamkang Review: A Quarterly of Comparative Studies between Chinese and Foreign Literatures* 15, nos.1,2,3,4 (autumn-summer 1984-85): 389-410. Reprinted in *Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism*. Vol. 71, edited by Krstovic, J. Vol. 71. Detroit: Gale, 2005.

Loeffelholz, M. (2017). *The Norton Anthology of American Literature, Ninth Edition. Volume D: 1914-1945.* New York: W.W. Norton & Company. Inc.

Lomová, O. (2023) 'Czecho(slovak) Sinology'. Journal of Chinese History, 7, pp. 443 - 461.

Lowe, L. (2018) 'The Desires of Postcolonial Orientalism: Chinese Utopias of Kristeva, Barthes, and Telquel', in *Critical Terrains*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, pp. 136–189. Available at: https://doi.org/10.7591/9781501723124-006.

Lung, R. (2003) 'Translating sensitive texts', *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 11:4, 255-268, DOI: 10.1080/0907676X.2003.9961479.

Luo, Yuming. (2011) trans. Ye Yang. *A Concise History of Chinese Literature: Volume 1*. Leiden and Boston: Brill.

Lupton, E. (2010) *Thinking with type: a critical guide for designers, writers, editors & students (second, revised and expanded edition).* New York: Princeton Architectural Press.

Lynn, R.J. (1984) Guide to Chinese Poetry and Drama. Boston: G.K. Hall &Co.

Malmqvist, G. (1991) 'A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao (1084-1151)', *Archiv Orientalni* 2. no.59(1991):190-93. Reprinted in *Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism*. Vol. 71, edited by Krstovic, J. Vol. 71. Detroit: Gale, 2005.

Mascara Literary Review (2018). *Yunhe Huang translates Fan Zhongyan & Li Qingzhao*. Available at: https://www.mascarareview.com/yunhe-huang-translates-fan-zhongyan-li-qingzhao/ (Accessed: 3rd March 2024).

Massardier-Kenney, F. (2015) 'Toward a Rethinking of Retranslation', *Translation Review*, 92:1, pp73-85, DOI: 10.1080/07374836.2015.1086289.

Mather, R. B. (1976) (tr.) *Shih-shuo hsin-yü, A New Account of Tales of the World*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

Mayhew, L. & McNaughton, W. (1977) As Though Dreaming: the Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao. Tokyo: Mushinsha Limited.

McRae, E. (2012) 'The Role of Translators' Preface to Contemporary Literary Translations into English: An Empirical Study', in Gil-Bardaji, A.; Orero, P., and Rovira-Esteva, S. (eds.) *Translation Peripheries: Paratextual Elements in Translation*. Bern: Peter Lang. pp.63-82.

Meister, L. (2018) 'On methodology: How mixed methods research can contribute to translation studies', *Translation Studies*, 11:1, 66-83, DOI:10.1080/14781700.2017.1374206

Mendelsohn, D. (2011) 'Englishing the *Iliad*: Grading Four Rival Translations'. *The New Yorker* (*Online*). Available at: https://www.newyorker.com/books/page-turner/englishing-the-iliad-grading-four-rival-translations (Accessed:1st Jan 2024).

Millay, E. (no date) *Sorrow*. Available at: https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/44727/sorrow-56d223efbf6d2 (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

Miłosz, C. (1996) *A Book of Luminous things: an international anthology of poetry*. San Diego/New York/London: A Harvest Book/Harcourt Brace &Company.

Min, J. (2021) *Discover the Beauty of the Rhymes and Vibes in the Song Dynasty*. Available at: https://www.rhymesandvibes.com (Accessed at: 1<sup>st</sup> April 2023).

Miralles, H. L. (2022) 'Dopo il divorzio by Grazia Deledda: Reception, Rewriting, Retranslation', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp. 173-195

Moscoso, J. (2023) Arc of Feeling: The History of the Swing. London: Reaktion Books.

Mourinha, M. (2022) 'Translating and Retranslating Lobo Antunes: On Both of the English Renditions of Os Cus de Judas' in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp. 307-323

*Newsday* (1989) 'Top of The Week: [City Edition]'. Apr 02. pp.:02. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/top-week/docview/278147093/se-2?accountid=130472. (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2023).

Nord, C. (1995) 'Text-Functions in Translation: Titles and Headings as a Case in Point'. *Target-international Journal of Translation Studies* (7), pp. 261-284.

Nord, C. (2019) 'Paving the Way to the Text: Forms and Functions of Book Titles in Translation'. *Russian Journal of Linguistics*, 23 (2), pp. 328–343. doi: 10.22363/2312-9182-2019-23-2-328-343.

North, A. (2017) '*Historically, men translated the Odyssey. Here's what happened when a woman took the job'*. Available at: https://www.vox.com/identities/2017/11/20/16651634/odyssey-emily-wilson-translation-first-woman-english (Accessed: 25th Jan 2024)

O'Driscoll, K. (2011) *Retranslation through the Centuries*. Bern: Peter Lang AG, International Academic Publishers.

Online Etymology Dictionary (no date). *Orchid*, Available at: https://www.etymonline.com/word/orchid (accessed: 19th August 2024).

Osing, G.T, Min, Xh., and Huang, Hp. (1992) Forever Tonight at My Window (Chinese vs English)—Ci of Li Qingzhao. Zhengzhou: Henan Renmin Chubanshe.

Owen, S. (1994) 'Meaning the Words: The Genuine as a Value in the Tradition of the Song Lyric', in Pauline Yu, (ed.) *Voices of the Song Lyric in China*. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 30-69.

Owen, S. (1996) *Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911*. New York/London: W.W. Norton & Company.

Owen, S. (2010) *The Cambridge History of Chinese Literature. Volume 1: to 1375.* Cambridge: Cambridge university press.

Owen. S. (2019) Just a Song: Chinese Lyrics from the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Asia Center.

Palandri, A. J. (1981) 'Review of *Complete Poems by Li Ch'ing-chao*, by Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung (1979)', *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews (CLEAR)*. Vol. 3. CODA Press, pp. 267–271. Available at: https://doi.org/10.2307/495435. (Accessed:12<sup>th</sup> November 2023).

Paloposki, O. and Koskinen, K. (2004) 'A Thousand and One Translations: Revisiting Retranslation', in Hansen, G., Malmkjaer, K. & Gile, D. (eds.) *Claims, Changes and Challenges in Translation Studies*. Amsterdam: Benjamins, pp.27-38.

Pantopoulos, I. (2012) 'Two different faces of Cavafy in English: A corpus-assisted approach to translational stylistics', *International Journal of English Studies*, 12(2), 93–110. https://doi.org/10.6018/ijes/2012/2/161771. (Accessed: 5<sup>th</sup>. July 2024).

Payne, R. (1949) The White Phony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated. New York: The John Day Company.

Peacock, M. (2001) 'How Poems Work'. *The Globe and Mail*. Issn 03190714. Mar 31st. D.18. Available at: https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/how-poems-work/docview/384262573/se-2?accountid=130472 (Accessed: 20<sup>th</sup> July 2024).

Peeters, K. and Van Poucke, P. (2023) 'Retranslation, Thirty-Odd Years after Berman', *PARALLELES (GENÈVE)*, vol. 35, no. 1, pp. 3–27, doi:10.17462/para.2023.01.01.

Pellatt, V. (2018) 'Translation of Chinese Paratext and Paratext of Chinese Translation', in Shei, C. and Gao, Zhaoming.(eds.) *The Routledge Handbook of Chinese Translation*. London /New York: Routledge Taylor& Francis Group, pp.3+164-185+170-172+175.

Perberg, M. (1981) The Feel of The Sun. Ohio: Swallow Press Books/Ohio University Press.

Pięta, H. (2021) 'Indirect Translation', in Gambier and Van Doorslaer (eds.) *Handbook of Translation Studies*. Volume 5. pp113-119.

Pleijel, R. and Carlström, M.P. (2022) 'Introduction', in Pleijel, R. and Carlström, M.P. (eds.) *Paratexts in Translation: Nordic Perspectives*. Berlin: Frank & Timme, pp.9-19.

*Portrait* of *a Lady* (2020) Available at: https://web.archive.org/web/20200811004009/http://www.modernamericanpoetry.org/poem/portraitlady (Accessed: 19th August 2024).

Princeton University East Asian Studies Program (no date) *Don't You Know? 知否*. Available at: https://eap.princeton.edu/events/dont-you-know-zhi-fou (Accessed: 23rd Feb 2023).

Puchner, M. (2012) *The Norton Anthology of World Literature (Third Edition): Volume B.* NY/London: W.W. Norton & Company.

Pym, A. (2014) Method in Translation History. London &New York: Routledge Taylor &Francis Group.

Racz, G. (2013) 'No Anxiety of Influence: Ethics in Poetry Retranslation after Analogical Form', *Faculty* of Foreign Languages Publications. 1. https://digitalcommons.liu.edu/brooklyn\_forlfpub/1. (Accessed:5<sup>th</sup> August 2022).

Raffi, F. (2020) 'Resubtitling Italian cinema classics: case studies of De Sica's Ladri di Biciclette (1948) and Fellini's La Strada (1954)', *The Translator*, 26:1, pp. 61-76, DOI: 10.1080/13556509.2019.1696727.

Rayor, D. (2016) 'Reimagining the Fragments of Sappho through Translation', in *BRILL eBooks*. BRILL, pp. 396–412. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004314832\_020. (Accessed:4<sup>th</sup> January 2024).

Rexroth, K. (1956) trs. One Hundred Poems from the Chinese. New York: New Directions.

Rexroth, K. (1970) *Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese.* New York: A New Directions Book.

Rexroth, K. (1987) 'The Influence of French Poetry on American', in Morrow, B. (ed.) *World outside the Window: The Selected Essays of Kenneth Rexroth*. New York: New Directions, pp.143–70.

Rexroth, K. and Chung, L. (1972) Women Poets of China. A New Directions Book.

Rexroth, K. and Chung, L. (1979) Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems. New York: New Directions.

Robinson, D. (2014) *Western Translation Theory from Herodtus to Nietzche*. London & New York: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.

Rosa, A. A., Pięta, H., and Maia, R.B. (2017) 'Theoretical, methodological and terminological issues regarding indirect translation: An overview', *Translation Studies*, 10:2, 113-132, DOI: 10.1080/14781700.2017.1285247.

Rose, A. K. H. (2022) The perfect translation (once more / with feeling). Unpublished PhD thesis. University of Iowa. Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/etd.jbj39720 (Accessed: 29th December 2023).

Rydholm, L. (2017) 'Natural Imagery in Li Qingzhao's Song Lyrics: 'As Fragile as Chrysanthemums'?' in Eksell, K and Lindberg-Wada, G. (eds.) *Studies of Imagery in Early Mediterranean and East Asian Poetry*, Frankfurt am Main, Bern, Bruxelles, New York, Oxford, Warszawa and Wien: Peter Lang, pp. 97–152.

Şahin, M., Duman, D., Gürses, S., Kaleş, D., and Woolls, D. (2019) 'Toward an Empirical Methodology for Identifying Plagiarism in Retranslation', in Albachten, O.B. and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (eds.) *Perspectives on Retranslation: Ideology, Paratexts, Methods.* New York: Routledge: pp.166-191.

Sánchez, J. L. A and Rodríguez, N. (2016). 'The Six Lives of Celestine: Octave Mirbeau and the Spanish Translations of *Le Journal d'une femme de chambre* (Chapters I and II)', in Cadera, S. M. and Walsh, A. S.(eds.) *Literary Retranslation In Context*. Oxford/New York: Peter Lang, pp158-160.

Sanders, V. (2006) 'First Wave Feminism', in Gamble, S. (ed.) *The Routledge Companion to Feminism and Postfeminism*. New York: Routledge. pp. 15-24.

Sapiro, G. (2008) 'Translation and the field of publishing', *Translation Studies*, 1:2, 154-166, DOI: 10.1080/14781700802113473.

Schäpers, A. (2022) 'Good-for-Nothing, Idler or Vagabond? The Spanish Fortunes of *Aus dem Leben eines Taugenichts* by Joseph von Eichendorff', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp. 261-284.

Schögler, R.Y. (2018) 'Translation in the Social Sciences and Humanities: Circulating and Canonizing Knowledge', *Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics*, No. 38, Translation and the Production of Knowledge(s): pp. 62-90.

Scott, C. (2018) The Work of Literary Translation. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Seaton, J.P. (2006) *The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry: Translated and edited by J.P. Seaton.* Boston &London: Shambhala.

Seruya, T. (2013) 'Anthologies and translation', in Gambier, Y. and Doorslaer, L. V. (eds.) *Handbook of Translation Studies (Volume 4)*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. pp.1-2+9.

Sharifpour, P. and Sharififar, M. (2021) 'An Investigation of Retranslation Hypothesis in English Translations of RŪMĪ's poetry', *Translation Review*, 111(1), pp. 26–41. doi: 10.1080/07374836.2020.1860843.

Shuttleworth, M. and Cowie, M. (1997) Dictionary of Translation Studies. Manchester: St. Jerome.

Simmons, R. T. (2021) Authorship Identification of Li Qingzhao's Anthology: A Computational Approach. Honors Theses. 356. Available at: https://scarab.bates.edu/honorstheses/356 (Accessed:8th March 2024).

Spoturno, M. L. (2020) 'Bashir Lazhar on paper and stage or retranslation from a multimodal, intermedial perspective', *The Translator*, 26:1, pp. 77-90, DOI: 10.1080/13556509.2019.1694400.

Susam-Sarajeva, Ş. (2003) 'Multiple-entry visa to travelling theory: Retranslations of literary and cultural theories', *Target* 15(1), pp.1–36.

Sze, A. (2001) The Silk Dragon: Translations from the Chinese. Washington: Copper Canyon Press.

Tahir-Gürçağlar, Ş. (2002) 'What Texts Don't Tell: The Uses of Paratexts in Translation Research', in Hermans, H. (ed.) *Crosscultural Transgressions: Research Models in Translation Studies 2: Historical and Ideological Issues*. Manchester: St Jerome Publishing, pp. 44–60.

Tahir-Gürçağlar, Ş. (2008) *The politics and poetics of translation in Turkey*, *1923–1960*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (2020) 'Retranslation', in Baker, M. and Saldanha, G.(eds.) 3rd edition, *Encyclopedia of Translation Studies (Third Edition)*. London/New York: Routledge, pp. 484-489.

Taivalkoski-Shilov, K. (2015) 'Friday in Finnish: A character's and (re)translators' voices in six Finnish retranslations of Daniel Defoe's Robinson Crusoe', *Target*, 27(1), pp. 58–74. doi:10.1075/target.27.1.03tai.

Tan, Dali. (1997) *Exploring the Intersection Between Gender and Culture-Rereading Li Qingzhao and Emily Dickinson from a Comparative Perspective*. Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Maryland.

Tennyson, A. (no date). *In Memoriam A. H.H.* Available at: https://poets.org/poem/memoriam-h-h (Accessed:24<sup>th</sup> February 2023).

The Los Angeles Review (2024). 2 Poems by Li Qingzhao Translated by Brandon Toh. Available at: https://losangelesreview.org/2-poems-by-li-qingzhao-translated-by-brandon-toh/ (Accessed:20<sup>th</sup> March 2024).

The University of Rhode Island (no date) URI's Great Performances presents Silken Phoenix. Available at: https://www.uri.edu/news/2005/08/uris-great-performances-presents-silken-phoenix/(Accessed: 15th July 2022).

Tian, Chuanmao, Wang, Xu, and Xu, Mingwu. (2022) 'Historico-cultural recontextualization in translating ancient classics: a case study of Gopal Sukhu's *The Songs of Chu'*, *Perspectives*, 30(2): pp181-194, DOI: 10.1080/0907676X.2021.1907425.

Thornham, S. (2006) 'Second Wave Feminism', in Gamble, S. (ed.) *The Routledge Companion to Feminism and Postfeminism*. New York: Routledge. pp. 25-35.

Turnbull, L. (1964) 'On Translating Greek Lyric Poetry', *Studies in English*: Vol. (5) Article 9. Available at: https://egrove.olemiss.edu/ms\_studies\_eng/vol5/iss1/9 (Accessed: 9<sup>th</sup> January 2024).

Uslu, M. (2019) 'The Indicative Role of Retranslations for the Turkish Leftist Discourse: Using Berman's Translation Criticism Path to Analyze Manifest der Kommunistischen Partei as a Case', in Albachten,

O.B and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S.(eds.) *Studies from a Retranslation Culture: The Turkish Context.* Singapore: Springer. Pp.95-116.

Van Bibber-Orr, E. (2013) *A Feminine Canon: Li Qingzhao and Zhu Shuzhen*. Unpublished PhD thesis. Yale University.

Van Dyck, K. (2016) 'Translating a Canonical Author C. P. Cavafy', in Venuti, L. (ed.) Teaching *Translation: Programs, courses, pedagogies* (1st ed.). London &New York: Routledge, pp.110-116.

Van Gulik, R.H. (2004) Erotic colour prints of the Ming period: with an essay on Chinese sex life from the Han to the Ch'ing dynasty, B.C. 206-A.D. 1644. Volume One, Leiden/Boston: Brill.

Van Poucke, P. (2017) 'Aging as a motive for literary retranslation: A survey of case studies on retranslation', *Translation and Interpreting Studies*, 12(1), pp. 91–115.

Van Poucke, P. (2022) 'Non-retranslation as a Special Case of (Non?-)Reception', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (ed.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill. pp.23-40.

Venuti, L. (2004) 'Retranslations: The Creation of Value', Bucknell Review, 47(1): pp. 25–38.

Venuti, L. (2013) Translation Changes Everything: Theory and Practice. New York: Routledge.

Viezzi, M. (2011) 'The translation of book titles. Theoretical and practical aspects', in Kujamäki, P., Kolehmainen, L., Penttilä, E. & Kemppanen, H. (eds) *Beyond Borders – Translation Moving Languages, Literatures and Cultures*, Berlin: Frank & Timme. pp.183–195.

Von Flotow, L. (1997) *Translation and Gender: Translating in the 'Era of Feminism'*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing and University of Ottawa Press.

Von Flotow, L. (2009) 'This Time "the Translation is Beautiful, Smooth, and True": Theorizing Retranslation with the Help of Beauvoir', *FLS*, Vol. XXXVI, pp:35-49.

Waldman, A. (1984) "After Li Ch'ing-Chao", in Makeup on Empty Space, Iowa: Toothpaste Press. Pp.37.

Waley, A. (1918) A Hundred and Seventy Chinese Poems. London: Constable and Company. Ltd.

Waley, A. (1937) The Book of Songs. London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd.

Walsh, A.S. (2016) 'Lorca's Poet in New York as a Paradigm of Poetic Retranslation', in Cadera, S. M. and Walsh, A. S.(eds.) *Literary Retranslation In Context*, Oxford/New York: Peter Lang, pp. 21-51.

Walsh, A.S. (2019) 'Retranslating Lorca's "Ode to Walt Whitman": From Taboo to Totem', in Albachten, O.B. and Tahir-Gürçağlar, S. (eds.) *Perspectives on Retranslation: Ideology, Paratexts, Methods*. New York: Routledge, pp.11-27.

Wang, Jiaosheng. (1989) The Complete Ci-poems of Li Qingzhao: A New English Translation. Sinoplatonic papers, No.13. University of Pennsylvania.

Wang, Ping. (2000) Sturdy Steeds, Autumn Wind, Apricot Flowers, Spring Rain: A literary Stylistic Approach to the Lyrics of Li Yu and Li Qingzhao. Unpublished PhD Thesis. University of Sydney.

Wang, Ping. (2003) 'Stones and Bronzes' in *The Magic Whip*. Minneapolis: Coffee House Press, pp. 54-64.

Wang, R. (2003) Images of Women in Chinese Thought and Culture: Writings from the Pre-Qin Period through the Song Dynasty. Indianapolis/Cambridge: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc.

Wang, Ying. (2016) 'Identity and Narrative: A Special Female Case of Chinese Ancient Autobiography', *Global Journal of HUMAN-SOCIAL SCIENCE: D History, Archaeology & Anthropology*. Volume 16 Issue 1 Version 1.0. pp.1-13.

Wang, Ying. (2023) 'Gender Reconstruction in Chinese Ci When Translated into English', *International Journal of English Linguistics*; Vol. 13, No. 1; 2023. pp.65-73.

Ward, J. E. (2008a) Jean Elizabeth Ward Presents KIMO POEMS. Starward Studio. www.poetryplusart.com.

Ward, J. E. (2008b) Li Ch'ing Chao: Remembered. Starward Studio. www.poetryplusart.com.

Watanabe, K. (2000) 'Feminism: Japan', in Kramarae, C. and Spender, D. (eds.) *Routledge International Encyclopedia of Women: Global Women's Issues and Knowledge*. New York/London: Routledge, pp.769-773.

Whincup, G. (1987) The Heart of Chinese Poetry. New York: Anchor Press.

Whithall, J. (1918) Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade. New York: B.W. Huebsch.

Wilson, K. M. and Margolis, N (2004) *Women in the Middle Ages: an encyclopedia. Volume II: K-Z.* Westport. Connecticut/London: Greenwood Press.

Wixted, J. T. (1994) 'The Poetry of Li Ch'ing-Chao: A Woman Author and Women's Authorship', in Yu, P.(ed.) *Voices of the Song Lyric in China*. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 145-168.

Wu, Shuling and Yuan, Haiwang. (2019) *Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course*. London &New York: Routledge Taylor &Francis Group.

Wu, Yiping and Shen, Cishu. (2013) '(Ir)reciprocal Relation between Text and Paratext in the Translation of Taiwan's Concrete Poetry: A Case Study of Chen Li', in Pellatt, V. (ed.) *Text, Extratext, Metatext and Paratext in Translation*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, pp103-120.

Wyner, Y. (no date) *The Second Madrigal: Voices of Women (1999)*. Available at: https://www.wisemusicclassical.com/work/34634/The-Second-Madrigal-Voices-of-Women--Yehudi-Wyner/ (Accessed: 30th May 2024).

Xi, Chen. (2020) 'When the classic speaks for children Retranslation of Bob Dylan's songs in bilingual picture books', *Babel*, Volume 66, Issue 4-5, pp. 780 - 795: DOI: https://doi.org/10.1075/babel.00175.che (Accessed: 15<sup>th</sup> March 2024).

Xu, Yingguo. (2005) 'Reflections on the Differences Between Emily Dickinson and Li Ch'ing-Chao', *Comparative Literature: East & West*, 6:1, 116-122, DOI: 10.1080/25723618.2005.12015339.

Yang, Funing. (2022) A Comparative Study of English Translations of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poetry. unpublished Honors Thesis. Wellesley College.

Yang, Xianyi and Yang, Gladys. (1974) (tr.) *Records of the Historian*. Hong Kong: The Commercial Press, Limited.
Yao, Dan, Deng, Jinhui, Wang, Feng and Tang, Huiyun. (2012) translated by Li, Ziliang., Gao, Xiaoyan., Li, Guoqing., and Zhao, Feifei. *Chinese Literature*. NY: Cambridge University Press.

Yao, S. G. (2002) *Translation and the Languages of Modernism: Gender, Politics, Language*. New York & Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Yeats, W. B. (no date) *The Sorrow of Love*. Available at: https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/43282/the-sorrow-of-love (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

Yip, W-l. (1997) *Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Yu, P. (1983) 'Li Ch'ing-chao and Else Lasker-Schüler: Two Shattered Worlds', *Comparative Literature Studies*, 20(1), East-West Issue, pp.102-114.

Yu, P. (1994) 'Introduction', in Yu, P. (ed.) *Voices of the Song Lyric in China*. Berkeley: University of California Press. pp. x. http://ark.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/ft129003tp/ (Accessed: 11<sup>th</sup> March 2022).

Yu, P. (2007) "Your Alabaster in This Porcelain": Judith Gautier's "Le livre de jade", *PMLA: Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, 122(2), pp. 464–482. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1632/pmla.2007.122.2.464. (Accessed: 8<sup>th</sup> June 2023).

Yu, Zhongli (2015) Translating Feminism in China: Gender, sexuality and censorship. New York: Routledge.

Yuan, Naiying, Tang, Haitao, and Geiss, J. (2005) *Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Zeven, K. and Dorst, A.G. (2021) 'A beautiful little fool? Retranslating Daisy Buchanan in *The Great Gatsby*', *Perspectives*, 29:5, pp: 661-675, DOI: 10.1080/0907676X.2020.1778047.

Zeven, K. and Dorst, A.G. (2022) 'Characterizing Daisy Buchanan in Retranslations of *The Great Gatsby*: Translator Behavior and Reader Reception', in Cadera, S. M & Walsh, A. S. (eds.) *Retranslation and Reception: Studies in a European Context*. Leiden/Boston: Brill, pp.324-345.

Zhang, Huanyao and Ma, Huijuan (2018) 'Intertextuality in retranslation', *Perspectives*, 26:4, pp. 576-592, DOI: 10.1080/0907676X.2018.1448875.

Zhang, Yue, and Egan, R. (2022) 'Recent Developments in Medieval Chinese Literary Research and Pedagogy: An Interview with Ronald Egan', *Journal of Chinese Humanities*, 7(3), pp.366-379. https://doi.org/10.1163/23521341-12340121 (Accessed: 25<sup>th</sup> April 2024).

#### **Chinese Sources:**

Yelin (2011). 中国古典诗词的域外传播及其影响. (in Chinese) Available at https://culture.ifeng.com/shitan/detail\_2011\_09/19/9293011\_0.shtml and https://culture.ifeng.com/shitan/detail\_2011\_09/19/9293011\_1.shtml (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023) Yelin (2011) *The overseas dissemination and influence of classical Chinese poems*. Available at https://culture.ifeng.com/shitan/detail\_2011\_09/19/9293011\_0.shtml and https://culture.ifeng.com/shitan/detail\_2011\_09/19/9293011\_0.shtml (Accessed: 24<sup>th</sup> Feb 2023).

白云松(2019) 女性主义与诗学: 对肯尼斯.雷克思罗斯和钟玲英译李清照诗歌的研究(硕士学位论文) 云南师范大学 Bai, Yunsong. (2019) Feminism and Poetics: A Study of Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung's Translation of Li Qingzhao's Poems. Unpublished Master Theis. Yunnan Normal University.

" 包 含 凤 情 魡 诗 词 (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E9%A3%8E%E6%83%85.html (Accessed: 28th July 2024) (In 凤 情 Available Chinese) Poems containing (no date). at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E9%A3%8E%E6%83%85.html (Accessed: 28th July 2024) (my translation).

包 含 *ĭ⊞*ĭ 楼 ,, 魡 诗 词 date). Available (no at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E7%94%BB%E6%A5%BC.html (Accessed: 28th July 2024). (In " )囲j 楼 Available Chinese) Poems containing (no date). at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E7%94%BB%E6%A5%BC.html (Accessed: 28th July 2024) (my translation).

Ŧ 含 秋 魡 诗 *ॉन* 包 (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E7%A7%8B%E5%8D%83.html (Accessed: 28th July 2024). (In Chinese) Poems containing " 秋 Ŧ ,, (no date) Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/search-%E7%A7%8B%E5%8D%83.html (Accessed: 28th July 2024) (my translation).

蔡华(2016) 陶渊明五言诗色彩词翻译复译之生态与"副文本"译境探微. *中国文化研究*(01),pp: 90-100. doi:10.15990/j.cnki.cn11-3306/g2.2016.01.010. Cai, Hua. (2016). A Probe into Ecological and Paratextual Contexts in Foreign Retranslations of Color Words in Tao Yuanming's Five-Word Poems. *Chinese Culture Research*. (Spring Volume): pp. 90-100. in Chinese.

常亮(2022) 论典籍翻译的"合本复译" *中外文化与文论*(50). pp.333-344. Chang, Liang. (2022) On "Combined and Retranslated" Texts in the Translation of Classics. *Chinese and Foreign Culture and Literary Theory*. (50). pp.333-344. In Chinese (my translation).

常阳 (2017) 交际—语义翻译理论视角下《李清照词》三种英语全译本的对比研究(硕士学位论文). 河南大学 Chang, Yang. (2017) A Contrastive Study of the Three Complete English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poems from the Perspective of Communicative and Semantic Translation Theory. Unpublished Master Thesis. Henan University.

陈橙 (2011) 从词人到女人:李清照在英语世界中的形象重塑——以《〈金石录〉后序》为切入点. *名作欣赏*(36),147-149. doi:CNKI:SUN:MZXS.0.2011-36-054. pp.147-149 Chen, Cheng. (2011) From Poet to Woman: The Re-imaging of Li Qingzhao in the English-Speaking World—A Study Based on The Postscript to *Jinshilu*. *Masterpieces Review* (36), pp147-149. In Chinese. (my translation).

陈丹(2009) 双性同体视角下的李清照词英译研究(硕士学位论文). 西南财经大学. Chen, Dan. (2009) *Translation Studies of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poetry in the Perspective of Androgyny —A Case Study of Tune: A Twig of Mume Blossoms*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Southwest University of Finance and Economics.

陈慰(2013) 共谋视角下的翻译主体间性(硕士学位论文).电子科技大学 Chen Xue (2013). On the Intersubjectivity of Translation from the Perspective of Collusion ——A Case Study on the Translation of Li Qingzhao's Works. Unpublished Master Thesis. University of Electronics and Technology.

陈小洁(2016) 基于语料库的李清照词译者风格研究(硕士学位论文)江 南大 学. Chen, Xiaojie. (2016) A Corpus-Based Study of Translators' Styles in Three English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Tz'u. Unpublished Master Thesis. Jiangnan University.

陈祖美(2011) 李清照诗词文选评 上海:上海古籍出版社. Chen, Zumei. (2011). The Annotations on Li Qingzhao's Shi, Ci and Essays, Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe, (In Chinese).

陈祖美(2021) *李清照词选* 北京: 人民文学出版社 Chen, Zumei.(2021) *The Selected Lyrics of Li Qingzhao*, Beijing: Renmin Wenxue Chubanshe (In Chinese).

崔敬林(2013) 目的论视角下唐宋词中叠词的翻译研究(硕士学位论文). 东北财经大学. Cui, Jinglin. (2013) A Study of Translation of Reduplicated Words in Tang and Song Ci Poems from the Perspective of Skopos Theory. Unpublished Master Thesis. Northeast University of Finance and Economics.

初大告(1987) *中华隽词一 O 一首* 北京: 新世界出版社. Chu, Dagao. (1987) *101 Chinese Lyrics*. Beijing: New World Press. (bilingual)

大树 (2019) 李清照环形山—"千古第一才女",水星上镶嵌着您的名字 Available at: http://www.liqingzhao.cn/qzgs/52D0665C8C824432A641DC0182D092A4.html (Accessed: 5th. Nov 2022) (In Chinese) Dashu (2019) One crater on Mercury named after Li Qingzhao——the remarkably talented lady through ages. Available at: http://www.liqingzhao.cn/qzgs/52D0665C8C824432A641DC0182D092A4.html (Accessed: 5th. Nov 2022) (My translation).

戴郁莲(2014) 论陌生化手法在诗词翻译中的再现(硕士学位论文). 东华大学. Dai, Yulian. (2014). *The Representation of Defamiliarization In Poetry Translation — A Case Study of English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-Poems*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Donghua University.

付桂英(2012) "三美"理论指导下李清照词英译的美感再现(硕士学位论文). 上海外国语大学. Fu, Guiying. (2012) *Translation of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poems from the Perspective of Three-beauty Principle*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University

龚景浩(1999). 英译中国古词精选. 北京: 商务印书馆出版. Gong, Jinghao. (1999). Modern Rendition of Selected Old Chinese Ci-Poems. Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan. (bilingual)

龚晓斌,吴昊 (2013) 宋词英译:回顾与展望. 短篇小说(原创版), (11):pp.113-114. Gong, Xiaobin, and Wu, Hao. (2013). English Translation of Song Ci Poetry: Retrospect and Prospect. *Short Stories (Original Edition)*. (11): pp.113-114. in Chinese. (my translation).

谷羽 (2012) 李白《渌水曲》在国外的流传. Available at: https://epaper.gmw.cn/zhdsb/html/2012-12/05/nw.D110000zhdsb\_20121205\_1-19.htm (Accessed: 17th. May 2024) (In Chinese) Gu, Yu. (2012). *The circulation of Li Bai's Lushuiqu abroad*. Available at: https://epaper.gmw.cn/zhdsb/html/2012-12/05/nw.D110000zhdsb\_20121205\_1-19.htm (Accessed: 17th May 2024).

郭萍, 刘明东(2018) 毛泽东诗词海外英译本中副文本的身份建构. 湖南第一师范学院学报(04), pp: 46-52. doi:CNKI:SUN:DYHN.0.2018-04-011. Guo, Ping. and Liu, Mingdong. (2018) Identity Construction in Paratexts of Overseas English Versions of Mao Zedong's Poems. *Journal of Hunan First Normal University*. Vol. 18(4): pp 46-52. in Chinese.

洪晓春(2023) 简析古诗词中的"春风"意象. *今古文创*(44),51-53. doi:10.20024/j.cnki.CN42-1911/I.2023.44.016. Hong, Xiaochun. (2023). A Brief Analysis of the Imagery "Chunfeng" in Ancient Chinese poems. *JinGu Creative Literature*. (44),51-53. doi:10.20024/j.cnki.CN42-1911/I.2023.44.016. (my translation) (In Chinese).

侯丽枚(2007) 从归化、异化角度看李清照词的英译(硕士学位论文). 河北师范大学. Hou, Limei. (2007) *Foreignization and Domestication Strategies in Translating Li Qingzhao's Ci-poetry*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Hebei Normal University.

胡银根(2012) 文化语境视角下李清照八首词翻译的对比研究(硕士学位论文). 湖南工业大学 Hu, Yingen. (2012) A Comparative Study on the Translation of Li Qingzhao's Eight Ci-poems: a Perspective of Cultural Context. Unpublished Master Thesis. Hunan University of Technology.

冀爱莲(2010)翻译、传记、交游: 阿瑟·韦利汉学研究策略考辨(博士学位论文).福建师范大学, pp.130-131. Ji, Ailian. (2010) *Translation, Biography, Intercourse: Studies on Arthur Waley's Sinological Strategies*. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Fujian Normal University. Pp.130-131. In Chinese.

贾先慧(2011) 译者主体性与翻译规范的关系探析(硕士学位论文). 哈尔滨理工大学. Jia, Xianhui. (2011) *Analysis of the Relationship Between the Translator's Subjectivity and Translational Norms*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Harbin University of Technology.

康雪娥(2022) 基于 CiteSpace 的国内宋词英译研究(1982-2021) 知识图谱分析 *景德镇学院学* 税, 37(2): pp. 12-16. Kang, Xue'e. (2022) An Analysis on the Knowledge Graph of English Translation of Song Ci (1982-2021) ——Based on CiteSpace Software, *Journal of Jingdezhen University*, Vol.37 No.2: pp. 12-16 (in Chinese).

赖余(1997)"重译, 复译"林煌天(编) 中国翻译词典. 武汉: 湖北教育出版社. Lai, Yu. (1997). "Retranslation" in Lin, Huangtian. (1997) A Companion for Chinese Translators. Wuhan: Hubei Education Press. in Chinese. (my translation).

李成静(2008) 意识形态对李清照词译介的制控(硕士学位论文). 中南大学. Li, Chengjing. (2008). *The Manipulation in Translation of Lyrics of Li Qingzhao: An Ideology Perspective*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Zhongnan University.

李淑敏(2010) 翻译的历史观—《独立宣言》中译本的历时共时比较实证研究 (博士学位论文). 上海外国语大学. Li, Shumin. (2010) A Historical View of Translation an Empirical Study on the Chinese Versions of the Declaration of Independence, Unpublished PhD Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University. In Chinese.

李汶聪 (2021) 翻译中的视角化女性形象塑造(硕士学位论文).上海外国语大学. Li, Wencong. (2021) *Perspectivization and Female Image in Translation — A Case Study of Li Ch'ingchao's Ru Meng Ling*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University.

李延林,季淑凤 (2014) 李清照词在美国的英译方法及启示. 中州学刊(01), pp. 161-166. doi:CNKI:SUN:ZZXK.0.2014-01-033. Li, Yanlin. and Ji, Shufeng. (2014) The English Translation Methods and Implications of Li Qingzhao's lyrics in America. *Academic Journal of Zhongzhou*, (01), pp. 161-166 (In Chinese).

李正栓,朱慧敏(2021) 毛泽东诗词译著副文本作用研究——以五个版本为例. *南京工程学院学 报(社会科学版)*(01),pp: 1-6. doi:10.13960/j.issn.2096-238X.2021.01.001. Li, Zhengshuan., and Zhu, Huimin. (2021) A Study on the Functions of Paratext: Taking Five English Versions of Translation of Poems of Mao Zedong as Examples. *Journal of Nanjing Institute of Technology (Social Science Edition)*. Vol. 21(1). pp: 1-6. (in Chinese).

郦青(2005a)《一剪梅》英译的互文性对比解读. 修辞学习03: pp: 40-42+32. In Chinese. Li, Qing. (2005a) A Comparative Intertextual Analysis of the English Translations of "Yi Jian Mei". Rhetoric Learning (03): pp. 40-42+32. (In Chinese).

郦青(2005b) 李清照词英译对比研究(博士学位论文). 华东师范大学. Li, Qing. (2005b) A *Contrastive Study on the Translation of Tz'u Poems by Li Qingzhao*. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of East China Normal University. (In Chinese).

刘峰,李梓铭 (2021) 老舍《骆驼祥子》英译本的副文本研究. *东北师大学报(哲学社会科学版)*(06),pp. 58-69. doi:10.16164/j.cnki.22-1062/c.2021.06.008. Liu, Feng. and Li, Ziming. (2021). A Study of English Versions of Camel Xiangzi from the Perspective of the Paratext Theory. *Journal of Northeast Normal University (Philosophy and Social Science)*. No. (6). pp:58-69 (in Chinese).

刘果(2017) 生态诗学视阈下李清照词英译研究(硕士学位论文). 长沙理工大学. Liu, Guo. (2017) On the Translation of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poetry from the Perspective of Eco-poetics —With the Translations of Xu Yuanchong and Kenneth Rexroth as the Cases. Unpublished Master Thesis. Changsha University of Technology.

刘锦晖, 文军(2020) 李清照词在英语世界的百年译介综论. *英语研究*(1), pp.141-152. Liu, Jinhui, and Wen, Jun. (2020). An Overview of a Century of Translations of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poetry in the English-Speaking World. *English Studies* (1). pp.141-152. In Chinese. (my translation).

刘娟华(2012) 图式理论视角下李清照词英译的对比研究(硕士学位论文). 广西师范大学 Liu, Juanhua. (2012) A Comparative Study of the Translation of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poems from the Perspective of Schema Theory. Unpublished Master Thesis. Guangxi Normal University.

刘立香,李德超(2021) 中外传唱、译有所为:基于李清照词英译本的语料库考察.*外语与翻译* (3):pp. 9-16 Liu, Lixiang. and Li, Dechao. (2021) When East Meets West: A Corpus-based Study of the Two Translations of Li Qingzhao's Works, *Foreign Languages and Translation*, (3), pp. 9-16. (In Chinese).

刘娜(2015) 认知文体学视角下李清照词英译本的对比研究(硕士学位论文). 福州大学. Liu, Na. (2015) A Comparative Analysis of English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poetry: A Perspective of Cognitive Stylistics. Unpublished Master Thesis. Fuzhou University.

刘玮琦(2020) 李清照词的态度资源英译比较(硕士学位论文). 北京外国语大学. Available at: https://kns.cnki.net/KCMS/detail/detail.aspx?dbname=CMFD202101&filename=1021002063.nh.(Acc essed: 9<sup>th</sup> November 2021). Liu, Weiqi. (2020) *Linguistic Attitude and Its Presentation: A Contrastive Study of English Translations of Li Ch'ing-Chao's Poems*. Unpublished Master thesis. Beijing Foreign Studies University.

刘泽权(2021)数字人文视域下名著重译多维评价模型构建. 中国翻译(05), pp: 25-33+191. doi:CNKI:SUN:ZGFY.0.2021-05-004. Liu, Zequan. (2021) A Digital Humanities-framed Multivariant Model for Assessing the Quality of Retranslations of Literary Masterpieces. *Chinese Translators Journal* (05): pp: 25-33+191 (in Chinese).

刘尊明(2008) 历代词人追和李清照词的定量分析. *合肥师范学院学报*(04),pp.1-6. Liu, Zunming. (2008) Quantitative Analysis of Ci Poetry in Reply to Li Qing-zhao by Poets of Different Ages. *Journal of Hebei Teachers College* (04), pp. 1-6. (in Chinese).

刘尊明,王兆鹏 (1997) 从传播看李清照的词史地位——词学研究定量分析之一.*文献*(03):pp.27-49. Liu, Zunming. and Wang, Zhaopeng. (1997) From the Perspective of Communication: Li Qingzhao's Historical Status in Ci Poetry—A Quantitative Analysis of Ci Poetry Research, Part One. *Literature* (03): pp.27-49. in Chinese. (my translation).

龙丹(2015) 西方女性主义理论建构的中国妇女——以朱丽娅·克里斯蒂娃为例. 妇女研究论丛 (01): pp. 84-91. Long, Dan. (2005) Chinese Women in Western Feminism: Julia Kristeva. *Collection of Women's Studies*. (01): pp.84-91 (in Chinese).

龙明慧(2020) 与时俱进创新翻译——论数字化时代中国典籍复译 *外国语(上海外国语大学学报)* 43(02): pp. 121-128. Long, Minghui. (2020) Innovative Retranslation of Chinese Classics in the Digital Age. *Journal of Foreign Languages*.43(02). pp.121-128 (in Chinese).

鲁迅(2015) "非有复译不可". 罗新璋, 陈应年. 翻译论集 (修订本). 北京: 商务印书 馆. Lu, Xun.(2015) "The necessity of retranslation", in Luo, Xinzhang, & Chen, Yingnian (eds.) *The Collection of Translation Research (revised edition)* Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan. in Chinese. (my translation).

马丽娜(2012) 功能派理论下的创造性翻译(硕士学位论文). 上海外国语大学 Ma, Lina. (2012). Functional Analysis of Creative Translation—Comparison of Rexroth's and Xu's Translation of Li Ch'ing-chao's Ci Poems. Unpublished Master Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University.

毛嘉岳(2014) 宋词英译中的视域融合研究(硕士学位论文). 黑龙江大学. Mao, Jiayue. (2014) A Study on the Fusion of Horizon in the English Translation of Song Lyrics. Unpublished Master Thesis. Heilongjiang University.

毛小雨(1997) 漫画汉英语言精华: 唐宋词. 南昌: 江西美术出版社. Mao, Xiaoyu. (1997) Tang and Song Poems. Nanchang: Jiangxi Meishu Chubanshe. (bilingual)

庞云(2012) 从互文性视角看李清照词中意象的翻译(硕士学位论文). 湖南大学. Pang, Yun. (2012) Images Translation in Li Qingzhao's Lyrics — A Comparison of Two Versions by Xu Yuanchong, and Rexroth, Kenneth and Zhong Ling from Intertextual Perspective. Unpublished Master Thesis. Hunan University.

裴培(2008) 从李清照词的实例翻译谈互文性理论引入诗歌翻译研究的必要性(硕士学位论文). 河北大学 Pei, Pei. (2008) The Necessity of Introducing Intertextuality into Poems Translation Studies from the Case of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poetry. Unpublished Master Thesis. Hebei University.

彭施龙(2017)《橄榄球比赛规则》的重译和案例分析(硕士学位论文). 北京外国语大学. Peng, Shilong. (2017) *Laws of the Game: A Retranslation and Case Analysis*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Beijing Foreign Studies University. In Chinese.

清时日对酒(nodate)Availableat:http://find.nlc.cn/search/doSearch?query=%E6%B8%85%E6%98%8E%E6%97%A5%E5%AF%B9%E9%85%92&secQuery=&actualQuery=%E6%B8%85%E6%98%8E%E6%97%A5%E5%AF%B9%E9%85%92&searchType=2&docType=%E5%85%A8%E9%83%A8&isGroup=isGroup&targetFieldLog=%E5%85%A8%E9%83%A8%E5%AD%97%E6%AE%B5&fromHome=true&fromGuotu=fromGuoTu(Accessed: 2nd July 2024)(In Chinese)Clear Bright(nodate)Availableat:

http://find.nlc.cn/search/doSearch?query=%E6%B8%85%E6%98%8E%E6%97%A5%E5%AF%B9% E9%85%92&secQuery=&actualQuery=%E6%B8%85%E6%98%8E%E6%97%A5%E5%AF%B9%E9 %85%92&searchType=2&docType=%E5%85%A8%E9%83%A8&isGroup=isGroup&targetFieldLog =%E5%85%A8%E9%83%A8%E5%AD%97%E6%AE%B5&fromHome=true&fromGuotu=fromGuo Tu (Accessed: 2nd July 2024), translation by Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone(1992).

裘小龙(2006) 唐宋诗词 100 首. 上海: 华东师范大学出版社. Qiu, Xiaolong. (2006) Poems of Tang and Song Dynasties. Shanghai: Huadong Shifandaxue Chubanshe. (bilingual)

屈文生(2014) 《南京条约》的重译与研究 *中国翻译*. (03): pp.41-48. Qu, Wensheng. (2014). The Retranslation and Study of the *Treaty of Nanking*. *Chinese Translators Journal*. (03): pp.41-48. (in Chinese).

任宇(2022) 阐释学理论视角下李清照词英译对比研究(硕士学位论文). 浙江工商大学. Ren, Yu. (2022) A Contrastive Study on Translations of Li Ch'ing-chao's Ci-poems from the Perspective of Hermeneutics. Unpublished Master Thesis. Zhejiang Gongshang University.

石艳(2013) 翻译适应选择论视角下的李清照词英译本对比研究(硕士学位论文). 浙江工商大学. Shi, Yan. (2013). A Contrastive Study of the Three English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-Poems: a Perspective of Adaptation and Selection Approach. Unpublished Master Thesis. Zhejiang Gongshang University.

史芸,杨枫(2021) 典籍英译的副文本研究. *上海翻译* (2): pp.13-18. Shi, Yun., and Yang, Feng. (2021) The Paratextual Approach to Classical Chinese to English Translation. *Shanghai Journal of Translators*. (2): pp.13-18. in Chinese. (my translation).

孙慧怡(2005) *重写翻译史*. 香港: 香港中文大学翻译研究中心. Sun, Huiyi. (2005) Rewriting *Chinese Translation History*. Hongkong: Chinese University of Hongkong, Center of Translation Studies. (In Chinese).

孙建成,温秀颖(2007)从一首莎诗重译看翻译的语境对话. *外语与外语教学*(03),pp. 56-59. doi:CNKI:SUN:WYWJ.0.2007-03-015. Sun, Jiancheng. and Wen, Xiuying. (2007) Looking into the retranslations of Shakespear's *Sonnet 14* from the Perspective of Contextual Dialogism. *Foreign Languages and Their Teaching*. No. 3: pp: 56-59 (in Chinese).

孙奕(2015) 帕尔默文化语言学视域下李清照词许渊冲译本中意象移植(硕士学位论文). 华中师 范大学 Sun, Yi. (2015) A Study on the Image Transplantation in Xu Yuanchong's Translation of Li Qingzhao's Poetry from the Perspective of Palmer's Cultural Linguistics. Unpublished Master Thesis. Central China Normal University.

谭莲香,辛红娟(2017) 再论典籍复译的必然性. *外语与外语教学*(05), pp. 132-138+151. doi:10.13458/j.cnki.flatt.004436. Tan, Lianxiang. and Xin, Hongjuan. (2017) Revisiting Necessity of Retranslating Chinese Classics. *Foreign Languages and Their Teaching* (5): pp.132-138+151 (in Chinese).

唐聪(2019) 从格式塔异质同构看文学作品中文化意象的翻译(硕士学位论文). 上海外国语大学 Tang, Cong. (2019) *Translation of Cultural Images in Literary Works from the Perspective of Gestalt Heterogeneous Isomorphism —With Reference To the English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poems*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University.

唐艳芳, 王成(2012) 李清照《渔家傲·记梦》英译的美学特征再现——基于定性为主半定量为辅 的译作评价方法的探讨. 浙江外国语学院学报(06),pp. 60-68+85. doi:CNKI:SUN:ZJJX.0.2012-06-012. Tang, Yanfang. and Wang, Cheng. (2012) On the Representation of Aesthetic Features in the English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-Poem Yu Jia Ao·Jimeng: A Discussion of the Translation Assessment Based on the Qualitative Plus Semi-quantitative Approach. Journal of Zhejiang International Studies University, (6), pp.60-68+85 (In Chinese).

滕雄, 文军(2017) 理雅各《*诗经》*三种英译版本的副文本研究. *外语教学*(03),pp.79-85. doi:10.16362/j.cnki.cn61-1023/h.2017.03.017. Teng, Xiong. and Wen, Jun. (2017) The paratextual analysis of Legge's three English Versions of the Book of Poetry. *Foreign Language Education*, Vol (38), No (3): pp79-85. in Chinese. 田 传 茂 (2020) 基于 生 态 翻 译 学 的 重 译 动 因 研 究 . *上 海 翻 译* (04), pp: 57-61+95. doi:CNKI:SUN:SHKF.0.2020-04-013. Tian, Chuanmao. (2020) An Eco-Translatological Inquiry into Factors in Retranslating Endeavor. *Shanghai Journal of Translators* (4): pp: 57-61+95 (in Chinese).

田园 (2019)"重译"概念 初探. 中国科技翻译 (03),pp:47-49. doi:10.16024/j.cnki.issn1002-0489.2019.03.015. Tian, Yuan. (2019) The Connotation of "Chongyi". *Chinese Science& Technology Translators Journal*. Vol. 32. No. 3, pp: 47-49. (in Chinese).

涂慧(2016) 英语世界中国古代词人地位的定量分析. 燕山大学学报(哲学社会科学版) 17(2): pp.1-8. Tu, Hui. (2016). Quantitative Analysis of the Status of Ancient Chinese *Ci* Poets in the English-Speaking World, *Journal of Yanshan University (Philosophy and Social Science Edition)* Vol. 17 No. 2: pp.1-8. (in Chinese).

涂薏 (2020) 英语学界中国古典词译介与研究的宏观特点. *长江学术* (03),pp.59-67. doi:10.19866/j.cnki.cjxs.2020.03.006. Tu, Hui. (2020) General Characteristics of Translation of and Research on Chinese Classic Tz'u Poetry in English-speaking World, *Yangtze River Academic*: 2020 No. 3 (Serial No. 67). pp.59-67 (in Chinese).

 $\square \cancel{K}$  (no date) Available at: https://baike.baidu.com/item/%E5%9B%A2%E8%8C%B6/559037 (Accessed: 11<sup>th</sup> July 2024) (In Chinese) *Tea pie* (no date) Available at: https://baike.baidu.com/item/%E5%9B%A2%E8%8C%B6/559037 (Accessed: 11<sup>th</sup> July 2024).

王炳根(2017) *玫瑰的盛开与调谢:冰心吴文藻合传. 福州:福建教育出版社.* Wang, Binggen.(2017) Meigui De Shengkai Yu Diaoxie Bing Xin Wu Wenzao Hezhuan. Fuzhou: Fujian Jiaoyu Chubanshe. Available at:

https://baike.baidu.com/item/%E5%A4%A7%E4%B8%AD%E5%8D%8E%E6%96%87%E5%BA%9 3/1118641 (Accessed:28<sup>th</sup>. August 2022) (*In Chinese*).

王宏印(2015) 关于中国文化典籍翻译的若干问题与思考. *中国文化研究*(02),59-68. doi:10.15990/j.cnki.cn11-3306/g2.2015.02.002. Wang, Hongyin. (2015) Problems of Translating Chinese Classics and Solutions. *Chinese Culture Research* (02). Pp. 59-68. In Chinese.

王建开(2014) 经典与当代的融合:中国文学作品英译的通俗形态. *当代外语研究*(10),pp:49-54+78. doi:CNKI:SUN:KJYY.0.2014-10-010. Wang, Jiankai. (2014) Leading the Classics to Contemporary Readership: The Popular Approaches to Chinese Literature in English Translation. *Contemporary Studies of Foreign Languages* (10): pp.49-53+54+78. (in Chinese)

王若冰(2020) 译者行为批评视阈下古词中数词的英译对比研究(硕士学位论文). 中国石油大学 (北京) Wang, Ruobing. (2020) A Comparative Study on Numeral Translation in Ci-poems from the Perspective of Translator Behavior Criticism ——Taking Li Qingzhao's Ci-poems for Example. Unpublished Master Thesis. China University of Petroleum.

王晓骊(2015) '浪淘沙' 上海辞书出版社文学鉴赏辞典编纂中心. *李清照诗词辞典鉴赏*. 上海:上海辞书出版社. pp. 105-107. Wang, Xiaoli. (2015) 'Langtaosha', in Literature Appreciation Dictionary Compilation Center of Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe (ed.) *Appreciations of Poems and Lyrics of Li Qingzhao*. Shanghai: Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe. pp. 105-107. In Chinese. (my translation).

王昱, 范武邱(2022) 20 世纪以来中国文学英译的译者合作模式嬗变及思考. *外国语言文学*. 39(01): pp.108-117+136. Wang, Yu. and Fan, Wuqiu. (2022) A study of the development of the translators' collaboration modes in C-E literary translation since the 20th Century. *Foreign Language and Literature Studies*. 39(01): pp. 108-117+136. (In Chinese)

王云燕(2012) 从文学文体学角度分析李清照词风英译(硕士学位论文). 西安外国语大学 Wang, Yunyan. (2012) On *the Style Translation of Li Qingzhao's Ci from the Perspective of Literary Stylistics*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Xi'an International Studies University.

王兆鹏 (2022) 宋词:彰显中华民族文化自信的底气.*中国民族*, (03):pp. 68-72. Wang, Zhaopeng. (2022). Song Ci: Demonstrating the Confidence of Chinese National Culture. *China Ethnicities*. (03): pp. 68-72. in Chinese. (my translation).

王兆鹏, 刘学 (2003) 宋词作者的统计分析. *文艺研究*(6), pp.54-59. Wang, Zhaopeng., and Liu, Xue. (2003). Statistical Analysis of Song Dynasty Poets. *Literature and Art Studies* (6), pp.54-59. In Chinese. (my translation).

王兆鹏, 郁玉英(2008) 影响的追寻——宋词名篇的计量分析. *词学国际学术研讨会论文集*. pp.1-16. Wang, Zhaopeng. and Yu, Yuying. (2008) Seeking Influence—A Quantitative Analysis of Famous Works of Song Poetry. *Proceedings of the International Symposium on Ci Studies*. in Chinese. (my translation).

王仲闻(2020) *李清照集校注*. 北京: 中华书局. Wang Zhongwen (2020) *The Annotations on Li Qingzhao's Collection*, Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju. (In Chinese). My translation.

魏秀云(2012) 李清照词中意象翻译的符号学视域(硕士学位论文). 中南大学. Wei, Xiuyun. (2012) *A Semiotic Approach to Translation of Imagery in Li Qingzhao's Ci-poems*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Zhongnan University.

吴惠娟(2009) *李清照词集*. 上海:上海古籍出版社. Wu, Huijuan. (2009). *Collected Ci of Li Qingzhao*, Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe. In Chinese. (my translation)

谢晓芹 (2016) 顺应论视角下李清照诗词的英译对比研究(硕士学位论文). 安徽大学. Xie, Xiaoqing. (2016) A Contrastive Study of the Two English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poetry-From the Perspective of Adaptation Theory. Unpublished Master Thesis. Anhui University.

新华社 (2017) *中共中央办公厅国务院办公厅印发《国家"十三五"时期文化发展改革规划纲要》*. Available at: https://www.gov.cn/gongbao/content/2017/content\_5194886.htm (Accessed: 20th. Nov 2022). (In Chinese).

新华社 (2022) *中共中央办公厅国务院办公厅印发《"十四五"文化发展规划》*. Available at: https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/2022-08/16/content\_5705612.htm (Accessed: 20th. Nov 2022). (in Chinese).

徐培均(2018) 李清照集笺注. 上海:上海古籍出版 Xu, Peijun. (2018) The Annotations on Li Qingzhao's Collection, Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe. (in Chinese). (my translation).

许春初 (1997) 从"画楼"到"高楼"——浅析唐五代词中的"楼". *古典文学知识*(02), 50-55. Xu, Chunchu. (1997) From "Hualou" to "Gaolou"——analysis of "lou" in *Ci* of *Tang and Five Dynasties*. *Knowledge on Classical Literature* (02): pp. 50-55. (my translation).

许多,许钧 (2015) 中华文化典籍的对外译介与传播——关于《*大中华文库》*的评价与思考. *外语* 教学理论与实践(03),pp.13-17+94. doi:CNKI:SUN:GWJX.0.2015-03-003. Xu, Duo. and Xu, Jun. (2015) Translation and Dissemination of Chinese Classics: on the "Library of Chinese Classics". *FLLTP* (3): pp.13-17+94 (in Chinese).

许钧(1994) 重复·超越——名著复译现象剖析. *中国翻译*(03): pp. 2-5. Xu, Jun. (1994) Repetition and Transcendence: An Analysis of the Phenomenon of Retranslation of Classics. *Chinese Translators Journal*, (03): pp. 4-7. In Chinese. (my translation).

许渊冲(1984) 翻译的理论和实践. *中国翻译*(11): pp5-11. Xu, Yuanchong. (1984) The Theory and Practice of Translation. *Chinese Translators' Journal*, (11), pp.5-11. In Chinese. (my translation).

许渊冲(2011) *宋词三百首:汉英对照*. 北京: 五洲传播出版社 Xu, Yuanchong. (2011) *Bilingual Edition 300 Song Lyrics*. Beijing: China International Press. in Chinese and English.

杨海明(2015) '《金石录》后序'上海辞书出版社文学鉴赏辞典编纂中心《*李清照诗词辞典鉴赏》*上海:上海辞书出版社.pp. 141-152. Yang, Haiming. (2015) 'The Postscript to *Jinshilu*', in Literature Appreciation Dictionary Compilation Centre of Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe (ed.) *Appreciations of Poems and Lyrics of Li Qingzhao*, Shanghai: Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe. pp. 141-152. In Chinese. (my translation).

杨平平(2018) 翻译存异伦理视角下李清照词的两英译本对比研究(硕士学位论文). 西北师范大学. Yang, Pingping. (2018) A Comparative Study of the Two English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci

*Poems from the Perspective of Translation Ethics of Difference.* Unpublished Master Thesis. Northwest Normal University.

殷刘钢(2017) 从阐释学角度分析李清照词的英译(硕士学位论文). 东南大学. Yin, Liugang. (2017) A *Study on the English Versions of Li Qingzhao's Ci-poetry from the Perspective of Hermeneutics*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Southeast University.

殷燕, 刘军平(2017) 国内副文本研究三十年(1986-2016)——基于 CiteSpace 的科学计量分析. 上 海翻译(04),pp: 22-26+94. doi:CNKI:SUN:SHKF.0.2017-04-004. Yin, Yan. and Liu, Junping. (2017) Paratextual Studies in China (1986-2016): A Scientometric Analysis by Using CiteSpace. Shanghai Journal of Translators (04): pp. 22-26+94 (In Chinese).

应 妮 (2021) *系 列 图 书 致 敬 百 岁 翻 译 家 许 渊 冲*. Available at: http://www.cnpubg.com/news/2021/0406/54588.shtml (Accessed:28th. August2022). (In Chinese) Ying, Ni. (2021). *A series of books published paying tributes to the one-hundred-year-old translator Xu Yuanchong*. Available at: http://www.cnpubg.com/news/2021/0406/54588.shtml (Accessed:28th August2022). (my translation).

于紫萍(2014) 用许渊冲"三美说"评李清照词中叠词的翻译(硕士学位论文). 南昌大学 Yu, Ziping. (2014) On the Translation Strategies of Reduplicative Words in Ci-poems by Li Qingzhao Based on Xu Yuanchong's "Three Beauties Theory". Unpublished Master Thesis. Nanchang University.

曾清(2018) 海外毛泽东诗词英译副文本研究. *湖南第一师范学院学报*(04), pp: 53-57. doi:CNKI:SUN:DYHN.0.2018-04-012. Zeng, Qing. (2018). Paratext in the Overseas Translation of Mao Zedong's Poems. *Journal of Hunan First Normal University*. Vol. 18(4): pp53-57. in Chinese.

张春雨(2011) 互文视角下李清照词英译研究(硕士学位论文). 山东师范大学. Zhang, Chunyu. (2011) *Research on English Translations of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poetry from an Intertextual Perspective*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Shandong Normal University.

张李贝(2012) 基于语料库的李清照诗词翻译风格再现研究(硕士学位论文). 上海外国语大学. Zhang, Libei. (2012) *Corpus-based Study on the Reproduction of the Style of Li Qingzhao's Ci Poems*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University.

张珊(2014) 翻译美学视角下李清照词的英译研究(硕士学位论文). 江南大学. Zhang, Shan. (2014) A Study on English Translation of Li Qingzhao's Tz'u Poems from the Perspective of Translation Aesthetics. Unpublished Master Thesis. Jiangnan University.

张彦翠(2014) 关联理论视角下李清照词中的隐喻翻译比较研究(硕士学位论文). 曲阜师范大学. Zhang, Yancui. (2014) *Translation of Metaphors in Li Qingzhao's Ci-poems: a Comparative Study from the Perspective of Relevance Theory*. Unpublished Master Thesis. Qufu Normal University.

张玉洁 (2024) "东风"与"春风": 黛玉花名签引诗辨. *红楼梦学刊*(01),210-221. doi:CNKI:SUN:HLMX.0.2024-01-012. Zhang, Yujie. (2024) "Dongfeng" and "Chunfeng": An Analysis of Daiyu's Floral Name Poems. *Studies on "A Dream of Red Mansions."* (01),210-221. doi:CNKI:SUN:HLMX.0.2024-01-012. (my translation) (in Chinese).

赵璧(2012) 博弈论视角下的重译者策略空间(博士学位论文).上海外国语大学. Zhao, Bi. (2012) *A Study on Retranslator's Strategy Space from the Perspective of Game Theory*. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Shanghai International Foreign Studies University. In Chinese.

赵丽萍(2011) 唐诗宋词中的秋千意象及其文化内涵探讨. 长治学院学报, 28(04):36-38. Zhao, Liping. (2011) The image "swing" in *Tang Shi* and *Song Ci* and its cultural connotations. *Journal of Changzhi University*, 28(04): pp. 36-38. In Chinese. (my translation)

赵明臻,周晓琳 (2007) 中国古典诗词中的"秋千"意象. 现代语文(文学研究版) (06):70. Zhao, Mingzhen., and Zhou, Xiaolin. (2007) The image "swing" in Chinese classical poems. *Modern Chinese (literary studies)* (06): pp. 70. In Chinese. (my translation).

赵倩(2014) 同构衔接在李清照词及其英译中的应用——以李清照《声声慢》及杨宪益、戴乃 迭译本为例 *山西师大学报(社会科学版)*(41)S2:pp: 113-115. Zhao, Qian. (2014) Application of Homogeneous Connection in Li Qingzhao's Ci Poetry and its English Translation: A Case Study of Li Qingzhao's "Slow, Slow Song" and the Translation by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang. Journal of Shanxi Normal University (Social Sciences Edition) (41) S2: pp: 113-115. (in Chinese).

赵毅衡(2013) *诗神远游:中国如何改变了美国现代诗*. 成都:四川文艺出版书 Zhao, Yiheng. (2013) *The Muse from Cathay*. Chengdu: Sichuan Wenyi Chubanshe. (In Chinese).

中国文联艺术研究院(2021) 中宣部印发《中华优秀传统文化传承发展工程"十四五"重点项目规 划》. Available at: https://www.alac.org.cn/content/details\_49\_50249.html (Accessed:28<sup>th</sup> August 2022). (In Chinese) Academy of Literary and Art, CFLAC (2021). *The Publicity Department of the CPC Central Committees issued the '14<sup>th</sup> Five-Year Plan Key Projects in the Inheritance and Dissemination of Outstanding Traditional Chinese Culture'*. Available at: https://www.alac.org.cn/content/details 49 50249.html (Accessed:28<sup>th</sup> August 2022). (My translation).

中华诗词网 (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/ (Accessed: 28<sup>th</sup> July 2024). (In Chinese) Corpus of Chinese Poems (no date). Available at: https://www.haoshici.com/ (Accessed: 28<sup>th</sup> July 2024). (my translation)

钟玲(2003) 美国诗与中国梦:美国现代诗里的中国文化模式(第一版). 桂林: 广西师范大学出版社. Zhong, Ling. (2003) *Mei guo shi yu zhong guo meng: Mei guo xian dai shi li de zhong guo wen hua mo shi(First edition)*. Guilin: Guangxi Normal University Press. In Chinese.

周汝昌(2013) '序言(二)' *宋词鉴赏辞典*(上) 上海:上海辞书出版社.pp. 10-15. Zhou, Ruchang. (2013). "Preface (II)" in *The Dictionary to Song Ci Appreciation (Volume 1)*. Shanghai: Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe. pp. 10-15. in Chinese. (my translation).

朱爱秋(2019) 论李清照词英译本中的女性主义翻译策略(硕士学位论文). 苏州大学. Zhu, Aiqiu. (2019) On the Translator's Feminist Translation Strategies in Li Qingzhao's Ci Poetry. Unpublished Master Thesis. Suzhou University.

朱纯生(2003) 名作精译——《中国翻译》汉译英选萃. 青岛:青岛出版社 Zhu, Chunsheng. (2003) Translation from Chinese Translators Journal. Qingdao: Qingdao Chubanshe (Bilingual)

朱曼华(2018) 李清照诗词英译全集. 北京: 商务印书馆国际有限公司. Zhu, Manhua. (2018) Complete Collection of Li Qingzhao's Poetry Translated by Mansfield Zhu. Beijing: Shangwu Yinshuguan Guoji. Inc. (Bilingual)

朱烨洋 (2011) 《大中华文库》打造"走出去"精品工程. Available at: http://www.cnpubg.com/export/2011/1228/9726.shtml (Accessed:28th August 2022). (In Chinese) Zhu, Huayang. (2011) "The Library of Chinese Classics" is launching a premium-quality 'Going Global' initiative. Available at: http://www.cnpubg.com/export/2011/1228/9726.shtml (Accessed:28th August 2022) (my translation)

诸葛忆兵(2019) *李清照*. 哈尔滨:北方文学出版社. Zhuge, Yibing. (2019) *Li Qingzhao*. Harbin: Northern Literature Press. In Chinese. (my translation).

No.	Time	Authors /Translators	The Title of the Book/Journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces	translator
1	1918	James Whithall	Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade	NY: B.W. Huebsch	1	/
2	1926	Bing Xin	The Translations and Editing of Li Yi-an's Ci	US	25	/
3	1933	Clara M. Candlin	The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs	UK/London: John Murray Limited	2	/
4	1937	Ch'u Ta-kao	Chinese Lyrics	London: Cambridge University Press	1	/
5	1937	Florence Ayscough	Chinese Women Yesterday and Today	Cambridge, Massachusett s: The Riverside Press	15	/
6	1949	Robert Payne	The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated	London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd.	3	Sophia. H. Chen
7	1956	Kenneth Rexroth	One Hundred Poems from the Chinese	New York: New Directions Publishing Corporation	7	/
8	1958	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	Why I Live on the Mountain: 30 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties)	San Francisco: Golden Mountain Press	1	/

## Appendix 3-1: Publications from the 1910s to 1950s

# Appendix 3-2: Publications from the 1960s to 1970s

N 0.	Time	Author /translator	Title of the Book/journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces	Translator
1	1960	Lin Yutang	The Importance of Understanding	Canada/Cleveland. US: The world publishing company	2	/
2	1961	Chen Shou-yi	Chinese literature, a Historical Introduction	NY: Ronald Press	2	Teresa Li
3	1962	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	The Lady and the Hermit: 30 Chinese Poems	San Francisco: Golden Mountain Press	20	/
4	1962	Kai-yu Hsu	'The Poems of Li Ch'ing-Chao'	PLMA	22	/

5	1962	A.R. Davis	The Penguin Book of Chinese verse	Middlesex: Penguin Books	1	/
6	1964	Lai Ming	A History of Chinese Literature	NY: The John Day Company	1	/
7	1962	James, J. Y. Liu	The Art of Chinese Poetry	Chicago: The university of Chicago Press	1	/
8	1965	Duncan Mackintosh and Alan Ayling	A Collection of Chinese Lyrics	London: Routledge and Kegan Paul	2	Duncan Mackintos h
9	1965	Cyril Birch	Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century	New York: Grove Press. Inc.	8	Kwock and McHugh, Kai-yu Hsu
1 0	1966	Liu Wu-chi	An Introduction to Chinese Literature	Bloomington/Londo n: Indiana University Press	4	/
1 1	1966	Hu Pin-ching	Li Ch'ing-chao	New York: Twayne Publisher. Inc.	56	/
1 2	1968	Lucy Chao Ho	More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao	HK: Mayfair Printing Press	44	/
1 3	1970	Kenneth Rexroth	Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese	NY: New Directions	6	/
1 4	1971	Irving Yu- cheng, Lo	Hsin Ch'i-chi	New York: Twayne Publisher. Inc.	1	/
1 5	1972	Kenneth Rexroth and Chung Ling	Women Poets of China	NY: New Directions	9	/
1 6	1977	Julia Kristeva	About Chinese Women	New York: Urizen Books	1	Anita Barrows
1 7	1974	William McNaughton	Chinese Literature: An Anthology from the Earliest Times to the Present Day	Charles E. Tuttle Company, Inc. of Rutland, Vermont and Tokyo Japan	6	/
1 8	1975	Wu-chi Liu and Irving Yucheng Lo	Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry	Bloomington/Londo n: Indiana University Press	13	Eugene Chen Eoyang
1 9	1975	Chung Ling	'Li Ch`ing-chao: Another Side of Her Complex Personality'	Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association	1	/
2 0	1976	John J. Deeny and Kenneth K. B. Li	A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry	HK: Chinese University of Hong Kong	3	John A. Turner
2 1	1976	Herbert Franke	Sung Biographies	Wiesbaden: Steiner	1	Julia Ching
2 2	1977	Lenore Mayhew and William McNaughton	As Though Dreaming: The Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao	Tokyo: Mushinsha Limited	51	/

2 3	1978	edited by Carol Cosman, Joan Keefe, Kathleen Weaver	The Penguin Book of Women Poets	Middlesex: Penguin Book Ltd.	4	Kwock and McHugh
2 4	1979	Kenneth Rexroth & Chung Ling	Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems	NY: New Directions	67	/

Appendix 3-3: Publications from the 1980s to 1990s
--

No	Time	Author /translator	Title of the Book /journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces	Translator
1	1980	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	Old Friend from far away: 150 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties	San Francisco: North Point Press	21	/
2	1980	Stephen. C. Soong	Song without Music: Chinese Tz'u Poetry	HK: The Chinese University of Hong Kong	2	D.C Lau
3	1980	Catherine Cleeves- Diamond	Selected Tz'u Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao	unknown	42	/
4	1981	Mark Perberg	The Feel of the Sun: Poems	Ohio: Swallow Press Books/Ohio University Press	1	/
5	1983	Pauline Yu	'Li Ch'ing-chao and Else Lasker-Schuler: Two Shattered Worlds'	Comparative Literature Studies	5	/
6	1983	Joanna Bankier and Deirdre Lashgari	Women Poets of the World	NY/London: Macmillan Publishing. Co. Inc.	2	Marsha Wagner
7	1984	Burton Watson	The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry from Early Times to the Thirteenth Century	New York: Columbia University Press	4	/
8	1985	Sam Hamill	The Lotus Lovers: Tzu Yeh: Li Ch'ing-Chao	Saint Paul: Coffee House Press	12	/
9	1985	Sam Hamill	Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese	Isla Vista, CA: Turkey Press	3	/
10	1984	James Cryer	Plum Blossom: Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao	Chapel Hill NC: Carolina Wren Press	55	/
11	1985	John Knoepfle and Wang Shouyi	Song Dynasty Poems	Illinois: Spoon River Poetry Press	2	
12	1985	Stephen C. Soong	A Brotherhood in Song: Chinese Poetry and Poetics	HK: The Chinese University Press	1	John Minford
13	1986	Stephen Owen	Remembrances: The experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature	Cambridge/London: Harvard University Press	1	/

14	1987	Greg Whincup	The Heart of Chinese Poetry	NY: Anchor Press	2	/
15	1987	Illona Linthwaite	Ain't A Woman! A book of Women's Poetry from around the world	NY: Barnes & Noble Books	1	Rexroth and Chung
16	1988	Lawrence Lipking	Abandoned Women and Poetic Tradition	Chicago/London: The University of Chicago Press	1	/
17	1989	Jiaosheng Wang	The Complete Ci-poems of Li Qingzhao into English	Sino-Platonic Papers	55	/
18	1991	Kenneth Rexroth	Flower Wreath Hill: Later Poems	NY: New Directions &Penguin Books Canada Limited	1	/
19	1991	Bonnie Mccandless	Chinese Poetry through the Words of the People	NY: Ballantine Books+Toronto: Random House of Canada Lit.	1	Rexroth and Chung
20	1991	Malmqvist, Goran	'A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao (1084-1151)'	Archiv Orientalni	1	/
21	1992	Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone	A Book of Women Poets from Antiquity to Now	NY: Schocken Books	14	Eoyang, E., Barnstone, W.&Sun Chun-chin, Rexroth; Rexroth& Chung, Seaton
22	1992	Li Yu-ning	Chinese Women through Chinese Eyes	NY: M.E.Sharpe.Inc	2	Hu Shi
23	1993	Patricia Buckley Ebrey	The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period	Berkeley/Los Angeles/London: University of California Press	3	Owen+Rex roth and Chung
24	1994	Julie. Landau	Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty	NY: Columbia University Press	15	/
25	1994	Victor H. Mair	The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	New York: Columbia University Press	11	Jiaosheng Wang
26	1994	David Lunde	'Chinese poems from the six dynasties and Sung periods'	Feminist Studies	2	/
27	1994	Pauline Yu	Voices of the Song Lyric in China	Berkeley: University of California Press	1	Owen, S.
28	1994	Almberg, Shiu-Pang E.	'Li Qingzhao: Letter to the Academician Qi Chongli'	(HK)Renditions: a Chinese-English Translation Magazine	1	/
29	1996	Czeslaw Miłosz	A Book of Luminous Things: an International Anthology of poetry	San Diego/NY /London: A Harvest Book/Harcourt Brace & Company	1	Rexroth
30	1996	Stephen Owen	Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911	NY/London: W.W.Norton & Company	4	/

31	1997	Wai-lim Yip	Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres	Durham/London: Duke University Press	1	/
32	1998	Jeannette. L. Faurot	Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry	San Francisco: China Books & Periodicals. Inc.	3	/
33	1998	James R. Hightower and Florence Chia-ying Yeh	Studies in Chinese Poetry	Cambridge/ Massachusetts/Londo n: Harvard University Asia Center	1	/
34	1999	Kang-i Sun Chang& Haun Saussy	Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism	California: Stanford University Press	23	Eoyang, E.
35	1999	Aliki Barnstone	Voices of Light: Spiritual and Visionary Poems by Women from around the World from Ancient Sumeria to Now	Boston/London: Shambhala	7	Barnstone, W.&Sun Chu- chin/Rexro th/ Barnstone, A./Barnsto ne,T.&Cho u Ping

## Appendix 3-4: Publications from 2000 to 2022/2023

N 0.	Tim e	Author /Translator	Title of the Book/journal	Publisher	No. of Li's translated pieces	Translator
1	2000	Sam Hamill	Crossing the Yellow River: Three Hundred Poems from the Chinese	NY: BOA Editions, Ltd.	16	/
2	2000	André Lévy	Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical	Bloomington/India napolis: Indiana University Press	2	William H. Nienhauser, Jr.
3	2000	Victor H. Mair	The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	New York: Columbia University Press	6	Jiaosheng Wang
4	2001	Arthur Sze	The Silk Dragon: Translations from the Chinese	Washington: Copper Canyon Press	2	/
5	2002	Julie Landau	'Tieh Lien Hua: Li Ch'ing-Chao'	Poetry	1	/
6	2003	Eliot Weinberger	The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry	NY: New Directions Publishing Corporation	13	Rexroth
7	2003	Robin. R. Wang	Images Of Women In Chinese Thought And Culture: Writings From The Pre-Qin Period Through The Song Dynasty	Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc.	2	Fatima Wu

8	2004	Wilt Idema& Beata Grant	The Red Brush: Writing Women of Imperial China	Cambridge/London : Harvard University Press	25	/
9	2005	Sam Hamill	Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations	Boston, Massachusetts: Shambhala Publications, Inc.	5	
10	2005	Naiying Yuan, Haitao Tang and James Geiss,	Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose	New Jersey: Princeton University Press	1	/
11	2005	Tony Barnstone& Chou Ping	The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry	New York: Anchor Books	9	Barnstone.T &Chou+Bar nstone,W. &Sun
12	2006	J. R. Seaton	The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry	Boston, Massachusetts: Shambhala Publications, Inc.	8	James Cryer
13	2008	Zong-qi Cai	How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology	New York: Columbia University Press	1	Xinda Lian
14	2008	David Hinton	Classical Chinese Poetry: an anthology	New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.	12	/
15	2010	Wei Djao	A Blossom Like No Other: Li Qingzhao	Toronto: Ginger Post. Inc.	34	/
16	2010	Stephen Owen	The Cambridge History of Chinese Literature Volume 1 To 1375	Cambridge: Cambridge university press	3	Kang-I Sun Chang & Stephen Owen
17	2011	Luo Yuming	A Concise History of Chinese Literature: Volume 1	Leiden/Boston: Brill	6	Translated with Annotations and an Introduction by Ye Yang
18	2012	Sabina Knight	Chinese Literature: A Very Short Introduction	New York: Oxford University Press, Inc.	1	/
19	2012	Martin Puchner	The Norton Anthology of World Literature, Second Edition	NY/London: W.W. Norton & Company	7	Owen
20	2012	Yao Dan et al	Chinese Literature	NY: Cambridge University Press	4	Li Ziliang, Gao Xiaoyan, Li Guoqing&Z hao Feifei
21	2012	Jie Cui and Zong-qi Cai	How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook	NY: Columbia University Press	2	Li E; Jie Cui
22	2013	Micheal Farman	Jade Mirror: Women Poets of China	NY: White Pine Press	23	/
23	2013	Ronald Egan	The Burden of a Female Talent	Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Asia Center	20	/

	24	2017	Michael A. Fuller	An Introduction to Chinese Poetry from the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty	Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press	5	Ronald Egan; Stephen Owen
-	25	2018	Karen An- Hwei Lee	Double Radiance: Poetry & Prose of Li Qingzhao	Singing Bone Press	59	/
	26	2019	Stephen Owen	Just a Song: Chinese Lyrics from the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries	Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press	4	/
-	27	2019	Shu-Ling Wu &Haiwang Yuan	Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course	London/New York: Routledge	1	/
-	28	2019	Ronald Egan	The Works of Li Qingzhao	Boston/Berlin: Walter de Gruyter Inc.	87	/
-	29	2021	Pamela Coren	Li Qingzhao, Poet. A Selection of Poems	FeedARead.com Publishing	41	/

Note: The book titles in red in the above four appendixes are the (re)translated collections of Li Qingzhao's works.

#### Appendix 4-1: Publishing information of 95 (re)translations

The following publications are listed in the format of "date-editors/authors-title of the book/articlepublisher-funding information (noting publications with external funding)"

- 1918: James Whithall. *Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade*. NY: B.W. Huebsch.
- 1926: Bing Xin. The Translations and Editing of Li Yi-an's Ci. US: Wellesley College
- 1933: Clara M. Candlin. *The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs.* UK/London: John Murray Limited.
- 1937: Ch'u Ta-kao. *Chinese Lyrics*. London: Cambridge University Press
- 1937: Florence Ayscough. *Chinese Women Yesterday and Today*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company/The Riverside Press Cambridge.
- 1949: Robert Payne. The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated. London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd.
- 1956: Kenneth Rexroth. One Hundred Poems from the Chinese. New York: New Directions Publishing Corporation.
- 1958: C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh. *Why I Live on the Mountain: 30 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties.* San Francisco: Golden Mountain Press. Asian Literature Program of the Asia Society, NY, under a grant from the National Endowment for the Humanities & National Translation Centre
- 1960: Lin Yutang. *The Importance of Understanding*. Canada/US: The world publishing company.
- 1961: Chen Shou-yi. *Chinese Literature, a Historical Introduction*. NY: Ronald Press. Rockefeller Foundation & John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation
- 1962: James J. Y. Liu. The Art of Chinese Poetry. Chicago: The university of Chicago Press
- 1962: Kai-yu Hsu. 'The Poems of Li Ch'ing-Chao'. PLMA.US Periodicals
- 1962: C.H. Kwock & Vincent McHugh. *The Lady and the Hermit: 30 Chinese Poems*. San Francisco: Golden Mountain Press.
- 1962: A.R. Davis. The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse. Middlesex (UK): Penguin Books.
- 1964: Lai Ming. *A History of Chinese Literature*. NY: The John Day Company.
- 1965: Duncan Mackintosh and Alan Ayling. *A Collection of Chinese Lyrics*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- 1965: Cyril Birch. *Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century.* New York: Grove Press. Inc. Asian Literature Program of the Asia Society
- 1966: Liu Wu-chi. An Introduction to Chinese Literature. Bloomington & London: Indiana University Press
- 1966: Hu Pin-ching. *Li Ch'ing-chao*. NY: Twayne Publishers, Inc.
- 1968: Lucy Chao Ho. *More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao* HK: Mayfair Printing Press. Master dissertation of Seton Hall University
- 1970: Kenneth Rexroth. *Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese*. New York: A New Directions Book.
- 1971: Irving Yu-cheng Lo. *Hsin Ch'i-chi*. New York: Twayne Publisher. Inc. Fullbright-Hays Senior Faculty Grant made by the US Office of Education
- 1972: Kenneth Rexroth and Ling Chung. *Women Poets of China*. New York: A New Directions Book.
- 1977: Julia Kristeva. Translated by Anita Barrows. *About Chinese Women*. New York: Urizen Books.

- 1974: William McNaughton. *Chinese Literature: An Anthology from the Earliest Times to the Present Day.* Charles E. Tuttle Company, Inc. of Rutland, Vermont & Tokyo, Japan. Asian Literature Program of the Asia Society, which acknowledges the support of the National Endowment for the Humanities
- 1975: Wu-chi Liu and Irving Yucheng Lo. Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry. Bloomington/London: Indiana University Press
- 1975: Chung Ling. 'Li Ch'ing-chao: Another Side of Her Complex Personality'. *Journal of Chinese Language Teachers Association*. 10, No.3 (October 1975):126-36. US Periodicals
- 1976: Herbert Franke. *Sung Biographies*. Wiesbaden: Steiner (Germany). Fund from the Gesellshaft von Freuden und Forderern der Universitat Munchen, the Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften, the American Council of Learned Societies
- 1976: John J. Deeny and Kenneth K. B. Li. *A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry*. HK: The Chinese University of Hong Kong
- 1977: Lenore Mayhew and William McNaughton. As Though Dreaming: The Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao. Tokyo: Mushinsha Limited. Asian Literature Program of the Asia Society
- 1978: edited by Carol Cosman, Joan Keefe, Kathleen Weaver. *The Penguin Book of Women Poets* Middlesex: Penguin Book Ltd. Asian Literature Program of the Asia Society& the National Endowment for the Humanities
- 1979: Rexroth, K & Chung, L. Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems. NY: New Directions.
- 1980: Stephen C. Soong. Song without Music: Chinese Tz'u Poetry. HK: The Chinese University of Hong Kong
- 1981: Mark Perberg. *The Feel of the Sun: Poems*. Ohio: Swallow Press Books/Ohio University Press
- 1983: Pauline Yu. 'Li Ch'ing-chao and Else Lasker-Schuler: Two Shattered Worlds'. *Comparative Literature Studies*, Spring, 1983, Vol. 20, No. 1, *East-West Issue*, pp. 102-114. US Periodicals
- 1983: Joanna Bankier and Deirdre Lashgari. *Women Poets of the World*. NY/London: Macmillan Publishing. Co. Inc.
- 1984: Burton Watson. *The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry from Early Times to the Thirteenth Century.* New York: Columbia University Press
- 1985: Sam Hamill. *The Lotus Lovers: Tzu Yeh: Li Ch'ing-Chao.* Saint Paul: Coffee House Press. National Endowment for the Arts for a Small Press Assistance Grant
- 1985: Sam Hamill. *Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese*. Isla Vista, CA: Turkey Press. National Endowment for the Arts and the John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation
- 1984: James Cryer. *Plum Blossom: Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao*. Chapel Hill NC: Carolina Wren Press. National Endowment for the Arts, a federal agency
- 1985: John Knoepfle and Wang Shouyi. *Song Dynasty Poems*. Illinois: Spoon River Poetry Press. Illinois Arts Council & the National Endowment for the Arts
- 1985: Stephen C. Soong. *A Brotherhood in Song: Chinese Poetry and Poetics*. HK: The Chinese University Press
- 1986: Stephen Owen. *Remembrances: The experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature*. Cambridge, Massachusetts/London: Harvard University Press
- 1987: Greg Whincup. *The Heart of Chinese Poetry*. NY: Anchor Press.
- 1987: Illona Linthwaite. *Ain't A Woman! A book of Women's Poetry from around the world.* NY: Barnes & Noble Books.
- 1988: Lawrence Lipking. *Abandoned Women and Poetic Tradition*. Chicago/London:The University of Chicago Press

- 1989: Jiaosheng Wang. *The Complete Ci-poems of Li Qingzhao into English*. Sino-Platonic Papers: University of Pennsylvania
- 1991: Kenneth Rexroth. *Flower Wreath Hill: Later Poems*. NY: New Directions Publishing Corporation/Penguin Books Canada Limited.
- 1991: Malmqvist, Goran. 'A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao (1084-1151)'. Archiv Orientalni 2. no.59(1991):190-93. Periodicals
- 1991: Bonnie Mccandless. *Chinese Poetry through the words of the People*. NY: Ballantine Books &Toronto: Random House of Canada Lit.
- 1992: Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone. *A Book of Women Poets from Antiquity to Now.* NY: Schocken Books.
- 1992: Hu Shih. 'Women's Place in Chinese History' in Chinese Women through Chinese Eyes, edited by Liu Yu Ning. NY: M. E. Sharpe. Inc.
- 1993: Patricia Buckley Ebrey. *The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period*. Berkeley/Los Angeles/London: University of California Press
- 1994: Julie Landau. *Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty*. New York: Columbia University Press
- 1994: Victor H. Mair. *The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press
- 1994: David Lunde. 'Chinese poems from the six dynasties and *Sung* periods'. *Feminist Studies* 20, no.2(summer 1994) by Feminist Studies, Inc. US Periodicals
- 1994: Pauline Yu. Voices of the Song Lyric in China. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- 1994: Almberg, Shiu-Pang E. 'Li Qingzhao: Letter to the Academician Qi Chongli', (*HK*)*Renditions: a Chinese-English Translation Magazine*. Nos, 41&42 (Spring & Autumn)
- 1996: Stephen Owen. *Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911*. New York/London: W.W. Norton & Company. grant from the Bureau of Cultural Planning and Development of the Republic of China
- 1996: Czesław Miłosz. *A Book of Luminous Things: An International Anthology of Poetry.* San Diego/New York/London: A Harvest Book/Harcourt Brace & Company.
- 1997: Wai-lim Yip. *Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres*. Durham/London: Duke University Press
- 1998: James R. Hightower and Florence Chia-ying Yeh. *Studies in Chinese Poetry*. Cambridge/Massachusetts/ London: Harvard University Asia Center
- 1998: Jeannette. L. Faurot. *Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry*. San Francisco: China Books & Periodicals. Inc.
- 1999: Kang-i Sun Chang and Haun Saussy. *Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism.* California: Stanford University Press
- 1999: Aliki Barnstone. Voices of Light: Spiritual and Visionary Poems by Women from around the World from Ancient Sumeria to Now. Boston/London: Shambhala
- 2000: Sam Hamill. *Crossing the Yellow River: Three Hundred Poems from The Chinese*. NY: BOA Editions, Ltd. grants from the Literature Program of the New York State Council on the Arts, and the Literature Program of the National Endowment for the Arts the Sonia Raiziss Giop Charitable Foundation, the Eric Mathieu King Fund of the Academy of American Poets, The Halcyon Hill Foundation, Starbucks Foundation, the Mary S. Mulligan Charitable Trust, The County of Monroe, NY, and the Estate of E.M.K.
- 2000: André Lévy. *Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press

- 2000: Victor H. Mair. *The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press
- 2001: Arthur Sze. *The Silk Dragon: Translations From the Chinese*. Washington: Copper Canyon Press. Centurum Foundation at Fort Worden State Park in Port Townsend, Washington
- 2003: Eliot Weinberger. *The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry*. NY: New Directions Publishing Corporation.
- 2003: Robin Wang. Images of Women in Chinese Thought and Culture: Writings from the Pre-Qin Period through the Song Dynasty. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. Summer Research Grant from Loyola Marymount University
- 2002: Julie Landau. 'Tieh Lien Hua: Li Ch'ing-Chao'. *Poetry*;(Apr 2002); Vol.180, No. 1; pg. 31. US Periodicals
- 2004: Wilt Idema and Beata Grant. *The Red Brush: Writing Women of Imperial China*. Cambridge/London: Harvard University Press
- 2005: Sam Hamill. *Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations*. Boston, Massachusetts: Shambhala Publications, Inc.
- 2005: Naiying Yuan, Haitao Tang and James Geiss. *Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press
- 2005: Tony Barnstone and Chou Ping. *The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry*. NY: Anchor Books, a division of Random House, Inc.
- 2006: J.R. Seaton. *The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry*. Boston, Massachusetts: Shambhala Publications, Inc.
- 2008: Zong-qi Cai. *How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology*. New York: Columbia University Press
- 2008: David Hinton. *Classical Chinese Poetry: An Anthology.* New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.
- 2008: Jean Elizabeth Ward. *Li Ch'ing Chao: Remembered.* Starward Studio. www.poetryplusart.com
- 2010: Wei Djao. A Blossom like No Other: Li Qingzhao. Toronto: Ginger Post. Inc.
- 2010: Stephen Owen. *The Cambridge History of Chinese Literature Volume 1 To 1375*. Cambridge: Cambridge university press
- 2011: Luo Yuming. A Concise History of Chinese Literature Volume 1. This book is the result of a co-publication agreement between Fudan University Press and Koninklijke Brill NV. Leiden & Boston: Brill
- 2012: Sabina Knight. *Chinese Literature: A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Oxford University Press, Inc.
- 2012: Martin Puchner. *The Norton Anthology of World Literature, Second Edition*. NY/London: W.W. Norton & Company.
- 2012: Yao Dan, Jinhui Deng, Feng Wang and Huiyun Tang. translated by Li Ziliang, Gao Xiaoyan, Li Guoqing and Zhao Feifei. *Chinese Literature*. NY: Cambridge University Press
- 2012: Jie Cui and Zong-qi Cai. *How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook*. New York: Columbia University Press
- 2013: Micheal Farman. *Jade Mirror: Women poets of China*. NY: White Pine Press. Grants from Amazon.com and the National Endowment for the Arts; public funds from the New York State Council on the Arts, a State Agency
- 2013: Ronald Egan. *The Burden of a Female Talent*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Asia Center

- 2017: Michael A. Fuller. An Introduction to Chinese Poetry from the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press
- 2018: Karen An-Hwei Lee. Double Radiance: Poetry & Prose of Li Qingzhao. Singing Bone Press.
- 2019: Stephen Owen. *Just a Song: Chinese Lyrics from the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries.* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press
- 2019: Ronald Egan. *The Works of Li Qingzhao*. Boston/Berlin: Walter de Gruyter Inc. Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.
- 2019: Shu-Ling Wu and Haiwang Yuan. *Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course*. London & New York: Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group. Western Kentucky University Libraries' Quick Turn-Around Grants (QTAG)
- 2021: Pamela Coren. *Li Qingzhao, Poet. A selection of poems. Edited and translated by Pamela Coren.* FeedARead.com Publishing (UK publisher).

Appendix 4-2:	<b>Categories of</b>	publishers
---------------	----------------------	------------

categories	No. of publications	
University Press	33	
Funded	19	
Other Publications	36	
periodicals	7	
total	95	

Publishers	No of publications	Publishers	No of publications
New Directions	6	Routledge	2
Penguin	3	Norton	2
Shambhala	3	Macmillan Publishing	1
Random	2		

#### **Appendix 4-3: Translators and popularity**

Time	Title	Translator	Background
1918	Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade	James Whithall	poet translator
1926	The Translations and Editing of Li Yi- an's Ci	Bing Xin	Chinese writer
1933	The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs	Clara M. Candlin	British translator
1937	Chinese Lyrics	Ch'u Ta-kao	Chinese translator
1937	Chinese Women Yesterday and Today	Florence Ayscough	American sinologist
1949	The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated	Sophia.H.Chen	Chinese writer
1956	One Hundred Poems from the Chinese	Kenneth Rexroth	American poet
1958	Why I Live on the Mountain: 30 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	American poets
1960	The Importance of Understanding	Lin Yutang	Chinese writer
1961	Chinese literature, a Historical Introduction	Teresa Li	Chinese American

1962	The Art of Chinese Poetry	James Liu	Chinese American sinologist
1962	'The Poems of Li Ch'ing-Chao'	Kai-yu Hsu	Chinese American sinologist
1962	The Lady and the Hermit: 30 Chinese Poems	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	American poets
1962	The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse	Robert Kotewall and Norman L. Smith	civil servants of Hong Kong
1964	A History of Chinese Literature	Lai Ming	Chinese American sinologist
1965	A Collection of Chinese Lyrics	Duncan Mackintosh	poet translator
1965	Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century	Kwock and McHugh+Kai-yu Hsu	American scholar studying Chinese
1966	An Introduction to Chinese Literature	Liu Wu-chi	Chinese American
1966	Li Ch'ing-chao	Hu Pin-ching	Taiwan poet
1968	More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao	Lucy Chao Ho	Chinese American
1970	Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese	Kenneth Rexroth	poet translator
1971	Hsin Ch'i-chi.	Irving Yu-cheng, Lo	Chinese American
1972	Women Poets of China	Rexroth and Chung.	poet translator
1977	About Chinese Women	Anita Barrows	poet translator
1974	Chinese Literature: An Anthology from	Mayhew/Kwock and	American poet and
1771	the Earliest Times to the Present Day	McHugh/McNaughton	scholar
1975	Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry	Eugene Chen Eoyang	Chinese American sinologist
1975	'Li Ch`ing-chao: Another Side of Her Complex Personality'	Chung Ling	Chinese poet
1976	Sung Biographies	Julia Ching	Chinese American sinologist
1976	A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry	John A. Turner	Irish sinologist
1977	As Though Dreaming: The Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao	Lenore Mayhew and William McNaughton	American poet and scholar
1978	The Penguin Book of Women Poets	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	American poet
1979	Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems	Rexroth & Chung	poet translator
1980	<i>Old Friend from far away: 150 Chinese</i> <i>Poems from the Great Dynasties</i>	C.H. Kwock and Vincent McHugh	American poet
1980	Song without Music: Chinese Tz'u Poetry	D.C Lau	Chinese sinologist
1981	The Feel of the Sun: Poems	Mark Perberg	American poet translator
1983	'Li Ch'ing-chao and Else Lasker-Schuler: Two Shattered Worlds'	Pauline Yu	Chinese American sinologist
1983	Women Poets of the World	Marsha Wagner	American sinologist
1984	The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry from Early Times to the Thirteenth Century	Burton Watson	American sinologist
1985	The Lotus Lovers: Tzu Yeh: Li Ch'ing- Chao	Sam Hamill	American poet translator
1985	Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese	Sam Hamill	American poet translator
1984	Plum Blossom: Poems of Li Ch'ing-chao	James Cryer	American poet translator
1985	Song Dynasty Poems	John Knoepfle and Wang Shouyi	American poet translator & Chinese scholar

1985	A Brotherhood in Song: Chinese Poetry and Poetics	John Minford	British sinologist
1986	Remembrances: The experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature	Stephen Owen	American sinologist
1987	The heart of Chinese Poetry	Greg Whincup	American sinologist
1987	Ain't A Woman!A book of Women's Poetry from around the world	Rexroth and Chung (1972)	poet translator
1988	Abandoned Women and Poetic Tradition	Lawrence Lipking	American sinologist
1989	The Complete Ci-poems of Li Qingzhao into English	Jiaosheng Wang	Chinese mainland teacher
1991	Flower Wreath Hill: Later Poems	Kenneth Rexroth	poet translator
1991	'A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao (1084-1151)'	Malmqvist, Goran	Swedish sinologist
1991	Chinese Poetry through the words of the People	Rexroth and Chung(1972)	poet translator
1992	'Women's Place in Chinese History' in Chinese women through Chinese eyes	Hu Shih	Chinese writer
1992	A Book of Women Poets from Antiquity to Now	Eugene Eoyang, P134-137 Barnstone, W. &Sun Chun- chin, P138-141 Rexroth; P142Rexroth&Chung, J.P. Seaton	Sinologist & poet translators
1993	The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period	Owen 1986+Rexroth&Chung1979	poet translator & sinologist
1994	Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty	Julie. Landau	American poet translator
1994	The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	Jiaosheng Wang+Lin Yutang	Chinese
1994	'Chinese poems from the six dynasties and Sung periods'	David Lunde	American poet translator
1994	Voices of the Song Lyric in China	Stephen Owen	American sinologist
1994	'Li Qingzhao: Letter to the Academician Qi Chongli'	Almberg, Shiu-Pang E.	Chinese sinologist
1996	Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911)	Stephen Owen	American sinologist
1996	A Book of Luminous things: an international anthology of poetry	Kenneth Rexroth	American poet translator
1997	Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres	Wai-lim Yip	Editor& Translator
1998	Studies in Chinese Poetry	James R.Hightower and Florence Chia-ying Yeh	American sinologist & Chinese scholar
1998	Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry	Jeannette. L. Faurot	American sinologist
1999	Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism	Eugene Eoyang	Chinese American sinologist
1999	Voices of Light: Spiritual and Visionary Poems by Women from around the World from Ancient Sumeria to Now	Wills Barnstone&Sun Chu- chin/Rexroth1970+Aliki Barnstone+Tony Barnstone&Chou Ping	American poet translator
2000	Crossing the Yellow River: three hundred poems from the Chinese	Sam Hamill	American poet translator
2000	Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical	William H. Nienhauser, Jr.	American sinologist
2000	The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	Jiaosheng Wang+Lin Yutang	Chinese writer and scholar
2001	The Silk Dragon: Translations from the Chinese	Arthur Sze	American poet translator

2003	The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry	Rexroth and Lung, 1979	poet translator
2003	Images of Women in Chinese Thought and Culture: Writings from the Pre-Qin Period through the Song Dynasty	Fatima Wu	Chinese American sinologist
2002	'Tieh Lien Hua: Li Ch'ing-Chao'	Julie Landau	American poet translator
2004	The Red Brush: writing women of imperial China	Wilt Idema and Beata Grant	American sinologist
2005	Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations	Sam Hamill	American poet translator
2005	Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose	Naiying Yuan, Haitao Tang and James Geiss	Chinese & American
2005	The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry	Tony Barnstone&Chou Ping+Willis Barnstone&Sun Chu-chin	poet translators
2006	The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry	James Cryer	American poet translator
2008	How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology	Xinda Lian	Chinese American sinologist
2008	Classical Chinese Poetry: An Anthology	David Hinton	American poet translator
2010	A Blossom like No Other: Li Qingzhao	Wei Djao	Chinese Canadian scholar
2010	The Cambridge History of Chinese Literature: Volume 1 To 1375	Shuen-Fu Lin	Chinese American sinologist
2011	A Concise History of Chinese Literature: Volume 1	Ye Yang	American sinologist
2012	Chinese Literature: A Very Short Introduction	Sabina Knight	American sinologist
2012	The Norton Anthology of World Literature, Second Edition	Stephen Owen	American sinologist
2012	Chinese Literature	Li Ziliang, Gao Xiaoyan, Li Guoqing and Zhao Feifei	Chinese translator
2012	How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook	Li E+Jie Cui	American sinologist
2013	Jade Mirror: Women poets of China	Micheal Farman	American translator
2017	An Introduction to Chinese Poetry from the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty	Egan+Owen+Michael A. Fuller	American sinologist
2013	The Burden of a Female Talent	Ronald Egan	American sinologist
2018	Double Radiance: Poetry & Prose of Li Qingzhao	Karen An-hwei Lee	American writer
2019	Just a Song: Chinese Lyrics from the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries	Stephen Owen	American sinologist
2019	The Works of Li Qingzhao	Ronald Egan	American sinologist
2019	Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course	Shu-Ling Wu and Haiwang Yuan	Chinese American sinologist
2021	Li Qingzhao, Poet. A selection of poems	Pamela Coren	British sinologist

No.	Time	The Title of the book/article containing Li Qingzhao's (re)translated pieces	Chinese Source material
1	1918	Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade	translated from French by Judith Gautier (1867), <i>Livre de Jade</i> (see cover page)
2	1926	The Translation and Editing of Li Yi- an's Poems	hand-written <i>Shu Yu Ci</i> by the translator (no date, Wang 2017, p.269)
3	1933	The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs	not specified
4	1937	Chinese Lyrics	not specified
5	1937	Chinese Women Yesterday and Today	Shu Yu Ci (no date in reference)
6	1949	The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated	not specified
7	1956	One Hundred Poems from the Chinese	no Chinese, half from French (p. xiii)
8	1960	The Importance of Understanding	Suyu Tze (no date, p.143)
9	1961	Chinese literature, a Historical Introduction	not specified
10	1962	The Penguin Book of Chinese verse	translator's preference (p. xxxix)
11	1962	The Art of Chinese Poetry	Tz'u Tsung, Chuan (no date, p.145)
12	1962	'The Poems of Li Ch'ing-Chao'	<i>Chao Wan-li, Chiao-chi Sung Chin Yuan jen tz'u</i> (Collated Tz'u of Sung, Chin, and Yuan Poets, Nanking: Academia Sinica, 1931 (see primary reference at the end)
13	1964	A History of Chinese Literature	not specified
14	1965	A Collection of Chinese Lyrics	not specified
15	1965	Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century	multiple cited translators
16	1966	An Introduction to Chinese Literature	not specified
17	1966	Li Ch'ing-chao	<i>Shu Yu Yz'u</i> , Kaoshiung: The Ta Chung Book Company. 1964. <i>A Collection of</i> <i>fifty tz'u by Li Ch`ing-chao</i> (p.123)
18	1968	More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao	Shu Yu Chi (漱玉集), Leng Hsueh An 1930 revised edition (冷雪金版) and Li Ch'ing-Chao Chi (李清照集) or Collected Work of Li Ch'ing-Chao, Chung Hua Book Company 1962 edition (p.47)
19	1970	Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese	translator's preference (p. xv.)
20	1971	Hsin Ch'i-chi	Quang Song Ci (no date, see p.138+149)
21	1972	<ul> <li>2 Women Poets of China (1972)</li> <li>2 Women Poets of China (1972)</li> <li>2 Li Ch'ing-Chao Chi (A Collection Ch'ing-chao's Writings). Ed. Chu Shu Chu Shang Hai Pien Chi So. Chung Hua Shu Chii, 1962. (p.14)</li> </ul>	
22	1977	About Chinese Women	translated from French book (1974) by Anita Barrows

### **Appendix 4-4: Chinese source references**

23	1974	Chinese Literature: An Anthology from the Earliest Times to the Present multiple cited translators Day	
24	1975	'Li Ch`ing-chao: Another Side of Her Complex Personality'	<i>Li Ch'ing-Chao Chi</i> (Shanghai, 1962) (see notes at the end)
25	1975	Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry	cited translator
26	1976	Sung Biographies	<i>Li Ch'ing-Chao Chi</i> (Shanghai, 1962) (p.539)
27	1976	A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry	translators or editors' preference (p.2)
28	1977	As Though Dreaming: The Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao	Shu Yu Ci (no date) (p.14)
29	1978	The Penguin Book of Women Poets	cited translator
30	1979	Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems	<i>Li Ch'ing-Chao Chi</i> (Shanghai, 1962) (p.95)
31	1980	<i>Old Friend from far away: 150 Chinese poems from the Great Dynasties</i>	not specified
32	1980	Song without Music: Chinese Tz'u Poetry	not specified
33	1981	The Feel of the Sun: Poems	not specified
34	1983	'Li Ch'ing-chao and Else Lasker- Schuler: Two Shattered Worlds'	<i>Li Ch'ing-chao Chi</i> (Shanghai, 1962) (p.112)
35	1983	Women Poets of the World	not specified
36	1984	The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry from Early Times to the Thirteenth Century	not specified
37	1985	The Lotus Lovers: Tzu Yeh: Li Ch'ing- Chao	not specified
38	1985	Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese	not specified
39	1984	Plum Blossom: Poems of Li Ch'ing- chao	<i>Li Ch'ing-chao Chi</i> (Shanghai, 1962), with occasional browse through Ch'uan Sung Tz'u (Peking,1965) (p.89)
40	1985	Song Dynasty Poems	not specified
41	1985	A Brotherhood in Song: Chinese Poetry and Poetics	not specified
42	1991	'A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao (1084-1151)'	not specified
43	1986	Remembrances: The experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature	<i>Li-Ch'ing-chao chi chiao-chu</i> , ed. Wang Chung-wen. Peking, 1979.
44	1987	The Heart of Chinese Poetry	not specified
45	1987	Ain't A Woman! A book of Women's Poetry from around the world	cited translator
46	1988	Abandoned Women and Poetic Tradition	not specified
47	1989	The Complete Ci-poems of Li Qingzhao into English	not specified
48	1991	Chinese Poetry through the words of the People	cited translator
49	1991	Flower Wreath Hill: Later Poems	not specified
50	1992	A Book of Women Poets from Antiquity to Now	multiple cited translators
51	1992	'Women's Place in Chinese History' in Chinese women through Chinese eyes	not specified

52	1993	The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period	<i>Li Ch'ing-chao Chi</i> (Shanghai, 1962) (p.298)
53	1994	Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty	Li Ch'ing-chao. Nu tz'u jen Li Ch'ing- chao. Ed. She Hsueh-man. Taipei: Wen Kuang t'u shu kung,1961. (p.258)
54	1994	The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	not specified
55	1994	'Chinese poems from the six dynasties and Sung periods'	not specified
56	1994	Voices of the Song Lyric in China	not specified
57	1994	'Li Qingzhao: Letter to the Academician Qi Chongli'	not specified
58	1996	Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911	not specified
59	1996	A Book of Luminous things: an international anthology of poetry	not specified
60	1997	Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres	not specified
61	1998	Studies in Chinese Poetry	not specified
62	1998	Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry	not specified
63	1999	Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism	Li Qingzhao. Li Qingzhao Ji. Shanghai: Zhonghua shuju, 1962+Quan Song ci. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1965
64	1999	Voices of Light: Spiritual and Visionary Poems by Women from around the World from Ancient Sumeria to Now	cited translator
65	2000	Crossing the Yellow River: three hundred poems from the Chinese	not specified
66	2000	Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical	translated from French (1991) by William H. Nienhauser, Jr.
67	2000	The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	not specified
68	2001	<i>The Silk Dragon: translations from the Chinese</i>	not specified
69	2003	The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry	cited translator
70	2003	Images of Women in Chinese Thought and Culture: Writings from the Pre- Qin Period through the Song Dynasty	Shu Yu Ci (no date), see p435.
71	2002	'Tieh Lien Hua: Li Ch'ing-Chao'	not specified
72	2004	The Red Brush: writing women of imperial China	Wang Xuechu, ed., <i>Li Qingzhao ji jiaozhu</i> . Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1979, p.846
73	2005	Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations	not specified
74	2005	Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose	not specified
75	2005	The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry	not specified
76	2006	The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry	not specified
77	2008	How to Read Chinese Poetry : A Guided Anthology	not specified
78	2008	Classical Chinese Poetry: An Anthology	not specified
79	2010	A Blossom like No Other: Li Qingzhao	not specified

80	2010	<i>The Cambridge History of Chinese</i> <i>Literature: Volume 1 To 1375</i>	not specified
81	2011	A Concise History of Chinese Literature Volume 1	translated from Chinese, not specified Chinese source of Li Qingzhao
82	2012	Chinese Literature: A Very Short Introduction	not specified
83	2012	The Norton Anthology of World Literature, Second Edition	cited translator
84	2012	Chinese Literature	translated from Chinese, not specified Chinese source of Li Qingzhao
85	2012	How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook	not specified
86	2017	An Introduction to Chinese Poetry from the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty	Xu Peijun. <i>Li Qingzhao ji jianzhu</i> (Shanghai 2002).
87	2013	Jade Mirror: Women Poets of China	not specified
			Jianzhu Xu Peijun 徐培均. Li Qingzhao
			<i>ji jianzhu 李清照集箋注</i> . Rev. ed.
		The Burden of a Female Talent	Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe,
88	2013		2009. Huibian Chu Binjie 褚斌杰 et al.
			Li Qingzhao ziliao huibian 李清照資料
			<i>彙編</i> . Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1984
89	2018	Double Radiance: Poetry & Prose of Li Qingzhao	Ming-Qing Women's Writings Digitalization Project at the Yenching Library of Harvard University
90	2019	Just a Song: Chinese Lyrics from the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries	Tang Guizhang 1999; Wang Zhongwen 2000.
			Jianzhu Xu Peijun 徐培均. Li Qingzhao
			<i>ji jianzhu 李清照集箋注</i> . Rev. ed.
			Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe,
91	2019	The Works of Li Qingzhao	2009.Huibian Chu Binjie 褚斌杰 et al.
			Li Qingzhao ziliao huibian <i>李清照資料</i>
			<i>彙編</i> : Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1984
92	2019	Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course	not specified
93	2021	Li Qingzhao, Poet. A Selection of Poems	Xu Peijun. <i>Li Qingzhao ji jianzhu</i> (Shanghai 2013). Zeng, Christine (ed.) <i>Shu Yu Ci by Qing Zhao Li</i> . (Zhong Hua Publishing House, 2008).

#### Appendix 4-5: Individual pieces (re)translated

To save space, Li Qingzhao's (re)translated pieces are listed in the format of "date: title of the book/article: number of (re)translated pieces-specific *Ci* in Chinese-page number" (Mandarin is provided for reference)

1918: Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade: (1)-浪淘沙 • 帘外五更风The Wild Swans.pp.32-33

1933: The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs: (2)-声声慢/武陵 春.pp.68-69

1937: Chinese Lyrics: (1)-武陵春.PP.32

1949: The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated: (3)-如梦令, 進伴明 窗 独坐/一剪梅/醉花阴/,pp.330-331

1956: One Hundred *Poems from the Chinese*: (7)-怨王孙・湖上风来波浩渺/小重山・春到长门春 côo qing zhé gū tiến hán rì xitô xitô xiếu chúng diễ liến hải nuốn yũ qingtêng chủ pỏ dong yǐ jiến méi hàn xi sho 草青/鹧鸪天·•夷日萧萧上琐窗/蝶恋花•暖雨晴风初破冻/一剪梅/浣溪沙•淡荡春光寒食天/浣溪 动心 viô yunxine/uningchún gô 春色深.pp.107-14

1960: The Importance of Understanding: (2)-声声慢/《金石录》后序.pp.143-145

1961: Chinese Literature, a Historical Introduction: (2)-声声慢/武陵春.pp.406

1962: The Art of Chinese Poetry: (1)-浣溪沙 • 楼上晴天碧四垂.pp.51

1962: The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse: (1)-武陵春.pp.45

1964: A History of Chinese Literature with a preface by Lin Yutang: (1)- 好事近.pp.228

1965: A Collection of Chinese Lyrics: (2)-醉花阴/声声慢.pp.143-147

# 1966: An Introduction to Chinese Literature: (4)-一剪梅/醉花阴/武陵春/声声慢.pp.106+115-118

1966: Li Ch'ing-chao: (56)- $\ddot{w}$  and  $\ddot{w}$  moi huè den aborg  $\dot{y}$  ipin moi sherged  $\dot{z}$  if  $\dot{z}$  are  $\dot{z}$  is the shere aborg in  $\dot{z}$  is the shere  $\dot{z}$  is  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  is  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  is  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  is  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  is  $\dot{z}$  in  $\dot{z}$  i

1968: More Gracile Than Yellow Flowers: The Life and Works of Li Ch'ing-chao: (44)- $\frac{1}{2}$  [1969]/ $\frac{1}{2}$  merging changing is xi ting if in the relieve of the finance of the time interval of the relieve of the time interval of the relieve of

1970: Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese: (6)-声声慢 zal huð yin shēng zho zi /醉花阴/生查子•年年玉镜台/武陵春/一剪梅/凤凰台上忆吹箫.pp.183-193

1971: Hsin Ch'i-chi.(1)-怨王孙•湖上风来波浩渺.pp.97-99

1972: Women Poets of China: (9)-减字术兰花• 载花担上/小重山 •春到长门春草青/如梦令•常 jì xī tíng rì mò lán huð mið ný ling chan yð jið ðo rì xī tíng rì mò lán huð mið ný ging feng cha pó ðong wð ling chan yð jið ðo 记溪亭日暮/蝶恋花• 暖雨晴风初祓冻/武陵春/渔家傲• 天接云涛连晓雾/永遇乐/点绛唇• 蹴罢秋 "千/丑奴儿•晚来一阵风兼雨,pp.36-44

1977: About Chinese Women: (1)-声声慢.pp.91-93

1974: Chinese Literature: An Anthology from the Earliest Times to the Present Day: (6)-如梦令 · 常 <sup>j1 x1</sup> ting ri mo ro menging zuo ye yo sho (engrico huén x1 sho 记溪亭日暮/如梦令 · 昨夜雨疏风骤/浣溪沙 · 淡荡春光寒食天/浣溪沙 · 髻子伤春慵更梳/武陵春 <sup>shongshongman</sup> /声声慢.pp.400-404

1975: Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry: (13)-清平乐 • 年年雪里/武陵春 200 non ge zl /南歌子・天上星河转/醉花阴/小重山・春到长门青草春/减字木兰花・卖花担上/念奴娇・萧条 tiggyah ni ménging ji xi ting ni mi zu yè yā shu čengzhu huán xi shu 庭院/如梦令・常记溪号日暮/昨夜雨疏风骤/浣溪沙・淡荡春光寒食天/小院闲窗春色深/丑奴 儿·晚来一阵风兼雨/诉衷情。夜来沉醉卸 妆迟.pp.366-371

1975: 'Li Ch`ing-chao: Another Side of Her Complex Personality': (1)-武陵春.

1976: Sung Biographies: (1)-如梦令•谁伴明窗独坐.pp. 530-539

1976: A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry: (3)-渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/声声慢/如梦令·昨夜雨 疏风骤.pp.248-255

1977: As Though Dreaming: The Tz'u of Pure Jade by Li Ch'ing-chao: (51)-i.i.\$ and the set of the

1978: The Penguin Book of Women Poets: (4)-点绛唇•蹴罢秋千/减字木兰花•卖花担上/蝶恋花•永 後恹恹欢意少/永遇乐.pp.82-85

1979: Li Ch'ing-chao: Complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en en en interprete en en en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de la complete Poems: (67) -uber de statistic en entre de tradition de tradi

1980: Song without Music: Chinese Tz'u Poetry: (2)-如梦令 · 常记溪亭日暮/如梦令 · 昨夜雨疏风 骤.pp.21-22

1981: The Feel of the Sun: Poems: (1)-孤雁此.PP.53

1983: 'Li Ch'ing-chao and Else Lasker-Schuler: Two Shattered Worlds': (5)-声声慢/一剪梅/醉花 加減時間 2018年 個/武陵春/渔家傲•天接云涛连晓雾.pp.102-114

1983: Women Poets of the World: (2)-声声慢/一剪梅/醉花阴.pp.20

1984: The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry From Early Times to the Thirteenth Century: (4)丑奴 "L"•晚来一阵风兼雨/诉衷情 •夜来沉醉卸 妆迟/如梦令 •常记溪亭日暮/清平乐 •年年雪里.pp.188-189

1984: The Lotus Lovers: Tzu Yeh: Li Ch'ing-Chao: (12)-春残/一剪梅/鹧鸪天•寒日萧萧上琐窗/营 s<sup>6</sup> mán · fēng róu rl béo chán yóu zéo jián zl mú lán huð án shéng wú líng chán de linn huð nuán yú ging fēng chú pộ dóng dönjiðng chú jú nó sten sé mán · fēng róu rl béo chán yóu zéo jián zl mú lán huð én shéng wú líng chún de linn huð nuán yú ging fēng chú pộ dóng dönjiðng chún jí mó sten (12)-春残/一剪梅/鹧鸪天•寒日萧萧上琐窗 / 菩 guí zei huð yín yóng yú lé huðu xi shó 闺/醉花阴/永遇乐/浣溪沙•小院闲窗春色深/生查子• 年年玉镜台

1985: Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese: (3)-浣溪沙 • 绣面芙蓉一笑开/好事近/浣溪沙 • 小 winxinchungedin se shin 院闲窗春色深,pp.46-48

1985: Song Dynasty Poems: (2)-夏日绝句/如梦令•昨夜雨疏风骤.pp.18+54-55.

1985: A Brotherhood in Song: Chinese Poetry and Poetics: (1)-醉花阴.pp.200

1991: 'A Note on a Lyrical Poem by Li Qingzhao(1084-1151)': (1)-声声慢.pp.190-193

1986: *Remembrances: The experience of the Past in Classical Chinese Literature*: (1) 《金石录》后 序.pp.81-98

1987: The Heart of Chinese Poetry: (2)-醉花阴/武陵春.pp.118-123

1987: Ain't A Woman! A book of Women's Poetry from around the world: (1)-永遇乐.pp.170

1988: Abandoned Women and Poetic Tradition: (1)-声声慢.pp.27

1991: Chinese Poetry through the words of the People: (1)-小重山•春到长门春草青.pp.62

1991: Flower Wreath Hill: Later Poems: (1)-声声慢.pp.48

1992: A Book of Women Poets from Antiquity to Now: (14)-如梦令 常记溪亭日暮/孤雁儿/蝶恋 hud yū qingfēng chi pò dong yū jič do tiān jič yūn teo liān xiðo wu ri mengling vi yð shu fengshu xiðochángshan chān dö cháng ménchan cið ar ging feng huð yū ging feng huð yū jič do tiðn jič yūn teo liān xiðo wu ri mengling vi yð shu fengshu xiðochángshan chān dö cháng ménchan cið ar ging she ng ku yū ging feng huð yū jing téi fengshuáng téi sheng yì chul xiéo yì jiðn méi zul huð yin shengsheng mán zul huð yin diðnjöngchan cið bé gið giðn míng ri /生 查子 •年年玉镜台/凤凰台上忆吹箫/一剪梅/醉花阴/声声慢/醉花阴/点绛唇 • 蹴罢秋千/明日 du jin 对酒.pp.133-142

1992: 'Women's Place in Chinese History' *in Chinese women through Chinese eyes*: (2)-《金石录》 后序/《打马图经》序.pp.8-10

1993: The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period: (3)-《金石 录》后序/醉花阴/转调满庭芳•芳草池塘.pp.159-160

1994: Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty: (15)-如参。cong ji Xi ting i nu hu mending 200 ye yo shu fangzhou yo jia ao tian jie yan too lian xiao wa yi jian mei fanghudag tei shang yi chu xiao hun xi shu xiao younxianchungha se shan zu huo yin 南疏风骤/渔家傲•天接云涛连晓雾/一剪梅/凤凰台上忆吹箫/浣溪沙•小院闲窗春色深/醉花阴/ 添字采桑子.芭蕉/念奴娇•萧条庭院/永遇乐/武陵春/声声慢/临江仙•庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁 春迟&云窗雾阁常扃)/如梦令•谁伴明窗独坐.pp.160-174

1994: 'Chinese poems from the six dynasties and Sung periods': (2)醉花阴/武陵春.pp.367-369

1994: Voices of the Song Lyric in China: (1)-声声慢. pp.60

1994: 'Li Qingzhao: Letter to the Academician Qi Chongli': (1)-綦 密礼信.pp.79-84

1996: Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911 : (4)-渔家傲 •天接云涛连晓雾/南歌子 •天 shōnxīng hé zhuǎn shēnshēng màn rū mēnglīng · cháng jī xī tīng rī mù jīn shī lù 上星河转/声声慢/如梦令 • 常记溪亭日暮/《金石录》后序.pp.624-627+635-640

1996: A Book of Luminous Things: an International Anthology of Poetry: (1)-声声慢.pp.218

1997: Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres: (1)-如梦令•昨夜雨疏风骤.pp.327

1998: Studies in Chinese Poetry: (1)-渔家傲•天接云涛连晓雾.pp.146

1998: Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry: (3)-一剪梅/醉花阴/声声 慢.pp.116-121

1999: Voices of Light: Spiritual and Visionary Poems by Women from around the World from Ancient Sumeria to Now: (7)-孤雁儿/渔家傲 • 天接云涛连晓雾/蝶恋花 • 暖雨晴风初破冻/浣溪沙 • 莫许杯 家琥珀浓/如梦令 • 常记溪亭日暮/武陵春/生查子 • 年年玉镜台.pp.56-59

2000: Crossing the Yellow River: Three Hundred Poems from the Chinese: (16)-好事近(two similar poems)/浣溪沙 · 绣面芙蓉一笑开/鹧鸪天 · 暗淡轻黄体性柔/春残/一剪梅/鹧鸪天 · 寒日萧萧上琐 (chinese pienese)/浣溪沙 · 绣面芙蓉一笑开/鹧鸪天 · 暗淡轻黄体性柔/春残/一剪梅/鹧鸪天 · 寒日萧萧上琐 (chinese pienese)/浣溪沙 · 沙сара (chinese pienese)/浣溪沙 · 沙сара (chinese pienese)/浣溪沙 · 沙сара (chinese pienese)/淙溪沙 · 沙сара (chinese pienese)/ (chinese pienese)/ (chinese)/ (chinese)

2000: Chinese Literature, Ancient and Classical: (2)-声声慢/诉衷情•夜来沉醉卸妆迟.pp.96-100

2000: The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature: (6)-点绛唇, 號罢秋千/減 字木兰花,卖花担上/渔家傲,天接云涛连晓雾/声声慢/武陵春/《金石录》后序.pp.195-198

2001: The Silk Dragon: Translations from the Chinese: (2)-醉花阴/诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟.pp.53-54

2003: The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry: (13)-春戌/一剪梅/满庭芳 · non tig teng hun x bog e zngchun shengsheng men tin z) ci sing z] · chung gin shut zhong bi jio shu pi shu ma feng ru tì bo chunyu zo xi ngxing z] · tin yù gi guan hun xi shu zi ovu xing men tin z) ci shu pi shu ma feng ru tì bo chunyu zo xi ngxing z] · tin yù gi guan hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung gin hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung gin hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung gin hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung gin hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung gin hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung gin hun xi shu zi ovu xing tio chung tio chung yu ging feng chung yu ting feng chung yu ting feng tio pi chung yu ging feng chung yu ting feng tio pi chung yu ting feng ti chung yu ti t

2003: Images Of Women In Chinese Thought And Culture: Writings from the Pre-Qin Period through the Song Dynasty: (2)-如梦令 • 谁伴明 窗 独坐/武陵春.pp.450-451

2002: 'Tieh Lien Hua Li Ch'ing-Chao': (1)-蝶恋花 • 永夜恹恹欢意少.pp.31

2005: Almost Paradise: New and Selected Poems and Translations : (5)-一剪梅/武陵春/永遇乐/浣溪 炒•小院闲窗春色深/生查子•年年玉镜台.pp.41-43

2005: Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose: (1)-如梦令•昨夜雨疏风骤.pp.146-148

2005: The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry: (9)-醉(約/一剪梅/武陵春•春晚/浣溪沙•莫许杯深琥 pö nóng rú mèngilng cháng jì xǐ tíng rì mó lín jiðngxiðn tíngyuðnsbensbensben jǐ xǔ yún chúng wù gé chángijóng gū yón ér yú jið dó 珀浓/如梦令•常记溪亭日暮/临江仙•庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁常扃)/孤雁儿/渔家傲•天接云 tög lín xiðo wù gé lín huð 涛连晓雾/蝶恋花•暖风晴雨初破冻.pp.493-498

2008: How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology: (1)-声声慢.pp.273-276

2008: Classical Chinese Poetry: an Anthology: (12)-丑奴儿 • 晚来一阵风兼雨/如梦令/常记溪亭 rì mù pin lìng luò cán hóng zi hui yin diánjiðngchún củ bờ giù giản yu nưmởng sửn hủ shờng feng lài bù bào miðo rì mêngling shu bàn míngchuống 日暮/品令 • 蒙弦成幻醉花阴/点绛庵。 或 医子子的 "说 是人来波浩渺/如梦令 • 谁伴 明 窗 他 zwò wù lìng chún sử zhông quy yi lài chún zul xiù zhuông chí tin zì chúu mũ crì 独坐/武陵春/诉衷情 • 夜来沉醉即 妆迟/添字丑奴儿 • 窗 前谁种芭蕉树/清平乐 • 年年雪里/临江 ǔủ • 庭院深深深几许(云 窗 雾阁常扃).pp.493-504

2010: The Cambridge History of Chinese Literature Volume 1 To 1375: (3)-夏日绝句/永遇乐/声声 慢.pp.502-504+523

2011: A Concise History of Chinese Literature Volume 1: (6)-夏日绝句/如梦令•昨夜雨疏风骤/一 jiān méi shēngshēngmàn yǒng yù lè wǔ ling chún 剪梅/声声慢/永遇乐/武陵春.pp.511-515

2012: Chinese Literature: A Very Short Introduction: (1)-武陵春.pp.66

2012: The Norton Anthology of World Literature, Second Edition: (7)-《金石录》后序/南歌子•天 shóngxīng hé zhuán yú jiě če tián jiế yán téo lián xiếo vù rừ méngling cháng jì xí tíng rì mù zu huá yín vũ lingchún shěngshěngmèn 上星河转/渔家傲 •天接云涛连晓雾/如梦令 •常记溪亭日暮/醉花阴/武陵春/声声慢.pp.1061-1071 2012: Chinese Literature: (4)-如梦令 • 常记溪亭日暮/醉花阴/声声慢/夏日绝句.pp.112

2012: How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook: (2)-一剪梅/武陵春.pp.44-47+206-208

2013: Jade Mirror: Women poets of China: (23)-鹧鸪天 · 暗淡轻黄体性柔/殢人娇· 后亭梅花有感 nin ni liao xiao tió tig yao ho kỳ lịn để lian hei yôn yê yào yào hoào xi ô chông shôn chông mên chông do chông do chông mên chông do chôn

2017: An Introduction to Chinese Poetry From the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty: (5)-词论/声声慢/如梦令•昨夜雨疏风骤/如梦令•常记溪亭日暮/永遇乐.pp.408-416

2018: Double Radiance: Poetry & Prose of Li Qingzhao: (59)- $\sin \phi \circ \sin \psi$ . Like field is /  $\sin \phi \circ \sin \psi$ . The most of the product of the product

2019: The Works of Li Qingzhao: (87)-南歌子·天上星河转/转调满庭芳·芳草池塘/渔家傲·天 ji g yun too lion xiko yu ru menulug 接云涛连晓雾/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/如梦令·哈夜雨疏风骤/多丽·小楼寒/菩萨蛮·风柔日薄 春犹早/菩萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧/浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/浣溪沙·统 changyu zao pi so man aut haugshengdun can yun bl. huản xi sha 春犹早/菩萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧/浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/浣溪沙·统 changyu zao pi so man aut haugshengdun can yun bl. huản xi sha 春犹早/菩萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧/浣溪沙·美许杯深琥珀浓/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/浣溪沙· changyu zao pi so man 春秋早/菩萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧/浣溪沙·美许杯深琥珀浓/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/浣溪沙· changyu zao pi so man 春秋早/菩萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧/浣溪沙· changyu zao pi so man 春秋年/蔷薇金·归鸿声断残云碧/浣溪沙· changyu zao pi so man 春秋年/苔萨蛮·小陵闲窗春色深/浣溪沙· changyu zao pi so man 春秋年/香萨蛮·小陵和香色大/四星台上忆吹箫/一剪梅/蝶恋花· auto più no man di di lin huà shang (mg lui bù huản yi sha shang (mg lui bù huàn yi sha shang (mg lui bù huàn

2019: Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course: (1)-<sup>y1 jign méi</sup>.pp.136-146

2021: Li Qingzhao, Poet. A Selection of Poems: (41)-满庭芳 · 小腐藏春/玉楼春 · 红酥肯放琼瑶碎/南歌子·天上星河转/狐雁儿/转调满庭芳 · 芳草池塘/春残/分得知字/渔家傲 · 无接云涛连晓雾/ 「南歌子 · 天上星河转/狐雁儿/转调满庭芳 · 芳草池塘/春残/分得知字/渔家傲 · 无接云涛连晓雾/ "如夢令 · 昨夜雨疏风骤/渔家傲 · 雪里已知春信至/菩萨蛮 · 风柔日薄春犹早/菩萨蛮 · 归鸿声断残 "如梦令 · 昨夜雨疏风骤/渔家傲 · 雪里已知春信至/菩萨蛮 · 风柔日薄春犹早/菩萨蛮 · 归鸿声断残 "如 bì hươn xi sho mo xi bi shen hì pì nơng rì mèngling · chang jì xi ting rì mù ginh nóng bù là hương yì the chang hì ng yì hương yì bù cháng "如梦令 · 昨夜雨疏风骤/渔家傲 · 雪里已知春信至/菩萨蛮 · 风柔日薄春犹早/菩萨蛮 · 归鸿声断残 "如 bì hươn xi sho mo xi bèi shen hì pì nơng rì mèngling · chang jì xi ting rì mù ginh mà ginh hương yì the chang yì the chang yì the chang yì the pà hướng yì bù hương yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the bà hương yì the pà hơng yì the pà hương yì the pà hương yì the pà hướng yì the pà hương yì the pà hướng yì the pà hương yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hương yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng yà the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng hướng yì the pà hướng yì the pà hơng hướng hướng hướng hơng hướng yì the pà hơng hướng hơ

# Appendix 4-6: Popularity of individual pieces (re)translated

translated source pieces	Included frequency	translated source pieces	Included frequency
声声慢	47	怨王孙·帝里春晚	9
武陵春	45	丑奴儿·晚来一阵风兼雨	9
醉花阴	40	玉楼春·红酥肯放琼瑶碎	9
一剪梅	37	殢人娇·玉瘦香浓	9
如梦令·常记溪亭日暮	31	春残	9
渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾	30	临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗 雾阁春迟)	9
如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤	27	著萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧	8
永遇乐	27	感怀	8
减字木兰花·卖花担上	21	流溪沙·楼上晴天碧四垂	7
浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深	21	庆清朝·禁幄低张	7
孤雁儿·藤床纸帐朝眠起	21 20	如梦令·谁伴明窗独坐	7
凤凰台上忆吹箫	19	如多受·唯件防菌强坐 转调满庭芳·芳草池塘	7
			7
诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟	19	浪淘沙·帘外五更风	-
蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻	19	浪淘沙·素约小腰身	6
蝶恋花·永夜恹恹欢意少	18	品令·零落残红	6
点绛唇·蹴罢秋千	18	晓梦	6
怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺	17	分得知字	5
好事近·风定落花深	17	偶成	5
念奴娇·萧条庭院	17	词论	4
菩萨蛮・风柔日薄春犹早	17	吾溪中興颂诗和张文潜(二 首)	4
点绛唇·寂寞深闺	16	咏史	4
南歌子·天上星河转	16	青玉案·征鞍不见邯郸路	5
小重山·春到长门春草青	16	夜发严潍	3
清平乐·年年雪里	15	题八咏楼	3
鹧鸪天·寒日萧萧上琐窗	15	皇帝阁端午帖子	3
添字丑奴儿·窗前谁种芭蕉树	14	春光好·看看腊尽春回	1
浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天	13	上框密斡公工部尚胡公	2
蝶恋花·泪揾征衣脂粉暖	13	打馬系列	2
乌江/夏日绝句	13	皇后阁端午帖子	2
临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁 常扃)	13	夫人阁端午帖子	2
生查子·年年玉镜台	12	投翰林学士綦崈礼密信	2
行香子·草际鸣蛩	12	长寿乐·微寒应侯	1
山花子·病起萧萧两鬓华	12	河传·香苞素质	1
渔家傲·雪里已知春信至	12	七娘子·清香浮动到黄昏	1
金石录后序	12	忆少年·疏疏整整	1
忆秦娥·临高阁	12	玉楼春·腊前先报东君信	1
鹧鸪天·暗淡轻黄体性柔	11	新荷叶·薄露初零	1
浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓	11	木兰花令·沉水香消人悄悄	1
浣溪沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开	10	瑞鹧鸪·风韵雍容未甚都	1
多丽·小楼寒	10	鹧鸪天·枝上流莺和泪闻	1
满庭芳·小阁藏春	10	青玉案·一年春事都来几	1
怨王孙·梦断漏悄 淀涩沙影乙佐素塘更按	10	祭超湖州文	1
浣溪沙·髻子伤春慵更梳	10		
摊破浣溪沙·揉破黄金万点轻(山花 子)	10		

D a t e	Editor/auth or	Gend er	Title	(Re)Translated pieces included in monographs
1 9 3 7	Florence Ayscough	femal e US	Chinese Women Yesterday and Today	一剪梅/醉花阴/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/怨王孙·梦 断漏悄/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/感怀/蝶恋花·暖雨晴 风初破冻/点绛唇·寂寞深闺/念奴娇·萧条庭院/凤凰 台上忆吹箫/武陵春/声声慢/夏日绝句/浪淘沙·素约 小腰身/《金石录》后序
1 9 7 2	Rexroth and Chung	1 femal e CH	Women Poets of China	减字木兰花·卖花担上/小重山·春到长门春草青/如梦 令·常记溪亭日暮/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻/武陵春/ 渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/永遇乐/点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/ 丑奴儿·晚来一阵风兼雨
1 9 7 7	Julia Kristeva	Fema le_Fr.	About Chinese Women	声声慢
1 9 7 8	Carol Cosman, Joan Keefe, Kathleen Weaver	3 femal es	The Penguin Book of Women Poets	点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/减字木兰花·卖花担上/蝶恋花·永 夜恹恹欢意少/永遇乐
1 9 8 3	Joanna Bankier and Deirdre Lashgari	femal e US	Women Poets of the World	声声慢/一剪梅/醉花阴
1 9 8 7	Illona Linthwaite	femal e poet	Ain't A Woman! A book of Women's Poetry from around the world	永遇乐
1 9 8 8	Lawrence Lipking	male	Abandoned Women and Poetic Tradition	声声慢
1 9 9 2	Aliki Barnstone and Willis Barnstone	1 femal e US	A Book of Women Poets from Antiquity to Now	如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/孤雁儿/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破 冻/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤/ 小重山·春到长门春草青/生查子·年年玉镜台/凤凰台 上忆吹箫/一剪梅/醉花阴(Rexroth)/声声慢/醉花阴 (Seaton)/点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/明日对酒
1 9 9 2	Li Yu-ning	femal e	Chinese women through Chinese Eyes	《金石录》后序/《打马图经》序
1 9 9 3	Patricia Buckley Ebrey	femal e histor ian	The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Chinese Women in the Sung Period	《金石录》后序/醉花阴/转调满庭芳·芳草池塘

Appendix 4-7: Female-focused monographs and popularity list

1 9 9 4	Li Yu-ning	femal e Ch- US	Images of women in Chinese Literature	孤雁儿/点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/减 字木兰花·卖花担上/一剪梅/浣溪沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开 /醉花阴/摊破浣溪沙·病起萧萧两鬓华/清平乐·年年 雪里/临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁常扃)/诉衷 情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟/永遇乐/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾 /武陵春/鹧鸪天·寒日萧萧上琐窗/忆秦娥/声声慢/好 事近/浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤 /浣溪沙·楼上晴天碧四垂/玉烛新·双调梅花
1 9 9	Kang-i Sun Chang and Haun Saussy	Chine se Amer ican	Women Writers of Traditional China: An Anthology of Poetry and Criticism	怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺/鹧鸪天·寒日萧萧上琐窗/采 桑子·晚来一霎风兼雨/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/一剪 梅/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤/常记溪亭日暮/念奴娇·萧 条庭院/减字木兰花·卖花担上/小重山·春到长门春草 青/醉花阴/蝶恋花·永夜恹恹欢意少/菩萨蛮·风柔日 薄春犹早/点绛唇·寂寞深闺/添破浣溪沙·揉破黄金万 点明/清平乐·年年雪里/南歌子·天上星河转/行香 子·天与秋光/好事近/武陵春/声声慢/孤雁儿/诉衷 情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟
1 9 9	Aliki Barnstone	femal e	Voices of Light: Spiritual and Visionary Poems by Women from around the World from Ancient Sumeria to Now	孤雁儿/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初 破冻/浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮 /武陵春/生查子·年年玉镜台
2 0 0 3	Robin.R.W ang	femal e sinolo gist	Images Of Women in Chinese Thought And Culture	如梦令·谁伴明窗独坐/武陵春
2 0 0 4	Wilt Idema and Beata Grant	male and femal e sinolo gist	The Red Brush: Writing Women of Imperial China	词论/感怀/《金石录》后序/夏日绝句/晓梦/春残/减字 木兰花·卖花担上/点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/寂寞深闺/渔家 傲·天接云涛连晓雾/孤雁儿/诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟 /渔家傲·雪里已知春信至/永遇乐/醉花阴/蝶恋花·永 夜恹恹欢意少/念奴娇·萧条庭院/怨王孙·帝里春晚/ 武陵春/如梦令常记溪亭日暮/昨夜雨疏风骤/一剪梅/ 声声慢/凤凰台上忆吹箫/菩萨蛮·风柔日薄春犹早
2 0 1 3	Micheal Farman	male	Jade Mirror: Women poets of China	鹧鸪天·暗淡轻黄体性柔/殢人娇·后亭梅花有感/念奴 娇·萧条庭院/好事近/蝶恋花·永夜恹恹欢意少/小重 山·春到长门春草青/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻/蝶恋 花·泪揾征衣脂粉暖/孤雁儿/浣溪沙·髻子伤春慵更梳 /浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓/浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天/ 摊破浣溪沙·病起萧萧两鬓华/摊破浣溪沙·桂花·揉破 黄金万点明/一剪梅/诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟/怨王 孙·湖上风来波浩渺/凤凰台上忆吹箫/忆秦娥/醉花阴 /永遇乐/渔家傲·雪里已知春信至/渔家傲·天接云涛 连晓雾

Note: The book titles in red are monographs on the theme of international women.

Popularity list of specific source pieces included in female-centred monographs								
Specific	Includ		Inclu		Inclu			
translated	ed	Specific translated source	ded	Specific translated source	ded			
source	freque	pieces	frequ	pieces	frequ			
pieces	ncy		ency		ency			
醉花阴	9	菩萨蛮·风柔日薄春犹早	2	蝶恋花·泪揾征衣脂粉暖	1			
声声慢	8	丑奴儿·晚来一阵风兼雨	2	鹧鸪天·暗淡轻黄体性柔	1			

如梦令·常					
记溪亭日 暮	7	怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺	2	殢人娇·玉瘦香浓	1
一剪梅	7	浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天	2	如梦令·谁伴明窗独坐	1
武陵春	7	生查子·年年玉镜台	2	行香子·天与秋光	1
渔家傲·天	/		2		1
运家 顷 八 接云涛连	7	山花子·病起萧萧两鬓华	2	春残	1
晓雾	/	山化了内起州州内其十	2		1
永遇乐	6	渔家傲·雪里已知春信至	2	词论	1
<u></u> 孤雁儿	6	忆秦娥·临高阁	2	《打马图经》序	1
减字木兰	0	口采风间间间	2	《11 ) 国 红 / ) )	1
减于小三 花·卖花担	5	摊破浣溪沙·揉破黄金万点轻	2	晓梦	1
化·头化担 上	3	(山花子)	2	阮汐	1
上 点绛唇·蹴					
点年后·飒 罢秋千	5	浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓	2	行香子·草际鸣蛩	0
蝶恋花·暖					
<sup>乘心化</sup> 破	5	夏日绝句	2	多丽·小楼寒	0
破冻	5	<u> </u>	2	少而 行收率	U
小重山·春					
到长门春	4	感怀	2	满庭芳·小阁藏春	0
<b>革</b> 青	•		-		Ū
平下 如梦令·昨					
夜雨疏风	4	浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深	1	玉楼春·红酥肯放琼瑶碎	0
骤	•		-		Ŭ
凤凰台上	_				
忆吹箫	4	南歌子·天上星河转	1	菩萨蛮·归鸿声断残云碧	0
诉衷情·夜					
来沉醉卸	4	浣溪沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开	1	浪淘沙·素约小腰身	0
妆迟					
蝶恋花·永					
夜恹恹欢	4	怨王孙·梦断漏梢	1	庆清朝·禁幄低张	0
意少					
念奴娇·萧	4	怨王孙·帝里春晚	1	浪淘沙·帘外五更风	0
条庭院	т	芯工的 巾主管税	1		U
《金石	4	浣溪沙·楼上晴天碧四垂	1	品令·零落残红	0
录》后序	-		1		U
点绛唇·寂	3	临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗	1	临江仙·庭院深深深几	0
寞深闺	U U	雾阁常扃)	-	许·云窗雾阁春迟	Ŭ
好事近·风	3	转调满庭芳·芳草池塘	1	青玉案·征鞍不见邯郸路	0
定落花深	-		_		÷
清平乐·年	2	添字丑奴儿·窗前谁种芭蕉树	1	春光好·看看腊尽春回	0
年雪里					
鹧鸪天·寒	2	· 治滅》、影了你++ 城市林	1	<b>叔</b> 小左 动声	~
日萧萧上 琐窗	2	浣溪沙·髻子伤春慵更梳	1	忆少年·疏疏整整	0
坝团					

(Please refer to Appendix 4-5 for the mandarin of these Ci)

#### Appendix 4-8: Anthologies and popularity list of individual pieces

# A: Individual Source Pieces Included in Anthologies (Please refer to 4-5 for mandarin of these pieces)

To save space, Li Qingzhao's (re)translated pieces in anthologies are listed in the format of "date: author/editor, gender, title of the book/article: number of (re)translated pieces-specific *Ci* in Chinese"

1918: James Whithall, male, Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade: (1)-浪淘沙·帘外五更风.

1933: Clara M. Candlin, female, The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs: (2)-声声慢/武陵春.

1937: Ch'u Ta-kao, male, Chinese Lyrics: (1)-武陵春.

1949: Robert Payne, male, The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated: (3)-如梦令·谁伴明窗独坐/一剪梅/醉花阴

1956: Kenneth Rexroth, male, One Hundred Poems from the Chinese: (7)-怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺/小重山·春到长门春草青鹧鸪天·寒日萧萧上琐窗/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻/一剪梅/浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深.

1960: Lin Yu-tang, male, The Importance of Understanding: (2)-声声慢/《金石录》后序.

1962: A.R. Davis, male, The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse: (1)-武陵春

1965: Duncan Mackintosh & Alan Ayling, male, A Collection of Chinese Lyrics: (2)-醉花阴/声声慢

1965: Cyril Birch, male, Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century: (8)-点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/减字木兰花·卖花担上/蝶恋花·永夜恹恹欢意少/武陵春/好事近/永遇乐/一剪梅/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮

1970: Kenneth Rexroth, male, Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese: (6)-声声慢/醉花阴/生查子·年年玉镜台/武陵春/一剪梅/凤凰台上忆吹箫.

1974: William McNaughton, male, Chinese Literature: An Anthology from the Earliest Times to the Present Day: (6)-如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤/浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天/浣溪沙·髻子伤春慵更梳/武陵春/声声慢

1975: Wu-chi Liu and Irving Yucheng Lo, male, *Sunflower Splendor: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry*: (13)-清平乐·年年雪里/武陵春/南歌子·天上星河转/醉花阴/小重山·春到长门青草春/减字木兰花·卖花担上/念奴娇·萧条庭院/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/昨夜雨疏风骤/浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天/小院闲窗春色深/丑奴儿·晚来一阵风兼雨/诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟.

1976: John J. Deeny & Kenneth K.B.Li, male, A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry: (3)-渔家傲·天接云 涛连晓雾/声声慢/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤

1980: C.H.Kwock & Vincent McHugh, male, Old Friend from Far Away: 150 Chinese Poems from the Great Dynasties: (21)-武陵春/添字丑奴儿·窗前谁种芭蕉树/点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/卖花担上/醉花阴/蝶恋花·永夜恹恹欢意少/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/菩萨蛮·风柔日薄春犹早/南歌子·天上星河转/忆秦娥/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/凤凰台上忆吹箫/点绛唇·寂寞深闺/声声慢/好事近/一剪梅/永遇乐/孤雁儿/临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁常扃)/摊破浣溪沙·病起萧萧两鬓华/怨王孙·梦断漏悄

1985: John Knoepfle & Wang Shouyi, male, Song Dynasty Poems: (2)-夏日绝句/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤

1985: Sam Hamill, male, Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese:(3)-浣溪沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开/好事近·风定落花深/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深

1987: Greg Whincup, male, The Heart of Chinese Poetry: (2)-醉花阴/武陵春

1994: Julie Landau, female, Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty: (15)-如梦令·常记溪亭

日暮/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/一剪梅/凤凰台上忆吹箫/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春 色深/醉花阴/添字采桑子.芭蕉/念奴娇·萧条庭院/永遇乐/武陵春/声声慢/临江仙·庭院深深深几许 (云窗雾阁春迟&云窗雾阁常扃)/如梦令·谁伴明窗独坐.

1994: Victor H. Mair, male, *The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature*: (11)-点绛唇·蹴 罢秋千/减字木兰花·卖花担上/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/诉衷情·夜来沈醉卸妆迟/念奴娇·萧条庭院/鹧鸪天·暗淡轻黄体性柔/行香子·天与秋光/永遇乐/声声慢/武陵春/《金石录》后序

1996: Stephen Owen, male, *Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to* 1911: (4)- 渔家傲·天接 云涛连晓雾/南歌子·天上星河转/声声慢/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/《金石录》后序

1996: Czeslaw Miłosz, male, A Book of Luminous Things: an International Anthology of Poetry: (1)-声声慢

1997: Wai-lim Yip, male, Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres: (1)-如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤

1998: Jeannette. L. Faurot, female, Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry: (3)-一剪梅/醉花阴/声声慢.

2000: Sam Hamill, male, Crossing the Yellow River: Three Hundred Poems from the Chinese: (16)-好 事近(two similar poems)/浣溪沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开/鹧鸪天·暗淡轻黄体性柔/春残/一剪梅/鹧鸪天·寒 日萧萧上琐窗/菩萨蛮·风柔日薄春犹早/减字木兰花·卖花担上/武陵春/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻/点 绛唇·寂寞深闺/醉花阴/永遇乐/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/生查子·年年玉镜台

2000: Victor H. Mair, male, *The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature*: (6)- 点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/减字木兰花·卖花担上/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/声声慢/武陵春/《金石录》后序

2001: Arthur Sze, male, *The Silk Dragon: Translations from the Chinese*: (2)-醉花阴/诉衷情·夜来沉 醉卸妆迟

2003: Eliot Weinberger, male, *The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry*: (13)-春残/一剪梅/满 庭芳·小阁藏春/声声慢/添字采桑子·窗前谁种芭蕉树/菩萨蛮·风柔日薄春犹早/行香子·天与秋光/ 浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻/武陵春/偶成/清平乐·年年雪里/行香子·草际鸣 蛩

2005: Naiying Yuan, Haitao Tang, James Geiss, male, Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose: (1)-如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤

2005: Tony Barnstone & Chou Ping, male, *The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry*: (9)-醉花阴/一剪梅/武陵春/浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁常扃)/孤 雁儿/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/蝶恋花·暖风晴雨初破冻

2006: J. R. Seaton, male, *The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry*: (8)-点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/浣溪 沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开/怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺/浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深/品令·零落残红/点绛唇·寂 寞深闺/一剪梅/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤

2008: Zong-qi Cai, male, How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology: (1)-声声慢

2008: David Hinton, male, *Classical Chinese Poetry: an anthology*: (12)-丑奴儿·晚来一阵风兼雨/如梦令/常记溪亭日暮/品令·零落残红/醉花阴/点绛唇·蹴罢秋千/怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺/如梦 令·谁伴明窗独坐/武陵春/诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟/添字丑奴儿·窗前谁种芭蕉树/清平乐·年年雪里 /临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云窗雾阁常扃)

2012: Martin Puchner, male, *The Norton Anthology of World Literature*, *Second Edition*: (7)-《金石录》后序/南歌子·天上星河转/渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/醉花阴/武陵春/声声慢

2012: Jie Cui and Zong-qi Cai, male, How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook: (2)-一剪梅/武陵春

2017: Michael A. Fuller, male, An Introduction to Chinese Poetry from the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty: (5)-词论/声声慢/如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤/如梦令·常记溪亭日暮/永遇乐

2019: Shu-Ling Wu and Haiwang Yuan, one female and one male, *Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course*: (1)-一剪梅

Note: The female translators/editors are marked in red.

#### B. popularity list of individual pieces in anthologies

translated source pieces	Included	translated source pieces	Included frequency	
-	frequency	-		
武陵春	18	生查子•年年玉镜台	2	2
声声慢	17	忆秦娥		2
醉花阴	13	鹧鸪天・暗淡轻黄体性柔		2
一剪梅	13	品令·零落残红	2	2
如梦令·常记溪亭日暮	10	行香子•天与秋光		2
如梦令·昨夜雨疏风骤	9	孤雁儿·藤床纸帐朝眠起		2
渔家傲·天接云涛连晓雾	8	蝶恋花·永夜恹恹欢意少	2	2
浣溪沙·小院闲窗春色深	7	念奴娇·萧条庭院		3
永遇乐	6	鹧鸪天・寒日萧萧上琐窗		2
减字木兰花·卖花担上	6	丑奴儿・晚来一阵风兼雨		2
点绛唇·蹴罢秋千	6	春残		2
诉衷情·夜来沉醉卸妆迟	4	金石录后序	4	5
蝶恋花·暖雨晴风初破冻	4	小重山•春到长门春草青	1	1
好事近·风定落花深	4	山花子•病起萧萧两鬓华	]	1
南歌子·天上星河转	4	怨王孙·梦断漏梢	]	1
临江仙·庭院深深深几许(云	3	满庭芳·小阁藏春	]	1
窗雾阁常扃)				
凤凰台上忆吹箫	3	浣溪沙·髻子伤春慵更梳	]	1
点绛唇·寂寞深闺	3	浣溪沙·莫许杯深琥珀浓	]	1
清平乐·年年雪里	3	庆清朝 • 禁幄低张	]	1
菩萨蛮·风柔日薄春犹早	3	浪淘沙·帘外五更风	1	1
怨王孙·湖上风来波浩渺	3	春光好•看看腊尽春回	]	1
浣溪沙·绣面芙蓉一笑开	3	夏日绝句	1	1
添字丑奴儿·窗前谁种芭蕉	3	偶成	1	1
树				
浣溪沙·淡荡春光寒食天	3			
(Dlaasa ra	for to Annond	in 1.5 for the mondarin of these (	(·)	

(Please refer to Appendix 4-5 for the mandarin of these Ci)

	Appendix 4-9: Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies						
N 0.	Ti me	The Title of the Book	Li/total Song poets	Li's poems/ total Song Poems	Anthologized poets		
1	19 18	Chinese Lyrics from the Book of Jade	1/2	1/2	Li, Su		
2	19 33	The Herald Wind: Translations of Sung Dynasty Poems, Lyrics and Songs	1/9	2/33	Ouyang, Yan, Liu, Su, Qin, Zhou, Li, Xin, Lu		
3	19 37	Chinese Lyrics	1/6	1/20	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Qin, Li, Xin		
4	19 49	The White Pony: An Anthology of Chinese Poetry from the Earliest Times to the Present Day, Newly Translated	1/5	3/27	Su,Li, Xin, Yue, Lu		
5	19 56	One Hundred Poems from the Chinese	1/4	7/54	Ouyang, Su, Li, Lu		
6	19 60	The Importance of Understanding	1/2	2/7	Su, Li		
7	19 65	A Collection of Chinese Lyrics	1/12	2/28	Ouyang, Su, Li, Liu, Zhou, Jiang, Wu, Qin, Yan, Yue, Lu		
8	19 65	Anthology of Chinese Literature: From Early Times to the Fourteenth Century	1/3	8/16	Su, Li, Ouyang		
9	19 70	Love and The Turning Year: One Hundred More Chinese Poems from the Chinese	1/4	6/12	Xin, Li, Lu, Su		
10	19 71	The Penguin Book of Chinese Verse	1/8	1/15	Ouyang, Liu, Su, Yan, Zhou, Li, Lu, Xin		
11	19 74	Chinese Literature: An Anthology from the Earliest Times to the Present Day	1/7	6/12	Su, Qin, Zhou, Xin, Li, Lu, Jiang		
12	19 75	Sunflower Splendour: Three Thousand Years of Chinese Poetry	1/9	13/88	Liu, Ouyang, Yan, Su, Qin, Li, Lu, Xin, Jiang		
13	19 76	A Gold Treasury of Chinese Poetry: 121 Classical Poems	1/5	3/16	Ouyang, Su, Li, Lu, Xin		
14	19 80	Old Friend from Far Away: 150 Poems from the Great Dynasties	1/2	21/27	Li, Xin		
15	19 85	Song Dynasty Poems	1/9	2/24	Su, Qin, Li, Lu, Yue, Ouyang, Xin, Yan, Liu		
16	19 85	Night Traveling: Poems from the Chinese	1/5	3/10	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Qin, Li		
17	19 87	The Heart of Chinese Poetry	1/3	2/5	Su, Lu, Li		
18	19 94	Beyond Spring: Tz'u Poems of the Sung Dynasty	1/8	15/111	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Zhou, Li, Lu, Xin, Jiang		
19	19 94	The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	1/8	11/56	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Qin, Li, Xin, Wu, Lu		
20	19 96	Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911	1/11	5/84	Ouyang, Yan, Liu, Zhou, Su, Li, Xin, Jiang, Wu, Qin		
21	19 96	A Book of Luminous Things: An International Anthology of Poetry	1/4	1/4	Li, Su, Ouyang, Qin		
22	19 97	Chinese Poetry: An Anthology of Major Modes and Genres	1/6	1/7	Liu, Su, Zhou, Li, Lu, Xin		
23	19 98	Drinking with the Moon: Selections of Classical Chinese Poetry	1/5	3/21	Ouyang, Su, Li, Lu, Xin		

## Appendix 4-9: Li Qingzhao and her peers in anthologies

24	20 00	Crossing the Yellow River: Three Hundred Poems from the Chinese	1/6	16/32	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Qin, Zhou,Li
25	20 00	The Shorter Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature	1/8	6/25	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Qin, Li, Xin, Wu, Lu
26	20 01	The Silk Dragon: Translations from the Chinese	1/2	2/3	Li, Su
27	20 03	The New Directions Anthology of Chinese Poetry	1/5	13/36	Ouyang, Su, Li, Lu, Xin
28	20 05	Readings in Classical Chinese Poetry and Prose	1/5	1/9	Ouyang, Su, Qin, Li, Xin
29	20 05	The Anchor Book of Chinese Poetry	1/10	9/55	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Qin, Zhou, Li, Lu, Xin, Jiang, Wu
30	20 06	The Shambhala Anthology of Chinese Poetry	1/4	8/36	Liu, Ouyang, Su, Li
31	20 08	How to Read Chinese Poetry: A Guided Anthology	1/8	1/12	Ouyang, Liu, Su, Li, Xin, Jiang, Wu, Lu
32	20 08	Classical Chinese Poetry: an Anthology	1/3	12/52	Su, Li, Lu
33	20 12	The Norton Anthology of World Literature	1/1	7/7	Li
34	20 12	How to Read Chinese Poetry Workbook	1/5	2/13	Li, Xin, Lu, Su, Ouyang
35	20 17	An Introduction to Chinese Poetry from the Canon of Poetry to the Lyrics of the Song Dynasty	1/7	4/22	Liu, Su, Zhou, Li, Xin, Jiang, Wu
36	20 19	Mastering Advanced Modern Chinese through the Classics: An Advanced Language and Culture Course	1/2	1/2	Li, Su

Note: In this table, Li Qingzhao and her peers are represented by their surnames. That is, Li refers to Li Qingzhao; Su refers to Su Shi (苏轼); Ouyang refers to Ouyang Xiu (欧阳修); Liu refers to Liu Yong (柳永); Xin refers to Xin Qiji (辛弃疾); Jiang refers to Jiang Kui (姜夔); Wu refers to Wu Wenying (吴文英); Zhou refers to Zhou Bangyan (周邦彦); Qin refers to Qin Guan (秦观); Yan refers to Yan Jidao (晏几道); Yue refers to Yue Fei (岳飞), and Lu refers to Lu You (陆游).